International Journal of Educational Management

Volume 33 Number 1 2019

The human side of management

Guest Editor: Sanjay Kumar Singh

1 Editorial advisory board
2 Guest editorial
5 Internal marketing in a higher education context – towards an enriched framework
   Prakash Vel, Aakash Shah, Sunita Mathur and Vijay Pereira
28 Workplace spirituality, employee wellbeing and intention to stay: a multi-group analysis of teachers’ career choice
   Nimitha Abiodhaker, Manoj Edward and Zakkariya K.A.
45 Student–university identification and loyalty through social responsibility: a cross-cultural analysis
   Abdul-Nasser El-Kassar, Dania Makki and Maria Alejandra Gonzalez-Perez
66 Role of virtues in the relationship between shame and tendency to plagiarise: study in the context of higher education
   Deepika Pandoi, Sanjaya Singh Gaur and Anup Kumar Gupta
86 Building a culture of business analytics: a marketing analytics exercise
   M. Elizabeth Haywood and Anubha Mishra
98 Continuing professional development: policies, practices and future directions
   Davoud Masoomi, Javad Hatami and Javad Pourkareemi
112 Investigating the barriers to change management in public sector educational institutions
   Adel Ismail Al-Alawi, Muna Abdalmohsen, Fatema Mohamed Al-Malki and Arpita Mehrotra
149 Influences of working condition and faculty retention on quality education in private universities in Bangladesh: an analysis using SEM
   Mohammad Al-Amir
166 The linkage between knowledge management practices and organization based projects for better learning outcome: a conceptual framework
   Parijat Upadhyay and Manas Paul
179 The effect of highly emotionally intelligent teachers on their students’ satisfaction
   Bassem E. Maamari and Joelle F. Majdalani
194 Parents’ involvement, identification and alertness and their children’s functioning in school
   Shoshana Ben-Tov and Shlomo Romi


www.emeraldinsight.com/loi/ijem
The human side of management

Educational institutions exist to serve the goals of the society and the nation. To attain its goals, an organization requires human resources in different roles and functions to help achieve its goals (Champoux, 2011; Greenberg, 2011; Tosi et al., 1986), and the educational institution is not an exception. The educational institutions face competitive environment (Richardson et al., 1995) in the form of shrinking students’ enrollments combined with rising maintenance costs, demographic changes, online competition, burdens of accreditation (Hughes and White, 2006) that calls upon the critical role played by leadership in making things happen successfully (Al Matrooshi et al., 2016; Al Mehrzi and Singh, 2016; Chaturvedi and Gaur, 2009; Gaur, 2006). The twenty-first century is an era of knowledge economy characterized by the continuous renewal of knowledge and skills of human resources (Bozionelos and Singh, 2017; Gaur et al., 2014; Singh and Gaur, 2013) to stay relevant and competitive. It is argued that the role of managers in education institution’s innovation processes become critical (Lee and Gaur, 2013; Nuruzzaman et al., 2018) as the educational institutions face competition for resources (Lorange, 2002) like any other organizations across the industry. At the same time, the extant literature asks organizations to find ways and means to leverage the potential of their human resources toward the successful achievement of organizational goals (Al Hosani et al., 2017; Budhwar et al., 2018). Therefore, it is pertinent for organizations to manage change for growth (Al Ali et al., 2017) so as to stay organic through a strong emphasis on their processes, systems and most importantly through acquiring and retaining talented human resources. It is in this backdrop that the special issue (SI) on “The human side of organization” in the *International Journal of Educational Management* was conceptualized and that was well received as I received 56 paper submissions and 11 best papers after reviews and revisions were found suitable for this SI.

The first paper titled “Internal marketing in a higher education context – towards an enriched framework” provides an agenda on how to design and implement internal marketing tools, techniques, and, above all, the strategy to successfully run the educational institutions.

The second paper titled “Workplace spirituality, employee well-being and intention to stay: a multi-group analysis of teachers’ career choice” is contextualized in the Indian context. This paper discusses in detail about the linkages amongst workplace spirituality, employee well-being and intention to stay in the organization.

The next paper titling “Student–university identification and loyalty through social responsibility: a cross-cultural analysis” is contextualized in the Middle Eastern context. This paper discusses implications for theory and practice.

The fourth paper entitled “Role of virtues in the relationship between shame and tendency to plagiarize: study in the context of higher education” is very much contemporary and relevant. The paper presents and discusses key issues related to virtue, shame and tendency to plagiarize in the context of higher education.

The following paper is titled “Building a culture of business analytics: a marketing analytics exercise” that discusses and presents how to develop and sustain a culture of the analytics. The paper discusses on the key processes and systems necessary to develop and sustain a culture of business analytics.

The sixth paper titled “Continuing professional development: policies, practices and future directions” much more relevant in today’s context wherein institutions leverage on how to maximize the benefits of the professional development of their human resources.
This paper presents key implications for designing and implementing professional development policies and practices. The seventh paper is titled “Investigating the barriers to change management in public sector educational institutions.” This paper is very much timely and contemporary on what educational institutions do to effectively identify and manage the key barriers of change management. The eighth paper titled “Influences of working condition and faculty retention on quality education in private universities in Bangladesh: an analysis using SEM” is contextualized in the Bangladeshi context. It discusses about how to leverage working conditions and retention of faculty members if educational institutions focus on providing quality education to the students, the future of Bangladesh. The ninth paper entitled “The linkage between knowledge management practices and organization based projects for better learning outcome: a conceptual framework” is a review-based paper. It presents a framework for key learning outcomes for educational institutions and the critical role of knowledge management practices for education providers to fall back on. The penultimate paper titled “The practices of quality management in Norwegian higher education – collaboration and control in study programme design and delivery” in the Scandinavian context. This paper deals with what constitute to quality management and the role of collaboration and control mechanisms in the design and delivery of education programme. The last paper is titled “The effect of highly emotionally intelligent teachers on their students’ satisfaction.” The paper discusses on what constitute of an emotionally intelligent teacher and how an emotionally intelligent teacher enhances their students’ satisfaction level vis-à-vis the program and overall education. I hope that these 11 papers in the SI on “the human side of management” will be liked by the readers – the researcher, the educationist, the policy makers and the likes.

Sanjay Kumar Singh

College of Business, Abu Dhabi University, Abu Dhabi, UAE

References


**About the Guest Editor**
Sanjay Kumar Singh, PhD, is Associate Professor of Management at the College of Business, Abu Dhabi University, Abu Dhabi, UAE. His research interests include big data analytics, knowledge management, innovation management, sustainability, international HRM, and SMEs. Sanjay Kumar Singh can be contacted at: sanjay.singh@adu.ac.ae
Internal marketing in a higher education context – towards an enriched framework

Prakash Vel
University of Wollongong in Dubai, Dubai, United Arab Emirates
Aakash Shah
Research Scholar, Monash University, Melbourne, Australia
Sunita Mathur
Heriot-Watt University – Dubai Campus, Dubai, United Arab Emirates, and
Vijay Pereira
Humanities and Social Sciences, Khalifa University, Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates

Abstract
Purpose – The concept of “internal marketing” (IM) has gained the attention of researchers over the past three decades. Though a lot of research has been carried out on this topic, it remains a concept yet to be completely understood and captured, with ambiguity in terms of its definition and scope. The purpose of this paper is to utilise the higher education (HE) context in an emerging country, United Arab Emirates (UAE), to argue that the term “IM” needs more unbundling and hence the authors propose an enriched framework with a renewed and relevant identity, which the authors term as “corporate fusion” (CF).
Design/methodology/approach – The authors do so with a renewed framework and philosophy that tries to capture new constructs and dimensions of IM in line with the emerging corporate milieu and has been applied to the HE sector of the UAE in this paper.
Findings – The proposed new conceptual framework identifies a CF philosophy building on the existing literature and captures the essence of IM orientation, albeit with its new constructs, dimensions and justifications. Furthermore, the authors argue that this new model is relevant to the contemporary environmental trends surrounding present day HE organisations, more so ever in emerging markets such as the UAE, given their growth needs in a competitive global marketplace.
Originality/value – In this paper, the authors take a close introspection at the contemporary role of IM in the HE landscape available in the UAE using a renewed framework titled “Corporate Fusion”.
Keywords Human resource management, Emerging markets, Internal marketing, Corporate strategy, Enriched framework, Higher education

1. Introduction
The process of formulating business strategy requires both external and internal environmental analysis of an organisation (Driouchi and Bennett, 2011). Earlier literature on management of products and services was significantly dominated by an external environment orientation. Despite the increasing recognition that quality of services or products was the key to competitive advantages (Doyle, 1994), and that employees were the drivers of this quality (Gummesson, 1994; Higón et al., 2009; Pereira and Malik, 2015), business strategies still revolved around external market analysis (end customers) and scarcely on internal market analysis (employees). In many cases, cognisance of corporate goals, policies and procedures by the employees were still abysmally low leading to a phenomenon dubbed as “corporate disease” by researchers (e.g. Freudenberg, 2005). This led to inter-departmental rivalry and high organisational politics which limited firm-level co-operation (Caruana et al., 1997). Whilst this evolution and importance of analysing
“internal markets” has been strongly felt within corporate entities, there is still a dearth of research on internal marketing (IM) and internal marketing orientation (IMO). The necessity to focus on employees, especially when “IM” has been indicated as the crucial part of successful firm-level strategy and corporate philosophy, is yet to be addressed to the depth it deserves.

Given the current global economic trends, the world is moving from geographically concentrated economies to multiple economic zones (Caiazza, 2016). The advent of emerging economies in Asia, Middle East, South America and Eastern Europe including the now famous BRICS (Brazil, Russia, India, China and South Africa) has caused the dispersion of the global economic power from being concentrated on the triad economies (traditional America, Europe and Japan) to that of the emerging economies (Caiazza and Volpe, 2015). Hence, in such fierce and competitive times, firms from both global and emerging markets need to apply holistic internal and external marketing strategies to be serving the customer better and stay competitive. The current literature has mostly ignored the effects of IM on emerging markets, which is increasingly gaining attention in today’s global business arena. With firms, such as TATA of India and Ali Baba of China, run by efficient leadership, their internal strategies have yet to be studied (Park, 2014). For example, in the context of an emerging economy, Budhwar et al. (2009) inquire if IM could help tackle high employee turnover. Findings from their study suggest that IM interventions could combat the problem of employee turnover and also enhance employee satisfaction, which possibly can lead to their contribution in enhancing customer satisfaction, similar to other studies in the same context (e.g. Pereira et al., 2015). It is due to these factors that IM becomes much essential in these markets.

In this paper, we utilise the higher education (HE) context in an emerging country, United Arab Emirates (UAE), to argue that the term “IM” needs more unbundling and hence we propose an enriched framework with a renewed and relevant identity, which we term as “corporate fusion” (CF). The renewed framework and philosophy tries to capture new constructs and dimensions of IM in line with the emerging corporate milieu and has been applied to the HE sector of the UAE in this paper. We contribute through this proposed new conceptual framework by identifying a CF philosophy building on the existing literature and capturing the essence of IMO, albeit with its new constructs, dimensions and justifications. Furthermore, we argue that this new model is relevant to the contemporary environmental trends surrounding present day HE organisations, more so ever in emerging markets such as the UAE, given their growth needs in a competitive global marketplace.

2. Internal marketing (IM) and the service marketing triangle
Historically, the service marketing literature was among the first to capture the role of IM, showcasing its complementing nature to the external focus (Lings, 2004). The services marketing triangle popularised in Kotler and Keller (2012) showcased the three forms of relationships that service managers must be aware of and focus on (Figure 1).

Varey (1995) had already pointed out that IM was not just essential to service marketers but organisations in general. According to his study, every organisation, including manufacturing firms, must practice IM to be successful in their external marketing efforts. Following that, there has been an increase in interest on IM to identify its scope and define its aim and purpose. Yet, it has remained in a state of ambiguity. After Varey’s (1995) ground-breaking research on IM, much of the research studies in the domain were still focussed only towards service firms. The extant literature has over time argued that there has been a serious lack of IM practice by organisations, ambiguity of the definition, scope and functional ownership themselves being major reasons, apart from the unclear nomenclature stand. Pertinent questions have been raised such as: is IM a marketing or a corporate function, given the term “IM”? Currently, practitioners are...
debating the concept because of its domain ambiguity and whether it belongs to human resource management, marketing, TQM or any other discipline. Most of the current literature has been dominated by reconfirmation studies of existing scales on IM. An initiative to orient research on the conceptual rigour behind IM is lacking, thus, failing to completely capture current trends and give a holistic view of this important concept. In addition to that, existing literature has not been able to capture its scope (functional or corporate).

3. Dominant perspectives of internal marketing
IM, as a concept, has generally been viewed as just the application of marketing approaches and tools to the organisation’s internal markets, who are employees within the organisation (Gronroos, 1985; Gummesson, 1987; Rafiq and Ahmed, 1993, 2000; Piercy, 1995; Pereira and Fontinha, 2016). Despite this widely available and growing literature, there has been little acceptance of the IM concept by practitioners. Rafiq and Ahmed (2000) pointed out that while customer consciousness and market orientation are becoming popular among practitioners (Augusto Cauchick Miguel, 2013) and IM also having a positive impact on employees, and thus organisational performance (Ahmed et al., 2003), there is still hesitance and reluctance towards the implementation of IM programmes. The main reason for this conundrum has been the lack of the existence of a unified definition of IM (Rafiq and Ahmed, 1993, 2000; Lings, 2004; Coban and Percin, 2011; Gounaris, 2006). Over the years, there have been several interpretations of the concept but none that have been widely accepted. Each of these interpretations has been dominated by certain perspectives not lending themselves for a general acceptance. The dominant perspectives of different definitions of IM propounded by different authors are presented in Table I.

The extant literature suggests that while each definition indicated above explains a part of IM or reveals an insight, an effort to capture IM holistically reflecting the spirit and purpose still does not exist. Each new definition has brought a new perspective of IM, but has not taken previous insights into account. Though there have been many definitions of IM, they do not completely align with the realm of the current global corporate strategy trends. Thus, it calls for a refined thinking and a framework for “IM”.

**Figure 1.** Kotler’s service marketing triangle

Source: Kotler and Keller (2012)
4. Research methodology

We adopt an in-depth literature review-based approach wherein, the current research and the corresponding knowledge base on “IM” have been subjected to a structured content analysis to trace the evolution, applicability and the holistic nature of the philosophy, in comparison with the emerging contemporary corporate milieu. Content analysis, apart from being helpful in capturing the evolutionary nature, also aids in getting a holistic picture than a narrow view of phenomenon under study (Williams and Plouffe, 2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table I. Dominant perspectives of IM definitions propounded by different authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dominant perspective</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal marketing as synonymous to human resources management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal marketing as usage of marketing techniques in internal marketplace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IM for the purpose of satisfying external customers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The current research was designed through a two-phase strategy. The first phase was an initial review of literature on “IM” which pointed out different areas of lacunae that lead us to the following probing research questions:

- **RQ1.** What does IM entail from an evolutionary and a conceptual standpoint?
- **RQ2.** Is IM to be treated as a functional or a corporate strategy?
- **RQ3.** Is “IM” the right identity, since it appears to be restricted to marketing domain only?
- **RQ4.** Are the constructs and dimensions of IMO comprehensive enough in capturing the scope required to address the contemporary trends presently available in the corporate milieu?
- **RQ5.** What is the place for “quality orientation” in an IMO framework, since the quality of a company’s product or service, apart from other aspects, also depends on the quality of its IM practice within the company?
- **RQ6.** Can a service sector like education benefit from a refined thinking on “IM”?

To answer the above questions, through Phase 2, we used content analysis of the extant literature. In doing so, we have identified and reproduced thematic areas that emerged from our analysis, leading to the development of a new framework proposed by the current authors.

### 5. A literature review on internal marketing evolution, constructs and dimensions

The first instance of IM concept has been seen in the total quality management literature since the early 1950s (Ishikawa, 1985). But it was not till the late 1970s that there was seen an explicit discussion of the concept in the context of internal operations, in marketing literature, especially service marketing literature and gained a centre stage in 1980, as researchers took note of the concept. Berry (1981) first proposed IM as a solution to deliver and maintain service quality. Since then, the literature on IM has been rapidly growing and a wide range of interpretations as to what is IM developed and resulted in a diverse set of activities being grouped under the umbrella of IM, which perhaps has been a source of more confusion than clarity.

The conception and development of IM has been grouped into three phases by Rafiq and Ahmed (2000):

1. employee motivation and satisfaction;
2. customer orientation; and
3. strategy implementation and change management.

This classification of literature into phases was further enhanced and extended by Hwang and Chi (2005) to include a fourth phase, thus, the enhanced set of phases included:

1. treating the employee as an internal customer;
2. developing customer-oriented behaviour among employees;
3. human resources management (HRM) orientation; and
4. internal exchange of intelligence.

#### 5.1 Employee motivation and satisfaction/treating the employee as an internal customer

The early literature on IM primarily focused on employee motivation and satisfaction and since employees deliver service, it would be necessary to address their satisfaction.
Thus came the view of considering the employees as internal customers (Berry, 1981; George, 1977; Thompson et al., 1978; Murray, 1979; Hult et al., 2000; Parasuraman et al., 1985).

The key notion underlying this phase is “to have satisfied customers, the firm must also have satisfied employees” (George, 1977, in Rafiq and Ahmed, 2000).

5.2 Developing customer-oriented behaviour among employees

The second phase in the development of the IM concept began from the work of Gronroos (1985) who identified the focal position of contact employees in services. It was at that point that it became evident that it was no longer enough to have mere satisfied employees but sales-minded employees.

The key notion thus underlying this phase is to create motivated and customer-conscious employees.

5.3 Strategy implementation and change management

The third phase of IM was marked by several authors explicitly recognising the role of IM as more of a means for strategy implementation than anything else (Rafiq and Ahmed, 2000). During this phase, IM came to be accepted for its role as the tool for implementation of any organisation strategy by establishing communication and thus reducing inter-functional friction and resistance to change (Winter, 1985; Flipo, 1986; Tansuhaj et al., 1987; Martin, 1992; Darling and Taylor, 1989; Rafiq and Ahmed, 1993, Ewing and Caruana, 1999).

Thus, the underlying notion of this phase is to “align, motivate and integrate employees towards implementation of corporate strategies” (Winter, 1985, in Rafiq and Ahmed, 2000).

5.4 Human resource management orientation

Several authors contended that IM is not a part of marketing but has more to do with managing human resources. Joseph (1996) suggested that IM must be incorporated in all of the HR and related discussions. IM comprises efforts to bring the organisation together, by training the employees and encouraging them to deliver better services (Cooper and Cronin, 2000). Hales (1994) also has shown similar thoughts, expressing that IM as an approach is more like an explicit symbolic dimension of the existing HRM practices. Catalin et al. (2014) expressed a similar but different opinion that parts of IM coincided with HRM while others with marketing.

5.5 Leadership

The importance of leadership and its impact has been discussed by many authors in management, HR, organisational behaviour and change management literature. Burke and Litwin (1992) presented a model for organisational change management, in which they have brought out the role played by leadership and how its style can have an impact on the resistance to change and since one of CF’s key objectives is to reduce the resistance to change, it becomes evident that leadership has a key role to play in it. Here culture too plays an important role when it comes to managing and leading people (Laleman et al., 2015). It is not just in the literature of the disciplines mentioned above that the role and importance of leadership has been stated but in IM literature as well. Ahmed et al. (2003) pointed out that amongst the various elements of IM, senior leadership is one of them. Wieseke et al. (2009) also pointed a similar observation, stating that the leader’s charisma and the duration of time or tenure spent impact how the organisational identification flows from the leader to the subordinates. Lee et al. (2015) showed that the leader’s
charisma and the ability to take risks along with the employee’s faith on the leader influence the performance and IM effectiveness. Caruana and Calleya (1998) also indicated that leadership has a role to play in the effectiveness of IM.

Leadership does not just mean providing the employees with direction by the means of vision and goals, it entails far more. Jung and Avolio (1999) pointed out that the leadership style adopted by a leader has direct influence on the job performance of the subordinates. Menges et al. (2015) suggested that the leadership style does have an impact on communication which is a critical IM feature. Bass (1985) and Bass and Bass (2008) pointed out that leadership style has varying effects on the follower’s perceptions and behaviours. Mat (2008) pointed out that leadership style does have a direct impact on IM and its effectiveness. Hamstra et al. (2013) showed that leadership styles have a direct impact and influence on the goals and achievements of subordinates.

In line with leadership style, there have been many authors who have spoken about charisma of a leader. A leader’s charisma allows for employees to be able to better connect with the leader and helps them better envision goals and achieve them (Choi 2006; Zehir et al., 2014). A successful leader is one who can connect with his subordinates and show emotional understanding, which allows them to find comfort in the leader (Choi, 2006; Shamir et al., 1993; Lee et al., 2015). It has also been documented that the success of leadership only comes with trust of the subordinates on the leader (Dirks and Ferrin, 2002; Wieseke et al., 2009; Lee et al., 2015). As stated earlier, it is the leader’s role to provide direction and vision (Rafferty and Griffin, 2004; Burke and Litwin, 1992; Choi, 2006). In addition to that, the leader must also facilitate an environment in which innovation, inter-functionality and harmony are induced (Harris et al., 2013; Zhou et al., 2014; Chen and Hou, 2016).

5.6 Organisational citizenship behaviour (OCB)

OCB has been richly discussed in organisation behaviour and IM literature alike. OCB has been defined to represent the behaviours that go above and beyond those formally described to be in the organisational role, and that are discretionary in nature, not explicitly rewarded but are evident for the successful operation of the organisation (MacKenzie et al., 1993; Podsakoff and MacKenzie, 1994). OCB has been known to contribute to the overall performance of the organisation in more ways than one: providing means for facilitating and managing interdependency and inter-functionality among employees; reducing the organisation’s need for allocating resources for maintenance of simple functions; and aiding in improving the performance of others (Netemeyer et al., 1997). Aryee et al. (2002) showed that there is a direct relationship between the organisation’s regulatory policies and OCB. Abzari and Ghujali (2011) showed that there is a direct link between IM and OCB, as such that OCB helps improve IM and thus customer satisfaction, and hence OCB becomes an integral part of IM. According to Zhang (2014), there exist five determinants for OCB, namely, altruism; conscientiousness; sportsmanship; civic virtue; and courtesy:

1. “Altruism” has been defined as the discretionary behaviour whose main purpose is to aid others in accomplishing organisationally relevant tasks.

2. “Conscientiousness” has been defined as discretion displayed by the employee to go beyond the minimum requirements of his/her organisational role (Abzari and Ghujali, 2011).

3. “Sportsmanship” has been defined as the ability of an employee to be able and adapt to difficult working conditions, without objections and complaints, formal or informal (Farh et al., 2004; Abzari and Ghujali, 2011).
“Courtesy” has been defined as the discretionary behaviour displayed by employees to prevent work-related confrontations and problems with others (Organ, 1988; Farh et al., 2004; Abzari and Ghujali, 2011).

“Civic virtue” has been defined as the employee’s tendency towards participating and taking responsibility in the life of the organisation, and also form a suitable image for the organisation (Organ, 1988; Farh et al., 2004; Abzari and Ghujali, 2011).

Leadership is found to be a facilitator and that of OCB to be an enhancer of the philosophy of IM. The leader’s role has been effectively showcased to be critical to success of any corporate strategy. Leadership has been found to induce OCB, and in many scenarios, extend, enhance and orient existing OCB. It is a symbiotic relationship of sorts, where leadership and OCB help the existence of the other. OCB is found to grow positively with better internal market orientation.

5.7 Internal marketing orientation
IMO would be the latest stage in the evolution of IM. In the past, researchers have focussed on developing various definitions or interpretations of the concept, but in the current stage of IMO, the focus has shifted towards operationalizing the concept of IM, for measurement and testing. IMO has been seen to capture the essence of and represent what this philosophy stands for (Gounaris, 2006, 2008; Lings, 2004; Lings and Greenley, 2005, 2010). Over the last two decades, there has been considerable work on the concept of “market orientation” (Kohli and Jaworski, 1990; Narver and Slater, 1990). The marketing orientation philosophy had the customer at the heart of the strategy and focus (McGee and Spiro, 1988) and as such organisations adopting this strategy became more sensitive to the customer’s needs and were quick to respond accordingly (Gounaris et al., 2004). While this was true for manufacturing organisations, the same did not hold for service organisations, which were proving to be reluctant to adapting the marketing orientation paradigm (Harris and Ogbonna, 2002). It should be noted that just like the adoption of marketing orientation influences the company’s marketing practices, adoption of the IMO paradigm would influence the company’s IM practice and effectiveness (Gounaris, 2006; Gounaris et al., 2010; Lings and Greenley, 2010). Gounaris (2006) suggested that unless the internal climate of an organisation is conducive to the adoption of market orientation, the organisation can never truly be able to achieve the needed marketing orientation, and get customer focussed. It should be noted that while in the past, marketing strategies and orientations widely differed for manufacturing and service firms, today, that line is disappearing and for successful external market orientation, a firm, irrespective of their core line of business in manufacturing or service sector would have to implement and adopt IMO.

Thus, for a successful marketing philosophy, an organisation has to maintain both internal and external orientation; they sort of serve as the pontoons of a boat and have to be balanced appropriately to stay afloat (Lings and Greenley, 2010; Gounaris et al., 2010). While external market orientation is focussed on the satisfaction of the firm’s external customers, IM focusses on the firm’s internal customers (employees) and their satisfaction (Berry, 1981; Gronroos, 1985; Tansuhaj et al., 1988; Rafiq and Ahmed, 1993, Gounaris, 2006; Panigyrakis and Theodoridis, 2009). IMO as a concept is still in its nascent stages, with research on it still scarce and young. Lings (2004) stated that IMO was composed of three dimensions, namely, internal market intelligence generation, internal communication of intelligence and response to internal market intelligence. Several authors have suggested that IMO helps improve the IM practice, thereby improving the employee satisfaction and in turn the customer satisfaction (Gounaris, 2004, 2006; Lings and Greenley, 2005, 2010; Lee et al., 2015; Kameswari and Rajyalakshmi, 2012; Jou et al., 2008; Gronroos, 1985, 1995).
Figure 2 shows the three constructs as proposed by Lings (2004) and their corresponding dimensions. Internal market research implies the effort put towards identifying the needs and wants of the employees, the regulatory needs and how these affect the relationship between employees and the management. Internal communication entails as to how the information is passed through the organisation and how departments ensure others are aware of issues occurring in the organisation. Internal response is the actions that the organisation takes as means to make sure that the intelligence generated towards the needs and issues are answered and satisfied. A detailed explanation of these dimensions is given by Lings (2004), Lings and Greenley (2005) and Gounaris (2006, 2008). Lings (2004) had proposed the dimension of “response” to include job design, remuneration, management consideration and training. In this paper, through a deeper analysis of literature, we deduced that though Lings (2004) had captured most of the aspects to handle the issues and implement IM effectively, scope for adding more aspects exists. Several authors have
discussed the emphasis of employee empowerment, which leads to better job involvement and in turn job satisfaction and performance (Ballantyne, 2003; Al-Dmour et al., 2012; Chen and Lin, 2013). The importance of physical environment in improving employee satisfaction and job performance has been discussed by various authors (Burke and Litwin, 1992; Al-Dmour et al., 2012; Chen and Lin, 2013; Pereira and Fontinha, 2016). Similarly, staffing has been showcased effectively in the HR literature to be one of the most important factors in the success of an organisation and its importance has also been documented in the literature of other disciplines (Al-Dmour et al., 2012; Netemeyer et al., 1997; Pereira et al., 2015). Hence, we argue that the addition of three new dimensions of employee empowerment, physical environment and staffing under the current construct of “response” will bring about holistic and synergetic value.

Most of the works following Lings (2004) on IMO were merely reconfirmation studies (Lings and Greenley, 2005; Gounaris, 2006, 2008; Jou et al., 2008; Tag-Eldeen and El-Said, 2011). The current authors contend that the notion of IM and its terminology are not complete enough and that the conceptual model of IM needs to be revisited. A thorough study of the literature led the current authors to believe that though the model captures IMO, it does not do so completely, in that it fails to address several components, mainly the notion of quality orientation, which is crucial to the concept because IM as stated earlier was proposed to be a solution to offering superior quality and thus customer satisfaction.

IM, as seen currently, is not restricted to either product or services industry but is an organisation-wide philosophy. In that regard, the current scales of IM, having been studied and discussed only in the realms of services industry, beg the questions has it been biased in any way, and if all the dimensions have been addressed? Second, various authors have already pointed out the implications of quality orientation and other elements on IM, so it has to be seen how quality orientation and the other elements described above come within IM.

Thus, in order to address the critical issues on IM mentioned in the discussions above, the present authors have proposed a new framework to capture the current and the unrepresented constructs and dimensions of IM, christened “CF” with the bounds of quality, thereby giving more clarity.

6. Corporate fusion – a proposed new path
As discussed above, IM has implications across the various functions of an organisation and not with the marketing function alone. The term “IM” is thus a misnomer, in that it leads people to assume that it is the application of marketing internally to the organisation. IM has various facets and research so far has captured IM merely as an application of the traditional marketing approaches within the organisation. This has been done taking an approach similar to external marketing orientation when it came to the internal environment. In addition, much of the literature has also failed to completely capture the problems faced in effectively implementing IM in organisations. Thus, it could be said that the research so far has been more prescriptive (Varey, 1995; Gounaris, 2008).

In addition to the fundamental questions raised in the previous section in terms of suitability of the title “IM”, scope of IM, corporate or functional, we add another important question, specifically in the context of this special issue: What is the role of IM whilst operating in the education sector?

In proposing our new IM concept and in trying to answer the questions we raised above, it makes sense to revisit the concept of IM as it was first proposed and capture its essence. A renewed IMO framework to explain contemporary IM is needed for addressing three major aspects namely relevance of the IMO constructs and its alignment with the contemporary trends, relevance of dimensions of each construct and the role of “quality orientation” across the different constructs.
To achieve this, the authors have proposed a new CF framework (Figure 3) to capture the concept of CF with the bounds of quality orientation across the dimensions of the different constructs proposed.

The new framework includes two new constructs (in dark grey, Figure 3), namely “leadership” and “OCB”. The first two constructs of IMO, namely “internal market intelligence” and “internal communication” are accepted as they are, but the third dimension of “response” has been amended to include three new dimensions (in light grey, Figure 3), namely, staffing, employee empowerment and physical environment and the rationale is presented in Figure 3 showing the elements of the newly proposed framework of CF.

We thus come up with the concept of “CF” to substitute “IM” to effectively capture what the concept constitutes and holds for corporate entities. CF posited by the current authors is not just a process or policy as IM has been proposed to be, rather, it is a philosophy, drive or an orientation that originates at the strategic level, percolates down the layers of the organisation to finally satisfy the external customer. CF is an organisation’s common preserve or a resource that flows through all parts of the organisation and all the internal stakeholders partake a role, responsibility and ownership of it, leading to cognisance and practice of a common and uniform corporate voice. We thus define “CF” as a medium to unite the organisation towards a common goal not just by policy but through bringing about the faith in the organisation among employees, thus reducing the resistance to change by increasing inter-functionality, where all are groomed to speak the same language – the singular corporate voice.

CF espouses a unique strain, as its implementation is not by a specific department, but by all the departments of the organisation working in harmony. The CF philosophy we propose is similarly not restricted or bound to a specific domain, but has its implications in internal market intelligence and internal communication.
multiple domains such as marketing, total quality management, human resource management and organisation behaviour.

The core of this philosophy is not just to bring about employee satisfaction, but to have customer-oriented employees. Its aim is to facilitate the inter-functionality and hence reduce the departmental rivalry, thus allowing information to disseminate throughout the organisation’s boundaries. In other words, the philosophy of CF is to bring together all the departments and employees of the organisation towards a single goal of satisfying the external customer, by means of satisfying the internal customer (employees), and making sure that all the departments function in harmony representing OCB.

6.1 Corporate fusion and quality orientation
All the models that have been proposed for explaining IM have been oriented towards the three dimensions solely, or have only showcased how IM works with external marketing in the complete marketing strategy. In that regard, none of the models so far have looked at the concept of IM, in its present form proposed by the current authors as “CF” in the light of quality orientation, which holds prime importance, because the purpose of CF is to deliver superior quality and satisfaction to the external customer by satisfying and orienting the internal customers (Lasrado and Pereira, 2017).

The proposed model of CF not only showcases how quality orientation comes into the picture, but also how all the various elements work in tandem to provide the most effective CF strategy. As stated earlier, the CF philosophy as proposed by the current authors is composed of five elements, namely, leadership, OCB, intelligence generation, internal communication and response. The three elements of intelligence generation, internal communication and response represent the core of CF and the other two elements are enhancers and facilitators of the philosophy and hence as seen in Figure 3 not included in the core. The dimension of leadership is found to be a facilitator and that of OCB to be an enhancer. The leader is the one who is responsible for the initiation of CF strategy and provide the orientation and vision so needed. In addition to that, the leader’s role has been effectively showcased to be critical to success of any corporate strategy. While it may be a facilitator for CF, it is a mediator for OCB. Leadership has been found to induce OCB, and in many scenarios extend, enhance and orient existing OCB.

The presence of OCB leads to the effective implementation of CF strategies and the better adoption of it. Thus, it is a symbiotic relationship of sorts, where each helps the existence of the other. OCB is found to grow positively with better internal market orientation, while the implementation of CF strategies is found to be positively influenced by the presence of OCB. Figure 4 indicates how all the elements of CF work together. While it should be noted that CF strategies could be implemented by just capturing the core, it is not possible to attain the optimal level without successful leadership and OCB.

7. The UAE HE context – identifying success factors and challenges
The UAE has seen a remarkable growth in the HE sector. This has been driven by the upsurge of enrolments in both government-owned colleges and universities and private institutions including foreign branch campuses of many well-established entities from abroad. There are many foreign colleges and universities already operating in the UAE and many more are expected to fill in a growing demand. According to a Gulf News report, the revenue base for the HE market in the UAE is estimated to be worth more than $1bn (gulfnews.com). The UAE has become the largest host of international branch campuses in the world as it hosts 32 international branch campuses, which equates to 13 per cent of all international branch campuses worldwide. Dubai is an Emirate by itself accommodates 24 international branch campuses, five are in Abu Dhabi and three in Ras Al Khaimah (C-BERT, 2016; Ashour and Fatima, 2016).
The UAE has options for students to choose from US, UK, Australian, French, Indian, Pakistani, Emirati and other HE systems. These are highly regulated by both the federal UAE National regulators and regional regulators, i.e. Dubai and Abu Dhabi regulators. The federal regulators include the Ministry of Higher Education & Scientific Research, Commission for Academic Accreditation, Vocational Education and Training Awards Council, National Qualifications Authority and the Ministry of Education. The Dubai regulator is the Knowledge and Human Development Authority and the Abu Dhabi counterparts are the Abu Dhabi Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training and the Abu Dhabi Education Council. Similarly, for other Emirates, it is the Sharjah Education Council, Ajman Educational Zone, Ras Al Khaimah Educational Zone, Fujairah Educational Zone and Umm Al Quwain Educational Zone. Furthermore, there is another layer of regulation, especially when it comes to campuses of foreign entities HE, which are their respective head offices in the parent country. Thus, the University of Wollongong, Australia would govern and regulate their branch campus the University of Wollongong, Dubai operations, which is the oldest foreign university in the UAE, in its 25th year of operation now.

According to a recent PricewaterhouseCoopers (PwC report, September 2016), the quality of education in the UAE remains high, despite the negative impact of including gross tertiary education enrolment in the Global Competitiveness Index. According to them, this rate reflects the unique demographic make-up of the UAE and its outbound student mobility rate, which is one of the highest in the world. The report goes on to state that despite a declining tertiary-aged population group, the UAE’s tertiary enrolment rate has continued to rise to which 42,000 additional seats will be required by 2020. The country has been a popular destination for students from abroad to come and study, being drawn to its international HE institutions and this is coupled by the fact that the UAE is the largest host of foreign expatriates in the world, close to 8.2m. The PwC report also states that in Dubai, HE enrolment has been growing faster than in Abu Dhabi since 2010 and offers more universities, including international branch campuses, than any other Emirate. Furthermore, despite a strategic commitment from the government to promote STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics) subjects and encourage more
programme diversity, the field of Business and Economics remains popular for university graduates. The report suggests that over 175,000 additional seats are predicted to be required by 2020 in the UAE of which 90 per cent are expected to be in the private sector.

In terms of the international ranking of the UAE as per the “Quality Education and Training” index of 2011–2015 (Schwab and Sala-i-Martin, 2013; Schwab et al., 2012, 2015; WEF, 2011, 2013, 2014; Ashour and Fatima, 2016), the UAE was ranked 11th in the “quality of math and science education” index, surpassing developed countries such as Germany (16th), the USA (44th), Britain (46th) and Sweden (43rd) for the same index. As for the “quality of business schools” index, the UAE has been ranked 20th, again surpassing Germany (25th) and Japan (51st). When the “extent of staff training” is considered, the UAE has been ranked 12th and leads Germany (13th), the USA (14th), Britain (21st), Japan (19th) and Hong Kong (23rd). According to the same report for 2014, the UAE was ranked 9th place in the “quality of the education system”, 18th in the index of “quality of management schools”, 17th in “availability of research and training services” and 11th in the “extent of staff training”.

However, despite the above laurels, research on education and education management in the Middle East in general remains at a low level (Singh, 2017) and UAE represents an important nation in the Middle East. The HE sector in the UAE faces many dynamic, complex and evolving challenges. The positive areas that support these are identified as the state’s commitment towards building a competitive education system; possessing recognised and advanced HE universities across the seven emirates; possessing well-structured quality assurance (QA) systems (local and foreign) in place; and possessing a competitive environment that is attracting globally recognised universities to establish branches in the UAE (Ashour and Fatima, 2016). The challenges, thus, are to sustain the above-mentioned positives of continuity of the government’s commitment towards HE in the UAE, developing and keeping in pace with local and global QA systems, maintaining the competitive environment by keeping a close watch on quality entrants, etc. Universities are also posed with the challenge of providing the right school leadership and climate to positively influence the academic achievement of the students (Alhosani et al., 2017). The UAE will need to make a call on maintaining an equilibrium when it comes to quality and quantity in its HE aspirations. We have seen above the growing demand for student enrolments and hence what will the stance and strategy be of the private universities, both currently operating, and those entering the market? Another very important aspect is the level of research engagement in HE institutions. Ultimately research is an important facet when it comes to the standing and ranking at regional as well as international levels (see arguments made by CHEDS, 2012; Barqawi, 2012; Wilkins, 2010, 2011; Soomro and Ahmad, 2012; Ashour and Fatima, 2016). Also, to sustain the success and overcome the challenges faced by the UAE HE sector, the key is its human capital, its people who become their primary assets in attracting student enrolment numbers, carrying out regular, relevant and impactful research and thus maintaining a brand image. A need to understand the needs of the university staff, both teaching and non-teaching, internal communication of student and industry needs, maintaining singularity of university’s vision and mission across all departments, strong leadership and maintaining the Esprit-de-corps across the staff become quintessential.

Having identified the success factors and challenges in the UAE HE sector, we now utilise our proposed internal market orientation through the proposed CF framework as lens to envision and recommend strategic ways of sustaining its success and overcoming its challenges.

8. Proposed internal marketing orientation through corporate fusion: utilising it in the UAE HE context

In the context of HE in the UAE, it is observed and we argue that the Ministry of Higher Education or the concerned regional regulators in the UAE (apex education bodies), as may be applicable, are the entities in the CF model acting as the employer/manager, as the
various universities and their employees indirectly report to them. The students of the universities are treated as the end users (external consumers). As stated earlier, the UAE Government has created a well-developed environment with ample infrastructure and support, due to which so many foreign universities are operating in the country and many more are moving in, showcasing the need for suitable physical environment. In addition to this, the UAE Government has established a panel comprising of the most competent people to administer and regulate the education in the country, which also ensures that every university in the country adheres to the quality parameters by instilling and maintaining well-educated, experienced and trained staff. It shows the country’s ability to provide quality education in all the Emirates by handling the dimensions of staffing and training effectively. The country’s apex educational bodies effectively require the universities to communicate through periodical reports including ongoing research, quality adherence procedures and student satisfaction. It also requires universities to effectively communicate the necessity of support and recommend outstanding students for programs and scholarships organised by the apex bodies. This showcases the country’s ability to effectively manage communication from and to its superiors. In addition to this, the ministry also effectively collects feedback from students directly via surveys sent through mail, which allows them to gain vital intelligence and knowledge on students’ perception of quality of education received independently. This also allows them to verify if universities are not forging data. Thus, it can be argued that the country’s attention to detail in their practice of IM has led to its success factors described above. Furthermore, we argue that this competitive advantage can be sustained globally by taking the inputs from the proposed CF framework.

In the context of the UAE HE, it could be observed and argued that it is the vision and mentorship of the leaders that has driven the country to outperform various first world countries in rankings. It is this leadership and forward proactive thinking that has led the UAE to be the only country in the world to have a Ministry of Artificial Intelligence. It is argued that this could not have been possible, if not for the close nexus and proximity of working, communicating and consulting with the academic community. The country has also delegated leadership to the governing bodies of each of the Emirates which ensures the best for their own Emirate in turn adheres to the policies set by the Ministry of Higher Education, who also in turn report to it. The Ministry’s vigilant stance has made sure that the universities also follow and maintain the best procedures in terms of recruitment of staff, students and quality delivery of courses. Hence, the complete service cycle is monitored. In addition to this, it has been seen that the strong and benevolent leadership has also lead to the country’s recognition, attracting many universities, as seen in our earlier discussion. Hence, it is all about sustaining the hard-earned success in the UAE HE sector, for which all the constructs and dimensions of the proposed CF framework become relevant in understanding needs of internal customers, the teaching and the non-teaching staff of the educational institutions, communicating the needs to the offices of decision-making authorities like the dean and vice-chancellor and relaying the decisions and communication back to the staff. Decisions made in response to the studied needs of the internal (employees) and external customers (students) would have to be relevant to keep the internal morale high. The response may be in terms of recruiting the right staff, job design, training and employee empowerment to make decisions. Leadership styles and the ability to instil trust and encourage OCB become important. Relevant leadership styles in educational institutions with suitable vision, solicitude and charisma cannot be overemphasised.

9. Discussions and conclusions
In conclusion, in this paper, the current authors posit that IM as a practice has been evolving over the years, however, lacking on its alignment with the current corporate
milieu, which has been duly addressed by them through the proposed framework titled “CF”. In this framework, viewpoints on the value additions that can be made in the practice and philosophy of IM have been put forward, answering the various critical questions raised in this study.

The proposed new conceptual framework identifies a CF philosophy, building on the existing literature and captures the essence of IMO with its new constructs, dimensions and justifications. Two new constructs, namely, "leadership" (detailed with eight dimensions) and “OCB” (detailed with five dimensions) have been added. Since the construct “response” from existing literature wanting more clarity, three more dimensions have been added to it. Thus, the new model is more relevant to the contemporary environmental trends surrounding present day corporate entities.

Our refined framework looks at IM as a medium to unite the organisation towards a common goal not just by policy but through bringing about the faith in the organisation among employees, thus reducing the resistance to change by increasing inter-functionality, where all are groomed to speak the same language – the singular corporate voice, and all departments working together for the common corporate cause, thereby giving a new identity to IM, more appropriately as “CF”, a domain-independent corporate strategy.

It may not be enough for an organisation just to have a CF framework in practice, but also to have an interface that constantly monitors and establishes a link between internal customer satisfaction and that of external customer satisfaction and that is the “quality orientation” interface that monitors and infuses quality orientation across the different constructs and dimensions of the CF framework. The elements of CF must operate in harmony with each other in the encapsulation of “quality orientation”, as the external customer seeks not just product/service, but the quality of the product/service the he/she is purchasing as well, and since every business operates to satisfy the customer, the notion of quality orientation is of critical importance. The three elements of intelligence generation, internal communication and response represent the core of CF and the other two elements “leadership” and “OCB” serve as enhancers and facilitators of the philosophy.

Given the new emerging climate in the education sector across the world and UAE in particular, a need for revisiting the present strategic portfolio models has become the more relevant and important and the domain of IM is no exception to that. The education sector is going through a rapid transformation, in terms of changes in industry expectations from educational institutions, student preferences to disruptive teaching innovations. Teaching institutions have a high need to put their assets to good use, particularly the human capital, for which a congenial internal environment is quintessential. In that regard, our proposed CF framework will find an important place in the corporate strategies of an educational entity, might it be a university or a college. The two new dimensions in the CF framework, namely, “leadership” and “OCB” deserve a separate mention in terms of their contribution to the education sector. In today’s tough marker scenario, in terms of intensive competition, quality standards expected by governing bodies and skill sets expected by the industry, it is imperative that the survival and growth of an educational institution rests to a great extent on successful leadership. The style, vision, innovation, charisma and inter-functionality of a leader are important to stimulate the employees to address the latest expectations and to accomplish new goals. At the same time, labour turnover, low work commitment, a demotivated working environment, low morale and decreasing organisational loyalty are ravaging many institutions and a way to stem these negative trends would be by way of encouraging OCB, best manifested by the dimensions in our CF framework, namely civic virtue, conscientiousness, altruism and courtesy. The employees in educational institutions are undergoing an increased work pressure compared with their predecessors and hence become susceptible to productivity losses and work frustration, often referred to as “target and terror” (Bevan and Hood, 2006). Hence, if the right OCB atmosphere is not created
within work places in educational institutions, it might be detrimental to the growth of the whole institution.

In conclusion, in this paper we utilise the HE context in an emerging country, UAE, to argue that the term “IM” needs more unbundling. We put forward our renewed framework and philosophy of “CF” that tries to capture new constructs and dimensions of IM which could be of much relevance and use to the emerging HE sector that is rapidly developing in the UAE.

10. Implications and future research directions
Future researchers in the domain of CF can test the validity of the proposed model by both and quantitative and qualitative methods. The various constructs and their dimensions need to be operationalised to conduct a quantitative study. Researchers must also keep in mind to test this model both in terms of employee’s and employer’s perspective, and across different industries to avoid bias. In other words, researchers must go through the levels of the organisation to test the model, so that the true nature and effectiveness of CF can be tested and understood. In the education sector, it is germane to test the CF framework in different countries to reflect the different teaching environments and also eliminate its impact on the constructs and dimensions of the framework.

In terms of adding further value to the proposed CF framework using qualitative methods, methods such as critical incident technique have been found to be amongst the most effective tools in trying to unearth new constructs that may be evolving and their associated dimensions that may add further value to the proposed CF framework.

References


Mat, J. (2008), “The influence of leadership style on internal marketing in retailing”, PhD, University of Sterling, Stirling.


Further reading


About the authors

Dr Prakash Vel is Associate Professor at the University of Wollongong in Dubai and specialises in marketing and related areas. He is backed up with 25 years of teaching and practising marketing instance in the industry with experience spread across Bahrain, India, Singapore, Malaysia and the UAE. His areas of research, consulting and training include strategic marketing, consumer behaviour, marketing communications and events marketing and has trained and offered consultancy for more than 16 corporate clients in different countries in the world including Malaysia, Singapore, Kuwait, India and Dubai. He has published in international journals and has presented in more than 15 international conferences. He serves in the editorial and review committee of international Journals. At the University of Wollongong in Dubai, he was nominated for "Research Excellence Award" in 2011, 2013, 2014, 2015 and 2016.

Aakash Shah holds a post-graduate qualification in International Business from the University of Wollongong in Dubai and specialises in marketing and related areas. He is currently the managing partner at Aakash Cotton, India. He has over three years of experience in marketing, business
development and human resources across UAE and India. His areas of research include consumer behaviour, services marketing and strategic management. He has published in international journals and presented at international conferences in Geneva, Japan and India.

Dr Sunita Mathur is Associate Professor at Heriot-Watt University, Dubai campus. She is backed up with 20 years of teaching and entrepreneurial experience spread across UAE and Canada. Her areas of research include accounting, marketing and statistical analysis. She has published papers in conferences in UAE and India.

Dr Vijay Pereira is Associate Professor and Associate Dean (Research) at the University of Wollongong, Dubai. He has exposure in industry, consultancy and academia. He has developed subject specialism in strategic and international human resource management. Dr Pereira has published and presented over 85 papers worldwide including in A and A* international journals such as HRM, JWB, IJHRM, JBR, SI, JIM, OD and IFM and at numerous international conferences including the AOM, AIB, BAM and INDAM. He is currently on the international advisory board for the ERA “A” ranked Routledge journal South Asian History and Culture and the FT listed A* Production and Operations Management Society (POMS) journal and an elected member of the Indian Academy of Management. Dr Vijay Pereira is the corresponding author and can be contacted at: vijay.pereira@port.ac.uk

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Workplace spirituality, employee wellbeing and intention to stay
A multi-group analysis of teachers’ career choice

Nimitha Aboobaker, Manoj Edward and Zakkariya K.A.
School of Management Studies, Cochin University of Science and Technology, Kochi, India

Abstract
Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to examine the influence of workplace spirituality on employee wellbeing and intention to stay with the organization among teachers in technical higher education institutions. Furthermore, the study endeavors to test the difference in model estimates across two groups of teachers who differ in their intentional career choice.

Design/methodology/approach – This descriptive study was conducted amongst a sample of 523 teachers working in technical educational institutions in India. Self-reporting questionnaires were administered among the respondents, who were selected through purposive sampling method. Structural equation modeling and multi-group analysis were done to test the hypotheses.

Findings – Analysis revealed that workplace spirituality enhanced employee wellbeing and intention to stay. Differences were observed on the effects of different dimensions of workplace spirituality on job outcomes. Also, teachers’ intentional career choice was found to moderate these relationships.

Originality/value – This study is pioneering in conceptualizing and testing a theoretical model linking workplace spirituality, employee wellbeing and intention to stay, particularly in the context of teachers who differ in their intentional career choice. Implications with regard to the experience of workplace spirituality and job outcomes in the specific context of teaching are elaborated, thus striving to fill a gap in existing literature.

Keywords Teachers, Workplace spirituality, Higher education sector, Career choice, Intention to stay, Well-being at work

1. Introduction
Ever since the Academy of Management launched the special interest group “Management, Spirituality and Religion” in 2000, the concept of workplace spirituality has gained the attention of both academicians and practitioners as a salient area of inquiry. Workplace spirituality is essentially an employee’s experience of spirituality in the context of the workplace. It is conceptualized at three levels: having a deep sense of meaning and purpose in one’s work, experiencing connectedness with co-workers and experiencing a strong sense of alignment between one’s personal values and their organization’s mission and purpose (Milliman et al., 2003). Experience of spirituality at the workplace has been found to be positively associated with employee work attitudes such as job satisfaction, organizational commitment, OCB and organizational performance (Rego and Cunha, 2008; Crawford et al., 2009; Petchsawang and Duchon, 2012; Houghton et al., 2016). In recent times, employee well-being has emerged as one of the greatest challenges faced by managers (Boddy, 2014) and they are inquiring into strategies aimed at improving the same. Experience of more positive emotions at work has significant influences on both individual outcomes and organizational performance and productivity (Illies et al., 2015). In line with the theory of job demands-resources model (Bakker and Demerouti, 2017, 2014; Schaufeli and Taris, 2014), we conceptualize that workplace spirituality is a psychological job resource that will help employees in realizing enhanced well-being at work. Also, drawing from the Broaden and Build theory of Positive Emotions (Fredrickson, 2013), we propose...
that when employees experience positive emotions at work, higher will be their intention to stay with the organization. Research in these areas are still emerging, and our study attempts to fill this gap in the literature and examines the role of workplace spirituality in influencing well-being at work and intention to stay with the organization.

This study, being conducted among teachers, gains more relevance as teaching is a stressful occupation (Kidger et al., 2016) and teachers in general seek to discover meaning and purpose in what they do at the workplace (Khasawneh, 2011). Lowered well-being and resultant unfavorable individual and job outcomes like attrition costs profoundly to the organizations, and managers seek to develop policies aimed at improving the well-being of their employees (Amzat et al., 2017; Imran et al., 2017). In this context, the concept of career choice is of particular concern, as literature reveals that an individual’s career decision has a significant influence on both individual and work attitudes (AlDhaheri et al., 2017; Zaidi and Iqbal, 2012). Only if teachers are able to experience connectedness with their work and workplace, can they identify themselves with the profession and the organization as a whole. No study, to the best of our knowledge, has examined the relevance of intentional career choice in the context of the experience of workplace spirituality, well-being and intention to stay with the organization.

1.1 Indian context
India has one of the largest higher education systems in the world, with 25.9 million students enrolled in more than 45,000 degree and diploma institutions in the country. Over the past decade, enrollments of students and institutions have escalated at a rapid rate (MHRD, 2016). Alongside, reports reveal that universities and other higher education institutions in India continue to be overwhelmed by more than 30 percent faculty shortage (Pushkar, 2016). It becomes critical to retain the talented educators, especially in the context of entry of foreign universities and lucrative offers from the corporate world. Recent studies have identified that factors like improved job satisfaction, organizational commitment, organizational culture, and perceived supervisor support have a positive influence on an employee’s well-being and intention to stay with the organization (AbuAlRub and Nasrallah, 2017; Cao et al., 2014; Chew and Chan, 2008; Sarooghi et al., 2015). Since private educational institutions have commercialized most of their services, they heavily rely on their staff for quality services and outcomes, thus making their retention more imperative (Hanselman et al., 2016). To the best of our knowledge, no study till date has investigated the inter-connectedness between the aforementioned constructs among educators. An attempt is made to extend the body of knowledge by exploring the relationships between workplace spirituality, well-being at work and intention to stay with the organization, among teachers in technical higher education institutions in India.

2. Literature review
2.1 Workplace spirituality
People spend a huge portion of their life at work and increasingly place demands on the workplace for a sense of wholeness and connectedness. As a result, there has been a paradigm shift in the consciousness of workers and managers at all levels of organizations to find more meaning, purpose and fulfillment in their work, rather than just materialistic outcomes. Workplace spirituality has thus emerged as a significant focus for contemporary business organizations who strive hard toward sustainability. Workplace spirituality is “the lived experiences and expressions of one’s spirituality in the context of the work” (Sheep, 2006). Inclusive of the transcendent aspect, the pioneering survey on workplace spirituality (Ashmos and Duchon, 2000) extracted seven different dimensions of workplace spirituality and studies have proposed values framework for measuring workplace spirituality (Jurkiewicz and Giacalone, 2004). However, as proposed by
Milliman et al. (2003), only three dimensions have been found to be significantly associated with organizational and job outcomes. The transcendence aspect of spirituality has been more related to individual outcomes like life satisfaction (Zullig et al., 2006). Since the focus of this study was on job outcomes, we adopted the conceptual definition that workplace spirituality is “the effort to find one’s ultimate purpose in life through the work one does, to develop a strong connection to co-workers and other people associated with work, and to have consistency (or alignment) between one’s core beliefs and the values of their organization” (Mitroff and Denton, 1999; Milliman et al., 2003).

As reflected from existing literature, workplace spirituality is conceptualized to be comprised of three dimensions: meaningful work, sense of community and alignment with organizational values. Meaningful work is the quest to find a deep sense of meaning and purpose in one’s work (Gatling et al., 2016) and represents how employees interact with their day-to-day work at the individual level (Ashmos and Duchon, 2000). The sense of community relates to having a deep connection to, or relationship with others (Milliman et al., 2003). Alignment with organizational values encompasses the notion that employees yearn to work in an organization whose goal is not merely wealth maximization, but also seeks to have a high sense of ethics or integrity and make a larger contribution to the welfare of employees, customers and society (Alas and Mousa, 2016; Biggs et al., 2014; Milliman et al., 2003). Experience of spirituality at the workplace has been found to be positively associated with employee work attitudes such as intuition, creativity, honesty, trust, personal fulfillment, organizational commitment, organizational performance, customer orientation, adaptability, service orientation, ethical selling behavior, job satisfaction, reduced intentions to quit, organizational citizenship behavior and job involvement (Krishnakumar and Neck, 2002; Kolodinsky et al., 2008; Rego and Cunha, 2008; Petchsawang and Duchon, 2012; Gupta et al., 2014; Pradhan et al., 2016). Though few studies have lately attempted to examine the relationship between workplace spirituality and employee well-being, these studies were either focused on experience of individual spirituality, which included transcendental aspects (Arnetz et al., 2013) or had measured well-being in a loosely defined manner; either in terms of positive emotions alone (Pawar, 2016) or on a broader level of subjective well-being (Zou and Dahling, 2017) or as a collective experience of employee commitment, job satisfaction and work-life balance satisfaction (Garg, 2017). Lack of studies relating to different dimensions of workplace spirituality and affective well-being at work (comprehensively measured in terms of experiencing both positive and negative emotions at work) signifies the relevance of this current research endeavor.

2.2 Well-being at work
The “happy worker–productive worker” thesis suggests that workers, who experience high levels of well-being, perform well. However, organizations need to know how to nurture and sustain such happy and productive workers (Illies et al., 2015; Wright and Staw, 1999). Within the academic literature, there are many definitions of well-being (Warr, 2003). Dodge et al. (2012) propose a simple definition: “[...] wellbeing is the balance point between an individual’s resource pool and the challenges faced.” In this study, we conceptualize and measure employee well-being via job-related affective well-being, as experiencing more positive emotions than negative emotions (Van Katwyk et al., 2000; Warr, 2003). Studies across the globe have ascertained that employee well-being is rapidly decreasing in academia (Boyd et al., 2011; Kidger et al., 2016; Vesely et al., 2014). More than 50 percent of all teachers report teaching to be “stressful” or “extremely stressful” (Collie et al., 2012; De Nobile and McCormick, 2010). Lowered well-being results in diminished individual and work outcomes like absenteeism, job turnover and lack of motivation (Brunetto et al., 2012; McCormick and Barnett, 2011; Scanlan et al., 2013).
The well-being of academic faculty is considered to have a remarkable impact on student accomplishment and hence important for the attainment of educational goals (Capone and Petrillo, 2016; Gonzalez-Rico et al., 2018). Earlier studies in this context have focused on faculty and administrator job satisfaction, faculty turnover and intention to leave (Ryan et al., 2012; Smerek and Peterson, 2007). Therefore, the psychological integration of employees toward their work and workplace needs to be deliberated within the higher education settings. In the context of Indian higher education sector, there is an increased level of absenteeism and turnover intention in the academic profession which are potential indicators of their lowered level of well-being (Raina and Khatri, 2015) and the lack of existence and focus on such studies compounds the obstacles toward formulation of policies and strategies aimed at improving well-being at work. However, the relevance of workplace spirituality as a precursor to well-being at work has not been previously examined in the organizational literature.

2.3 Intention to stay
Intention to stay refers to an employee’s conscious and deliberate willingness to stay with the organization, hence the likelihood of him or her staying in his or her present job (Tett and Meyer, 1993). Higher education institutions are more dependent on the intellectual capital, creativity and commitment of their academicians than most other organizations, therefore making it critically significant to retain them (Pienaar and Bester, 2008). The costs of academic staff turnover have a significant impact on quality of services and the image of the institution (Zhou and Volkwein, 2004). With abundant career opportunities presented, it is important for private educational institutions to recognize why academic staff stays in their organizations. Govaerts et al. (2011) notes that appropriate retention strategies are grounded on the understanding of the influences that affect whether or not employees leave or stay, particularly noting that working climate has a positive influence on the retention of talented employees. Teachers’ intention to stay with the organization depends on both personal and contextual factors and no study has examined the role of workplace spirituality as a contextual psychological job resource that would facilitate improved well-being and intention to stay and hence the relevance of our current study.

2.4 Career choice as a moderator
The decision of choosing to remain in a deep-rooted profession has a significant and long-term effect on both individual and organizational outcomes (Preston and Biddle, 1994). Generally, human beings take part in a profession as it helps them to fulfill their life desires like gaining a living, maintain enthusiasm, make a difference to the mankind, proliferation of social status, self-esteem and respectability (Kyriacou and Coulthard, 2000; Padhy et al., 2015). Moreover, one’s profession is an instrument of seeking for self-actualization and fulfillment in life (Watt and Richardson, 2007; Wrzesniewski, 2003). Studies have reported that employees stay with the organization when they enjoy doing their work and see work as a calling, as the case with most of the teachers (Bullough and Hall-Kenyon, 2012; Dik and Duffy, 2009). People are attracted to teaching because of various intrinsic (teaching as a calling and intellectual fulfillment) and extrinsic reasons (job security, high remuneration and long holidays) (Azman, 2013; Butt et al., 2010; Kyriacou, 2011; Mee et al., 2012). Studies report that an individual’s career decision has a significant influence on both individual and work attitudes and outcomes (AlDhaheri et al., 2017; Zaidi and Iqbal, 2012). Nevertheless, no study has examined the role of career choice in the context of constructs under the focus of our study. To address the existing gap in the literature, we seek to examine whether career choice would influence the relationship between a teacher’s workplace spirituality, well-being at work and intention to stay with the organization.
3. Theoretical framework and hypothesis development

One of the basic premises of the Job Demands-Resources model (Bakker et al., 2014; Demerouti et al., 2001) – employed in this study – is that the job resources are critical for employee well-being. Job resources are those physical, psychological, social, or organizational aspects of the job that help the person to cope with job demands, increase learning and development as an employee and are useful in accomplishing work-related goals (Bakker et al., 2014; Demerouti et al., 2001). Numerous studies have examined how different job characteristics like supervisory support, autonomy, feedback and task significance act as resources, resulting in improved job outcomes (Crawford et al., 2010). Studies have identified that centrality of work is pivotal to an individual’s well-being (Burack, 1999; Krishnakumar and Neck, 2002; Warr, 2003). Employees experience meaningful work through work designs that will facilitate enjoyment and purpose in what they do at workplace. Managers help experience meaningfulness by providing challenges, clarity and authenticity associated with each work, so that employees will enjoy their work and finds it connected to the larger good of the society. The dimension of meaningful work in workplace spirituality is thus conceptualized as a job resource, as the same is facilitated by managers, in the work environment. Sense of community is the togetherness experienced by co-workers, and managers play a great role on facilitating a work climate that nurtures and nourishes team-spirit and good personal relationships. Managerial practices aimed at improving the social and organizational context have been proved to add value to employee well-being at work (Bakke, 2005; Tehrani et al., 2007). Sense of community is thus conceptualized as an organizationally determined job characteristic and thus a job resource. Accordingly, workplace spirituality is conceptualized as a job resource that will help employees in realizing enhanced well-being at work and we put forward the following hypothesis:

\[ H1a. \text{ There is a significant positive relationship between meaningful work and well-being at work.} \]

\[ H1b. \text{ There is a significant positive relationship between sense of community and well-being at work.} \]

\[ H1c. \text{ There is a significant positive relationship between alignment with organizational values and well-being at work.} \]

The Broaden and Build theory (Fredrickson, 2013) posits that positive emotions broaden peoples’ momentary thought–actions (the broaden effect), which in turn prompts growth in personal and social resources, reflected through improved outcomes like job satisfaction and lowered turnover intentions (the build effect). Experience of positive emotions “expand the obtainable array of potential thoughts and actions that come readily to mind” (Fredrickson and Branigan, 2001) and has an enduring effects on employee job attitudes and outcomes like lower turnover intentions, higher organizational performance and productivity (Cotton and Hart, 2003; Siu et al., 2015). The role of economic, social and emotional resources as predictors of employees’ intention to leave or stay with the organization have been reported in many studies (Blau, 1964; Aryee et al., 2002; Bambacas and Kulik, 2013). Based on such findings, we presume a relationship between well-being at work and intention to stay with the organization, as well-being at work reflects one’s emotional resource. Hence we propose that when employees’ experience higher levels of well-being at work it would be reflected in improved intention to stay with the organization. Accordingly, it is hypothesized that:

\[ H2. \text{ There is a significant positive relationship between well-being at work and intention to stay with the organization.} \]
The present study also aims to uncover the underlying mechanism through which workplace spirituality would influence job outcomes, as the case with “intention to stay” in this study and it is henceforth hypothesized that:

\[ H3. \text{ Workplace spirituality will have an indirect effect on intention to stay, through well-being at work.} \]

Based on the review of literature on career choice as a moderator, it can be inferred that teaching as a career can be internalized by individuals in different ways and those choices will have significant influence on their work outcomes (Azman, 2013; AlDhaheri et al., 2017). It is thus proposed that (Figure 1):

\[ H4. \text{ The relationship between workplace spirituality and well-being will vary among teachers for whom teaching was an intentional career choice and otherwise.} \]

\[ H5. \text{ The relationship between well-being and intention to stay will vary among teachers for whom teaching was an intentional career choice and otherwise.} \]

4. Research methodology

4.1 Overview of sample and procedures

This descriptive study was conducted among a sample of 523 teachers working in government-approved technical educational institutions located in three Indian states, operating in private sector. Only teachers with a minimum of one year experience with the current employer were selected, as many aspects measured in the study required a sufficient period of experience at the workplace thus ensuring an effective measure of the constructs. The data were collected by administering self-reporting questionnaires among the respondents, who were selected through the non-probabilistic purposive sampling method. The sample consisted of 51 percent males and 49 percent females. The majority of them belonged to the age group of 25 years – 35 years (59 percent), with work experience of 5 to 12 years (51 percent) and 64 percent of them had a post-graduate degree. Of the total respondents, 56 percent reported that teaching is their intentional career choice.

4.2 Measures

Workplace spirituality was measured using the scale adapted from Milliman et al. (2003), consisting of three dimensions: meaningful work (\( \alpha = 0.857 \)), sense of community (\( \alpha = 0.957 \)) and alignment with organizational values (\( \alpha = 0.945 \)), and it consisted of 21 items. Intention to stay is conceptualized and measured as a single order construct and was
measured using three items \( (\alpha = 0.918) \), adapted from Bloemer and Odekerken-Schröder (2006) and Curry et al. (1986). Responses for both constructs were rated on a five-point Likert scale \((1 = \text{strongly disagree} \text{ and } 5 = \text{strongly agree})\). Well-being at work was operationalized using the Job-Related Affective Well-being scale (originally developed by Van Katwyk et al. (2000) and a short version developed by Basinski et al. (2014)). It consisted of two dimensions (positive affect \( (\alpha = 0.913) \) and negative affect \( (\alpha = 0.890) \)), measured using eight items, on a five-point scale \((1 = \text{never} \text{ and } 5 = \text{always})\). All scales complied with the internal reliability of minimum 0.7 criterions (Table I) (Hair et al., 2010). Career choice of teachers was assessed using a single item “Was teaching your intentional career choice?” and responses were either a “Yes” or “No.”

5. Results
Table I reveals the means, standard deviations, and correlations between the different constructs under focus. The mean values ranged between 4.22 (meaningful work), 3.38 (sense of community), 3.52 (alignment with organizational values), 3.66 (positive affect), 2.27 (negative affect) and 3.54 (intention to stay). All variables under the focus of study had significant positive correlations with each other (Table I).

5.1 Measurement model testing
Structural equation modeling using IBM AMOS 21.0 was used to validate the proposed hypotheses for the underlying relationships (Arbuckle, 2010). All measurement items had loadings greater than 0.70 and the hypothesized five-factor measurement models had a satisfactory fit \( (\chi^2 = 1,090.50, \ p < 0.001; \ \chi^2/df = 2.42; \ \text{SRMR} = 0.03, \ \text{TLI} = 0.951, \ \text{CFI} = 0.955, \ \text{RMSEA} = 0.052) \). The average variance extracted for each construct was above 0.50, ensuring convergent validity (Fornell and Larcker, 1981). Table I provides the square roots of the average variance extracted values for each construct along the diagonal (Field, 2013; Hair et al., 2010), confirming discriminant validity. Overall, there is satisfactory support for the model, which permits us to advance with an estimation of the structural model and thorough hypotheses testing.

5.2 Structural model hypothesis testing
Our hypothesized model showed a good fit to the observed data \( (\chi^2 = 704.676, \ p < 0.001; \ \chi^2/df = 2.230; \ \text{SRMR} = 0.05, \ \text{TLI} = 0.907, \ \text{CFI} = 0.916, \ \text{GFI} = 0.850; \ \text{RMSEA} = 0.065) \) (Field, 2013; Hair et al., 2010). The results of regression coefficients of each path and their statistical significance are summarized in Table II. Of the proposed four hypotheses, meaningful work has the strongest effect on well-being at work \((H1a – \text{supported})\), followed by a sense of community \((H1b – \text{supported})\). Alignment with organizational values did not emerge as a significant predictor of well-being among the entire sample under study \((H1c – \text{not supported})\). Employee well-being has a significant positive relationship with intention to stay \((H2 – \text{supported})\) (see Table II).

The mediation analysis was done using bootstrapping method in SEM (using IBM AMOS 21.0), at 95% confidence interval and bootstrap resamples of 5,000 (Preacher and Hayes, 2008); see Table III. In Baron and Kenny (1986) approach, we employ a series of regression equations to identify the mediating effect of the intervening variable, with respect to one independent variable and one dependent variable at a time. But in the context of our study, we adopted bootstrapping method so as to understand how well-being at work mediates the relationship between workplace spirituality and intention to stay, incorporating together the direct and indirect effects of each of the dimensions of workplace spirituality. The standardized direct and indirect effects between hypothesized paths were scrutinized and it was found that well-being at work mediated the relationship
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>AVE</th>
<th>MSV</th>
<th>WS_SOC</th>
<th>WS_MW</th>
<th>WS_AOV</th>
<th>PEWB</th>
<th>IS</th>
<th>NEWB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WS_SOC</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>0.943</td>
<td>0.703</td>
<td>0.311</td>
<td>0.839</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WS_MW</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>0.857</td>
<td>0.502</td>
<td>0.445</td>
<td>0.510</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.709</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WS_AOV</td>
<td>3.52</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.945</td>
<td>0.685</td>
<td>0.471</td>
<td>0.558</td>
<td>0.476</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.827</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEWB</td>
<td>3.66</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.914</td>
<td>0.727</td>
<td>0.508</td>
<td>0.355</td>
<td>0.667</td>
<td>0.458</td>
<td>0.853</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IS</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>0.953</td>
<td>0.870</td>
<td>0.328</td>
<td>0.249</td>
<td>0.414</td>
<td>0.472</td>
<td>0.558</td>
<td>0.933</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEWB</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>0.891</td>
<td>0.672</td>
<td>0.508</td>
<td>0.445</td>
<td>0.553</td>
<td>0.434</td>
<td>0.713</td>
<td>0.458</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** The values on the diagonal (in italic) represent the square root of average variance extracted (AVE) for each factor, while the variables below the diagonal represent the correlations between each pair of factors.
between meaningful work → intention to stay (β = 0.362, p < 0.05) and sense of community → intention to stay (β = 0.168, p < 0.05). However, well-being at work did not mediate the relationship between alignment with organizational values → intention to stay (β = 0.080, p = 0.163) and hence H3 was partially supported.

5.3 Testing for factor invariance

Multi-group invariance analysis was done to examine the difference in causal path estimates, among the two groups of teachers who reported teaching as their intentional career choice and otherwise. A multi-group measurement model was executed with AMOS 21.0 using ML estimation method (unintentional choice = 0 and intentional choice = 1), and the data were split alongside. The resultant model fit indices were adequate (χ² = 1,914.90, p < 0.001; χ²/df = 2.072; SRMR = 0.05, TLI = 0.918, CFI = 0.923, RMSEA = 0.045) (Hair et al., 2010), confirming configural invariance of measurement model. Upon confirmation of configural invariance, metric invariance was tested using multi-group moderation test using critical ratios for differences, with the help of Stats Tools Package. Value of z-score greater than 1.96 indicates a difference (p-value < 0.05) between the two groups (Bryne, 2010). Of the four paths in the model, two paths showed significant difference among the two groups of teachers (H4 – partially supported and H5 – supported) (Table IV).

6. Discussion

In accordance with Mitroff and Denton's (1999) initial assessment of workplace spirituality as a competitive advantage for organizations, findings of our study document the significant role of workplace spirituality in fostering well-being at work. Consistent with the job demand-resource model (Bakker et al., 2014; Demerouti et al., 2001) and our hypothesized theoretical framework, meaningful work and sense of community were found to be positively related well-being at work, whereas the proposition between alignment with organizational values and well-being was not supported. In line with existing literature (Amabile and Kramer, 2012; Arnold et al., 2007; Meyers and Van Woerkom, 2014), our study emphasized the strong association between meaningful work and well-being at work (H1a supported). Experiences of meaningful work, positive emotions and stronger intrinsic motivation at work are strong driving forces that would influence employee attitudes and outcomes which in turn act as the vital source of competitive advantage for organizations (Steger et al., 2012).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path</th>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1</td>
<td>Meaningful work → Well-being at work</td>
<td>0.680</td>
<td>0.097</td>
<td>4.883 ***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2</td>
<td>Sense of community → Well-being at work</td>
<td>0.316</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td>3.258 0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3</td>
<td>Alignment with org. values → Well-being at work</td>
<td>0.150</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td>1.526 0.127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4</td>
<td>Well-being at work → Intention to stay</td>
<td>0.532</td>
<td>0.384</td>
<td>5.238 ***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table II. Hypotheses testing

Notes: n = 523. ***p < 0.001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path</th>
<th>Direct effect SE (p-value)</th>
<th>Indirect effect SE (p-value)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H3a</td>
<td>0.526 (0.008)</td>
<td>0.362 (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3b</td>
<td>0.359 (0.000)</td>
<td>0.168 (0.050)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3c</td>
<td>0.127 (0.062)</td>
<td>0.080 (0.163)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table III. Mediating effects of well-being at work

Notes: n = 523. ***p < 0.001
Our study identified a strong association between sense of community and employee well-being (H1b supported). The wider research literature has shown that social support is associated with better psychological well-being in general (Diener and Seligman, 2004; Kossek et al., 2011; Siedlecki et al., 2014). Indhira and Shani (2016) proposed that employees look forward to staying in those organizations which provide opportunities for experimentation of ideas, taking initiatives, autonomy, and freedom to express opinions, all of which were well reflected in the construct “sense of community.” Accordingly, sense of community can be a valuable resource to both the employee and the employer alike. Consistent with the Broaden and Build theory of positive emotions, our study revealed that well-being at work (higher positive emotions) was positively associated with higher intention to stay with the organization (H2 supported). However, contrary to existing studies, alignment with organizational values had no influence employee well-being (H1c not supported), though they were positively correlated with each other (Table I). Though the sample has good scores on alignment with organizational values (Table I), it was not effectively translated into well-being at work. Employees might have perceived the organization to be an ethical one with a value system, which was as expected from an institute of the stature that fulfilled the inclusion criteria of sample selection, and is not a particular organizational resource in itself. Also, limitations in terms of the chosen sample and the sample size could have led to smaller effect size, thus revealing no significant relationship between alignment with organizational values and well-being at work.

Well-being mediated the relationships between meaningful work → intention to stay and sense of community → intention to stay, but had no mediating effect in the relationship between alignment with organizational values → intention to stay (H3 partially supported; see Table III). Additional managerial efforts like spiritual leadership styles and organizational support and interventions might be required to translate the same into a favorable job outcome. Multi-group analysis of the hypothesized model revealed that few paths significantly varied across the two groups of teachers. The relationships between meaningful work → well-being and alignment with organizational values → well-being did not significantly differ among the two. However, the path coefficients between sense of community → well-being at work groups (H4 partially supported). The relationship between well-being at work → intention to stay varied among the two groups (H5 supported) and the relationships were stronger among those for whom teaching as a career choice was unintentional (Table IV). The stronger relationship between sense of community and well-being among this group of teachers could be attributed to the improved socialization experienced by them at the workplace (sense of community), which may be a stimulating factor leading to higher well-being.

Employment decisions and pathways are impacted by different contextual personal, financial, family and job-related constraints (Dill et al., 2012). Acknowledging the fact that this study did not probe further into teachers’ career preferences, the emerging relationships could in a way be attributed to their preference to remain in the current organization, as a result of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Intentional Career Choice</th>
<th>Non-intentional Career Choice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Estimate (std)</td>
<td>Estimate (std)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaningful work → Well-being at work</td>
<td>0.680***</td>
<td>0.301***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of community → Well-being at work</td>
<td>0.316***</td>
<td>0.615***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alignment with org. values → Well-being at work</td>
<td>0.150</td>
<td>0.151***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Well-being at work → Intention to stay</td>
<td>0.532***</td>
<td>0.706***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: n = 295; b = 228. **p-value < 0.05; ***p-value < 0.01

Table IV. Multi-group analysis across teachers’ career choices
opportunities for affiliation, influence and social-connection needs. Teachers, who have opted for the career unintentionally, might have apprehensions about their skills and competencies required for the profession and have a feel of insecurity, which they might have probably compensated through hard work and high involvement in community activities. Ultimately it would have resulted in a high sense of community and intention to stay with the organization. Different maintenance and environmental reasons like experiencing togetherness with co-workers could be the reason why teachers exhibit higher intention to stay with the organization (Kossek et al., 2011). Studies have suggested that factors like organizational socialization, external career opportunities and individual internal career anchors have a significant influence on an employee’s intention to stay/quit the organization (Bigliardi et al., 2005; Siedlecki et al., 2014). The findings of our study suggest that reinforcement environmental factors like sense of community at workplace build resources among employees, leading to favorable individual and organizational outcomes.

7. Theoretical and practical implications

The findings of our study are illuminative with respect to many theoretical and practical implications. The validation of the workplace spirituality-employee outcomes framework delivers a significant contribution to organizational literature, in its efforts to understand the role of workplace spirituality in organizational settings. Designing a work environment where employees have the opportunity to experience meaning and purpose in their work, sense of community through positive relationships, and alignment of personal and organizational values may be one of the most important managerial tasks of the twenty-first century of meaningful work had the utmost influence on well-being at work. This finding implies that utmost care should be taken while designing jobs, so as to enable employees' experience meaning and purpose in what they do at the workplace. Promotion of an organizational climate that nurtures interpersonal bonding among department members would help build much more well-being and intention to stay. The present work also signifies that managerial efforts should be focused toward making the workplace a community that enriches employee’s social and psychological needs for inclusion and social affiliation. Socialization programs that are designed to foster employee adjustment in the context of the workplace will prove fruitful for both the individuals and the organization alike. Since alignment with organizational values didn’t emerge as a predictor of well-being at work, additional efforts and interventions like instilling more person-environment fit and spiritual leadership styles need to be taken up by managers, as to translate alignment with organizational values into higher well-being amongst their employees. The focus should be on developing personnel programs, policies and procedures that are responsive to the disparate values of employees, and thus enabling their experience of alignment with organization.

Reflecting on the results of multi-group analysis, since teachers with non-intentional career choice had lowered effect of meaningful work to well-being, managers should conduct training programs that will enable experience of self-discovery and help teachers realize their potential and develop a passion for teaching, which in turn will be reflected in enriched well-being and intention to stay amongst them (Low et al., 2017). At the same time, since the effects of sense of community on well-being and the effects of well-being at work on intention to stay were lower among teachers with intentional career choice, managerial efforts should be focused on providing them community-building programs and training programs aimed at building enhanced constructive relationships with colleagues. Also, it is very evident that additional efforts are required to translate well-being at work into intention to stay with the organization, amongst the above mentioned group of teachers. Managers must make authentic connections with employees, help them find meaning and purpose in what they do at workplace, support them cultivate team spirit and good
inter-personal relationships in the context of workplace and align individual's deeply held values of ethics and integrity with that of the organization. Such practices can have an impact on how employees feel about their work and workplace and consequently influence how long they will choose to stay with the organization.

8. Limitations and recommendations for future research
Our study was conducted among teachers in private sector and it is recommended for future researchers to consider testing the conceptual model among a larger and more representative sample of teachers, inclusive of teachers in public sector institutions. Also, the role of various demographic factors in influencing the relationships was not taken into consideration and future studies may investigate the role of gender, age-group, years of teaching, etc., as moderating factors that could further explain intention to stay. Career choice was measured using a single item, which could pose potential limits to generalizability. Studies should attempt to identify the possible moderating and mediating influence of organizational variables in the relationship between alignment with organizational values and well-being at work. Finally, it is recommended for future studies to look into organizational antecedents that would stimulate experience of workplace spirituality and well-being at work.

References


Corresponding author
Nimitha Abboobaker can be contacted at: nimis540@gmail.com

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Student–university identification and loyalty through social responsibility
A cross-cultural analysis

Abdul-Nasser El-Kassar
Information Technology and Operations Management, Lebanese American University, Beirut, Lebanon
Dania Makki
Lebanese American University, Byblos, Lebanon, and
Maria Alejandra Gonzalez-Perez
Management, Universidad EAFIT, Medellin, Colombia

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to highlight the value of university social responsibility (USR) by investigating its impact on student–university identification and student loyalty. It also examines the mediating effect of student–university identification and the moderating effect of the perceived importance of USR. A comparative study is also conducted between students from two diverse cultural backgrounds.

Design/methodology/approach – An online questionnaire was administered to students of universities in two different emerging markets economies (Lebanon and Colombia). The collected data were tested by applying descriptive techniques, cluster analysis and partial least square structural equation modeling with multi-group analysis using SmartPLS3.0 software.

Findings – The findings revealed that USR affects student loyalty both directly and indirectly through student–university identification.

Research limitations/implications – Assessing the model through a more varied sample population from different cultural backgrounds would entail more universal results and the ability to generalize the causality relationship between USR and student identification and loyalty.

Originality/value – This study is a valuable addition to the scarce literature on USR and its interplay with student–university identification. It presents USR as a vital marketing tool to achieve student identification and loyalty, being key factors that impact student enrollment and retention. It also translates into a competitive advantage for higher education institutions to overcome the fierce competition in the educational market. Additionally, this research can be considered a laboratory for theory testing and theory building due to its unique context and original primary data.

Keywords Higher education, Perceived importance of USR, Student loyalty, Student–university identification, University social responsibility

Paper type Research paper

1. Introduction

Today, higher education institutions (HEIs) are experiencing a tremendous pressure and a fierce competition due to the increasing number of college students and the steady growth in the number of universities incurred in this industry. In addition, globalization and the emerging social and environmental challenges affected this industry and imposed major changes on the approach and objective of education (Nunez Chicharro and Carrillo, 2009), urging universities to reconsider their vision and procedures to respond effectively and efficiently to the social crises and environmental changes (Gonzalez-Perez et al., 2007). These strains highlight the importance of socially responsible practices and their impact on HEIs. Accordingly, university social responsibility (USR) appears as a vital tool to respond effectively to the global changes, as well as to the vicious competitiveness in the educational market (Sánchez-Hernández and Mainardes, 2016).
A university’s teaching mission goes far beyond providing the general education, knowledge and technical skills required for occupations and professions (Altbach, 2008). Universities play a key role in shaping the nation’s identity (Sullivan, 2003). Despite the importance of the USR, there is a limited academic research on USR and its effect on university stakeholders (Gonzalez-Perez, 2011; Larran-Jorge et al., 2012), even though an organization’s socially responsible behavior takes into consideration the needs and interests of all affected stakeholders (Gaete, 2009). However, there is abundant research on corporate social responsibility (CSR) that can serve as a base to tackle USR by analogy.

Many researchers examined the direct and indirect effects of CSR on several outcomes internal to the company such as employee identification, satisfaction, commitment and organizational citizenship behavior (Turker, 2006; Gonzalez-Perez, 2013; El-Kassar, Yunis and El-Khalil, 2017; El-Kassar, Messarra and El-Khalil, 2017). Also, CSR practices have been proven to affect outcomes external to the company, some of which are customer–company identification and customer loyalty (Homburg et al., 2009; Martinez and Del Bosque, 2013; Pérez and Rodriguez Del Bosque, 2015; Chen et al., 2015). However, only few have tried to assess the relationship between USR and student-related outcomes, namely student–university identification and loyalty which is believed to affect student recruitment and retention (Sánchez-Hernández and Mainardes, 2016). Therefore, there is a crucial need for further research that examines the relationship between USR and student-related outcomes to identify the constructs that are vital to students (Aldridge and Rowley, 1998; Elliott and Shin, 2002). Besides, previous research on higher education management including USR, student loyalty and satisfaction calls for cross-cultural analysis to replicate the outcomes using student populations from different cultural backgrounds to secure a greater validity and generalizability of the results (Brown and Mazzarol, 2009; Vázquez et al., 2014; Sánchez-Hernández and Mainardes, 2016).

The aim of this paper is to highlight the importance of USR concept by investigating its impact on student–university identification and loyalty. It also intends to assess the mediating effect of student–university identification on the relationship between USR and student loyalty, as well as the moderating effect of the perceived importance of USR on the model relations. In addition, a comparative analysis between students from two different cultural backgrounds is conducted. Furthermore, this research has a unique context of study as the data were collected in two culturally different emerging markets economies (Lebanon and Colombia). Besides, literature based on emerging economies other than India and China tends to be scarce (Singh et al., 2017; Singh and Gaur, 2009, 2013). Therefore, this study with its distinctive contexts and original primary data could be considered a laboratory for both theory testing and theory building.

This study constitutes a fundamental contribution to the literature on USR and an addition to the modest number of research in this area. To the best of our knowledge, it is the first paper that tests an unexplored association between USR and student–university identification, which will also be presented as a mediator to the relationship between USR and student loyalty. Additionally, it examines the moderating effect of the perceived importance of USR on the proposed conceptual model. The research is also a primary comprehensive paper that validates the antecedents of student loyalty through a cross-cultural analysis (Brown and Mazzarol, 2009; Vázquez et al., 2014; Sánchez-Hernández and Mainardes, 2016), thus generating universal results with a greater validity.

The remainder of this paper is organized as follows: a background on the concepts related to this study is provided in Section 2. The theoretical framework is presented in Section 3, along with the development of the conceptual model and hypotheses to be tested. The research methodology is described in Section 4 and the data analysis results and interpretations are given in Section 5. The discussion, limitations and suggestions for future research are provided in Section 6.
2. Literature review

Nowadays, HEIs are liable to the society and the market needs as never before. They ought to find a balance between the academic environment and the public interest (Altbach, 2008), where fulfilling the society’s expectations from higher education has become necessary to survive and prosper.

Currently, the role of universities goes beyond providing academic services (Altbach, 2008) to building socially responsible generations that embrace sustainable and environmental practices as well as the interest of the community at large. Consequently, USR emerged in higher education as a new paradigm (Giuffré and Ratto, 2014) that impacts different internal and external stakeholders. However, students remain the keystone of the educational system and the primary stakeholder directly affected by university’s socially responsible behaviors, which influence students’ experiences and attitudes.

Furthermore, HEIs are considered service providers and they apply many principles that govern the services industry (Vázquez et al., 2014), where some researchers consider customer–company identification as one of the main positive consequences of CSR image (Salmones et al., 2005; Martínez and Del Bosque, 2013). Recently, more customers are making purchasing decisions based on their perception of the company’s ethical and socially responsible initiatives (Grimmer and Bingham, 2013). According to Bhattacharya and Sen (2003), this relation between the company and its customers is governed by the social identity theory (SIT) developed by Tajfel and Turner (1979). Social identity is the way an individual identifies himself in line with his perception of the social group he belongs to or he identifies with. It serves as a base through which customers define themselves, identify with the company and build a solid customer–company relationship according to the attractiveness of the offered social identity and the extent to which it satisfies one or more major “self-definitional needs” (Bhattacharya and Sen, 2003). In this regard, many studies tackled the relationship between CSR and customer–company identification (Pérez and Rodríguez Del Bosque, 2015; Chen et al., 2015). However, in the higher education industry, some studies concluded that students are giving more attention to USR (Ali and Ali, 2016), yet there is scarcity of research examining students’ perception of USR and its effect on student–university identification.

On the other hand, previous research revealed that CSR can affect loyalty (Maignan and Ferrell, 2001; Sureshchandar et al., 2001; Pérez and Rodríguez Del Bosque, 2015). In fact, an increasing number of customers value socially responsible behaviors, which leads to a stronger commitment toward the organization and greater loyalty (Maignan et al., 1999). The importance of this outcome as a result of social responsibility practices reinforces the need for further research to evaluate a similar effect on USR and student loyalty.

In addition, several studies indicated that employees’ attitudes toward their organizations are influenced by their perception of CSR (Turker, 2006, 2009). Accordingly, the organization’s socially responsible initiatives appear to be more impactful on employees who highly value CSR compared to those who perceive it of low importance (El-Kassar, Messarra and El-Khalil, 2017). This perception leads to a greater employee identification (Bhattacharya et al., 2007) and loyalty (Ali et al., 2010; Zhu et al., 2014).

3. Conceptual model and hypotheses

3.1 USR and student–university identification

Since people aspire to achieve a positive self-image (Tajfel and Turner, 1985), employees and customers tend to relate to firms showing shared values and desired attributes. Accordingly, CSR activities appeared to enhance employee–company identification (Kim et al., 2010). Also, empirical studies showed a positive relationship between CSR
and customer–company identification (Marin and Ruiz, 2007). By analogy to these relationships, we assume a similar relationship between USR and student–university identification and we propose the following hypothesis:

\[ H1. \] Perceived USR is directly and positively related to student–university identification.

3.2 Student–university identification and loyalty
Ahearn et al. (2005) validated customer–company identification and its positive consequences on customers’ behaviors. More specifically, those who strongly identify with a company tend to buy more and to recommend the company and its services or products, which can be translated into greater customer satisfaction and loyalty. This result is supported by both the organizational identification theory (Cheney and Tompkins, 1987) and the SIT. Organizational identification, which is the tendency of an individual to identify with his organization, is linked to main organizational outcomes that comprise employee loyalty and retention (Ashforth et al., 2008). Moreover, according to the SIT, the group identification always includes an emotional component (Homburg et al., 2009). Identification with the company occurs when customers exhibit positive views and emotions toward the company. Since most of the research focused mainly on customer loyalty as a direct outcome for the customer–company identification (Abdeen et al., 2016; Ahearn et al., 2005; Lichtenstein et al., 2004), we suppose a positive association between student–university identification and student loyalty leading to the following hypothesis:

\[ H2. \] Student–university identification directly and positively affects student loyalty.

3.3 USR and student loyalty
Previous studies showed that CSR can affect loyalty (Maignment and Ferrell, 2001; Sureshchandar et al., 2001). In fact, socially responsible behaviors contribute to enhancing customers’ trust (Aaker, 1996; Maignment et al., 1999) that stems directly from the service consumption, and indirectly from the firm’s reputation (Delgado Ballester and Munera Alemán, 2001), leading to customers’ stronger commitment toward the organization. Furthermore, researchers discerned an increased number of customers keen to purchase goods and services from firms engaged in social causes (Gaur et al., 2015; Jones, 1997; Ross et al., 1992). Customers value these efforts and reward the firm with greater loyalty (Maignment et al., 1999). Therefore, we posit the following hypothesis:

\[ H3. \] USR is directly and positively related to student loyalty.

Recent studies have demonstrated the mediating role of employee–organization identification on the relationship between CSR and favorable outcomes such as commitment and organization citizenship behavior (El-Kassar, Yunis and El-Khalil, 2017; El-Kassar, Messarra and El-Khalil, 2017). In an analogous manner, student–university identification plays a mediating role in the relationship between USR and student loyalty. Accordingly, we posit the following:

\[ H4. \] The relationship between USR and student loyalty is mediated by student–university identification.

The above-stated relationships can be illustrated by the conceptual model shown in Figure 1.

4. Research methodology
4.1 Participants
Data were collected through a structured questionnaire adapted from previously developed scales with tested validity and reliability. It was sent by e-mail to all currently enrolled
students in two private universities located in two different countries: The Lebanese American University (LAU) in Lebanon and Universidad EAFIT in Colombia.

For Lebanon, the questionnaire was in English language only; no Arabic version was needed since English is the adopted instruction language at LAU. As for Colombia, the questionnaire was translated to Spanish and revised by a professional to ensure accurate translation, and consequently a better understanding of the questions and more reliable responses. The administered survey returned 690 responses from Lebanon out of which 429 were complete and deemed usable. As for Colombia, it resulted in 190 complete and usable responses. Accordingly, the analysis was conducted on a total of 619 questionnaires complete and usable from both populations.

Respondents comprised 370 females (59.8 percent) and 249 males (40.2 percent), with 1 percent aged 17 years (6 students), 35.5 percent of them aged 18–19 years (220 students); the rest were distributed as follows: 20 years old (18.4 percent), 21 years old (14.7 percent), 22 years old (10 percent), 23 years old (8.4 percent), 24 years old (4 percent) and 25 years old and above (7.5 percent). Undergraduate students represented the greater portion (92.4 percent) corresponding to 572 students of the sample population, and 47 graduate students (7.6 percent).

4.2 Measures
The survey comprises three parts in addition to demographic questions, and is based on a five-point Likert scale with responses ranging from 1 (very low) to 5 (very high) or from 1 (strongly disagree) to 5 (strongly agree).

The demographic section includes questions such as gender, age and class level as suggested in Ho et al. (2017). The first part covers 11 items adopted from Burcea and Marinescu (2011) to measure perceived USR toward students (6 items) and toward society (5 items).

The second part adapted from Mael and Ashforth (1992) contains seven items to evaluate student–university identification with questions such as “I strongly identify with my university” and “I like to tell that I am a student at my university”.

The last part of the survey is comprised of three items measuring student loyalty adapted from the scale developed by Homburg and Giering (2001).

5. Results
The proposed conceptual model was tested using SmartPLS3.0 software for all the latent constructs (USR, student–university identification and student loyalty). The parceling method was applied by combining USR toward students and toward society into one construct, then the analysis of the first model was performed accordingly.

The parceling method was used to transform the higher-order, multidimensional USR construct into a first-order latent construct (see Bagozzi and Edwards, 1998; Coffman and MacCallum, 2005). The parcels are composite scores used to decrease the total number of observed variables, or indicators, measuring USR (Aluja-Fabregat and Blanch, 2004). The parcels were obtained by averaging the scores of items measuring USR toward

---

**Figure 1.**
The conceptual model
students and society. By using these parcels as indicators, USR becomes a first-order latent construct (Landis et al., 2000).

When testing relationships among latent factors, the use of parceling offers estimation and psychometric benefits (Little et al., 2002). In fact, data based on individual items compared with data based on aggregate scores result in “lower reliability, lower communality, a smaller ratio of common-to-unique factor variance, and a greater likelihood of distributional violations” (Little et al., 2002, p. 154). Landis et al. (2000) indicate that sample size limitations can be avoided through the use of parceling. Little et al. (2002) propose that by using parcelled items, the structural model becomes more parsimonious.

5.1 Model 1
Outer model analysis. Model 1 was tested by examining the reliability and the discriminant validity of the three latent constructs (USR, student–university identification and loyalty) as shown in Tables I and II. In the process of validating the measurement, a confirmatory factor analysis was conducted on each set of items used to test USR (11 items), student–university identification (7 items) and student loyalty (3 items). Almost all the items scored a significant loading (greater than 0.7), except for one item related to student identification which was excluded. The significant factor loadings confirm the convergent validity of the three constructs.

Also, the achieved values of the average variance extracted (AVE) for student–university identification, student loyalty and USR constructs are 0.688, 0.767 and 0.914, respectively. In fact, these values are above 68 percent, thus surpassing the required 50 percent (Fornell and Larker, 1981). Finally, Cronbach’s $\alpha$ and Dillon-Goldstein’s $\rho$ for the three factors exceed the minimum limit of 0.6 (Nunnally and Bernstein, 1994) confirming the high-scale reliability of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Manifest variables label</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Standardized loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student–university identification</td>
<td>STUIDF1</td>
<td>I strongly identify with my university</td>
<td>0.872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STUIDF2</td>
<td>I feel good to be a student at my university</td>
<td>0.906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STUIDF3</td>
<td>I like to tell that I am a student at my university</td>
<td>0.884</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STUIDF4</td>
<td>I feel attached to my university</td>
<td>0.882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STUIDF5</td>
<td>When someone criticizes my university, it feels like a personal insult</td>
<td>0.767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STUIDF6</td>
<td>I am very interested in what others think about my university</td>
<td>0.634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student loyalty</td>
<td>STULOY1</td>
<td>I recommend my university to others</td>
<td>0.899</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STULOY2</td>
<td>I continue graduate studies at my university if the major/degree I require is offered</td>
<td>0.850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>STULOY3</td>
<td>I come back and join my university alumni chapters</td>
<td>0.879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USR toward society</td>
<td>USRSOC</td>
<td>I strongly identify with my university</td>
<td>0.954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USR toward students</td>
<td>USRSTU</td>
<td>I feel attached to my university</td>
<td>0.958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table I. Outer model loadings and construct reliability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Manifest variables label</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Cronbach’s $\alpha$</th>
<th>Composite reliability</th>
<th>Average variance extracted (AVE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.830</td>
<td>0.907</td>
<td>0.906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STULOY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.802</td>
<td>0.849</td>
<td>0.860</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.589</td>
<td>0.906</td>
<td>0.908</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table II. Discriminant validity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the proposed constructs. Moreover, the scale’s validity is demonstrated as the diagonal entries of the discriminant validity matrix, shown in Table II, are larger than the entries in their respective rows or columns.

**Inner model analysis.** The inner model analysis showed an $R^2 = 0.347$ for student identification and 0.684 for student loyalty, which confirms that the proposed model can explain a considerable part of the variance of these constructs. According to Chin (1998), this model’s validity is deemed satisfactory.

The outer loading and the values of path coefficients are depicted in Figure 2. The path coefficients and their significance, listed in Table III, revealed that USR has a significant direct impact on student–university identification (reg. coeff. std. = 0.589, $p$-value = 0.0000) and student loyalty (reg. coeff. std. = 0.249, $p$-value = 0.0000) which confirms $H1$ and $H3$. Accordingly, USR significantly affects student identification, which in turn positively and directly impacts student loyalty (reg. coeff. std. = 0.655, $p$-value = 0.0000) supporting $H2$.

Also, USR exhibits a positive indirect effect on student loyalty with a $p$-value = 0.0000 (Table III) which supports $H4$. The results show that student identification partially mediates the relationship between USR and student loyalty.

**Discussion.** HEIs play a vital role in promoting socially responsible culture that affects students’ experiences and directs their focus toward societal and public interest. This research explores the proposed relationships between USR and student–university identification and loyalty. Data analysis results confirmed that USR has a positive and

---

**Figure 2.** Results of the conceptual model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Original sample (O)</th>
<th>Sample mean (M)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>$t$-statistics (O/SD)</th>
<th>$p$-values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Path coefficients: direct effects</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF → STULOY</td>
<td>0.655</td>
<td>0.655</td>
<td>0.029</td>
<td>22.650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USR → STUIDF</td>
<td>0.589</td>
<td>0.589</td>
<td>0.031</td>
<td>18.948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USR → STULOY</td>
<td>0.635</td>
<td>0.635</td>
<td>0.028</td>
<td>22.830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Path coefficients: indirect effects</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USR → STULOY</td>
<td>0.386</td>
<td>0.386</td>
<td>0.024</td>
<td>15.959</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table III.** Model 1 path coefficients
significant impact on student–university identification, which validates H1 and aligns with the findings of previous CSR research that links it to customer–company identification (Marin and Ruiz, 2007; Kim et al., 2010) where students represent the company customers. Moreover, the results are supported by the SIT. Adopting socially responsible initiatives grants the university a better image and reputation. Since students perceive themselves as part of the university they belong to, they tend to identify more with it based on the attractiveness of its social identity. Accordingly, students’ perception of socially responsible behaviors practiced by the HEI appears as a strong determinant of student identification with the university.

Results also affirmed a positive and significant relationship between USR and student loyalty. This outcome confirms H3, in consistency with researchers’ findings noting an increased number of customers who value the firm’s engagement in social causes (Ross et al., 1992; Jones, 1997), and who reward it with a stronger loyalty (Maignan et al., 1999). Similarly, students perceive and appreciate USR initiatives undertaken by universities, yielding a direct effect on student loyalty.

This study also validated student–university identification as a strong determinant of loyalty. Previous research indicated that customer–company identification has positive consequences on customers’ behaviors (Ahearn et al., 2005). Other studies considered customer loyalty as a direct outcome for customer–company identification (Ahearn et al., 2005; Lichtenstein et al., 2004). When identifying with the company, customers are likely to increase their purchase and to recommend the company’s services or products, which convert into greater satisfaction and loyalty. Likewise, students who identify with their universities tend to recommend them more and exhibit a greater loyalty. This outcome is supported by the social identity and the organizational identification theories. According to the SIT, exhibiting positive views and emotions toward the university leads students to identify with it. Additionally, organizational identification is associated with key organizational outcomes that include employee loyalty (Ashforth et al., 2008). In the academic setting, it represents the students’ sense of belonging and membership that translates into loyalty. Accordingly, there is a positive direct association between student–university identification and loyalty, which supports H2. The results also show that student identification partially mediates the relationship between USR and student loyalty implying the presence of other factors that can play a mediating role.

5.2 Model 2
Following the analysis of the first model using the combined USR dimensions, it becomes clear that exploring the above model in terms of each of the USR dimensions and loyalty yields additional insight into the proposed relationships. Consequently, the USR construct was split into two dimensions (USR toward students and toward society). The analysis was then conducted to test the below sub-hypotheses depicted in the new model (Figure 3):

H1a. USR toward students directly and positively affects student–university identification.

H1b. USR toward society directly and positively affects student–university identification.

---

**Figure 3.**
The conceptual model in terms of the 2 sub-dimensions of USR
H2. Student–university identification directly and positively affects student loyalty.

H3a. USR toward students directly and positively affects student loyalty.

H3b. USR toward society directly and positively affects student loyalty.

H4a. Student identification mediates the relationship between USR toward students and loyalty.

H4b. Student identification mediates the relationship between USR toward society and loyalty.

Outer model analysis. The four constructs in Model 2 (USR toward students, USR toward society, student–university identification and loyalty) were analyzed by examining the reliability and discriminant validity. Almost all the items scored significant factor loadings well above the threshold of 0.7, see Table IV. This led to the removal of that particular item to ensure the convergent validity of the constructs.

The AVE for student–university identification (AVE = 0.688), student loyalty (AVE = 0.767), USR toward society (AVE = 0.725) and USR toward students (AVE = 0.683) exceeded the required 0.5 (Fornell and Larker, 1981). Also, the reliability of the four constructs was well confirmed (Table IV) with Cronbach’s $\alpha$ and Dillon-Goldstein’s $\rho$ way above 0.6 (Nunnally and Bernstein, 1994; Gaur and Gaur, 2009). The discriminant validity matrix depicted in Table V supports the scale’s validity as the diagonal entries are larger than the entries in their respective rows or columns.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manifest variables label</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Standardized loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF1</td>
<td>I strongly identify with my university</td>
<td>0.872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF2</td>
<td>I feel good to be a student at my university</td>
<td>0.906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF3</td>
<td>I like to tell that I am a student at my university</td>
<td>0.884</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF4</td>
<td>I feel attached to my university</td>
<td>0.882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF5</td>
<td>When someone criticizes my university, it feels like a personal insult</td>
<td>0.767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF6</td>
<td>I am very interested in what others think about my university</td>
<td>0.633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STULOY1</td>
<td>I recommend my university to others</td>
<td>0.899</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STULOY2</td>
<td>I continue graduate studies at my university if the major/degree I require is offered</td>
<td>0.849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STULOY3</td>
<td>I come back and join my university alumni chapters</td>
<td>0.879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSOC1</td>
<td>My university is committed to other stakeholders’ welfare (staff, faculty, suppliers, NGOs, etc.)</td>
<td>0.829</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSOC2</td>
<td>My university contributes financially to social responsibility activities directed toward society</td>
<td>0.864</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSOC3</td>
<td>My university conducts workshops/conferences/lectures to increase awareness of social responsibility</td>
<td>0.828</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSOC4</td>
<td>My university encourages employees’ efforts (staff and faculty) for social responsibility related activities</td>
<td>0.872</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSOC5</td>
<td>My university’s socially responsibility initiatives are satisfactory</td>
<td>0.863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSTU2</td>
<td>My university participates in environmental protection programs (recycling, tree plantation, etc.)</td>
<td>0.809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSTU3</td>
<td>My university has a fair system of complaints</td>
<td>0.835</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSTU4</td>
<td>My university has cooperation agreements with other institutes to improve education quality</td>
<td>0.766</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSTU5</td>
<td>My university encourages students to participate in social responsibility related activities</td>
<td>0.850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSTU6</td>
<td>My university contributes financially to social responsibility activities directed toward students</td>
<td>0.869</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table IV. Model 2 outer loadings and construct reliability
In the inner model analysis (Figure 4), student identification and student loyalty achieved an $R^2 = 0.357$ and 0.684, respectively, affirming that the validity of Model 2 is satisfactory (Chin, 1998).

Figure 4 shows that student identification has a strong significant effect on student loyalty (reg. coeff. std. = 0.653, $p$-value = 0.0000), supporting $H2$. Furthermore, USR toward students has a positive direct impact on both student identification (reg. coeff. std. = 0.416, $p$-value = 0.0000) and student loyalty (reg. coeff. std. = 0.160, $p$-value = 0.0000), which confirms $H1a$ and $H3a$. However, USR toward society appears to have less impact on student loyalty (reg. coeff. std. = 0.101, $p$-value = 0.024), as well as on student identification (reg. coeff. std. = 0.206, $p$-value = 0.004). Nonetheless, the results indicate that these effects are significant and $H3b$ and $H1b$ are supported.

Moreover, the results indicate that student–university identification partially mediates the relationship between USR toward students and loyalty. This partial mediation is confirmed through the significant direct effect shown in Table VI, with a reg. coeff. std. = 0.160, $p$-value = 0.0000. The indirect effect is also significant (reg. coeff. std. = 0.272, $p$-value = 0.0000), thus supporting $H4a$. Similar results are obtained for $H4b$.

Discussion. Consistent with the SIT, the results of Model 2 confirmed that USR toward students positively and significantly affects student–university identification. The engagement of the university in socially responsible practices leads to a better connection and a greater identification with the institution, which supports $H1a$. Similarly, $H3a$ is confirmed with a
strong positive relationship between USR toward students and loyalty. Students appear more interested in socially responsible behaviors practiced toward them, which they reward with a greater sense of loyalty toward their institution (Maigran et al., 1999). Hence, USR toward students can be considered a strong determinant of student–university identification and student loyalty.

As for USR toward society, the analysis confirmed its relation with student identification and loyalty. However, this relationship is less significant compared to USR toward students; these findings support $H1b$ and $H3b$. Unsurprisingly, students better perceive and are more receptive of socially responsible actions directed toward them than toward society.

Moreover, the partial mediation effect of student–university identification on the relationship between USR toward students and loyalty as well as USR toward society and loyalty reflects the presence of other factors that affect student loyalty.

5.3 Multi-group analysis

Multi-group analysis by gender. A multi-group analysis by gender revealed differences in the significance in the relationships between USR toward society and student–university identification, USR toward society and student loyalty and USR toward students and student loyalty.

Table VII reveals that the effect of USR toward society on student–university identification was significant for the female students ($p$-value = 0.006) and not significant for the male students ($p$-value = 0.214). This suggests that female students are sensitive to university’s socially responsible acts toward society, which leads to identification with their universities, while male students’ identification with their universities is not affected by USR toward society.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path coefficients: direct effects</th>
<th>Original sample (O)</th>
<th>Sample mean (M)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>$t$-statistics ($O/SD$)</th>
<th>$p$-values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$\text{STUIDF} \rightarrow \text{STULOY}$</td>
<td>0.653</td>
<td>0.651</td>
<td>0.029</td>
<td>22.598</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\text{USRSOC} \rightarrow \text{STUIDF}$</td>
<td>0.206</td>
<td>0.206</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>2.864</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\text{USRSOC} \rightarrow \text{STULOY}$</td>
<td>0.101</td>
<td>0.101</td>
<td>0.045</td>
<td>2.287</td>
<td>0.024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\text{USRSTU} \rightarrow \text{STUIDF}$</td>
<td>0.416</td>
<td>0.418</td>
<td>0.066</td>
<td>6.269</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\text{USRSTU} \rightarrow \text{STULOY}$</td>
<td>0.160</td>
<td>0.162</td>
<td>0.044</td>
<td>3.669</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table VI. Model 2 path coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path coefficients: indirect effects</th>
<th>Original sample (O)</th>
<th>Sample mean (M)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>$t$-statistics ($O/SD$)</th>
<th>$p$-values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$\text{USRSOC} \rightarrow \text{STULOY}$</td>
<td>0.135</td>
<td>0.134</td>
<td>0.047</td>
<td>2.839</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\text{USRSTU} \rightarrow \text{STULOY}$</td>
<td>0.272</td>
<td>0.272</td>
<td>0.044</td>
<td>6.109</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table VII. Multi-group analysis by gender – direct and indirect effects
Moreover, the direct effect of USR toward society on student loyalty is not significant for female students \((p\text{-value} = 0.417)\), while it is significant for male students \((p\text{-value} = 0.018)\). This indicates that female student loyalty toward university cannot be directly achieved by socially responsible practices toward society, but rather through student–university identification, as the indirect effect is significant \((p\text{-value} = 0.007)\), see Table VII. As for male student, the indirect effect is not significant \((p\text{-value} = 0.211)\). Hence, for male students, loyalty can be attained directly through socially responsible practices toward society, but not through student–university identification.

Furthermore, the direct effect of USR toward students on student loyalty is significant for female students \((p\text{-value} = 0.001)\) but not significant for male students \((p\text{-value} = 0.134)\). Thus, for female students, practicing USR toward students leads to student loyalty both directly and through identification with the university. However, for male students, loyalty is not achieved directly by USR practices toward students, but rather through student–university identification. This result is confirmed through the significant indirect effect of USR toward students on male student loyalty \((p\text{-value} = 0.0000)\), as shown in Table VII.

Multi-group analysis by country. The multi-group analysis by country (Table VIII) also revealed differences in the significance for the following relationships: USR toward society and student loyalty, USR toward students and student–university identification and USR toward students and student loyalty.

Table VIII indicates that the direct effect of USR toward society on student loyalty is not significant for Colombian students \((p\text{-value} = 0.824)\), while it is significant for Lebanese students \((p\text{-value} = 0.039)\). Hence, USR toward society impacts Lebanese students’ loyalty but not Colombian students’ loyalty toward their university.

Similarly, the direct effect of USR toward students on identification is not significant for Colombian students \((p\text{-value} = 0.300)\), while it is highly significant for Lebanese students \((p\text{-value} = 0.000)\). This suggests that Colombian students’ identification with the university cannot be attained by socially responsible practices toward them. It is achieved through USR toward Lebanese students.

Furthermore, the effect of USR toward students on student loyalty is marginally significant for Colombian students \((p\text{-value} = 0.070)\), but not significant for Lebanese students \((p\text{-value} = 0.105)\). Thus, for Colombian students, practicing USR toward them leads to loyalty directly \((p\text{-value} = 0.070)\), and not through identification, as the indirect effect is not significant \((p\text{-value} = 0.295)\). However, for Lebanese students, loyalty is not achieved directly \((p\text{-value} = 0.105)\) but rather through identification \((p\text{-value} = 0.000)\).

| Path coefficients: direct effects | Original sample (O) | SD | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------------|---------------------|----|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| STUIDF → STULOY | 0.628 | 0.716 | 0.072 | 0.031 | 8.785 | 22.801 | 0.000 | 0.000 |
| USRSOC → STUIDF | 0.451 | 0.154 | 0.141 | 0.070 | 3.186 | 2.192 | 0.001 | 0.029 |
| USRSOC → STULOY | 0.023 | 0.098 | 0.101 | 0.048 | 0.223 | 2.071 | 0.039 | 0.039 |
| USRSTU → STUIDF | 0.133 | 0.459 | 0.128 | 0.064 | 1.038 | 7.143 | 0.295 | 0.000 |
| USRSTU → STULOY | 0.173 | 0.081 | 0.095 | 0.050 | 1.812 | 1.621 | 0.070 | 0.105 |

| Path coefficients: indirect effects | Original sample (O) | SD | | | | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------|----|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| USRSOC → STULOY | 0.283 | 0.110 | 0.100 | 0.050 | 2.821 | 2.192 | 0.006 | 0.029 |
| USRSTU → STULOY | 0.084 | 0.329 | 0.080 | 0.048 | 1.047 | 6.827 | 0.295 | 0.000 |
We can draw from the above that USR toward Colombian students directly affects their loyalty, while USR toward society has an indirect effect through identification; the latter fully mediates this relationship.

As for Lebanese students, it is the USR toward students that indirectly affects their loyalty, with student–university identification fully mediating this relationship. Also, USR toward society leads to loyalty directly and indirectly through student identification, hence, partially mediating the relationship between USR toward society and student loyalty.

It is also worth mentioning that USR toward society has a greater impact on Colombian students' identification (reg. coeff. std. = 0.451) compared to the impact of USR toward students (reg. coeff. std. = 0.133). However, USR toward Lebanese students has the greater effect on student–university identification (reg. coeff. std. = 0.459) in comparison to a lower impact of USR toward society (reg. coeff. std. = 0.154).

In fact, most Latin American populations have a strong collectivistic element. According to Geert Hofstede, the founder of comparative intercultural research who developed the first empirical model of “dimensions” of national culture, Colombia scored one of the lowest individualistic scores out of all the countries in the world (13 out of 100 on the Hofstede model for individualism). It is considered one of the most collectivistic cultures, with the society maintaining a high degree of interdependence among its members. Parents raise their children to value the role of the family in providing support and maintaining unity. They are taught to care for the welfare of all family members rather than to attend to their own personal interests which explains the greater impact of social responsibility initiatives toward society on Colombian students.

As for Lebanon, it scored higher than Colombia on Hofstede’s model for individualism (40 out of 100), indicating a lower level of collectivism. Children are raised to believe that they are members of a family and are not considered independent individuals. However, their individualism, self-centeredness and selfishness are well nurtured. Raising narcissistic children in a small country like Lebanon which continuously faces many external pressures and influences is becoming an epidemic. This can explain the discrepancy between Colombian and Lebanese students' sensitivity and response to socially responsible practices toward them or toward society.

Perceived importance of USR. Several studies indicated that employees' perception of CSR shapes their attitudes toward their organizations. Thus, those who value CSR and perceive it as highly important are directly and positively affected by the CSR practices of their organizations (El-Kassar, Messarra and El-Khalil, 2017). This perception leads to a greater employee identification (Bhattacharya et al., 2007), satisfaction and loyalty (Ali et al., 2010; Zhu et al., 2014), and to lower turnover rates (Brammer et al., 2007). By analogy to the relationship between CSR and employee identification and loyalty as well as the effect of the perceived importance of CSR on these relations, we assume that the higher the perceived importance of USR, the greater the student identification and loyalty. Consequently, we posit the following hypothesis:

**H5.** Students' perception of the importance of USR moderates the relationships among USR, identification and loyalty.

To test H5, the sample population was divided into two groups according to students' perception of the importance of social responsibility. Cluster analysis was performed to identify the two groups of students who view USR of high importance (group 1) or low importance (group 2). A multi-group analysis was then conducted to test the differences in the significance of the relationships between USR toward society and student–university identification, USR toward society and student loyalty and USR toward students and student loyalty.
As shown in Table IX, the effect of USR toward society on student identification was significant for those who perceived social responsibility of high importance ($p$-value = 0.002), and not significant for those who perceived it of low importance ($p$-value = 0.842). Apparently, students who grant high importance to social responsibility are more likely to be affected by socially responsible actions toward society, leading to a higher level of identification with their university. However, no significant influence of socially responsible actions toward society on identification was found for the second group.

Additionally, the direct effect of USR toward society on student loyalty is not significant for students with high perception of SR ($p$-value = 0.519), while it is significant for students with low perception ($p$-value = 0.004), which indicates that student–university identification fully mediates the relationship between USR toward society and student loyalty for students that highly perceive social responsibility. On the other hand, identification does not mediate the relationship between USR toward society and loyalty for those who perceive USR as less important. Therefore, loyalty for these students can only be achieved directly by USR toward society.

As for USR toward students, a direct positive impact was found to affect student loyalty for students with high perception of SR ($p$-value = 0.000). In addition, a significant positive impact was found on student identification for this group. Hence, USR toward students leads to student loyalty either directly or indirectly through student–university identification. Consequently, identification partially mediates this relationship. The effect of USR toward students on identification was also found significant for the group with low perception of SR ($p$-value = 0.000). However, the direct effect was not found significant ($p$-value = 0.309). Thus, student–university identification fully mediates the relationship between USR toward students and loyalty for students with low perception of SR.

In summary, the perception of SR among students moderates the relationships among USR, identification and loyalty as the significance of the relationships differ between those who perceive SR of high or low importance.

6. Implications, limitations and recommendations

The main purpose of this study is to highlight the importance of USR through examining its relationship with student–university identification and student loyalty which are two important and highly regarded outcomes that support universities’ efforts to survive and succeed. The findings revealed that USR affects student loyalty both directly and indirectly through student–university identification. Consequently, student–university identification mediates the relationship between USR and student loyalty. Furthermore, when the two dimensions of USR, toward students and toward society, were taken into consideration, the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path coefficients: direct effects</th>
<th>Original sample (O)</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-statistics (O/SD)</th>
<th>p-values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High IMP</td>
<td>Low IMP</td>
<td>High IMP</td>
<td>Low IMP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STUIDF → STULOY</td>
<td>0.674</td>
<td>0.632</td>
<td>0.033</td>
<td>0.047</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSOC → STUIDF</td>
<td>0.285</td>
<td>0.020</td>
<td>0.091</td>
<td>0.099</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSOC → STULOY</td>
<td>0.034</td>
<td>0.221</td>
<td>0.052</td>
<td>0.077</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSTU → STUIDF</td>
<td>0.381</td>
<td>0.469</td>
<td>0.085</td>
<td>0.100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSTU → STULOY</td>
<td>0.205</td>
<td>0.074</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>0.073</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table IX. Multi-group analysis by perceived importance of USR – direct and indirect effects

Path coefficients: indirect effects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>High IMP</th>
<th>Low IMP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>USRSOC → STULOY</td>
<td>0.192</td>
<td>0.012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USRSTU → STULOY</td>
<td>0.257</td>
<td>0.297</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
same results were obtained. However, when students were grouped according to gender, country and perception of the importance of USR, significant differences in the relationships were found.

Multi-group analysis by gender indicated differences in the significance of the relationships. For female students, practicing USR toward students leads to loyalty both directly and through identification with the university. However, for male students, loyalty is not achieved directly by USR practices toward students, but rather through identification. Similarly, due to cultural differences, grouping by country also resulted in differences in the significance of the relationships. Colombian students were more affected by USR toward society, while USR toward students led to a greater effect among Lebanese students. As per Hofstede’s model of individualism, this discrepancy may be attributed to the fact that the society in Colombia is considered more collectivistic when compared to the individualistic society in Lebanon.

Cluster analysis was used to group students according to their perceived importance of USR. Significant differences in these relationships were identified. In particular, students who perceive social responsibility of high importance are more affected by socially responsible actions toward society leading to student–university identification, which in turn leads to loyalty. However, for students who perceive SR of low importance, loyalty can be achieved directly through USR toward society and not through identification. Hence, for these students, the relationship between USR toward society and loyalty is partially mediated by identification. This suggests that other factors such as student satisfaction, university image and service quality may explain the relationship between USR toward society and loyalty. However, USR toward students does not affect students with low perception of SR directly, but rather through student–university identification, which fully mediates this relationship.

USR in its two dimensions leads to student loyalty directly or through student identification regardless of differences in gender, country or perceived importance of USR. However, these factors influence the significance of the relationships among USR toward students, USR toward society, student identification and loyalty.

The proposed model and the deduced effects and relationships have vital practical implications, since managers of HEIs can take advantage of identifying the drivers that affect student loyalty. It will help them make informed decisions and direct their efforts toward the factors that mostly influence the desired outcomes. They can design and implement social responsibility programs and activities targeted toward students or toward society, while taking into account the effect of the gender, the level of individualism/collectivism of the society, and the perceived importance of SR on achieving student loyalty.

Accordingly, USR appears to be a pivotal marketing tool to meet the main internal stakeholders’ needs and to achieve student identification and loyalty, being key factors that impact student enrollment and retention (Ashforth et al., 2008). This translates into a competitive advantage that will leverage universities’ efforts to defeat market competitiveness.

In addition, HEIs cannot escape the impact of global environmental and social challenges, nor their role in responding to these changes. This objective can be achieved by implementing ethical and socially responsible practices and values into their “management, teaching, research and extension” (Giuffré and Ratto, 2014), which will optimize their contribution to building sustainable societies.

This study is a valuable contribution to the scarce literature on USR and the lack of research on the interplay between USR and student–university identification. It establishes USR as an antecedent to student–university identification and loyalty. This, in turn, translates into a vital marketing tool that can enhance universities’ recruitment and retention efforts (Sánchez-Hernández and Mainardes, 2016). In addition, this study was conducted in unique and distinct contexts in two countries considered as emerging...
economies, and it relies on original primary data. Thus, it can serve as a laboratory for both theory testing and theory building (Singh et al., 2017; Singh and Gaur, 2009, 2013). Moreover, the cross-cultural analysis performed between two countries from diverse cultural backgrounds validates the results.

Nonetheless, this paper has some limitations. Since some of the outcomes can be attributed to the university’s culture, assessing the model through a more varied sample population from different cultural backgrounds would entail more universal results and the ability to generalize the causality relationship between USR and student identification and loyalty. In addition, the partial mediation effect on the relationship between USR and student loyalty reveals the presence of other determinants for student loyalty. Therefore, there is a crucial need for further studies that tackle the relationship between USR and other antecedents to detect factors which are vital to students (Aldridge and Rowley, 1998; Elliott and Shin, 2002).

To conclude, USR can no longer be disregarded by academics and university administrators. Further research in this area is required to deepen knowledge of USR and its impact on students’ attitudes and perceptions of university-related outcomes such as perception of university image and quality of service, as well as student satisfaction. Such understanding will eventually determine the practical applications and inferences that will support the HEIs’ survival and progress.

References


**Further reading**


Barakat, H. (1977), Lebanon in Strife: Student Preludes to the Civil War, University of Texas Press, Austin, TX.


Corresponding author
Abdul-Nasser El-Kassar can be contacted at: abdulnasser.kassar@lau.edu.lb

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website:

www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm

Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Role of virtues in the relationship between shame and tendency to plagiarise

Study in the context of higher education

Deepika Pandoi
GLA University, Mathura, India
Sanjaya Singh Gaur
Department of Marketing, Sunway University, Subang Jaya, Malaysia, and
Anup Kumar Gupta
GLA University, Mathura, India

Abstract

Purpose – Plagiarism is an epidemic for scholars that needs to be managed. Penalties do not seem to be able to stop people from indulging in it. Manipulation of emotions and values may help in discouraging people from plagiarism. Therefore, the purpose of this paper is to understand the association between felt emotion and plagiarism outcome behaviours. Another objective of the study is to see the role of virtues in discouraging people from plagiarism.

Design/methodology/approach – A scenario-based quasi-experimental method is used to collect the data. Graduate students from various Indian universities were invited for the experiment. The partial least square based structural equation modelling is used to test the measurement as well as path model.

Findings – The authors found that manipulated shame resulted in feelings of both international and external shame. When individuals feel internal shame, they avoid and discontinue plagiarism. They also try to repair the damage that they cause by plagiarism. However, feeling of external shame only encourages individuals to discontinue plagiarism behaviour. Virtues such as influence, competitiveness and equality weaken the relationship between internal shame and plagiarism-related outcome behaviour. At the same time, these virtues do not affect the relationship between external shame and outcome behaviours.

Practical implications – This study has important implications for the institutions of higher education. The study suggests that universities should provoke the emotion of shame through various communications to students to control the act of plagiarism by their students.

Originality/value – No study seems to have examined if the manipulation of emotions and values can help reduce the problem of plagiarism. This is an attempt towards bridging this important gap in literature. Therefore, findings of this study are of great value to scholars and content developers.

Keywords Emotions, Graduate education, Plagiarism, Virtues, Quasi-experiment

Paper type Research paper

1. Introduction

Plagiarism is the unlawful use of another author’s ideas or words and representing them as one’s genuine work. A Roman, Martial, defined the term “plagiarus”, a Latin word, which means kidnapper. Martial claimed that another poet had “kidnapped his verses”. According to Mallon (1989), “the Elizabethan playwright Ben Johnson was the first person to use the word ‘plagiary’ to mean literary theft, at the beginning of the 17th century”.

With the rise of the internet, the epidemic of plagiarism has assumed threatening propositions for the academia. This is because the universality of the “copy and paste” phenomenon has hit original contributors in the worst possible way. Novice researchers lift sentences, paragraphs and sometimes the entire paper. Simultaneously, the advent of technology has its own benefits as well. It enables the user in detecting instances of plagiarism, thanks to the advanced tools and software available. It has been a norm rather than the exception for universities to deal with this menace. Plagiarism happens when...
someone attempts to benefit from others’ works without giving due credit to the original contributor.

Legally, it is not an offence to plagiarise in several countries. However, the infringement of the copyright is a crime. There are instances when an author starts using their own work, either overall or in parts, without proper citation; specifically, while asserting to represent novel data. Such a researcher is also guilty of duplicating their own work, which is known as self-plagiarism. This leads to the duplicity of the data, which has already been used and is unethical in research parlance. An exception in this regard could be if the paper contains proper acknowledgement about re-use and citation. To use someone else's work, quotation marks to classify paragraphs and to reference the source are the norms. Just because people tend to plagiarise to varying extents, it does not mean it is ethical. It is unacceptable in any form. Academic institutions should consider four aspects, i.e., direction, competence, opportunity and motivation to enhance the performance of scholars and reduce the plagiarism (Singh, 2014). On the other hand, public shaming is one of the reprimands for plagiarism, which could be as severe as a dismissal in extreme cases. Hence, it can be said that emotion of shame could be induced in scholars to reduce plagiarism.

Thus, it becomes imperative to know the concept of plagiarism and its implications, as well as the consequences of plagiarism and the virtues that may result from it. This paper focuses on the role of emotion, especially shame, on the graduate student’s decision to plagiarise. It further includes how such behaviour can be moderated by various virtues like influence, competitiveness and equality.

Within the realms of behavioural studies, an interesting aspect related to research is the study of emotions. Rose et al. (2007) suggested that emotions are instrumental as far as the behavioural patterns and actions of individuals are concerned. Huang (2001) talked about how theories on emotions from varied disciplines like sociology and psychology have been helpful as far as developing theoretical frameworks is concerned in the marketing arena thus leading to the understanding of the role of emotions in consumer behaviour. As per Rose et al. (2007), when it comes to predicting human behaviour, emotions are one of the most valuable and reliable aspects. In this regard, Gaur et al. (2014) conducted a systematic review of the extant literature and identified five contemporary areas – marketing, advertising, consumer behaviour, consumer psychology and retailing which have witnessed researchers carrying out research related to emotions. They concluded in their study that consumer behaviour could be predicted quite reliably thanks to human emotions.

In the above backdrop, this study investigates and discusses the effect of emotions, especially shame and selected virtues on plagiarism outcome behaviour. Also, this study investigates the moderating effects of virtues on the relationship between shame and pro-social outcome behaviour of plagiarism.

2. Theoretical background
Most universities around the globe consider plagiarism, in the form of copying other’s work and representing as one’s own, as the most serious offence. This is increasing day by day because it is challenging to notice such acts. Even if some of the cases are caught, then there are no proper rules in some universities to take actions against them or to punish them. This, in return, gives an impetus to such kind of copying activities for gaining grades. Detection of plagiarism is time-consuming and requires a lot of efforts. Presently, there is an increase in plagiarism in varied types of academic texts. It is very difficult to measure the attitude of students towards plagiarism; researchers should use psychometrically tested instruments for the better understanding of plagiarism behaviour among students (Ehrich et al., 2015).

Maurer et al. (2006, pp. 1050-1051) list the following activities that are included in plagiarism: “a) turning in someone else’s work as your own; b) copying words or ideas from someone else without giving credit; c) failing to put a quotation in quotation marks; d) giving
incorrect information about the source of a quotation; e) changing words but copying the sentence structure of a source without giving credit; f) copying many words or ideas from a source that it makes up the majority of your work, whether you give credit or not”. For reducing the plagiarism, it is essential to describe what plagiarism is, why it is unethical, how to detect and control the plagiarism and what corrective measures can be adopted. Other’s words have always been repeatedly used throughout the history of society. From adolescence, we figure out how to talk, read and compose by noticing others’ words. Ordinarily, our words are really others’ words. During the education and learning of text and theory, reproduction is commonly utilised through activities of retention and duplication. Besides, many thoughts and “sayings” are so generally used that it is difficult to allocate origin to them. The way dialect is utilised and reused makes plagiarism a complex issue (Pennycook, 1996).

In spite of the conscious action of plagiarism, in some cases, the intention to plagiarise is not adequately described due to lack of awareness about plagiarism. Considering its variations, according to Maurer et al. (2006, p. 1051) plagiarism can be: “a) accidental: due to the lack of knowledge of plagiarism and understanding of citation or referencing style being practiced at an institute; b) unintentional: the vastness of available information influences thoughts and the same ideas may come out via spoken or written expressions as one’s own; c) intentional: a deliberate act of copying complete or part of someone else’s work without giving proper credit to original creator; d) self plagiarism: using self-published work in some other form without referring to original one”.

In general, it is noticed that the significance of plagiarism has increased since 2000, mostly in English-speaking nations. Earlier the rules and procedures for the consideration of plagiarism by higher education institutions were not so far well explained (Berlinck, 2011). Cronan et al. (2018) discussed the various motivational factors, which are responsible for increasing plagiarism behaviour and sharing of homework so that the universities can reduce this academic misconduct.

2.1 Plagiarism as consumer misbehaviour
Consumer misbehaviour may be defined as behavioural activities by consumers which disobey the usually standard norms of behaviour in consumption circumstances, and disturb the conduct estimated in such conditions (Fullerton and Punj, 1993). Consumer misbehaviour (Reynolds and Harris, 2009) is regarded as a negative act or involvement in consumer exchange process.

Traditionally, consumer misbehaviour research has been mostly regarded as sabotage, stealing, fraud, dishonesty and cheating (Harris and Reynolds, 2004). However, simultaneously with the quick expansion of the internet, Harris and Dumas (2009) noticed the appearance of the latest kind of consumer misbehaviour, that is, online consumer misbehaviour. Freestone and Mitchell (2004) and Chatzidakis and Mitussis (2007) explained that the internet contributes a fresh and an ideal atmosphere to commit immoral behaviour in the form of plagiarism, easily and anonymously.

For the projects and assignments, graduate students consume the research papers and articles of other authors, and some of them choose to copy and paste the information and ideas without proper citations. This act is unethical on the part of the consumer and considered as plagiarism. Singh et al. (2016) explained that job characteristics are used for calculating motivating potential scores among professionals. This shows that lack of skills and pressure for getting grades among scholars motivate for excessive use of the internet for copy and paste to complete their assignments. This act is unethical on the part of the consumer and is considered as plagiarism. This is getting more popular among university students due to the easy access to the internet and the reward of achieving excellent scores in their assignments. Alhosani et al. (2017) proposed that the school leadership and climate
affect the academic achievement of the students. There are significant relationships between organisational culture, leadership and teamwork which are important for organisations’ success and sustainability (Al Mehrzi and Singh, 2016). This shows that the university work environment and actions affect the student’s academic performance and their frequency to plagiarise to complete their assignments. Selwyn (2008) suggested that online misbehaviour is increasing among university students. Plagiarism is one of the most common consumer misbehaviour nowadays prevalent among graduate students, which is escalating due to the presence of the internet. With the availability of computer-aided text analytic tools, which allow scholars to conduct content analysis for literature review (Gaur and Kumar, 2018), the instances of plagiarism are coming to the forefront very frequently.

2.2 Emotions

Emotions are considered as transitory mental states which originate when people face significant actions. The term “emotion” was derived from the Latin term “emovere”, which means “to move away from” or “to stir up” (Pettijohn, 1991). Juma (2008) elaborated that the description of emotion has sustained to change, and in current emotion literature, the extant explanations evolve with changing the life of individuals. Erevelles (1998) was the first person to review emotion in the context of marketing.

Strongman (2003) talked about how emotions arise from moment to moment continuously and assumingly play an essential role in humans’ personal and social life (Manstead, 1991). The study of emotions has always been an intriguing one and has drawn the attention of researchers for more than two millenniums as per Kagan (2007) and Solomon (2008). Strongman (2003) explained that he had recognised more than 150 diverse theories of emotion. As per the opinion of Juma (2008), emotion theories can be classified into traditional emotion and contemporary emotion theories. Traditional theories, such as evolutionary theory and physiological theory, consider emotions as gaining recognition without any influential cognition. On the other hand, contemporary approaches, such as attribution theory, social constructive theory, cognitive theory and self-discrepancy theory, comprise a cognition element in the discussion of emotions. In short, these theories are differentiated by presence or absence of cognitive processes in the emotions. These two different approaches verify that emotions are comprehensive and multifaceted (Grappi et al., 2013).

According to various studies on emotions, they commonly provide adaptive, communicative, social and learning functions. These functions assist in making certain people easily deal with external happenings and surroundings (Damasio, 2004). The existing literature illustrates that the emotions are predicted by various elements such as sanctions, needs and expectations (Turner, 2007), as well as, standards and goals (Clore et al., 1994).

2.2.1 Outcomes of emotions: According to emotion literature, there is an increasing proof that emotions have an effect on several areas of humans’ “social life” (Parkinson, 1996), “cognitive processes” (Sutton and Wheatley, 2003) and “strength of motivation and behaviour” (Zeelenberg and Pieters, 2004). In short, Izard (1991) explained that emotions control a human being’s mind, body and every aspect of his/her life. Thus, there is a link between the emotional intelligence and its dimensions with the contextual performance of individuals (Bozionelos and Singh, 2017).

Mehrabian and Russell (1974), for the first time, explored the elements-based approach towards emotion, where emotion is considered as a scale including three independent bipolar elements: pleasure, arousal and dominance. This further concludes that individual’s emotions have the capability to extract their own opinions, thoughts, intentions, feelings, reminiscences and other inner conditions to control and adapt their behaviour in order to fulfil norms and standards of the community (Leary and Buttermore, 2003) and to retain optimistic self-representation (Tracy and Robins, 2007).
2.2.2 Self-conscious emotions. As per the study of Tracy and Robins (2004), Bagozzi (2006) categorised self-conscious emotions as positive or negative emotions; they are different. Tracy and Robins (2004) described that when people appreciate themselves and consider that they are within the standard norms and principles or increase expectations of others, they are prone to practice positive emotions, like pride. On the other hand, when people consider that they are not within the acceptable norms and standards or unable to fulfil others’ expectations or move towards unethical practices, they tend to practice negative emotions, like shame or guilt.

Tracy and Robins (2004) categorise shame, embarrassment and guilt as negative self-conscious emotions. According to Lewis (1991), the feeling of shame and guilt is unlikable and hurting. As these emotions are ruthless and nasty, people evade them by either considering their basis or restoring their negative experience through commencing pro-social behaviour.

2.3 Shame and self
Shame is defined as the unpleasant and unlikable emotion, i.e., resulting from individuals’ consciousness of being unethical, dishonest, disreputable, offensive, unacceptable and immoral (De Hooge et al., 2008). Both physical and mental experiences create the feeling of shame in individuals. It is an emotion that jeopardises individuals’ honour, status, reputation and well-being within the society. As an outcome, shame is declared to be the most significant, influential and potentially disturbing life experiences of an entity (Gilbert, 1997).

As discussed earlier, both physical and mental experiences probably generate shame. The differentiation among these experiences is the strength and the extent of the shame exposure. For example, in the perspective of plagiarism, the shame of being noticed, punishment by the university and facing the court trial is only short term. Once a person’s fines are paid, and the punishment or the court case has ended, the physical “self” experience and the feeling of shame also vanishes. On the other hand, shame from mental experiences, such as being called as a corrupt, unethical and immoral individual, means that the “self” experience persists and it generates a feeling of shame that might continue for the remaining life of that person.

2.3.1 Shame and plagiarism. Preserving a positive and genuine personality is considered as one of the most difficult and essential objectives in human society. Involvement in negative and unethical behaviours, such as plagiarism, is supposed to be ethical disobedience along with exposure against principles, norms and regulations, thereby, recovering self-worth (Cohn and Vaccaro, 2006) and creating shame experience (Taylor, 1985). Dobson (2017) discussed the relationship between shame and resistance in the context of social welfare practices.

Bagozzi et al. (2003) argue that the shame occurrence is specific to the culture, that is, the level of shame experienced varies with culture. There is a rich body of literature that examines various aspects of cultural differences and their impact on individual-level and organisational-level outcomes (Contractor et al., 2016; Gaur et al., 2007; Gaur and Lu, 2007; Popli et al., 2017). For example, In India, the concept of plagiarism is not that much well known and familiar with as compared to many of the developed countries, where it is considered as unethical and punishable. Here, copy and paste of others’ work is so common that most of the students and scholars plagiarise in assignments, reports and research papers without any feeling of shame. The main reason behind it is the lack of awareness about plagiarism and its consequences. Actually, they do not realise that they are doing something wrong.

2.3.2 Two types of shame. As per Gilbert (1998), the social, cognitive, affective, physiological and behavioural factors characterize shame thereby lending it a complex
self-conscious aspect. Furthermore, he classifies shame as the internal shame and the external shame. The internal shame is defined as the one which originates from self-assessment or comparison. It is experienced from the inside. On the other hand, the external shame is to be understood as resulting from individual’s values, belief and assumptions that the others are evaluating them negatively. This shows that such kind of shame is concerned with others’ perception about individuals’ behaviour. People are concerned about what others think and feel about us; their primary focus is on the outside world (Gilbert, 1998).

According to Goss and Allan (2009), the main consideration of external shame is superficial and outward-oriented, and assessment is based on others’ opinions, feelings or ideas about individual’s behaviour (Gilbert, 1998). According to scholars, shame has several roles, which include: adaptive, psychological, social and motivational functions in the plagiarism. Nathanson (1994) explained that shame is one of the negative emotions that represent individual’s hurt feelings or rejection. Depending upon the intensity with which the feelings are affected, shame directs people to select the suitable coping strategy, like anti-social or pro-social behaviour, which, in turn, decides the person’s intention to maintain or break off their relationship with the cause which led to these feelings.

The shame questions were introduced with a scenario, which attempted to convey the idea that customers may signal or say something unfavourable about the salesperson, thus exemplifying a shame incident. This context-specific manner of asking questions is a standard way by which psychologists measure shame responses, as it is both difficult and unethical to manipulate shame directly into the respondents. Responses to items were recorded on seven-point scale “I do not feel anything at all” to “I feel this very strongly”. Internal shame was assessed with four-item scale, “I feel I could die of shame”, “I feel I need to escape quickly”, “I feel very small” and “I feel helpless” and, on the other hand, external shame was assessed with two-item scale, “I notice that my voice has become lower” and “My heart is beating more slowly” (Verbeke and Bagozzi, 2003).

2.4 Outcome behaviour: pro-social behaviours

As explored by Bryant and Crockenberg (1980), pro-social behaviour is concerned with others’ prosperity and energises the building of the relationship. Such behaviour re-establishes and maintains the damaged conditions along with managing the relationship by improving self-development and social-development. In the context of plagiarism, pro-social behaviours are signified by repair, discontinuance and avoid behaviours.

On that basis, if the individual virtue increases, individuals’ felt shame is expected to increase through individuals’ perceived failure and sense of inability to reach their goals. Thus, in order to reduce the shame and hope to reverse the damage, scholars predict that felt shame will directly stimulate reparation behaviour (i.e. De Hooge et al., 2010), discontinuance behaviour (Delmonico and Griffin, 1997) and avoid behaviour (Tangney et al., 1996; Schmader and Lickel, 2006) (Figure 1). Therefore, we hypothesise that:

H1. The feeling of shame is associated with the outcome behaviour (i.e. avoidance, discontinuance and repair).

Accordingly:

H1A. The feeling of internal shame is associated with the outcome behaviour.

H1B. The feeling of external shame is associated with the outcome behaviour.

2.4.1 Avoidance behaviour. Avoidance behaviour refers to intentional or unintentional conduct to prevent or discontinue undesired behaviour permanently with no thought to
repeat it (Chapman et al., 2006). People also tend to retain their success by evading actions that could probably destroy or spoil their successful repute.

Avoidance is used as distancing and is assessed with three items, “Completely dissociate myself from this event”, “Hide and remove any association with this event” and “Distance myself as much as possible from this event” (Tangney et al., 1996; Schmader and Lickel, 2006).

Thus, we propose that:

**H1Aa.** The feeling of internal shame is associated with the avoidance behaviour.

**H1Ba.** The feeling of external shame is associated with the avoidance behaviour.

### 2.4.2 Discontinuance behaviour

Lengnick-Hall et al. (2000) explained that discontinuance behaviour refers to the repetition of the voluntary or involuntary actions in an appropriate condition which provides desirable outcomes and not to repeat those which are producing adverse outcomes. Discontinuance behaviour is concerned about others’ well-being. If conduct is producing positive consequences, then it is going to be repeated by others, otherwise, discontinue the same for negative outcomes. This type of behaviour is important for prospects, as, on the basis of consequences and its observations, it is easy to decide whether to repeat the action or not (Arbuthnott, 2009).

Discontinuance behaviour is assessed with two items, “It is probable that I will not repeat such behaviour” and “It is highly acceptable that I will not repeat such behaviour” (Bougie et al., 2003).

Thus, proposed that:

**H1Ab.** The feeling of internal shame is associated with the discontinuance behaviour.

**H1Bb.** The feeling of external shame is associated with the discontinuance behaviour.

### 2.4.3 Repair behaviour

Repair behaviour is defined as the act of repairing or correcting the wrong deeds (Adams and Balfour, 2008). According to Desmet et al. (2011), repair behaviour
is acceptable for backward-oriented basis. It means that repair behaviour focuses on re-establishing the unfairness or injustices rather than making efforts to discourage it. For example, in case of plagiarism, repair behaviour focuses on apologizing, reimbursement or remediation rather than reducing future misconducts.

Drawing from past shame and shame research (Lickel et al., 2005; Tangney et al., 1996), the approach is to make reparations and it is assessed with three items (rated on a seven-point scale), “I should do something after this event to make it better”, “I want to apologize for what has happened” and “I will try to do something after the event to make it better”.

Thus, it is proposed that:

H1Ac. The feeling of internal shame is associated with the repair behaviour.
H1Bc. The feeling of external shame is associated with the repair behaviour.

2.5 Virtues

In this study, virtues refer to the types of qualities that allow people to assess and follow any psychological procedure that approves individuals to think and act in a manner beneficial to them and their society (Fowers, 2005). This shows that virtues are measured as superior qualities that permit individuals to reply to the demands of the society excellently. That is why Swanton (2003) concluded that virtues establish our relationship with others, particularly with whom we share common objectives and principles. Different virtues have different importance in different circumstances for different people in the society. Schwartz (2006) explained that alterations and the significance of virtues in one’s life would influence his/her behaviour. Kim and Johnson (2014) described the role of self-view concepts of individuals on the relationship between emotions, i.e., shame and outcome behaviour for the purchase of fashion counterfeits.

2.5.1 Virtues and emotions. Based on Aristotle’s principles, Hursthouse (1999) argued that virtues and emotions are associated with each other. Virtues are considered ethically significant, and their purpose is not only to direct behaviour but also to feel emotions, that is, the individual with virtues will also experience suitable emotions for the right persons or entities for the right basis. According to Schwartz (2006), the individual’s practice of virtues depends upon the circumstances or the current situation. For example, in favourable conditions, it is easy to promote equality. On the other hand, in the condition of poverty, it is difficult to exercise the virtue of equality, i.e., sharing the last piece of bread (Thompson and Bendik-Keymer, 2012).

2.5.2 Virtues as moderators. According to Taylor and Wolfram (1968), these virtues can be categorised into two main types: self-regarding virtues and other-regarding virtues. Esheté (1982) suggested that self-regarding virtues are virtues that are exhibited by individuals when they are concerned with their own interest and act non-socially. However, other-regarding virtues are important for an ethical system. People with such virtues keep the welfare of the society above their own welfare and serve the interests of others (Schwartz, 1992). So, there is the different moderating effect of different virtues on the relationships of shame and outcome behaviour (Figure 1). Thus, proposed hypotheses are:

H2. The virtues (i.e. influence, competitiveness and equality) in response to felt shame due to plagiarism will not promote outcome behaviour (i.e. avoidance, discontinuance and repair).

H2A. The virtues in response to felt internal shame due to plagiarism will not promote outcome behaviour.

H2B. The virtues in response to felt external shame due to plagiarism will not promote outcome behaviour.
In this study, we have used three virtues, influence, competitiveness and equality, as moderators for the relationship between emotions and outcome behaviour (pro-social behaviour). Many researchers worked on individual differences as moderators to see its effect on the relationship between emotions and outcome behaviour (Lin et al., 2018). The virtue of influence refers to the ability to affect others’ actions, behaviour, opinions and feelings, to make changes in one’s life (Carr, 2006). However, the virtue of competitiveness refers to the condition of active attempting to win or gain something by imposing superiority over others (Schwartz, 2006). Finally, the virtue of equality refers to an inherent value that encourages justice and fairness in dealing with different entities (Frankfurt, 1987). The primary objective of this virtue is to treat everyone equally and with fairness in the given conditions. The term “equality” originates from the Latin word “aequalitas” which represents an association among individuals with similar behaviour (Burmeister et al., 2011). In the context of plagiarism, different virtues will moderate the outcome behaviour of different people. Individuals with high virtues control the relationship between emotions and outcome behaviour, whether they are going to have a direct effect on behaviour or not especially in the Indian context for plagiarism.

3. Measures of the study
In this study, the questionnaire is taken from the previous research done by Halimin Herjanto (2013) on digital piracy. The seven-point Likert-type scales are used with anchors ranging from 1 = I do not feel anything at all to 7 = I feel this very strongly for felt emotions (shame) and 1 = I definitely would not to 7 = I definitely would for individual virtues and outcome behaviour. It contains the questions related to the felt emotions (external and internal shame), individual virtues (influence, competitiveness and equality) and outcome behaviour (repair, discontinuance and avoidance behaviour). Along with scale items, respondents were also asked to provide basic demographic information related to their gender, age, programme enrolled and religion.

Although most of the items were taken from the existing literature, still scale was given to experts for face validity of the questionnaire to refine the items to suit the specific context of the study (Gaur and Gaur, 2009). Details of measures are provided in Table I.

3.1 Research methodology
The research is empirical in nature and employs quantitative methods of analyses. This research is based on scenario-based quasi-experimentation. In this study, we manipulated emotions, i.e., shame, and investigated the effects of felt shame on plagiarism-related outcome behaviours (discontinuance, repair and avoid behaviours). We further tested the moderating role of individuals’ virtues (influence, competitiveness and equality) on the link between felt shame and outcome behaviour.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>References</th>
<th>Number of items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Felt shame (independent variables) (X)</td>
<td>Verbeke and Bagozzi (2003)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External shame</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal shame</td>
<td></td>
<td>4 items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual virtues (moderators) (MO)</td>
<td>Schwartz (1992, 2006)</td>
<td>2 items of each individual virtue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Influence, competition and equality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome behaviours (dependent variables) (Y)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repair behaviour</td>
<td>Minton and Rose (1997)</td>
<td>3 items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoid behaviour</td>
<td>Finn et al. (2005)</td>
<td>3 items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discontinuance behaviour</td>
<td>Bougie et al. (2003)</td>
<td>2 items</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I. Scale measurement
As mentioned earlier, the scenario-based experimental method was used in this study. Realistic scenarios are important for surveying, which are considered as the case in the study. The extant literature suggests that presenting scenarios is a useful method in emotional and ethics-related research (Bagozzi et al., 2003). The employment of the scenario method provides higher measurement accuracy (Hunt and Vitell, 1986) and offers a channel that permits an investigation of how individuals make decisions when involved in undesirable behaviour. This approach symbolises a way in which researchers can achieve potentially valuable insights into the ethical decision making of individuals (Chonko et al., 1996). Therefore, each scenario used in our study describes the specific circumstances of a situation in which a character commits an act of plagiarism. Before filling the questionnaire, every respondent was given one of the scenarios to read; either manipulated shame scenario or neutral one.

Primary data were collected using questionnaire from university master’s and doctoral students. Questionnaires were distributed to a total of 280 respondents. After several attempts, a total of 250 respondents returned completed questionnaires. However, some of the questionnaires which were incomplete or carelessly completed were omitted for data analysis. This is why only 244 questionnaires were found to be usable for further analyses.

The sample consisted of a comparatively higher number of males (i.e. 147 (60.2 per cent) males and 97 (39.8 per cent) females). According to All India Survey on Higher Education (MHRD.gov.in, 2018), females constitute only 46.2 per cent of the total enrolment for the higher education in India. So our sample too approximately reflects male–female ratio enrolled for higher education in India. Most of the participants, i.e., 181 (74.2 per cent) respondents were between 21 and 25 years old, 39 (16 per cent) were between 26 and 30 years old and 24 (9.8 per cent) were above 31 years old. A total of 142 (58.2 per cent) respondents were pursuing masters-level education (MBA and PGDM) and 102 (41.8 per cent) were pursuing PhD. Self-reported frequency of plagiarism varied: 37 (15.2 per cent) participants reported never, 36 (14.8 per cent) reported rarely, 125 (51.2 per cent) reported sometime, 34 (13.9 per cent) reported often and 12 (4.9 per cent) reported very frequently.

4. Data analyses

The partial least square (PLS) based structural equation modelling (SEM) is an advanced statistical technique that includes factor analysis and regression analysis simultaneously to examine the relationship between measurement indicators and constructs (Hair et al., 2017). SEM is commonly used in social science research to develop and test theories using survey data. SmartPLS software was used for testing of measurement model as well as for hypotheses testing (Ringle et al., 2015).

4.1 Results of measurement model testing

Confirmatory factor analysis was used to test the measurement model.

4.1.1 Reliability. Internal consistency is commonly used to establish scale reliability. According to Nunnally and Bernstein (1994), internal consistency is the degree of inter-correlations between the scale items. To check the reliability of the scale, Cronbach’s α is also used. The value of Cronbach’s α should not be lesser than 0.70 for scale reliability (Gaur and Gaur, 2009; Nunnally and Bernstein, 1994; Hair et al., 2017). Apart from Cronbach’s α, other measures are also used for checking the reliability of the scale, i.e. average variance extracted (AVE) and composite reliability (CR) (Garver and Mentzer, 1999). Interpretation of CR is similar to Cronbach’s α. Hair et al. (2017) stated that the value of CR should be equal to or greater than 0.7 and lesser than 0.7 shows that there is no internal consistency. According to Fornell and Larcker (1981), the value of AVE is generally acceptable if it is 0.5 or near to it and shows that the half of the variance of the indicators is explained by the construct (Hair et al., 2017). The item loadings, AVE and CR values given in Table II confirm the reliability of measures for each construct.
Indicator reliability: the size of the item loading for the indicators is known as indicator reliability, and it should be significant. Hair et al. (2017) stated that the value of indicator reliability should be 0.70 or closer. It is clear from Table II that the values of item loadings for all constructs are satisfactory establishing indicator reliability.

### 4.1.2 Validity

#### Convergent validity
Convergent validity is the extent to which a measure correlates with alternative measures of the same constructs (Hair et al., 2017). For the assessment of the convergent validity, AVE and item loadings of the indicators are examined (Hair et al., 2017). Table II shows AVE values and the item loadings for all the constructs.

#### Discriminant validity
Examination of cross-loadings is the first approach to check the discriminant validity of the constructs. The value of indicators’ outer loading with their constructs should be greater than any of its cross-loadings (Hair et al., 2017). In Table III, all loadings of the items of the associated construct are seen to be greater than any other construct. Fornell and Larcker criterion is the second approach to assess the discriminant validity. To analyse the discriminant validity, Fornell and Larcker (1981) presented this method. It can be evaluated by comparing the AVE for each construct with the shared variance between the constructs. The scale has discriminant validity when shared variance with any other construct is lesser than AVE for that construct. From Table IV, it is clear that the scale has discriminant validity; italic values show that AVE for each construct is greater than its shared variance. Heterotrait–Monotrait Ratio (HTMT) is the third approach and the

### Table II. Construct reliability and convergent validity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Item loading</th>
<th>AVE</th>
<th>Composite reliability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Independent variables</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal shame</td>
<td>Intshm1 – I feel I could die of shame</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intshm2 – I feel I need to escape quickly</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intshm3 – I feel very small</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intshm4 – I feel helpless</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External shame</td>
<td>Extshm1 – I notice that my voice has become lower</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Extshm2 – My heart is beating more slowly</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dependent variables</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avoidance</td>
<td>Avd1 – Completely dissociate myself from this event</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Avd2 – Hide and remove any association with this event</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Avd3 – Distance myself as much as possible from this event</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discontinuance</td>
<td>Discont1 – It is probable that I will not repeat such behaviour</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discont2 – It is highly acceptable that I will not repeat such behaviour</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repair</td>
<td>Rep1 – I should do something after this event to make it better</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rep2 – I want to apologize for what has happened</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rep3 – I will try to do something after the event to make it better</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Moderating variables</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Influence</td>
<td>Infloc1 – Having an impact on people</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Infloc2 – Having an impact on policy or programs</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitiveness</td>
<td>Compt1 – Doing better than others</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Compt2 – Winning or exceeding the achievements of others</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality</td>
<td>Eq1 – Supporting equality of outcomes for all</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eq2 – Supporting equality of opportunities for all</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
most advanced method to assess the discriminant validity. In order to analyse discriminant validity, Henseler et al. (2015) stated that HTMT is the ratio of between-trait correlations to that of within-trait correlations. The HTMT approach is an estimate of what the true correlation between two constructs would be if they are perfectly measured. The threshold value of HTMT is 0.85, i.e., all the ratios should be lesser than 0.85 and not closer to 1. From Table V, it is clear that the scale has discriminant validity because ratio for each construct is much lesser than 0.85.

### 4.2 Structural equation model

The structural model was tested using SmartPLS. The SRMR value of the model was found to be 0.08. The coefficient of determination ($R^2$ value) represents the amount of variance in the endogenous constructs linked to it. The $R^2$ value ranges from 0 to 1; there is no rule of thumb for acceptable $R^2$ value as it depends on the complexity of the model and the research discipline. In many cases, the $R^2$ value of 0.20 is considered as good enough in disciplines like consumer behaviour (Henseler et al., 2015). $R^2$ values in this study were 0.13 ($p = 0.000$) for avoidance, 0.09 ($p = 0.050$) for discontinuance and 0.15 ($p = 0.000$) for repair behaviour.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Avoidance</th>
<th>External shame</th>
<th>Discontinuance</th>
<th>Internal shame</th>
<th>Repair</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Avoidance</th>
<th>External shame</th>
<th>Discontinuance</th>
<th>Internal shame</th>
<th>Repair</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table V. Heterotrait–Monotrait ratio (HTMT)
4.2.1 Path coefficients. In the structural model, the path coefficients have standardized values approximately between $-1$ and $+1$. The path coefficients show the direction and magnitude of association and these coefficients are used in proving the hypothesis as given in Table VI. The estimated path coefficients close to $+1$ show strong positive relationships and vice versa for negative values, which are significant. Whether a coefficient is significant or not depends on its standard error, which computes the empirical $t$-values and $p$-values for structural path coefficients. When $t$-value is larger than the critical value, we conclude that coefficient is statistically significant. Common critical values for two-tailed tests are 1.65 (10 per cent significance level), 1.96 (5 per cent significance level) and 2.57 (1 per cent significance level). On the other hand, most researchers use $p$-values to assess significance levels. When $p$-value $\leq 0.001$, at the 1 per cent level of significance, $p$-value $\leq 0.005$, at the 5 per cent level of significance and $p$-value $\leq 0.010$, at the 10 per cent level of significance, then we can say that the relationship is statistically significant. In case of exploratory research, researchers often assume 10 per cent of the level of significance.

4.2.2 Moderation analysis. Moderation is defined as a condition where the association between two factors is not stable but dependent on the values of another variable, that variable is known as the moderator variable. The moderator changes the strength and direction of a relationship between two factors in the model (Henseler et al., 2015). In Table VI, coefficients show the strength of the effect that moderator has between the two constructs and its positive or negative sign indicates the direction of the relationship. For example, in case of $H2A(i)b$, the strength of moderator “influence” is $-0.18$ between the relationship of internal shame and discontinuance behaviour, the $p$-value is 0.002, and it is significant (significance level $= 5$ per cent). Furthermore, as the coefficient value is negative, this depicts that higher the influence, the weaker the relationship between internal shame and discontinuance behaviour for plagiarism.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Hypothesised path</th>
<th>$\beta$</th>
<th>$t$</th>
<th>$p$-values</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$H1Aa$</td>
<td>Internal shame$\rightarrow$avoidance</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>3.36</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H1Ab$</td>
<td>Internal shame$\rightarrow$discontinuance</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>0.060</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H1Ac$</td>
<td>Internal shame$\rightarrow$repair</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H1Ba$</td>
<td>Internal shame$\rightarrow$avoidance</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>0.012</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H1Bb$</td>
<td>Internal shame$\rightarrow$discontinuance</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>0.012</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H1Bc$</td>
<td>Internal shame$\rightarrow$repair</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>0.012</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table VI. Path coefficients and results of hypotheses testing.
5. Results of hypotheses testing

**H1.** The feeling of shame is associated with the outcome behaviour (i.e. avoidance, discontinuance and repair).

**H1:** it is clear from Table VI that **H1A** is supported by our data. This means that the internal shame has the significant positive effect on plagiarism-related outcome behaviours (avoidance, discontinuance and repair). **H1B** is supported in the case of discontinuance behaviour but rejected for avoidance and repair behaviour:

**H2.** The virtues (i.e. influence, competitiveness and equality) in response to felt shame due to plagiarism will not promote outcome behaviour (i.e. avoidance, discontinuance and repair).

**H2:** the results presented in Table VI show that **H2A(i)** is supported in our study only for the virtue of influence. Influence has significant negative moderation effect on the relationship between internal shame and discontinuance behaviour for plagiarism. This depicts that higher the influence, the weaker the relationship between internal shame and discontinuance behaviour for plagiarism. Similarly, **H2A(ii)** is found to be supported by the data of our study because of the virtue of equality because equality has significant negative moderation effect on the relationship between internal shame and discontinuance behaviour for plagiarism. This depicts that higher the equality, the weaker the relationship between internal shame and discontinuance behaviour for plagiarism.

In Table VI, **H2B** also shows that none of the virtues moderates the relationship between external shame and plagiarism-related outcome behaviour. Hence, the remaining hypotheses are not supported by the data in our study.

6. Discussions and conclusions

In this study, a conceptual framework is developed to show the relationship between the emotion of shame and plagiarism-related outcome behaviours. The framework based on recent psychological research is tested on graduates. The results show strong support for the scenario-based effect of felt emotions, i.e., shame on outcome behaviour for plagiarism with moderating effect of specific individual virtues. We found that manipulated shame resulted in feelings of both internal and external shame. When individuals feel internal shame, they discontinue plagiarism. They also try to repair the damage that they cause by plagiarism. However, feeling of external shame encourages individuals to discontinue plagiarism but does not influence their avoidance and repair behaviour. Virtues such as influence, competitiveness and equality weaken the relationship between internal shame and plagiarism-related outcome behaviour. At the same time, these virtues do not affect the relationship between external shame and outcome behaviours. When individuals have high value for influence and competitiveness, they may be justifying the act of plagiarism even if they internally feel ashamed. Similarly, they may be justifying the act of plagiarism when they have high value for equality. This may be because, in a country like India, they may think that they are deprived of resources which are easily available to their counterparts in well-developed economies and therefore they may perceive the act of plagiarism as a means for achieving equality.

This research contributes to emotion and consumer misbehaviour literature. It extends the literature by integrating the role of virtues in the context of plagiarism-related behaviours. Finally, this study supports our central hypotheses that manipulation of emotions and virtues of a graduate student by universities can prove to be a better deterrent for graduate students’ plagiarism behaviour than coercive methods which are currently in use.
7. Implications
The findings of the study have significant implications for the management of scholarly work at educational institutions and universities. It is important for universities to understand the role of specific emotions in influencing individuals’ plagiarism behaviour. Specifically, the study suggests that universities should provoke the emotion of shame to control plagiarism and encourage pro-social behaviour among scholars.

Second, the findings indicate that specific virtues moderate the felt internal shame and consequent pro-social plagiarism-related outcome behaviour among scholars. For instance, the virtue of influence has significant moderation effect in the relationship between internal shame and discontinuance behaviour. Third, the findings show that none of the virtues moderate the relationship between external shame and outcome behaviour for plagiarism. Therefore, focus should be on using only those communications which are able to provoke internal shame. For example, instead of publicly shaming an individual who is likely to indulge in plagiarism, it will be better if that individual is privately consulted and attempt is made to provoke internal shame in him or her.

8. Limitations
In order to conduct the theoretically and empirically sound research, all efforts were made. Despite this, no study can be free from the limitations. Geographically, India is a varied and vast country; this study is limited to certain geographical regions. There is scope to analyse the plagiarism issue at the sub-national levels (Gaur et al., 2014). Another limitation in the study is the use of the narrative description of fictitious scenarios to generate the self-conscious emotions among scholars. In future studies, use of videos and real-life examples may enhance the degree of realism of manipulations and generate stronger emotions (Xie et al., 2015). Due to time and fund constraints, the sample size is small for such type of study. There are clear differences across different developing countries and between developing and developed countries (Judge et al., 2010; Singh and Gaur, 2009). For instance, the role of regulations and government intervention, as well as perceptions about what is ethical and unethical, differs significantly between India and China (Gaur et al., 2018; Li and Gaur, 2014; Pattnaik et al., 2018). A person who plagiarises is not just a consumer but also simultaneously a producer. However, our research considers only consumer’s perspective. We have not included producer’s perspective in our study. This is another limitation that future studies may like to address. In Middle Eastern countries, very less amount of significant research has been carried out in the area of education management. Many research papers have been conceptualised to provide solutions to the problems being faced by policymakers and educational institutions in the Middle East region (Singh, 2017), but empirical studies are scare. Our study can be replicated in the context of Middle Eastern countries to understand the plagiarism phenomenon.

References


**Further reading**


**Corresponding author**

Sanjaya Singh Gaur can be contacted at: sanjayag@sunway.edu.my

---

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: [www.emergalgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm](http://www.emergalgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm)

Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Building a culture of business analytics: a marketing analytics exercise

M. Elizabeth Haywood
Department of Accounting, Rider University, Lawrenceville, New Jersey, USA, and
Anubha Mishra
Department of Marketing, Rider University, Lawrenceville, New Jersey, USA

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to describe how brief exercises in introductory and advanced marketing courses can help business students achieve a broader understanding of what Big data and data analytics mean in the workplace. These short analytics problems fit into the culture that we are building at our institution to create analytics cases for courses within our business curriculum.

Design/methodology/approach – A database of 1,500 customer reviews for a fictitious sporting company was created. Two exercises based on text mining and sentiment analysis were developed to be tested in introductory and advanced marketing course. Students were introduced to the basic concepts used in data analysis and the creation of R code for extracting sentiment words was demonstrated. Students then used pivot tables to identify patterns in the given data set. Students in the introductory course completed a short exercise while the students in the advanced class developed a detailed memo.

Findings – Results suggest that students in the introductory course are significantly more aware of the use of data in the industry as well as methods to deal with Big data after completing the exercise as compared to their knowledge at the beginning of the exercise. Students in the advanced course are able to identify patterns, detect shortcoming and propose strategic plans based on their analysis of the data.

Originality/value – Proposed exercises in the study are developed with an aim to help business schools develop a culture supportive of analytics. The purpose of these exercises is to make students aware of the importance of Big data and analytics early on in their curriculum and reinforce their exposure in an advanced course.

Keywords Big data, Marketing curriculum

Paper type Case study

Introduction

Big data is undoubtedly “big” as it influences every business facet and every economic sector these days. It has impacted both academia and industry, therefore, an understanding of its overarching reach has become imperative (Boyd and Crawford, 2012; KPMG, 2012; CIO Network Conference Task Force, 2016). Colleges and universities have begun to build data analytics programs (Gellman, 2014) and even accreditation agencies have become involved in addressing the challenges of Big data and data analytics. To address the changing environment, we need to educate our students on Big data and data analytics. The current study aims to explore strategies that can help create a culture to build awareness and stress on the importance of data analytics techniques within business schools.

The scope of this study focuses on business schools since aspiring managers in all areas of businesses are most likely to be confronted with data analytics in their careers. The proposed exercises were tested in the marketing department within a business school. We chose the marketing area to test these exercises because data backed strategic decision-making is becoming a requirement in marketing (Erevelles et al., 2016). This shift has resulted in an increase in marketing courses focusing on analytics in marketing curricula (Azam and Qamar, 2011). The issue of measuring the effectiveness of marketing activities has also received much attention in academic literature (Smit and Neijens, 2011). But, with this change comes the responsibility of educating marketing students to be
prepared to deal with data that is now available to them. A recent study provided evidence that marketing students generally lack quantitative skills (Pilling et al., 2012). Therefore, the study related to incorporating Big data analytics in marketing courses for decision-making strategies is the area that needs more focus on the educational level within business schools.

Moreover, while Big data is increasingly becoming an integrated part of most businesses, the make of this data is different than primary data collected for a specific research objective. Big data is raw, unstructured and complex (Xu et al., 2016). As a result, a different approach is required to first make this raw data relevant to the business at hand and then be able to mine it for insightful strategic decision making (Mintu-Wimsatt and Lozada, 2018). In this paper we discuss the importance of incorporating analytics in the marketing discipline followed by an example of two exercises tested in the introductory and senior level marketing courses. We will now discuss the significance of the proposed project.

**Significance of analytics in the marketing discipline**

According to the United States Department of Labor, Market Research Analysts jobs have seen a much faster than average rate of growth since 2014 (www.bls.gov/ooh/business-and-financial/market-research-analysts.htm#tab-1). In addition, the median salary of students at the entry level of a marketing analyst position upon completion of a Bachelor’s degree is higher than other traditional marketing jobs. There is no doubt that the landscape of marketing, like all other business functional areas, is rapidly evolving to accommodate analytics in the digital era (Joshi and Gimenez, 2014; Nichols, 2013; Fulgoni, 2013; Erevelles et al., 2016). In a study of 400 job postings and one million tweets about marketing analytics from Twitter, Liu and Burns (2018) found “big data” as one of the dominant themes in tweets and emphasized on the need to teach the conceptual foundations and tools within marketing curriculum. Becoming proactive in developing an analytics culture can provide a competitive advantage to the schools in facilitating career paths that are projected to be in demand.

Historically, marketing discipline is not perceived as a quantitatively focused area. Glenn (2011) found that a pool of employers and professors within business schools perceived marketing and management as “soft subjects” with significantly less emphasis on quantitative analysis. An empirical study of 250 business professors reported by Glenn (2011) stated that on average, professors had reduced the math and analytic-thinking requirements in their courses over the years. These conditions are a mismatch to the changing market demands. According to a national survey, marketing employers want new hires who can write coherently, think creatively, and analyze quantitative data (Glenn, 2011). Wedel and Kannan (2016) also recognize this gap of industry demand for analytics within marketing and the lack of appropriate analytical training provided by educational institutions and, therefore, emphasized on the importance of curriculum innovation to include analytics within marketing.

The proposed exercises of this study also help foster critical thinking and interdisciplinary theory, two core values of our university’s educational mission. Other colleges of business have similar missions and this case is a vehicle to address these educational objectives. Furthermore, through discussions at conferences, many academics surmise that the next set of AACSB Business Standards will have specific standards that address Big data and data analytics, as the newly AACSB Accounting Standard 7 did. By starting to address the issue now, schools will not only be prepared for the next set of standards but also will provide value and impact to its school’s curriculum.

Recent studies also suggest that incorporation of data analytics in marketing curriculum has been sporadic (Spiller and Tuten, 2015). A common response to the increasing importance of Big data is adding one analytics course to the marketing curriculum. LeClair (2018) argues that an isolated analytics course can trigger more of a disjointed approach
within the area as other professors may not see the need to introduce the topic in their courses. The author suggests a comprehensive approach in which content modules are spread across several courses is a deeper and more effective way to introduce analytics within marketing department (LeClair, 2018).

In order to make our students aware of the increasing emphasis on data analytics within marketing, we developed two exercises to be included in the marketing curriculum. First, we designed an awareness exercise for the introductory marketing course. The objective was to make students aware of the current data-focused culture within the industry and to expose freshmen students to the value of data analytics by demonstrating several techniques. Second, an in-depth analysis assignment was created for a senior-level marketing class wherein students were first lectured on common data analytic techniques followed by a hands-on analysis of the data. Both exercises were based on text mining and sentiment analysis techniques. The exercises used the same data set and presentation material. We will now briefly describe the reasoning behind creating these exercises, the data set and the presentation material used in the class. An outline of the exercises is also provided.

Marketing data analytics exercise

As stated earlier, data analytics is increasingly becoming a standard requirement in marketing. For example, targeted ads have become commonplace marketing and advertising strategies for the entertainment industry (Perlberg, 2014). Sales personnel comb millions of sales transactions to generate potential customers and then predict their propensity to buy. New software programs draw on e-mail conversations and other data to coach salespeople on how to manage a difficult account (Ovide and Dwoskin, 2015).

Marketing metrics are commonly used to measure the impact of marketing activities and realize the strategic value of data. Kotler and Keller (2007) define marketing metrics as tools which help companies quantify, compare and interpret their own performance from marketing activities. In a study of marketing effectiveness, Solcansky et al. (2011) proposed several non-financial metrics as a measure of consumers’ comprehensive view of a business. They suggest three attitudinal measures to understand consumers’ response to marketing effectiveness – sentiment, liking and loyalty. Today, marketers are exploring consumers’ attitudes through various processes such as conversation monitoring, response tracking, audience profiling, etc. (Raab, 2011). These measurements can help marketers identify behavioral patterns of consumers. Spiller and Tuten (2015) suggest that interaction measures such as comments, likes, recommendations and reviews are good sources to understand consumers’ perception of a brand/product/service. However, an issue when dealing with interaction data is the sheer mass of it. Millions of internet users share their views, opinions and reviews today. Sentiment analysis is a common method to mine these types of data (Pak and Paroubek, 2010). This method analyzes people’s opinions, evaluations, appraisals, attitudes and emotions toward entities such as products, services, organizations, individuals, issues, events, topics and their attributes (Liu, 2012).

The proposed exercises used consumer reviews to introduce students to the concept of sentiment analysis and text mining. Several researchers have suggested that an Excel spreadsheet is powerful tool to analyze data (Dickson, 2009). We used pivot tables to help students find patterns and correlations within the data set. In addition, we demonstrated the use of R in writing the sentiment analysis code to extract the core sentiment words from the data set. The details of the data set are now discussed.

The data set

The data set was based on a fictitious firm, SustainDye. A description of the case firm and its product offerings can be found below. We then created customer reviews for the ten listed product categories based on verified purchase reviews available on Amazon for
similar products. Each product had, at a minimum, 150 reviews. The comments were collected in chronological order such that the first 150 reviews, irrespective of their ratings or length, were included. In addition, we also included information on the month of purchase, the year of purchase, size, color and rating for each purchase. Please contact either author for the Excel file that contains data for all ten products.

*The firm.* SustainDye is an established Northeast company that purchases athletic apparel from reputable suppliers and then dyes the apparel to the customer’s color specifications. The company is a differentiator because all the dyes used in its products are plant-based and environmentally friendly. Moreover, SustainDye offers an expansive set of colors. Its motto is that “if you can find the color in nature, you can find it at SustainDye.” Products are sold to customers who then screen print the apparel for local elementary, middle and high schools, regional colleges and universities, as well as corporate patrons.

Table I provides product information for its customers. Note that because SustainDye offers an unlimited set of colors, it does not identify products in its systems by those colors. Rather, its engineers and technicians maintain the formulas in a separate database which can contain notations on the colors generated.

*Presentation on the basic concepts of text mining*

We prepared a presentation on some basic concepts of text mining to familiarize students with the steps involved in the process of the analysis. Concepts such as electronic word of mouth, bag of words, normalizing or stripping data, stemming, sentiment analysis and word clouds were discussed (Pang and Lee, 2008; Tang and Guo, 2015). Further, accessible and free of cost website sources to create word clouds were also shared (e.g. https://www.jasondavies.com/wordcloud/).

*The exercises*

As suggested in the American Accounting Association’s Webinar “Data Analytics and Managerial Accounting: Integrating Analytical Thinking and Technology Skills,” students should approach analyzing Big data through a series of systematic steps. We developed the exercises to adhere to the five steps of data analysis as proposed by John Dillard (2016) of Big Sky Associates. The recommended steps are – define your questions, set clear measurement priorities, collect data, analyze data and interpret results. Although the data were provided by us, we discussed how consumer comments are collected from the web.

In addition, one of the challenges of introducing data analytics exercises in regular courses is that such assignments are not yet a part of traditional textbooks and, therefore, most instructors hesitate to fit much more into their already-packed semesters. In order to achieve acceptance from instructors, exercises must be brief as to not take away too much

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Product No.</th>
<th>Product description</th>
<th>Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TS0001</td>
<td>Short-sleeve T-shirts</td>
<td>$5.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS0004</td>
<td>Long-sleeve T-shirts</td>
<td>7.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TS0009</td>
<td>Sleeveless T-shirts</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS0001</td>
<td>Crew-neck sweatshirts</td>
<td>10.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS0005</td>
<td>Hooded sweatshirts</td>
<td>12.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SS0007</td>
<td>Hooded sweatshirts with zippers</td>
<td>14.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH0003</td>
<td>Cotton shorts</td>
<td>5.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SH0015</td>
<td>Nylon shorts</td>
<td>6.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SP0001</td>
<td>Sweatpants</td>
<td>9.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP0001</td>
<td>Nylon pants</td>
<td>11.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I. Product table
time from discipline-specific content. These assignments must also provide clear instructions and suggested solutions for professors who are not comfortable with Big data and analytics. In a recent American Accounting Association’s Webinar “Data Analytics and Managerial Accounting: Integrating Analytical Thinking and Technology Skills,” 32 percent of those reported in a poll stated that they had no idea how to incorporate analytics in their classrooms yet, and 51 percent of the instructors polled noted that, to infuse it in the classroom, they would need proper solutions. This case can serve as an example to overcome the above-stated inhibitions. We will now discuss the outline of the two exercises.

Exercise 1: designed for introductory marketing course
The exercise was designed to be covered in one class period of an hour and half. For the introductory class, we started by asking students to fill in a survey that gauged the level of data analytics knowledge students had prior to engaging in the exercise. Please contact the authors for a copy of the survey. Second, a short newspaper article discussing the use of Big data in deploying advertisements (Krouse, 2017) was distributed in the class. Students read the article and discussed the general role of analytics within marketing. We then introduced them to the data set followed by a presentation on core concepts used in text mining. Next, the faculty demonstrated use of pivot tables in identifying trends within the data set. Students in groups of four brainstormed and created different relationships that can be tested using pivot tables. The faculty ran the proposed relations for each group and the class discussed the outcomes and probable implications such as trends in customer preferences of color and size choice. Each group was given an assignment to identify key sentiment words from consumer comments. Afterwards, students wrote a paragraph on the group’s proposed relationships and findings from the pivot table to be submitted during the next class period. A copy of the assignment is attached as Appendix 1. Finally, students completed a post-survey with the same set of questions as given at the start of the assignment. We compared their awareness of Big data before and after finishing the exercise.

Exercise 2: data analytics for senior level marketing course
We ran the second exercise in two sections of Marketing Research. At our business school, Marketing Research is a mandatory course for all Marketing majors and an elective for Business Analytics majors. Within the marketing area, the Marketing Research course is primarily designed to discuss data collection, analysis and interpretation across most universities in USA. We believed this class would be an appropriate platform to carry out this exercise in order to dive deeper into Big data analytic techniques. For the senior level course, we assigned two articles based on the importance of data analytics in marketing (Samuel, 2015; Nichols, 2013) prior to the class. Based on these articles, students were asked to summarize five applications or benefits that analytics play in the marketing profession. Suggested benefits include that filtering and splicing data allow companies to discover customer patterns never considered before (Samuel, 2015) and types of advertising (online display ads, TV, radio, direct mail) affect consumer behavior and ultimately, sales (Nichols, 2013).

During the assigned class period, we introduced students to the data set and went through the same presentation of core concepts in text mining as stated in exercise 1. An Information Systems (IS) faculty member then demonstrated the use of statistical package R to run sentiment analysis on the given data set. During this discussion, the IS faculty tied back all the core concepts discussed earlier to the written codes. Students were then presented with a list of approximately 100 keywords that were generated as a result of sentiment analysis of about 1,500 customer reviews. The software categorized the words as
positive and negative sentiment keywords. The keyword data were also included in the master data file.

After explaining the coding, the instructor demonstrated an alternate approach using pivot tables. The data used was from a homework assignment completed for that day. Students identified keywords in the sentiment list from a designated set of 30 comments assigned to their group.

In creating the pivot tables, the instructor first asked the students what questions might be helpful to identify trends in the marketing and sales of the short-sleeved t-shirts. Students responded that the company could examine sales by numerical rating, by year and month and color. Therefore, the instructor started out by creating a pivot table where rating was the first variable chosen, and changed the value field setting to average rather than sum. The next variable selected for the pivot table was color and then the three keywords. Students discovered that certain colors earned different average ratings (some good, some bad) and noticed that keywords revealed the reason for those scores.

Another pivot table generated by the instructor sorted month first, then color. Students noticed that lighter colors tended to be purchased more in the spring and summer while customers preferred darker colors in the Fall and Winter. Not surprising, orange was a popular color in October (for Halloween). After a few examples, the instructor asked the students to work in small groups and create pivot tables of their own. The professor walked around, answered questions of individuals and inquired about various pivot tables the students had created.

Finally, at the end of the exercise, we concluded the case with two reflection questions. First, what other data would have been helpful to enhance these insights? Second, given the analysis, what is the next logical step? We used this process as a framework in creating the hands-on exercise. Students were assigned homework to further explore one of the ten product categories, run several pivot table relations, and draft a memo suggesting future strategies. A copy of the assignment is attached as Appendix 2.

Findings
We ran paired sample \( t \)-tests on students’ responses to the survey before and after the exercise was administered in the introductory marketing class. There were 31 usable responses for the surveys. Six questionnaires were incomplete and were not included in the analysis. The survey started with an open-ended question asking students to state some benefits of using Big data in marketing. In the pre-survey, 11 out of the 31 students either left the open ended question blank or indicated that they did not know anything about analytics/Big data with respect to marketing. Only two students left it blank afterwards.

The differences between the pre and post tests for all other questions were statistically significant \( (p < 0.0001) \). Findings suggest that the exercise helped students better understand the role of Big data and data analytics in businesses. Specifically, they understood the meaning of Big data/data analytics, \( t(30) = 9.88, p < 0.001 \) and the business’ responsibility with respect to data analytics, \( t(30) = 8.10, p < 0.001 \). Further, they were aware of the tools available to analyze Big data, \( t(30) = 10.45, p < 0.001 \) and that we can apply data analytics to various areas of business including marketing, \( t(30) = 7.70, p < 0.001 \).

In the senior level marketing class, students analyzed the data via pivot tables and submitted a memo explaining patterns and trends within the data and future recommendations. Examples of submitted memos are available upon request. In these memos, students explored several interesting correlations within the data and were able to make informed decisions on future strategies.

For example, one group using pivot graphs noted that ratings had significantly increased over time. Certain colors (black/forest green and cardinal) were among the most popular and that the comments revealed that the color itself was not the problem.
Sizing tended to generate the greatest complaints. The students recommended that the company work with partners such as suppliers and manufacturers to remedy the sizing issue. Another team hypothesized that colors and seasonality would be strongly related and their pivot tables confirmed this prediction. In winter months, customers purchased darker colors, and in the Spring and Summer, lighter colors emerged as most popular. Given this seasonality, the group recommended promotions of sales on certain color during lower demand months. The team also concluded that sizing led to the greatest dissatisfaction of patrons, and therefore, investigating the demographics of those complaints could be fruitful. Students explicitly stated that gender and age can influence opinions on how snug or loose T-shirts should be.

Discussion

Data analytics in other core curriculum courses – managerial accounting
In order to address analytics to a broader student base, instructors at our university have spun off the project to include other classes in core business curriculum courses. One includes cash budgets as covered in a managerial accounting class. Instructors use the same case firm, SustainDye, but examine a different set of variables – customer, month, base amount, dispute and pay class.

Similar to the short marketing exercise, students first read an article on the applications of analytics in managerial accounting. Second, using pivot tables, students determined appropriate percentages for collections on payments. Then, students concluded on what other information would have been helpful in the analysis.

Two challenges have emerged since faculty members have implemented this accounting exercise. One is that these students, who are often not accounting majors, create nonsensical or incomplete pivot tables despite the video tutorials provided. For another teacher who employs this assignment in an accounting-majors only section, the hardest portion of the assignment is the critical thinking portion. Students do not hesitate with the pivot tables but cannot link the analyzed data back to determine monthly collection amounts. While these are drawbacks, it does show that introduction of such exercises are imperative in higher education to refine analytical and critical-thinking skills. Furthermore, based on similar pre- and post-tests, the t-tests for the accounting students revealed that students believe they have a greater understanding of Big data and data analytics after completing the exercise as compared to before starting the assignment ($p < 0.001$).

Implications and limitations of curriculum projects on marketing and other business areas

The emphasis on analytics in our institution’s marketing courses as well as in other business classes reflects how organizations can add value through analytics (Wedel and Kannan, 2016). Wedel and Kannan (2016) first state that organizations must have a culture that facilitates the importance of analytics. That culture exists at our university. Not only are more projects being developed across multiple business classes, but also data analytics co-majors and minors now are available to all of our school’s business students.

Second, a structure must be built that integrates business functions and breaks down silos. Often “turf wars” erupt between marketing analysts and information technology professionals when examining consumer and product data (Jobs et al., 2016). Data analytics does not belong to one business discipline; it belongs to them all. Therefore, exposing students in multiple core curriculum courses demonstrates the many areas that business analytics can add value to an organization.

Third, an organization must create a platform where individuals have both analytic skills and broad knowledge in a business discipline (specifically in the Wedel and Kannan, 2016 article, marketing knowledge). With marketing analytics alone, individuals must
possess information technology capabilities, an understanding of marketing analytics tools, and customer awareness. Xu et al. (2016) refer to this as knowledge fusion. Erevelles et al. (2016) complain that higher education has not swiftly altered curricula to address a shortage of consumer data scientists.

However, in the project we have created, instructors at our university administer the projects in the core curriculum classes only after exposing the students to the content of that business discipline. The projects all have fallen toward the end of the semester – for the basic marketing course, this means that students have already learned the elements of product, pricing, promotion and distribution. For example, we use analytic features of Excel in order to demonstrate product value through customer sentiments to promote certain product characteristics (color, size) as well as the overall brand. Xu et al. (2016) note that the value of sentiment analysis can lead to new product strategies and faster modifications to new products. But such insight from the data cannot be fully gained unless the analyst understands product strategies to begin with.

In addition, one major limitation of this study is the cross-sectional data. The case presented in the article is based on data collected from one section of introductory and core marketing course. Data collected over a period of several years can provide us with a much deeper understanding of students’ learning curve as a result of these exercises.

As described earlier, from these projects, students grasp how Excel assists in understanding the marketing problem – the level of product acceptance – through sentiment analysis. In upper-level marketing courses, students refine the IT knowledge through computer programming and word clouds. Moreover, at our university, majoring in analytics can only be fulfilled as a co-major; once must also concentrate on a particular business discipline. Therefore, these projects and initiatives promote knowledge fusion and foster the culture of analytics at our school.

Conclusion
The paper describes how brief exercises throughout the business curriculum can help business students achieve a broader understanding of what Big data and data analytics mean in the workplace. This paper creates a case for the introductory and senior level marketing courses. Going forward, the marketing professor plans to develop a more complex case in the capstone marketing course based on the data used in this project. Indeed, by involving more and more faculty across multiple disciplines, the culture we are building will be achieved.

References


Appendix 1. Sentiment analysis exercise

Background information at SustainDye
SustainDye is an established Northeast company that purchases athletic apparel from reputable suppliers and then dyes the apparel to the customer’s color specifications. The company is a differentiator because all the dyes used in its products are plant-based and environmentally friendly. Moreover, SustainDye offers an expansive set of colors. Its motto is that “if you can find the color in nature, you can find it at SustainDye.” Products are sold to customers who then screen print the apparel for local elementary, middle and high schools, regional colleges and universities, as well as corporate patrons.

The Director of Marketing wants to gain better insight into the satisfaction of customers in order to improve sales and expand its product lines. Customers have posted numerous comments on its website regarding one of its products, the short-sleeved t-shirt. An intern gathered customer reviews from SustainDye’s website and entered the data in the Excel file titled, “Customer Comments.” The file contains the customer reviews for SustainDye’s products over the last several years.

Your task is to understand the overall opinions behind these reviews using sentiment analysis. You are to perform text analysis for the first few comments in this file. From your lead, the intern will then examine the entire file and list the appropriate sentiments.

Pull out keywords from the customer reviews on the next page that match the terms in the sentiments table. Write those keywords in the columns to the right of the comments column. The first comment has been done for you.

Also, write a paragraph on the variables that the group tested using pivot table and the findings.

| available | P | happy | P | replaced | P |
| better | P | hope | P | right | P |
| cheap | N | ill | N | satisfied | P |
| color | P | kind | P | snag | N |
| come | P | like | P | soft | P |
| comfort | P | long | N | solid | P |
| cool | P | loose | N | super | P |
| durable | P | love | P | thought | P |
| excellent | P | nice | P | time | P |
| expensive | N | perfect | P | use | P |
| extreme | N | perfectly | P | wick | N |
| fabric | N | pleased | P | work | P |
| fine | P | pretty | P | worth | P |
| good | P | product | P | wrong | N |
| great | P | recommend | P |

Table AI. Sentiments table

Notes: P, Positive attitude; N, negative attitude
Appendix 2. Data analytics exercise in marketing

Text mining of customer reviews at SustainDye

SustainDye is an established Northeast company that purchases athletic apparel from reputable suppliers and then dyes the apparel to the customer’s color specifications. The company is a differentiator because all the dyes used in its products are plant-based and environmentally friendly. Moreover, SustainDye offers an expansive set of colors. Its motto is that “if you can find the color in nature, you can find it at SustainDye.” Products are sold to customers who then screen print the apparel for local elementary, middle and high schools, regional colleges and universities, as well as corporate patrons.

The Director of Marketing wants to gain better insight into the satisfaction of customers in order to improve sales and expand its product lines. Customers have posted numerous comments on its website regarding one of its products, the short-sleeved t-shirt. An intern gathered customer reviews from SustainDye’s website and entered the data in the Excel file titled, “Table I – Comments.” The first tab of this file contains the customer reviews and the second tab reflects common sentiments of reviews for all of SustainDye’s products over the last several years. Your task is to understand these reviews better by pulling out these keywords from the short-sleeve t-shirt reviews.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Customer comment</th>
<th>Keyword 1</th>
<th>Keyword 2</th>
<th>Keyword 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Love it! I have purchased seven shirts so far and may order more at some point. When I first ordered these shirts I had my doubts about the quality I was getting since the price was so low. Compared to the big name brands for performance shirts this is a steal. I also like the fact that they have no logo. The solid color shirts in my opinion run slightly bigger which is no big deal to me. Actually they are more comfortable. I ordered large and I am 6'2&quot; 230LBS 36 INCH WAIST big arms. Hope this helps</td>
<td>love</td>
<td>color</td>
<td>comfort</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fits very nicely. Love the color combo as well. Somewhat reminds me of some of the Adidas shirts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fits well, looks good, wicks away sweat well. Good value</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FYI, I probably have 30 different performance shirts, from about every manufacturer you could name–Nike, Adidas, Under Armour, etc. I’d say it’s pretty comparable to them at a good discounted price to them Nice budget alternative to the big names. I go through many of these types of shirts per year, generally just running, biking, etc. My favorites are Nike and Adidas, but they’ve become quite costly. I thought that I would try one of these as a cheaper alternative, since all I do is ruin them with sweat anyway. So far, so good! The material seems to be on par with the others, and the fit is fine. It seems slightly less “fitted” than my Adidas, but doesn’t look baggy or goofy. Just looks like a dry-fit tee. The shirt is good enough that I’m going to buy a few more. I’ll know more by the end of the summer, but so far, this looks like a fantastic deal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almost perfect. I’m 5’11&quot; 175 pounds, lean and fit. I bought the small and it fits perfect […] BUT […] it could be just a tiny bit more fitting. Arms are a good length but could be a half inch shorter. Neckline was perfect, Fabric is of a thin gauge which is a must for me. On a side note, these satin shirts clean easy in a sink, are light and pack up tiny, which makes them great for traveling. No muss, no fuss Odd neckline. I like the color, but the neck opening is 3 times too large. Makes the fit of the shirt odd. Only purchased for the gym, so no need to return. I got another of the same different color and fits great Would be 5 star but too large. I loved the shirt. The color is perfect. The quality fine. It arrived on time. Just be warned, these shirts really do run large! I usually wear an XL, but am reordering a M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Requirements:

(1) Your instructor will assign you a set number of comments. Peruse those comments and pull out 2-3 keywords from each of your assigned reviews that match the terms in the sentiments tab. Write those keywords in the columns to the right of the comments column. NOTE: The comments have been truncated in the Excel cell so double click on that cell to reveal the entire comment.

(2) Post your keywords to the Google Docs file posted under the “Collaborations” tab of your Canvas account. Make sure your words match up with your assigned comments.

(3) Once your classmates have uploaded all of the keywords to the short-sleeve t-shirt spreadsheet, use pivot tables to discover patterns relating to the reviews, including other variables listed such as the month of purchase, the year of purchase, size, color and rating. To create pivot tables, go to the Insert Tab, click on pivot tables and highlight all of the data cells. Then, check the boxes of the variables you want to analyze.

(4) Summarize your findings in a memo to the Director of Marketing and upload that file under the designated Assignments tab in Canvas. In your communication, note any other issues or concerns you have with the present list of customer reviews. Comment on what other data would have been helpful to enhance these insights. Finally, recommend what is the next logical step for the Director of Marketing regarding the short-sleeve t-shirt.

Corresponding author
Anubha Mishra can be contacted at: amishra@rider.edu

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website:
www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Abstract

**Purpose** – The purpose of this paper is to focus on mapping the ways in which HE institutions enhance faculty members’ professional development. More precisely, by introducing a case from one of the well-established universities in Iran, the authors aim to examine the focus of faculty development (FD) activities and how FD is conducted, with a view to shedding light on the challenges of and disparities between faculty roles and areas of FD in higher education (HE) in Iran as a developing country.

**Design/methodology/approach** – In order to explore and map the characteristics of FD and analyse the trends that Iranian HE institutions are experiencing in this area, a sequential explanatory multiple sources design, consisting of two distinct phases, was implemented (Creswell, 2012). In this design, the documents regarding the faculty professional development (decisions, agreements, The Job Structure Memorandum, and relevant documents and policies at the Iranian Ministry of Science, Research and Technology and the studied HE institution) were analysed first. Next, field records were collected by means of a series semi-structured interviews with faculty members in the given HE setting.

**Findings** – The analysis of the collected data brought to the surface three themes, namely, FD: policies and procedures, faculties professional development in practice, and associated challenges and future prospects. These initial findings helped to understand if and how FD activities occur as well as map the challenges and complexities in faculties’ CPD in Iranian HE. Further, it discusses possible solutions to develop relevant and practical professional development.

**Research limitations/implications** – This case study is partly limited to a group of faculty members’ experiences and reflections on FD in one Iranian HE institution. Conducting additional surveys and observations with a large sample of the faculties and students may verify and consolidate the findings of the study and contribute to further insights on the ways faculties’ professional development can be transformed.

**Practical implications** – Taking into account the findings of the study, a dynamic framework for continued professional development of faculties in Iran is developed.

**Originality/value** – The findings of the study present valuable insights into the FD procedures, challenges and paradoxes that seem to shape FD in Iranian HE institutions. Moreover, the findings indicated much-needed structural modifications to simplify and harmonise the policies and procedures to harness profession development. To conclude, the initiatives and action plans that may contribute to FD and reshape the Iranian HE landscape is discussed. The applications and implications are also relevant for similar HE systems in developing countries.

**Keywords** Higher education, Qualitative research, Continuing professional development, Iran, Educational development, Faculty development

Introduction

By addressing a case, this study provides an overview of the current state of faculty development (FD) in Iran and attempts to map the challenges and changes that have occurred in recent years. Iranian higher education (HE) has been affected by societal changes...
developments and changes in the globalised world. These changes do not only relate to
globalisation, but also to factors such as the increased demand for accountability, HE
institutions striving for “excellence” while, at the same time, experiencing competitive
pressure to become more efficient, the expansion of student bodies in HE institutions and
emerging information and communication technology-based initiatives. In order to adapt to
and keep abreast of these changes and developments, some Iranian HE institutions have
adopted innovative approaches aimed at empowering their key actors, i.e. faculty members.

The HE system in Iran consists of 2,640 universities and colleges. With 84,540 full-time
faculty members and more than four and half million students, these universities and
university colleges award degrees at various levels, from associate to PhD degrees, in all
academic disciplines. It should be noted that from 2007 to 2014, HE institutions were
strongly encouraged to increase their activities in terms of student enrolment and adding
new fields of studies, which was in line with the Iranian Government’s policies at that time.
Correspondingly, the student body increased from almost 2.8 to 4.8m.

Despite this large boost, the rate of increase in other sectors of the HE system, such as
qualified faculty members and financial resources, has not kept pace with increases in the
student population. The dramatic and rapid increase in the student body has further
challenged the quality of teaching and education and put considerable pressure on faculty
members (Institute for Research and Planning in Higher Education, 2015). Similarly, the
findings of Zahedi and Bazargan (2013) reveal that a significant number of faculty members
in main state universities experience high levels of burnout. Taking into account the local
and global challenges of globalisation and information technology, faculty members are
coming under increasing pressure in teaching, research and service contexts.

The continuous professional development of teachers is accordingly seen as a key
factor for both enhancing and ensuring quality in HE (Tippins, 2003). As a result, a
number of initiatives have been developed to facilitate faculty members’ professional
development. For instance, some of the initiatives have already been conceptualised in
some Iranian medical universities and led to the establishment of Educational
Development Centres (Ahmady et al., 2009). It should be noted that medical education
in Iran has been integrated into the healthcare system to form the Ministry of Health and
Medical Education (Azizi, 1997).

Despite these efforts, a large number of HE institutions in developing countries have no
distinct or well-documented plan for developing faculty competencies (cf. Phuong et al.,
2017; Phuong et al., 2015). In those cases where FD centres or FD plans exist, the
development initiatives often consist of occasional, short-term activities that are introduced
through top-down processes (Chaudary, 2011).

It would appear that the professional development of faculty members is a relatively
new phenomenon in HE institutions in developing countries and that its identity,
functions and strategies are still being explored (Phuong et al., 2017; Zahedi and Bazargan,
2013). But what is known about FD in developing countries like Iran? How does the
professional development of faculties function there? Which areas are focussed on, and
how? What informs the professional development actions of academics? To date, very
little research has been conducted on such questions and the ways in which FD activities
are taken into account. In an attempt to bridge this research gap, this paper focusses on
mapping how HE institutions enhance faculty members’ professional development. More
precisely, by introducing the case a of a well-established university in Iran, we aim to
examine the focus of FD activities and how FD is conducted, with a view to shedding light
on the challenges of and disparities between faculty roles and areas of FD in HE in Iran as
a developing country.

The studied HE institution is a graduate university located in the capital city of Iran,
Tehran. It was initially established to educate academic staff and researchers for HE
institutions across Iran. The university, with its 15 faculties, has been consistently ranked as one of the top universities in Iran. The university has about 10,000 registered postgraduate students at master’s and doctoral levels. With more than 690 full-time faculty members, the studied HE institution offers more than 120 graduate programmes.

Studying this university as a case will hopefully contribute to a better understanding of the procedures, challenges and paradoxes that seem to shape FD and quality enhancement in Iranian HE institutions.

Continuing professional development

Continuing professional development, also referred in the literature as “FD”, encompasses a wide range of interventions and activities aimed at improving faculty members’ performances in their different roles as scholars, advisers, designers and evaluators of academic programmes and courses, academic leaders, contributors to public service and participants in institutional decisions, all of which contribute to a college’s or university’s mission (Gaff and Justice, 1978; Gillespie and Robertson, 2010; Groccia, 2010). These categories address the wide range of possible roles that faculty members are expected to fill in HE institutions and, consequently, how their competencies should be developed. Accordingly, CPD is seen as an ongoing process which takes place throughout the faculty members’ academic life.

A faculty’s professional development is therefore “no longer an optional or dispensable ‘add-on’ to the list of benefits available to faculty at universities” (Nathan, 1994, p. 508), but is rather seen as playing a critical role in the promotion of academic excellence. Faculty members’ development is accordingly considered as a key factor for enhancing and ensuring quality and supporting institutional change in HE institutions.

In order to prepare faculty members for their multiple roles, different kinds of FD activities have been developed and pursued. These include formal/informal or planned/incidental activities, such as attending courses, workshops and conferences, networking, learning by doing, mentoring and taking part in online or offline forums (McKinney et al., 2005; Clegg, 2003; Ferman, 2002). Kennedy (2005) characterised nine main CPD models which can define faculty members’ learning opportunities including training, award bearing, deficit, cascade, standards based, coaching/mentoring, community of practice, action research and transformative. Any of these CPD models can inform one or more of the expected roles of the faculty (Phuong et al., 2017).

In order to facilitate faculty members’ professional development and nurture a culture of continuing professional development, a number of teaching and learning centres in HE institutions have been initiated (Roscoe, 2002). These centres are designed to support faculty members in developing the knowledge and skills they will need to conduct their different roles as teachers, researchers, service providers and administrators (Weimer, 2010). However, FD activities in HE institutions have mostly focussed on enhancing faculty members’ pedagogical competencies, e.g. mastering a discipline in order to achieve greater success and student satisfaction (Austin and Sorcinelli, 2013). The professional development of faculties can be characterised as continuing and long-term, contextual, joint and practice-driven initiatives that create formal and informal opportunities to articulate broader qualitative changes in alignment with institutional and personal needs (see Clegg, 2003; Nworie et al., 2013; Saroyan and Frenay, 2010).

Research method

A sequential, explanatory, multiple sources design consisting of two distinct phases was used to explore and map the characteristics of FD and to analyse the present trends of Iranian HE institutions (Creswell, 2012). Documents relating to a faculty’s professional development (decisions, agreements, Job Structure Memorandum and other relevant
documents and policies at the Iranian Ministry of Science, Research and Technology and the studied HE institution) were analysed first. Next, field records were collected by means of semi-structured interviews with faculty members in the given HE setting (Connelly and Clandinin, 1990). The audio-recorded interviews were then analysed and used to help to explain and elaborate on the data obtained from the analysis of the documents and policies.

Participants
A purposive sample of 14 prominent faculty members was chosen for semi-structured interviews. The participants were selected on the basis of their contributions to the university’s academic achievements and recommendations (the Vice Chancellor for Education and the head of the Strategic Planning Office). The participants, all of which had diverse professional backgrounds, were drawn from the following faculties: Mechanical Engineering, Arts, Mining and Metallurgy, Agriculture, Basic Sciences, Humanities, Natural Resources and Marine Sciences, Law, Mathematical Sciences, Biological Sciences, Management and Economics, Electrical and Computer Engineering and Chemical Engineering. All the participants were male, with teaching experiences ranging from 10 to 30 years and had occupied different positions in the institutional hierarchy, e.g. head of department, head of school and influential professors in their fields.

Collected data and procedure
Initially, related government policy documents at national and local levels (the latter from the studied HE institution) were collected. Only those documents that addressed FD were included in the review and analysis. The documents that were collected included policies, strategic plans, legislation, reports, decisions and the Job Structure Memorandum and were accessed via personal contact and several different online sources, including search engines and sites hosted by the Iranian Ministry of Science, Research and Technology.

The semi-structured interviews lasted between 60 and 90 min, were audio-taped and took place in the interviewees’ offices. The interviews focussed on how the participants explained their experiences of and reasoning around FD. In particular, they were asked about the process and key factors in their professional development at the studied institution, the faculty’s development goals and procedures at the studied institution, the process of developing new faculty competencies, the development of programmes/activities to promote faculty competencies and the challenges of and possible suggestions for professional development in the various faculties. All the interviews were later transcribed and analysed.

Data analysis
In order to gain a deeper understanding of the studied phenomenon, the data were analysed using content analysis in an iterative process (as described in Creswell, 2012). Content analysis provided a systematic approach to organising the qualitative data (Schreier, 2012). This enables us to “quantitative analysis of seemingly qualitative data” (Smith et al., 1996, p. 355).

More specifically, the following steps were taken in the analysis of the data.

The collected documents were read in order to structure the data and to differentiate between different meaningful segments of it. The identified meaningful segments were then coded and categorised based on their particular focus (Schreier, 2012). The content analysis of the documents served to map the undertaken initiatives and procedures in the implementation of the continuing development of faculties in Iranian HE institutions.

The audio-recorded interviews were transcribed and the transcriptions were read carefully in order to discern the main lines of reasoning and to create a coding scheme.
In this process, relevant keywords or phrases that aligned with the aims of the study were identified, and then emerged themes were coded. The emerged codes were placed under relevant sub-categories and categories. Next, in a second coding cycle, the interview transcripts and codes were re-read and checked by another independent researcher to verify and reconfigure the key themes. Representative examples from each theme were then selected and excerpts from the faculties' original response extracted as evidence. The interviews were carried out in Persian and were partly translated into English by the first author.

Findings
The analysis of the collected data led to the emergence of the following three themes: FD: policies and procedures, faculties' professional development in practice, and associated challenges and future prospects. These initial findings helped us to understand whether and how FD activities occurred and enabled us to map the challenges and complexities in faculties' CPD in Iranian HE. Further, the analysis highlighted possible solutions for developing a relevant and practical professional development.

FD: policies and procedures
The continued professional development of teachers is acknowledged in the analysed policy documents (Ministry of Science Research and Technology, 2015a, b; Tarbiat Modares University, 2012a). The Job Structure Memorandum especially emphasises the importance of developing faculties' educational and research competencies. Initiated by the need to obtain and disseminate more systematic knowledge about how Iranian HE institutions approach FD at the strategic and practical levels, the documents recommend the establishment of a systematic approach to FD (Ministry of Science Research and Technology, 2015a, b). For instance, the Job Structure Memorandum emphasises the "importance of taking a more structured approach to faculty development" (see pages 15 and 18).

FD practices are influenced by an individual university's policies and (sub-)strategies. Some universities, such as Tarbiat Modares University (TMU) and Shahid Beheshti University, emphasise teachers' professional development in their Strategic Change Plan (Tarbiat Modares University, 2012a). According to the TMU's Strategic Change Plan, a centre with specific responsibility for FD activities should be developed in order to support faculty members in the different stages of their careers. At a policy level, the professional development of faculty members is supported by the TMU University Staff Policy.

The analysis of documents at the national and local level reveals contradictions in terms of what an empowered university teacher looks like and how teachers' competencies should be measured and developed. The latest circulars from the Supreme Council of Cultural Revolution, the highest decision-making body for HE, on FD and promotion clearly state two sets of aims: ideological and pedagogical development. The faculty promotion document also stresses the importance of taking part in such activities (Supreme Council of Cultural Revolution, 2012). However, dominant policies like these are not popular with faculty members who are eager to define the means and ends of their development.

The collected data also show that the ways in which these policies are translated into practice are patchy. According to the interviewed faculty members, some of the policies and strategies reflect wishful thinking on the part of policymakers and have not yet been put into practice, partly because they would not be quantifiable. As one participant commented:

[…] taking part in such initiatives is not so useful, it is waste of time sitting and listening to something that is either irrelevant to what we do or too general to apply in practice.

This can generate tension between contradictory educational ideals based on political ideologies and faculty members' normative expectations associated with what they are expected to do. Such contradictory policies and trends seem to cancel each other out.
Similarly, another participant emphasised the importance of establishing a framework for FD and outlined how such a framework should be mapped out:

The university should set a vital framework to promote faculty members’ skills. The framework should not encourage publishing and teaching, but should scaffold a context to publish and teach effectively.

The importance of establishing a framework for continuing FD was further emphasised by the interviewed faculty members. There was a widespread belief among the participants that developing a comprehensive plan for CPD could enhance the effectiveness and quality of their activities.

However, faculty members are implicitly expected to have and develop their own range of professional skills, including pedagogical competencies. Mastering such competencies appears to be taken for granted in Iranian HE. This is reflected in the following quote from one of the interviewees:

There is no established framework for faculty professional development, everyone should explore his own ways of development.

Many of the interviewees addressed this in the context of their own development processes. It was generally assumed that each faculty member would themselves explore how they should develop their competencies and what these should be. In view of this, FD is largely based on individual faculty members’ initiatives, rather than structured institutional programmes designed to develop professional skills in general and pedagogical competencies in particular. The lack of centres/units for developing faculty members’ competencies in the majority of HE institutions is further evidence of this approach.

Iranian HE institutions do not offer post-tenured FD programmes and new faculty members enter teaching environments directly after completing their doctoral studies, which further illustrates the reliance on individual development initiatives:

[...], in the recruiting of new faculty members, the focus is totally on the applicants’ research achievements and publications, rather than their educational experiences.

Additionally, PhD programmes in Iran are mostly research-centred and do not usually require students to develop pedagogical competencies. In practice, research in subject areas does not automatically provide insights into the teaching and learning of these areas, although research that involves reflections on learning and teaching processes does. Thus, post-tenured faculty members often learn to teach by a long process of trial and error and by using their own teachers as role models.

However, there is evidence to suggest that some initiatives to embed FD institutionally, as in TMU, are in place. The development of faculty members’ teaching competencies has also been given particular attention by providing educational workshops and courses. Despite this, many of the interviewed faculty members were not convinced of the effectiveness of such courses, and instead argued that subject-oriented teaching that enabled them to explore ways of teaching and development could be more productive.

**Faculties’ professional development in practice**

According to the interviewees, their professional development was mostly based on self-directed and ad hoc activities. The participants had thus considered their development as a set of self-directed learning that was informed by environmental and ecological factors.

A participant explained the importance of ecological aspects in professional development:

At the start of my career we had a newly established department. I was appointed as head of department having opportunities to pursue professional passions. There wasn’t so much competition for departmental roles. Then I received a research grant. The trust invested in me and
the circumstances around it scaffolded my ways of development. But, unfortunately, such opportunities and surrounding circumstances are not available to newly recruited faculty members nowadays. There is so much competition for roles and positions.

The interviewees argued that their individual characters and endeavours had provided them with unique opportunities to develop their competencies. For instance, one of the interviewees mapped his professional development as an:

[...] endless trial and error to adapt myself to the academic world’s expectations and by taking my best teachers as role models.

This implies that self-directed activities play an important role in developing faculty members’ professional competencies.

The interviewees also acknowledged the role of ecological factors in their professional development and the inclusion of a variety of environmental and organisational issues, such as being able to work with top few scholars, get involved in projects, participate in educational workshops and conferences, receive administrative positions and supervise doctoral students. This is clearly indicated by one of the interviewees:

Well, [...], everything including faculty members’ development is self-directed rather than system oriented. In other words, there is neither a systemic approach to promote faculty competencies nor a functional system to do that. Thus, developing faculty competencies is seen as my own personal task [...].

A number of the participants regarded ecological factors as important for their professional development. However, using ecological factors to develop own competencies could be seen as self-directed learning, rather than organisational or pre-planned activity for FD.

Conducting stand-alone courses, workshops or seminars was another aspect that was reflected in many of the conducted interviews. These activities aimed to extend the faculty members’ competencies and cover a variety of issues, such as learning theories, educational technologies and cultural and ideological issues. It was assumed that introducing stand-alone courses or workshops could help faculties to change their ways of being, understanding and teaching. Appreciating the provision of stand-alone courses or workshops, the participants stated that “courses should be closely linked to their educational practices”. However, some of the participants were somewhat negative to workshops or seminars. One participant commented:

I am not very optimistic about the effectiveness of the provided courses and workshops. There isn’t much evidence to support their effectiveness, they may only have marginal effects.

They particularly suggested that the focus of CPD initiatives should be on changing the educational environments, rather than providing general workshops and courses.

The participants also highlighted other aspects of professional development, such as appointing excellent teachers and best researchers. According to them, this would encourage faculties to expand their competencies. They further suggested that conducting CPD initiatives by excellent teachers from diverse disciplines would be helpful.

Associated challenges and future prospects

The analysis of the interviews and policy documents highlighted a number of challenges and dilemmas that could influence faculty members’ professional development. The interviewees also contributed a number of ideas and suggestions for mapping how the continued professional development of teachers could be structured. The challenges and future prospects that were addressed came under three broad headings: “systematic approach to faculty development”, “centralised and hierarchical structure” and “faculties’ economic and livelihood concerns”.

Systematic approach to FD

The lack of well-established systems and structures for developing faculty members’ professional competencies is clearly visible in the collected data. The analysis of the policy documents reveals that there is very little systematic relationship between the university’s different divisions with responsibility for recruitment, rewards, assessments and the promotion of faculties. One participant said:

[...] we have too many regulations and protocols. Some of them are irrelevant to what we are doing [...] it is almost impossible to take into account all of those diverse regulations in practice.

The participants similarly highlighted the lack of transparency and complexity of the procedures. They were of the opinion that “harmonising and simplifying procedures and policies could be of great benefit to the academic profession”. They particularly underlined the importance of developing a contextualised and comprehensive plan for FD in alignment with academic policy decisions, including recruitment, rewards, assessments and promotions. Such a plan could map the continued professional development of faculties and their staff. One participant argued that:

[...] developing a contextualised and comprehensive plan for faculty development could simplify the system and may help faculties to think out of the box, to constantly revaluate their practices [...].

In addition, the participants highlighted the practice of assigning teaching assistants (TA) and developing professional TA programmes. They further indicated that doctoral studies were mostly research-based and that doctoral students were not properly equipped for the different roles and responsibilities they were expected to perform as faculty members. Two of the participants argued for redefining the procedures so that graduate students could be formally integrated as TA. Further, it was felt that the provision of educational activities could enhance their pedagogical competencies in alignment with their subject areas, which would better prepare them for their professional lives.

Cultural barriers in the continuing professional development of faculties

Academic culture and understanding the realities of HE institutions also emerged frequently in the interviews. The participants emphasised the need to understand the realities of academic culture and the potential cultural barriers that may have an impact on faculties’ CPD. As one individual stated, “most of the faculties prefer to do their projects and teaching individually, I think the culture of working together, sharing and collaborating must be enhanced”. Another added that:

[...] newly recruited faculty members usually enter the academic world with thousands of great ideas, but after a while see that they have difficulty getting into the system [...].

They thus argued for the development of a culture of collegiality in order to create opportunities for the continuing development of all faculties. As one participant stated:

[...] the sustainable change in the university requires a commitment to support collaborative and community work [...]. The group can push individuals to constantly think about how things could be done differently [...].

Similarly, the participants suggested that instead of creating new structures with ambiguous and modest operandi, the university should empower individual schools and departments to create an environment for continuing development in their respective faculties.

Centralised and hierarchical structure

The interviewees criticised the existing bureaucratic and hierarchical structures because it was felt that they hindered the growth of faculties’ professorial autonomy and participation.
They were of the opinion that such mechanistic and top-down structures left little room for the active participation of faculties in academic decision making. Highlighting the complex bureaucratic controls in HE institutions, one of the interviewees suggested that:

[…] the authorities should make tough decisions […] the higher education institutions need to be governed by faculties […].

Another participant added:

The hierarchical structure imposed from the top down makes the higher education system more uniform, but in order to develop, each university should focus on its own needs and potential.

The interviewees suggested that decision-making processes should be decentralised. One of the participants suggested that “young and newly recruited faculty members should be involved in the university’s decision making and decision-making processes e.g. in the university councils”.

Academic freedom and institutional autonomy in terms of being sufficiently independent from state control were also underlined by the interviewees and recurred in the conducted interviews:

The autonomy of the university, faculty and department should be granted. For instance, as dean of the faculty I cannot give any rewards to a faculty member who has done a great job!

Another participant noted that:

[…] If we cannot trust our faculty members as elites of the society to run their institutions, then who can we trust? At least they can give the universities and departments the authority to fulfil their predefined visions.

It was thought that the increased politicisation of universities could affect the academic profession and make the professional development of faculties more challenging. The participants accordingly highlighted the protection of academic freedom.

Insufficient resources and livelihood concerns
Another challenge that emerged in the data analysis was limited resources, both in terms of personnel and finances. For instance, the newly recruited faculty members’ economic and livelihood concerns were noted in many of the interviews. By addressing such concerns, a participant indicated that “faculty members are so busy with economic and livelihood concerns, which doesn’t leave any room for developing their competencies”. Another noted that “We should consider the financial needs of new faculty members”.

External pressures, followed by uncertainty and economic pressure, were identified as factors that impeded faculty members’ professional development, in that they led to members working extra hours in industry, teaching at other institutions, consulting or working in other sectors. Moreover, limited access to scientific communities, laboratories, resources and the internet in most HE institutions (see Nazarzadeh Zare et al., 2016) hindered faculty members’ professional development. The participants further suggested that the university should create a mechanism to support newly recruited faculty members with adequate salaries and a stable career path.

Discussion and implications for practice
The findings of the study show that self-directed learning and ad hoc activities play a dominant role in FD in Iranian HE institutions. FD is often dependent on the efforts of individual faculty members, rather than planned throughout the organisation, i.e. it is the result of personal, rather than institutional interventions. University teachers are, thus, not required to obtain any pedagogical qualifications. There are also very few FD units or
centres for structuring and systematically providing opportunities to develop faculty members’ competencies. This is consistent with the findings of earlier studies of Asian HE institutions (see Chaudary, 2011; Phuong et al., 2015).

The analysis of the policy documents demonstrates that there are a multitude of regulations and circulars relating to the recruitment, retention, promotion and reward of faculty members, many of which are complex and, in some cases, contradictory. For instance, issues concerning faculty members’ development, rewards and promotion are articulated differently in the circulars. The complexity is also often amplified due to the lack of any systematic relationship between the institutions’ different divisions.

In the analysed documents and the conducted interviews, the promotion of religious ideologies is clearly indicated as an absolute requirement for faculty promotion. This could signify that the professional development of faculty members is broadly linked to initiatives aimed at fostering their religious beliefs and ideological tendencies, and how these can later be strengthened and transferred to students. However, many of these issues may not relate to what faculty members are expected to accomplish.

Further, analysing the policy documents at both national and institutional levels suggests that FD activities are not yet a primary concern in a number of Iranian HE institutions. Despite the described circumstances, the continuing professional development of faculty members in some HE institutions is gradually being taken into consideration (see Tarbiat Modares University’s (2012b) Strategic Change Plan as an example). Nonetheless, there is no comprehensive road map to transform these ambitious policies into practice (Pourkarimi, 2011). This puts considerable pressure on faculties, and especially a new faculty, to cope with a wide array of duties and expectations. In order to address the increasing challenges, such as increased demands for accountability, budgetary concerns, internationalisation and the expansion of information technology (Gillespie and Robertson, 2010), Iranian HE institutions will need to introduce innovative and sustainable approaches that empower their faculty members.

Taking the findings of the study into account, a dynamic framework for continued professional development of HE faculties and their staff in Iran needs to be developed. It is also clear that no CDP framework/model would fit all HE institutions. An appropriate framework would therefore need to be adopted that took the specific context, culture and unique needs of the HE institutions into account (Austin and Sorcinelli, 2013).

As shown in Figure 1, a CPD framework for faculty members that focusses on re-engineering the procedures and engaging key actors, i.e. faculty members, gatekeepers, external stakeholders and students, in the process could be developed. This framework would aim to situate faculty members’ professional development in their cultural frames of reference (Masoumi and Lindström, 2009). In the CPD framework, the pedagogical aspects would complement others, such as research, mentoring, career advancement and individual development. Initially, it is suggested that all the diverse and puzzling policies, procedures and protocols should be reviewed, simplified and harmonised based on the HE institutions’ missions. In order to foster institutional and individual excellence, the university’s bureaucratic procedures and circulars for FD should be redesigned. A wholesale redesign of the structure could simplify the procedures and facilitate transparency.

Faculties (and even students) should be actively involved in reviewing and re-engineering the university’s circulars, regulations and procedures. How other countries’ top universities structure procedures, strategies and practices may offer insights that could help to change the practices in Iran and other developing countries (Austin and Sorcinelli, 2013; Nworie et al., 2013; Steinert, 2014).

Second, by establishing FD centres, HE institutions could systematically plan, implement and refine CPD initiatives. Such a systematic approach to CPD could help HE institutions to shift from self-directed and ad hoc activities to institutional and systematic initiatives.
Obviously, the developed CPD programmes and initiatives should align with the faculties’ recruitment, retention, rewards and promotion policies, measures and procedures. It is expected that faculties will become fully involved in and take responsibility for educational decisions about how such initiatives could be developed, conducted and refined. Taking a multidimensional approach that includes the different yet interrelated measures to promote faculty members’ competencies could significantly contribute to FD as a whole (Groccia, 2010).

Third, a close review and monitoring of the conducted CPD initiatives would help to show how well faculty members’ competencies are transformed and the extent to which the CPD initiatives have transformed HE institutions. Further, the review would provide opportunities to reflect on achievements and continuously promote the CPD activities. The continuing review could focus on assessing “what matters; connect with institutional and centre goals; develop a cohesive system to collect data; embed assessment into regular practice; collaborate strategically; and plan for and use the results” (Fink, 2013, p. 58).

Finally, nurturing a culture of continuing professional development in HE institutions as a social learning system could support institutional change (Wenger and Snyder, 2000). Faculty members’ greater engagement in designing and establishing CPD systems could, accordingly, ensure institutional quality. It could be thus argued that change in an HE institution requires a commitment to approaching a faculty’s continuous professional development as “collaborative, community work within and beyond the institution” (Austin and Sorcinelli, 2013, p. 95). Having a systematic approach to the design and delivery of innovative continuing professional development would ensure that faculties invest in academic growth and excellence.

Likewise, the creation of local and national communities and networks in particular areas would help isolated faculties to link up, share and accumulate their ideas and experiences. Such online and offline communities could offer a wide range of tools and opportunities to develop practitioners’ competencies (see Bowskill et al., 2000; Cherrington et al., 2017). Establishing professional networks at the local and national levels would help Iranian HE institutions to become more professional learning organisations.

The constant changes and developments further suggest that all faculty members, regardless of how long they have been in service, need to continuously engage in FD activities (Nworie et al., 2013). In the same vein, the call to develop teachers’ technological...
competencies, innovation, entrepreneurship and intercultural competence is too loud to be ignored. Against this background, universities may need to introduce specific measures to develop teachers’ technological competencies to support contemporary courses and instruction. The outputs and results of performance appraisals and student evaluations, for instance, could help to identify individual faculty members’ educational needs.

This case study is partly limited to a group of faculty members’ experiences and reflections on FD in one Iranian HE institution. Conducting additional surveys and observations with a larger sample may verify and consolidate the findings of the study and contribute to further insights into how faculties’ professional development can be transformed.

References


Ministry of Science Research and Technology (2015a), Memorandum on Job Structure for Academic Staff at Universities, Ministry of Science, Research and Technology, Tehran (in Persian).

Ministry of Science Research and Technology (2015b), The Regulations Governing the Promotion of Faculty Members, Ministry of Science, Research and Technology, Tehran (in Persian).


Schreier, M. (2012), Qualitative Content Analysis in Practice, SAGE, Los Angeles, CA.


Tarbiat Modares University (2012a), Outline of the Faculty Development Program in Tarbiat Modares University, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran (in Persian).

Tarbiat Modares University (2012b), Strategic Change Plan 2016-2020, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran (in Persian).


**About the authors**

Davoud Masoumi is Senior Lecturer and Quality Co-Ordinator at the University of Gävle, Sweden. He is also affiliated to the University of Tabriz, Iran. He has worked on different research projects relating to quality and faculty development. His research and teaching interests include technology-mediated learning and the transformation of knowledge in contemporary society, both within the context of educational institutions and working life. Davoud Masoumi is the corresponding author and can be contacted at: dadmai@hig.se

Javad Hatami is Associate Professor of Educational Technology at Tarbiat Modares University (TMU), Tehran, Iran. He is also Guest Researcher at Wageningen University in the Netherlands. Javad is one of the founders of E-Lab projects in Iran. Javad also served as Head of the Evaluation and Monitoring Office at TMU from 2015 to 2016.

Javad Pourkaremi is Assistant Professor at the University of Tehran, Iran. His research interests are professional development and faculty development.

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website:

[www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm](http://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm)

Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Investigating the barriers to change management in public sector educational institutions

Adel Ismail Al-Alawi
Department of Management & Marketing, College of Business Administration,
University of Bahrain, Sakhir, Bahrain

Muna Abdulmohsen
Board of Intermediate Education, Ministry of Education, Manama, Bahrain

Fatema Mohamed Al-Malki
Bahrain Teachers College, University of Bahrain, Sakhir, Bahrain, and

Arpita Mehrotra
Faculty of Business and Financial Services, Royal University for Women,
Riffa, Bahrain

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to explore barriers to the change management in the public sector of educational institutions such as public schools of the Ministry of Education in the GCC countries. The exploration of the research is based on the ADKAR change management model that consists of five key elements, which are awareness, desire, knowledge, ability and reinforcement. The ADKAR model was used for many reasons, among these reasons is that it allows management to separate the change process into parts, pinpointing where change is failing and addressing that impact point.

Design/methodology/approach – Five public schools and employees from the educational directorate were taken as samples in this study. The unit of analysis was the employees, and data on these change drivers were collected from questionnaires and interviews.

Findings – The study findings were articulated through strengths and weaknesses. The strengths were the desire to change and networking. The weaknesses were the knowledge element such as the absence of predetermining guideline for the implementation of the system; another observed weakness was in the leader’s authority, where leaders do not have clear definition of authority and responsibility to take a decision; and finally the deficiency in performance appraisal for not being taken on regular basis and the rewarding system for not being linked to performance appraisal.

Research limitations/implications – The information and feedback collected from the questionnaire may not represent all of the facts of the questionnaire subject; therefore, the researchers may have to use an unstructured interview to enhance the quality of information obtained. Due to the long bureaucratic procedures for issuance of permission from the higher research authorities (Scientific Research Directorate) to apply the questionnaire in the Ministry of Education, this took nearly three weeks, which was long considering the time available to end the research and resulted in a significant change in the project schedule.

Practical implications – This study provides an empirical evidence that gives a deep insight about the elements that act as barriers to change in the public sector of educational institutions, as there are certain elements that are tied to the nature and characteristics of the public sector itself that act as barriers to change.

Originality/value – Knowledge development is an essential part of the public sector development scheme. Effective training programs are the most important means to develop knowledge, considering that it has to be properly designed and delivered. Training programs should also be structured in a way that fills the knowledge gaps that exist between the present state and the future state. One useful technique for filling and assessing the gaps between the current state and future state requirements is by writing new job descriptions for employees, which should include details of knowledge and skills needed to perform that role during and after the transition.

Keywords Education, Knowledge, Awareness, Public sector, Bahrain, Desire

Paper type Research paper
1. Introduction

Due to the unconstrained development and advancement in knowledge and science in all fields, it became necessary for societies to undergo and cope with major changes in order to make significant changes in their economic system (Al-Alawi et al., 2007). In the business world, managers struggle in dealing with organizational change as it tends to be the most complicated to deal with due to the difficulty of projecting the results and the outcome (Somerville, 2008). Despite the increase of using suitable change methodologies and strategies, corporation yet end up being resistant due to the ambiguity of the outcome (Balassanian, 2007). Therefore, many experts claim that most of the change projects end up not living to its potentiality in the sense of achieving its end results (Somerville, 2008).

In light of the above, public sector organizations unlike the private sector are often perceived to be resistant to change, they seek capacity (the ability to get things done) but not change – a different way of doing old and new things (Balassanian, 2007). This is because the public sector is highly controversial as it lacks negotiable timescale and planning scale, as well as logistical and political implementation issues that are not taken into consideration (Andrews et al., 2008).

In respect of the above, the Bahrain Economic Development Board (2008, p. 1) made the following statement: "Economic Vision 2030 for Bahrain outlines the future path for the development of its economy. This has been shared with a host of opinion leaders from the private sector, academia and development organizations, and the public sector, at the heart of the Economic Vision lies the aspirations for Bahrain economy, government and society in accordance with the guiding principles of sustainability, competitiveness and, fairness. In collaboration with the legislative body, civil society and the private sector, the Bahraini government will develop detailed strategic and operational plans for making these aspirations a reality. In particular, the Economic Vision will be translated into a tangible and coordinated national strategy across government institutions."

This study is designed to determine the change management barriers in the public sector based on the ADKAR model, which is a change management module of five elements as indicated below:

1. awareness of the need to change;
2. desire to participate and support the change;
3. knowledge of how to change (and what the change looks like);
4. ability to implement the change on a day-to-day basis; and
5. reinforcement to keep the change in place.

According to the Bahrain Economic Development Board (2008), Bahrain will use its resources to invest for the future, improving its human capital through education and training, particularly in the field of applied sciences. The Embassy of the Kingdom of Bahrain to the United States (2007) in the USA stated that education reform has been a top priority in the Kingdom of Bahrain. Aside of the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Labor, the Bahrain Chamber of Commerce and Industry, the Supreme Council for Women and the Economic Development Board (EDB) have also cooperated to lay a modern foundation for Bahraini education. They studied the most successful reforms undertaken around the world, to develop a bold and a comprehensive reform plan for the Bahrain educational system.

The findings resulted in four reforms:

1. create a Quality Assurance Authority that is independent on the Ministry, to assure quality performance of schools, universities and vocational institutes;
strengthen teacher recruitment and training;
create a polytechnic school that educates the future private sector; and
improve higher vocational education to improve private sector productivity.

Education is exhibited as a key component of reform policy in Bahrain, and this is reflected in Education and Training initiatives (refer to Figures A1 and A2), both figures are adopted from Bahrain Economic Development Board (2008) and both exhibit that education is the future of Bahrain. Hence, according to the Human Development Index by United Nations Development Program, Bahrain is ranked in the “high human development category” and highlighted as the highest among others GCC averages in education.

The purpose of this study is to identify why changes are limited in some area and define the necessary steps to make change successful. The researchers had to break down the change into parts, understand where change is failing and address those specific points by using the ADKAR model to identify the gaps in change management process. The problem of this study was to determine the barriers of change in the public sector as represented by one of the ministries of education in the GCC countries.

This study is significant in that:

- It provides a basis for the positive and efficient changes.
- It provides helpful information for effective management of the people dimension of change, which requires managing five key elements that form the basis of the ADKAR model.
- Furthermore, the baseline data gathered from the result of this study shall serve as a guideline for other researchers in their quest for additional information. It can also be for those interested in the fields of change management. Likewise, the change management in GCC is somewhat a newly introduced subject and concept that will need intensive research and efforts for change management leaders to learn and digest to achieve successful change.

More specifically, the following research questions guided this study:

**RQ1.** What are the barriers, which restrict change management in the public sector organization such as Ministries of Education in GCC countries?

**RQ2.** What are the weak elements as barriers of change in the Ministries of Education in GCC countries, which are in accordance to the ADKAR model and how significant are these elements?

**RQ3.** How significant is knowledge management to contribute positively or negatively to competitive advantage?

### 1.1 Research objectives

The aim of this study is to understand the change barriers of the organization and determine the failure cause depending on the ADKAR model elements that effect change pursue. The research objectives can be summarized as follows:

- to identify the weak elements as barriers of change in the Ministries of Education in GCC countries in accordance to the ADKAR model;
- to analyze the significance of each element of ADKAR model in the public sector such as Ministry of Education in GCC countries; and
- to understand how knowledge management contributes positively or negatively to competitive advantage.
1.2 Research hypotheses
The researchers established the following research hypotheses as a guide to this study, which was framed around the five elements of the ADKAR model for determining the barriers of change management:

- **H1.** There is a difference between gender and ADKAR five key elements in change management.
- **H2.** Change management project and awareness about change.
- **H2a.** There is a positive relationship between qualification and awareness about change.
- **H2b.** There is a relationship between experience and awareness about change.
- **H2c.** There is a positive relationship between the level of career and awareness about change.
- **H3.** Change management project and desire to change.
- **H3a.** The desire to change is different according to age.
- **H3b.** There is a positive relationship between qualification and desire to change.
- **H3c.** There is a positive relationship between the level of career and desire to change.
- **H4.** The relationship between success of change and knowledge about change.
- **H4a.** There is a positive relationship between experience and knowledge about change.
- **H4b.** There is a relationship between the level of career and knowledge about change.
- **H5.** The relationship between success of change efforts and ability to change.
- **H5a.** There is a relationship between age and ability to change.
- **H5b.** There is a relationship between qualification and ability to change.
- **H6.** The relationship between success of change and reinforcement efforts.
- **H6a.** There is a positive relationship between experience and reinforcement efforts.
- **H6b.** There is a positive relationship between qualification and reinforcement efforts.

1.3 Definition of terms
For the purpose of this applied research, the following terms were defined:

- independent variable: for this study, the independent variable was the ADKAR five key elements;
- dependent variables: for this study, the dependent variable was the change management barriers in the public sector organization; and
- change management: change management is the set of processes, tools and practices that were used to manage the people side of a change. Change management is the final element of realizing change effectively.

Finally, this section reflects the purpose of this research, which was intended to identify the weak elements as barriers of change in the Ministry of Education in accordance to the ADKAR model. The next section presents the literature review for this study.

2. Literature review
According to Andrews et al. (2008), it is widely accepted that the context within which managers have to implement change is broader in the private sector than their counterparts in the
governmental sector. This is attributed largely to the nature of public policy that they describe as based upon ministerial edict (combined with threat), highly controversial in substance, tight and non-negotiable timescale, no planning window, no consideration of the logistical and political implementation issues. Andrews et al. (2008, p. 67) suggested that “public sector managers have much less satisfactory experiences of change than their private sector counterparts.”

Balassanian (2007) likewise argued that despite the fact that employees hold strong views of the new vision of change, they feel handicapped by obstacles in their paths which management are aware about but do not remove doubts concerning process of change, which causes failure to the whole process. One reason among others for this dilemma is management reluctance to deal with difficulties, air potential problems and clear uncertainties some employees may have. Balassanian (2007) argued that the prospect of changes in the way people work causes anxiety, which, in turn, causes resistance and only people who instigate change enjoy it; others have to suffer it.

2.1 Change management

According to Somerville (2008), organizational change is a complex subject. Achievements in change management are difficult to predict in terms of results; most experts believe that most of change projects do not achieve its final goals. Balassanian (2007) stated that organizations in public sectors are the most perceived for change resistance, as many of these organizations focus on getting things done rather than looking for new ways of doing things. The increased use of appropriate change management strategies and methods in the development of the cooperation will often be resisted due the difficulty of precise definition of their results and the uncertainty of their outcome. Balassanian (2007, p. 5) stated that “The first and most obvious definition of change management is that the term refers to the task of managing change. Managing change is in itself a term that has at least two meanings. One meaning of ‘managing change’ refers to making changes in a planned and managed or systematic fashion. External events may also necessitate organizational change. Hence, the second meaning of managing change – the response to changes over which an organization exercises little or no control (e.g. a rapid rise in the price of oil, devaluation of the national currency, civil unrest, new legislation, and so on). The recognition of the need for timely adjustment to external events has given rise to the concept of the ‘learning organization’. Change management refers to an area of professional practice and the related body of knowledge that has grown up within and around this subject.”

Change management is facilitated by a systematic approach that includes making the use of the knowledge acquired in an organization as well as the resources available that can be used to extract the benefits of the change. It is also seen that having a systematic approach results in better management of the method of change as it impacts the productivity and performance of change in a positive manner (Metre, 2009). Nonetheless, it is also viewed that a systematic approach can result in time constraints and restrictions in resources to evaluate the process of change and to concurrently apply the change as premeditated (Hudescu and Ilies, 2011).

According to Burnes (2004), organization change must be handled and approached properly or else any planned or occurred changes will be in conflict rather than in alignment. Furthermore, the approach should be determined based on what is suitable for the forms of changes, particularly the change that is anticipated and looked for in the organization framework. Therefore, change leaders and agents play a significant part in ensuring the success of the change process (Al-Yahya, 2009).

Ulrich and Brockbank (2005) discussed that change management is impacted by the internal elements of an organization such as the employees, culture, policies, procedures and management, which make change agents and the corporate culture a critical part of change management. However, to maintain a solid culture that can be subjected to change, the
change approach must be subjective and inclined by the corporate culture and change leadership (Erdogan et al., 2006; Al-Alawi and El Naggar, 2018).

Leadership is also a crucial aspect in change management as it has a strategic function in handling and controlling resistance to change through using appropriate factors of organizational culture to foster and increase employee participation in the method of change (Jaskyte, 2004; Al-Alawi, 2006). According to Cameron et al. (2006), change is coordinate through the leader of the organization or change agents who have the authorization to act as change enablers, which is inclined by resistance from employees.

According to Northouse (2013), change leaders’ behavior can be demonstrated through two general types. First, is a motivated and inspired a leader that demonstrates task behaviors for goal achievement as well as integrates his/her employees in such process to ease their comfort and make it easier for them to adapt to the change. Moreover, Hamstra et al. (2011) stated that in successful organizations that achieve their goals, leaders play the role of both traditional and transformational leaders through supervision of change management and through recognizing the need of change and constructing a path to implement it.

2.2 Change resistance
Robbins and Judge (2009) stated that it is well documented from many studies of individuals and organizations that both organizations and its members resist change, despite the fact that resistance to change in itself is positive to some degree as it maintains stability and predictability in behavior, for example, resistance to re-organization plan or a change in product line can stimulate a healthy debate over the merits of the idea and result in a better decision. Nevertheless, evidently resistance to change restricts adaptation and progress.

They also suggested that resistance to change can be categorized to four types, overt, implicit, immediate and deferred. The easiest for management to deal with is overt and immediate, while the most difficult and challenging to deal with will be implicit and deferred. They added that implicit resistance behavior is considered as subtle – loss of loyalty to the organization, loss of interest to work, increased errors, increased absenteeism due to sickness – and hence are more difficult to manage. Fronda and Luc Moriceau (2008, p. 605) suggested that “The persons observed do not refuse to change in the absolute; they refuse to sign up to a change which is imposed from the summit of the organization and whose ultimate purposes they do not share. This is the reason why approaches to resistance to change, such as that of human relations seem reductionist. It is not enough simply to ‘communicate’ for change to take place. Communication is highly difficult when the communicants have in their minds contradictory frames of reference for justification.”

For change management to be successful, it should consider individuals as agents or actors, and not as subjects. In normal cases, an individual can adapt at some margin to change by certain adjustments in his/her culture and characters, boosting flexibility in his/her principles and values. But deep and radical changes that are directly connected to the national cultures such as religious, geographical, demographical and political are deep rooted and often not extremely difficult to change (Fronda and Luc Moriceau, 2008; Al-Alawi and AlKhodari, 2016; Kophuting and Mutshewa, 2017).

Lawrence (1969) and Maurer (1996) stated that the reason many change initiatives do not end up being successful is due to change resistance. Moreover, resistance to change can result in incurring costs and time constraints in the process of change (Ansoff, 1990) to the extent that it becomes hard to predict and controlled, and must be taken into concern. From another perspective, resistance can help change agents to gather information and can help understand how to come up with a successful change process (Beer, 1996).

The implementation of change can occur in alignment with the objectives and internal environment of the organization as well as the external environment (Quattrone and Hopper, 2001). In order to achieve a successful change management initiative, the leader must be a
transformational leader rather than a traditional leader in the sense of having an optimistic character regarding the initiatives in addition to exhibiting commitment to the change process (Abrell-Vogel and Rowold, 2014).

It is important for a change agent or leader to motivate and inspire the employees of the organization (Gilley et al., 2009). When employees are motivated and inspired, they are less likely to resist change and more likely to accept it, which can be done through associating the employees with the leader in the change process. However, attaining collaboration between employees and the leader in change construction depends on the attributes and characteristics of the leader (Griffith-Cooper and King, 2007).

Nazim et al. (2014) stated that a change agent is a person who identifies the need of a change, then presents it, which leads and results in having an applicable environment for change where change can be implemented and evaluated. This indicates that change agents have certain obligations when dealing with change. According to Luscher and Lewis (2008), change agents must be extensively involved with the process of change and must be highly cooperative and flexible when interacting with employees. In other words, for example, Hudescu and Ilies (2011) stated that leaders must communicate with the employees in terms of making them understand the basics of change or else employees will not value the purpose of the change process and will resist it, which will act as a boundary to the change process. It is not easy to communicate information about the change process. However, if achieved, employees will be supportive in terms of easing and assisting the method of change (Al-Alawi et al., 2016; Nazim et al., 2014).

2.3 Organizational change process models

Edgehouse et al. (2007) stated that despite the fact that the ultimate goal of organizational change is aiming to change attitudes, practices and values of constituents to a more desirable state for individuals or organization, the available well-recognized models to achieve these common goals vary in approach and execution. Edgehouse et al. (2007, p. 7) suggested that, “Models are useful tools. Not only because they provide path to follow, but also because may are powerful mechanisms that can down anxieties about unknown future result.”

According to Robbins and Judge (2009), there are several approaches to managing change. Four models have been selected for the purpose of this study. The first three models, Lewin’s three-step change model, Kotter’s eight-step plan and the 7 S-Action Word Model have been demonstrated with some details for enlightening how they differ from the ADKAR model that is chosen as a base for this research project.

2.3.1 Lewin’s three-step change model. According to Latta (2009), Robbins and Judge (2009) and Cellars (2007), this model has three sequential steps to follow to ensure successful change. The term unfreezing refers to the commencing point in such situation which is considered as an equilibrium state, from which we need to move to new equilibrium status, by overcoming the pressures of both individual own resistance and group conformity. Then, term movement can be described as the transformation process from existing equilibrium to the new equilibrium (desired end state), while refreezing can be explained as stabilizing the change by balancing the driving forces and restraining forces and can be sustained over time through monitoring and reinforcement.

2.3.2 Kotter’s eight-step plan. According to Robbins and Judge (2009), John Kotter of the Harvard Business School created this approach for implementing change. Kotter began by listing common failures that managers make when trying to initiate change.

Kotter’s (1996) model identified eight steps for change initiatives that included:

1. sense of urgency to establish at first stage;
2. coalition of people who support and appreciate the need for change should be established at soonest;
(3) vision of desired end goals is clear and realistic;
(4) different communication media to be used to promote vision;
(5) using all means and tools to empower and act on the vision;
(6) build momentum and motivations by making short-term wins that will accelerate ongoing change;
(7) the change program must always be strengthened, adjusted based on reassessment and addressing of rising problems; and
(8) having the change efforts evident in the organization success will empower the change program.

2.3.3 The 7 S-Action Word Model. Cellars (2007) stated that Tom Peters and Robert Waterman (1982) created the McKinsey 7-S Model. The 7-S Model is made up by seven holistic components that contribute to collective company change, which are shared values, strategy, structure, and systems. Lennon (2009), Cellars (2007) and Edgehouse et al. (2007) argued that the McKinsey 7-S model identified 7 S for change initiatives that included:

(1) Scan: the initial survey of the institution to find out the working mechanism, and strategies, strengths and weaknesses.
(2) Select: leaders need to select. At this point, the leader should carefully chose extraordinary individuals, make appropriate plans, and determine the vision. The selection process in organizational change has to involve calculated decision making, shared values, vision and mission to be put in practice smoothly.
(3) Sense: sensitivity plays an important role in organizational change; decision makers of change project must sense feeling, attitudes, stress and insecurities of effected people. Organizational change without sensitivity becomes successful with task but not people and therefore will not be effective and will not last long.
(4) Sicken: change in organization to move forward and to be appreciated when people get sick of doing things unprofitably, inefficiently and not content with it, but nobody dares to change. Leaders take the risk and sacrifice their reputation for the sake of fruitful change.
(5) Sifting: in the organizational change is the process of separating good and bad, as excessive change may backfire if not performed carefully and selectively. Leaders should be flexible, reliable, authentic and honest when it comes to ideas, people and procedures.
(6) Speak: it is very common that organization change affects people at different extends. People, who are expecting to be affected negatively, want the change agents – leaders to speak to them about it and remove or at least reduce the stresses they burden.
(7) Spread: leaders should spread the authority and responsibility of the organizational change with others, as this will empower, entrust and sustain the change as well as speed the process of change and make it more effective and pleasant for all to join and participate in.

2.3.4 ADKAR model. For successful change management, Hiatt (2006) has identified five elements, named it as the ADKAR model; these elements must be followed in the right sequence to ensure the success of change projects: awareness, desire, knowledge, ability and reinforcement.

2.4 Overview of ADKAR model elements and the relation with other studies
According to Hiatt (2006), the ADKAR model when was structured was meant to be as an individual change management model. In other words, ADKAR represents the essential
elements of change of a single individual person or groups. During a change project, in the workplace, when change struggles due to a missing link or weak element, applying the ADKAR model can define this missing link or element that can undermine business change and rectify it.

For instance, in the event of the absence of both awareness and desire, you bound to expect stronger resistance from employees, weaker adherence to change and delay in implementation. When awareness and desire are very low, failure is very likely to happen. However, Edgehouse et al. (2007) argued that employee’s desire and acceptance to change will largely contribute to the success or failure of change efforts. It is also emphasized that willingness and acceptance to change is much affected by employee’s acceptance of new procedures.

Hiatt (2006) stated that the lack or shortages of knowledge and ability will naturally lead to inefficient utilization of all organization resources, improper utilization of new processes and tools, a negative impact on customers and sustained reduction in productivity. When reinforcement element is not empowered and being effectively monitored, individuals involved in the change project are bound to become less interested and revert to old behaviors; one or more of these elements may affect and undermine the possibility of successful change project. He also suggested that when the change subject is identified, the ADKAR model can be used as a starting point to provide a sequential framework for managing the human part of change (also refer to Bin Taher et al., 2015).

2.4.1 Awareness. Hiatt (2006) stated that one of the first corner stones of the ADKAR model is awareness of the need for change. In this stage, the change process, its nature and the need for it are rightly and effectively communicated to the concerned people at all levels in the organization. A study conducted by Hiatt (2006) in 2005 on a group of 411 companies all undergoing major change projects concluded that the largest single cause attributed to resistance to change and consequently the failure of change project was lack of awareness of why the change was being made. The employees and key personnel of the change projects had no clear views of what the change would add to the organization, so they could better understand and participate in the change process and align themselves together toward the success of the project.

2.4.1.1 Elements affecting the awareness’ receptivity. Communication: Frahm and Brown (2007) stated that commencement and maintenance of organizational change would largely depend on the communication process. Therefore, the success or failure of change efforts depends on how effectively the goals of change are communicated to the employees who are the targets of the change.

Kane (2008) argued that communication in organizational change is a crucial element in the consciousness of employees’ receptivity system to accept change and implement it. Hiatt (2006) argued that the most important messages to share with employees especially by project managers is to communicate the business need for change and explain why the change is necessary as well as provide the compelling reasons for the change and emphasize the risk of not changing.

Robbins and Judge (2009) stated that a study of German companies revealed that changes are most effective when a company achieves a rational balance between its stakeholders and shareholder interests rather than a rational that is based on shareholder interests only. They also suggested that resistance in employees can be dealt with and reduced by communicating to them and help them to understand the reasons behind change.

Communication can be effectively used to deal with change resistance in more than one level, first, to correct the false information (rumors) that it finds its ways to the employees from different sources either from inside or outside the organization, hence clearing the
negative effects of these false information. Second, proper communication will emphasize
the importance and essentiality of the project and its success for the organization to sustain.

Information distribution: in Frahm and Brown's (2007) study, Witherspoon and Wohlert (1996) found that in most cases information is improperly distributed in such a downward
and differential way and that the flow of information stops at the supervisor level. This
naturally raises doubts about lower-level employees' ability who should participate in
change without being aware of all facts concerning change. Nevertheless, Robbins and
Judge (2009) argued that the method of how the need of change is communicated to the
employees is a significant matter as change is more likely to be accepted when the necessity
for change is packaged and communicated properly.

Create a vision: according to Kane (2008), the first responsibility of leadership involves
the ability of employees to create a vision.

Latta (2009) and Kane (2008) identified the vision as the end state or goal, an organization
desires to reach. It provides people with a direction to move. It inspires people and motivates
them to a common goal through which the organization unity is built; it allows people to
form a linkage between their different activities and how to contribute to the end goal. Kane
(2008, p. 54) stated that:

A vision and effectively developed and communicated, are addressing the broader organizational
questions, why are we here? and why is it important that we are here? It can move mountains.

Kane also stated that vision can only be effective when it possess certain characters such as
interesting, compelling and plausible and more importantly can be translated into
organization realities allowing employees to accept it, absorb it and imagine the desired
future form of the organization, in which case it serves the long-term interests of all
constitutes. Furthermore, adding focus to vision will make it easy to followers understand it
as basis for all future decision making. It should also be simple, easy to communicate,
ambitious, inspirational, having both intellectual and emotional appeal.

Standardized work: according to Liker and Hoseus (2008) for the employees to
understand their roles properly, focus should be made on standardized work, as it is the
foundation of creating a repeatable process that reliably produces the desired result.
Standardized work is also the foundation for training. It is impossible to improve an
unstable process that is being done differently by everyone. Any improvement simply
becomes just one more way of doing the same job. To teach a team member how to do a job,
the method must be clearly defined.

2.4.2 Desire. Hiatt (2006) stated that desire is the second sequential element of the
ADKAR model; it creates motivation and inspiration for employees to support and
participate in the change process. The desire for the change has to be felt by employees
themselves; the management part in this process is limited to introduce the change and
make employees understand the reasons behind it. This can be a challenging task for the
management, as it possesses no control over people’s feelings and choices. There is no other
way apart from awareness building in which case-defined steps are predetermined to
achieve end result, reaching a self-convincing desire to change remains deceptive and, by
definition, not under our direct control. Hiatt (2006, p. 17) stated that, “In the workplace,
managers can develop new processes, tools and organizational structures. They can
purchase new technology and promote new values for their organization. However, they
cannot force their employees to support and engage in these changes.”

2.4.2.1 Elements affecting the desire receptivity. Participation: Andrews et al. (2008)
emphasized the role of stakeholders and their commitments, early involvement and support
to the idea of change right from the beginning of change project. Managers also should form
a group of people around them who are dedicated and committed and have strong
characters to influence other employees to join them in the change project. Therefore, careful selection should be exercised to pick up this group of highly influential people who should have the capability to represent the project to other employees and to the organization in all. As quoted by Andrews et al. (2008, p. 307) “It depends on how change is managed. It should be about taking people with them, rather than doing it to them. They need to involve and consult people rather than force them into it.”

Robbins and Judge (2009) argue that individuals normally will not resist or object to a change decision in which are they involved in prior to making the change. Therefore, those who oppose can be brought into the decision process but care needs to be taken that those who are participating in the decision making have the expertise and knowledge to do so. Naturally, their participation can reduce resistance, bring commitment and enhance the quality of the change decision. Nevertheless, in spite of these benefits, there are the disadvantages: potential for a limited, poor contribution and great consumption of time.

Failing to create a sense of urgency and win over hearts and minds will reduce impact of change programs. A survey taken by the society of human resource management indicated that performance and character are the two leadership behaviors and skills of importance. There is no greater test of performance and character than your ability to have courage during turbulent organization times (Kane, 2008).

Problem solving: Liker and Hoseus (2008) stated that problem solving should always receive immediate attention as it affects employee’s interests in their jobs. He resembled the problem solving as connecting two value streams, product and people. If the two value streams together make up the organizational DNA of the company, then problem solving is the code, which connects the two together. Problem solving should be a regular practice in the organization; otherwise, a gap is bound to occur in the transformation process.

According to Kane (2008), research indicates that involving stakeholders directly in the problem solving, knowledge sharing and examining of the progress and challenges of the change effort always yields a better result. Liker and Hoseus (2008) stated that management should give the team the encouragement and self-assurance to bring out their initiative, intellectual and innovative abilities on the way toward long sustainable, effective change. They must also be truthful with them in terms of their feedback to their input. Kane added that a good leader will cultivate a desirable culture, by the selection of the words he/she speaks and acts he/she does and by doing so, he/she sets the right tone and example for the whole organization. Confidence, respect and authority must all be evident in the leader’s communications. Kane acts must be reflections of the organization esteem values, with characteristics of honesty and integrity. Leader’s enthusiasm and eagerness should serve as a benchmark for other employees. Leader must be of open style, and should welcome all perspectives views.

2.4.3 Knowledge. According to Hiatt (2006), every organization has some kind of training programs that match its requirements in a large variety of areas, in both aspects technical and human resources. Normally, competent professionals of high skills, who must have good tools, materials and know what they are doing, take charge of delivering the training. Liker and Meier (2007, p. 8) stated that “Yet, go where the actual work is being done and ask people how they learned their jobs and you get a different picture. People have learned their jobs over time in a relatively an organized way, and the training courses are interesting but often do not have a direct bearing on the day-to-day job.”

2.4.3.1 Elements affecting the knowledge receptivity. According to Hiatt (2006), there are many factors affected knowledge receptivity as follows:

- A person’s current knowledge base: the gap between a person’s current level of knowledge and the knowledge requirement associated with the change will directly impact the probability of success for those individuals.
• Capability of the person to learn: the possible existence of knowledge gaps among us, as each of us has a different capacity towards learning different things. Some people could pick up new information without much of an effort, while others may have problems in learning new processes or tools. Some people could pick up new information without much of an effort, while others may have problems in learning new processes or tools.

• Available resources to provide training and education: resources could include the availability of subject matter, experts, teachers, books and other educational materials, equipment, systems for student use and sufficient funding to support the training program.

• The access to, or existence of, the required knowledge: for some desirable changes, the knowledge might not exist and if it existed, it may be hard to access. Depending on the geographic location of the organization, access to knowledge may be a barrier to learning. For instance, some parts of the world have little or no access to educational institutes or subject material; internet connectivity also can be a limitation in terms of organizations’ knowledge access (Al-Alawi et al., 2007).

2.4.4 Ability. Liker and Hoseus (2008) suggested that success can be ensured by provisions of two elements: production system that highlights the problem; and human system that provides the people to identify the problem and be able to solve it. People of the right characters, team minded, competent and well trained to deal with all rising problems are needed to ensure success. Liker and Hoseus (2008, p. 40) stated that they “view errors as opportunities for learning. Rather than blaming individuals, the organization takes corrective actions and distributes knowledge about each experience broadly.” They also suggested that learning is an endless process, superiors pass their experience and knowledge to subordinates and predecessors do the same for successors; team individuals at all levels should share knowledge with one another. Liker and Hoseus (2008, p. 3) stated that “When former Toyota Motor Manufacturing North American President Atushi (Art) Niimi was asked about his greatest challenge when trying to teach Toyota way to his American managers, he responded: ‘they want to be managers, not teachers.’ He explained that every manager at Toyota must be a teacher. Developing exceptional people is Toyota’s number one priority.”

2.4.4.1 Elements affecting the ability receptivity. Teamwork and team problem solving: It is essential here to point out the importance of collective teamwork approach to solving problems. Liker and Hoseus (2008, p. 45) stated “At Toyota the old adage ‘all of us are smarter than any of us’ is truly practiced on a daily basis. Many companies have thought of problem solving and have groups that meet periodically to make improvements, but Toyota has integrated this into the daily management system. Getting the right people together to solve a problem is the way much of the work gets done in engineering, sales, finance, and in the factory. People are organized into work teams with team leaders and review daily progress, taking problems as opportunities.” They also emphasized on work continuously to ensure open ways of communication throughout the team by emphasizing on the key values of mutual trust and respect, sharing the management point of view and encouraging team members to participate in team activities and share their ideas.

Intellectual capacity: According to Hiatt (2006), intellectual capacity also plays an important role in developing any new ability. All individuals have different unique skills of intellectual ability. For example, some have a natural talent when it comes to finance and math, whereas others do extremely well in innovation and creativity.

Depending on the nature of change, some individuals may have psychological barriers to implementing the change. In the case study of the network equipment manufacturer, only 20 percent of the sales people were able to change their selling approach because of the nature of their analytical skills. Many could not develop the abilities on problem
solving, financial analyzing and business case development within a reasonable time to generate the revenue result.

The available time for developing needed skills: According to Hiatt (2006), time can be a vital aspect for any change. If people could not change in the specific required timeframe, then the change is likely to fail, even if the person had the potential to change.

2.4.5 Reinforcement. According to Hiatt (2006), reinforcement is the final element of the ADKAR model. It includes any action or event that strengthens and reinforces the change with an individual or an organization. Reinforcement does not always require major events. In a study of customer service employees, the number one recognition desired by customer service agent was a personal thank you and an expression of appreciation by their supervisor. This gesture is meaningful because of the unique nature of the employee supervisor relationship.

2.4.5.1 Elements affecting the reinforcement receptivity. Celebrating successes: According to Hiatt (2006), in the workplace, many project teams ignore the potential of celebrating small success. When changes are new and when the difficulties of changing are the greatest, opportunities present themselves for celebration. These moments can be turning points for the change. Identifying and acting on these opportunities is a critical part of reinforcing the change. The converse is also true. If no accomplishment has been made, any attempt to rewards or recognition can backfire. Individuals want to be acknowledge for meaningful contributions and progress. Using recognition or rewards in the absence of demonstrated achievement reduces the value of recognition now and in the future. Hiatt (2006, pp. 40-41) stated that “In the absence of continual reinforcement, it is possible that old habits and norms will creep back into the work environment. If this occurs, then the organization builds a negative history related to change. When the next change comes along, individuals remember how previous changes were managed and how they were treated during the process. Reinforcement serves three purposes, first, reinforcement sustains the change and prevent individual from slipping back into old behaviors or old way of doing work. Second, reinforcement builds momentum during the transition. Finally, reinforcement creates a history that individuals remember when the change occurs. If change is reinforced and celebrated, the readiness and capacity for change increase.”

2.4.6 Summary. Why do some changes fail while other succeed, many extensive research performed on hundreds of organization undergoing major change concluded that inadequate communication or poor training are not the main causes of failure. Success in change is not attributed at all to excellent project management, or even the best vision or solution to a problem; it is also beyond the daily busy activities that surround change project. The secret to successful change is rooted in something much simpler, which is how to facilitate change with one person (Hiatt, 2006). The next section shall present and discuss the research works selected methodological approach.

3. Research methodology introduction
This section describes the methodology used for collecting data on the barriers to change in the Ministry of Education. It then describes the sources of data used, including the processes and procedures related to developing and administering a questionnaire and interview on change management; the units of analysis in this research were the employees of one of the Ministry of Education in the GCC who participate in change projects.

The results from this section helped to understand participants, their point of view about organizational change and address the research objective.

3.1 Population of the survey
Questionnaires were distributed on a sample of employees from a Ministry of Education from GCC countries – General and Technical Education Sector, who consists of Intermediate
Education Directorate, Secondary Education Directorate, Primary Education Directorate,
Technical and Vocational Education Directorate. The samples were employees of
educational directorate: directors, heads of educational district, school principals, teachers
and others (senior teacher, senior specialist). The survey participants were around 60
individuals all from the Ministry of Education out of which 40 were from 5 schools that were
included in the improvement projects, and 20 were employees of Educational Directorate
from the Ministry itself. This was not a statistical research but needed to canvass the views
of the correct section of the organization; therefore, the number of participants per
organization was not critical but aimed to be representative; seven people were interviewed,
one from each school and two from the Ministry of Education.

3.2 Survey method
The survey was intended to supplement data through interviews and questionnaire, and
likewise, the practices and individual perceptions in the organization. The aim was to gain
an understanding of the barriers of implementing the change in addition to the opinions and
understanding of the employees.

3.3 Design of questionnaire
Questionnaire design was adapted for use based on Glendinning (1991). Researchers
attempted to design and structure the questionnaire after the majority of the literature
review was completed to obtain a more complete picture. The questions in the questionnaire
were provided with a Likert scale for response. Given that it may be socially desirable for
the respondents to respond in certain ways, a five-point Likert scale was proposed. The
questionnaire was translated into Arabic, and this package was presented in a bilingual
format – English and Arabic, as Arabic language is the mother tongue of the sample people;
therefore, respondents were able to respond in the language of their choice. The
questionnaire had structured questions with set of responses in order to map the barriers of
the organizational change. The following sections provide a brief discussion concerning the
five ADKAR elements measured in the survey: awareness, desire, knowledge, ability and
reinforcement.

3.4 Awareness
Many researchers, e.g., Frahm and Brown (2007), Hiatt (2006) have highlighted the
importance of building awareness as defined within ADKAR means that is sharing both the
nature of the change and answering why this change is required needs to be widely
communicated throughout the organization, moreover creating clear vision and goals.

Table I presents the questions relating to awareness that were included in the
questionnaire and were aimed to focus on the implementation of the awareness.

3.4.1 Desire. Desire is another prominent driver of change that is highlighted in the
literature, e.g., Andrews et al. (2008) and Hiatt (2006); therefore, a number of questions
concerning desire were included in the questionnaire, once an individual has an
understanding of why a change is needed. After spreading the awareness, the next step in
questionnaire was to examine the individual decision to achieve the organizational change
that needs encouraging the employees to develop their full potential. Table II presents the
questions relating to desire that were included in the questionnaire.

3.4.2 Knowledge. The importance of knowledge-related questions was to explain what to
do during the transition and how to perform effectively in the future state. Knowledge is
only effective when the individual already has awareness and desire as has been noted by
many researchers (e.g. Liker and Hoseus, 2008; Hiatt, 2006). Table III represents the
questions relating to knowledge that were included in the questionnaire.
3.4.3 Ability. Hiatt (2006) stated that this is the stage in the process where the changes actually occur and are defined by the demonstrated achievement of the change such that the expected performance and results are achieved. There are many processes that can enhance the ability to obtain the required skills and behaviors such as performance monitoring, direct involvement of coaches.

Table IV represents the questions relating to ability that were included in the questionnaire to uncover and evaluate individuals’ response to this issue.

3.4.4 Reinforcement. Finally, it is important to change the organization’s structures and processes to ensure that they are congruent with the desired culture. Reinforcement is such a critical component of successful change; while making the change is difficult, sustaining a

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement awareness</th>
<th>Scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Organization’s goals and objectives are clearly stated in our institution</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Organization’s priorities are understood by its employees</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. My roles are clearly identified in my department</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. There are logical reasons for change which are visible and the goals are transparent</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Communication about the change is limited to only those directly concerned with the project</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Efficient communication exists through multimedia</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The reasons for change are unclear and there are different views of the goals of implementation</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. My manager give me appropriate feedback</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I. Questions relating to independent variable – awareness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement desire</th>
<th>Scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9. Organization’s managers are always listening to new ideas</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. I am encouraged to develop my full potential</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. The process of implementation for the change is flexible</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. The process of change is reactive to external environment</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. My salary is commensurate with the job that I perform</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. I feel motivated by the work I do</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. On occasions, I would like to make changes in my job</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. I constantly seek to improve the way we work</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. I cooperate effectively in order to improve the work efficiency</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. My manager is supportive and enthusiastic to the change</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. The structure of work in organization produces general satisfaction</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. I can have more responsibilities during change time</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Change is expected without being linked to incentives</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table II. Questions relating to independent variable – desire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement knowledge</th>
<th>Scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>22. Training is designed to solve specific problems</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Employees are cost conscious and seek to work efficiently</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Training is inadequate leaving unanswered questions about the change</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Training is frequently given with supporting materials creating confidence with the system and the processes</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Key implementation personnel are chosen, put in charge and left unchanged</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Conflicts within the implementation are avoided</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. There are predetermined guidelines for how the system implementation is to be managed and these are followed</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Gap is wide between current knowledge levels and desired knowledge levels</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table III. Questions relating to independent variable – knowledge
change can be even more difficult. There are a number of ways to support the reinforcement, such as individual performance review and feedback with possible support (Hiatt, 2006). Table V represents the questions relating to reinforcement that were included in the questionnaire to uncover and evaluate respondents’ opinions.

3.5 Pretest of the questionnaire
In order to determine the best means of obtaining valuable responses to this questionnaire and interview from the organizations, advice was sought from advisor, and a draft questionnaire was pre-tested with several professionals working in different area, including professor from Arabian Gulf University, who is very knowledgeable about the public sector employees’ surveys and norms. A manager from the private sector who has a long experience in management, and a head of district from Ministry of Education who has participated in change management projects.

These individuals were given a copy of the draft questionnaire and asked to provide feedback regarding the introduction, clarity of the questions, and they all commented by saying that it would be possible for respondents to give a reasonably accurate estimate noting that some minor changes were required to provide additional information. Time was measured in the pretest and found to be approximately 25 min to complete the questionnaire.

3.6 Interviews
For the purpose of the reassurance of the results obtained, collection of thoughts and opinions about the subject semi-structured interview style was used and the questions are as follows:

(1) Please describe any difficulties that affected your adoption of the change project system as a head of the organization.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement ability</th>
<th>Scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30. My boss is supportive and helps me in my work</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Results are attained because people are committed to them</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. During the change I need to put extra effort</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. There are delays in the timescales that are set in the change project</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Project teams have sometimes a lack of understanding of consequence and consistency with regards to the change</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Those concerned with the outcome of the change project take part in planning</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Good ideas for change are hidden and used for personal agendas</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. I have all the information and resources I need to do a good job</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table IV. Questions relating to independent variable – ability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement reinforcement</th>
<th>Scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>38. The organization keeps its policies and procedure up-to-date</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. The organization constantly reviews their methods and makes improvements</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. Performances are regularly reviewed by my manager</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. Individual performance review is against agreed standards</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. Effects of change, positive or negative are measurable in quantities term or subjective rating</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. During the change, management provided those involved with possible support</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. Conflicts within the desired change are looked for and try to be solved</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. Change projects create resistance, which has to be addressed</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table V. Questions relating to independent variable – reinforcement
3.7 Survey procedure

The researchers approach to the design of the interview and questionnaire was as follows:

- preliminary framework built on the literature review from the academic literature prior to design of questionnaires and structured interviews;
- pilot questionnaire – restructure the questions as necessary;
- taking notes during interviews, recording keywords and phrases and creating full record immediately after interview; and
- questionnaires explained, handed out and collected during the same session.

The research was performed in the Ministry of Education, for which access was granted to carry out the interviews and questionnaire after submittal of a letter to the Scientific Research Directorate to allow the researchers to implement the questionnaire in the Ministry of Education; their approval was obtained. Accordingly, appointments were fixed by telephone calls. The participants were visited to carry out the interviews and questionnaire as organized during March 2010.

A cooperative and rapid response was obtained; surveys issued were collected promptly. The close and friendly relationship that the researchers enjoy with colleges and school principals was a great help to gain the required number of participants.

In order to make the process go smoothly and to obtain a prompt and efficient response to the surveys, the participants group were met in the Ministry of Education where all of the participants were present and during the time the questionnaires were being handed out and collected after being filled. That ensured both a high response rate and has the correct participants answer the survey. It also enabled the researchers to explain clearly the aims of the research, control how the survey was fulfilled and clarify any enquiries that might arise.

To summarize, this section has discussed the research methodology that is most suited for this study. The next section will present the results of the questionnaires, interview and presents the study’s findings based on the results.

4. Analysis of results

This section presents the statistical analysis of the findings used to answer research questions; two types of data (quantitative and qualitative) together provided a concise record of the findings for this study seeking to determine the barriers of change management in the Ministry of Education.

4.1 Data analysis

The questionnaire was distributed, all were filled and returned, except for one; and therefore, out of 60 participants in total, 59 responded that makes 98.3 percent response.

The results from the questionnaires served to help address research objectives. The completed questionnaires data were entered into Statistical Package for the Social Science (Version 22.0) for analyzing the necessary statistics.

Demographic characteristics of the participants were calculated including the breakdown of the number of participants by gender, age brackets, educational background, experience and career. Valid percentages were used to represent the proportion of participants falling into each of the appropriate categories.
Descriptive statistics, including minimum, maximum, mean and standard deviation were used for all key elements. These descriptive statistics were calculated by summing all items making up the appropriate scale and dividing by the total number.

4.2 Results
4.2.1 Respondents’ categories. The results contained statistics and measurements in terms of the percentage of respondents in categories such as gender, age, qualifications, level of career and experience (refer to Tables AI–AV).

4.2.2 Determination the barriers of change. One of the research objectives was to identify the weak elements that are considered as barriers of change, and this was reflected through the following mean responses, which were significant to understand as comparisons were made with five key elements. One out of the five variables — “knowledge” significantly scored low (mean = 2.98, SD = 0.644). It is also important to draw attention to the variable “desire” where the participants scored high (mean = 3.72, SD = 0.602). The other three did not show significant score, where the awareness (M = 3.48, SD = 0.708), ability (M = 3.37, SD = 0.647), reinforcement (M = 3.43, SD = 0.823) (refer to Figure 1 and Table VI).

It seems that employees do have the desire and knowledge when it comes to the concept of change however there is a large gap between their desire and knowledge with their ability to accommodate with such change through being provided with the necessary tools to build their own abilities, support from top management, and having the right environment to cope with the change. Moreover, employees are introduced suddenly to change instead of introducing it gradually, which reduces their awareness about the change especially and they are not aware how this change benefits them in addition to the lack of reinforcement such as lack of incentives.
and rewards or acknowledgments (lowest mean = 2.8, highest mean = 3.8, mean greater than 3.2 = weak, mean greater than 3.4 = strong, mean between 3.2 and 3.4 = mediocre).

4.2.3 General observation on sample responses on interview questions

(1) Please describe any difficulties that affected your adoption of the change project system as a head of the organization.

The most comments are as follows:

- lack of morale support from management;
- insufficient financial resources;
- lack of incentives matching to responsibilities; and
- weak feedback during execution of projects.

(2) Please describe any challenges faced concerning people change with change projects:

- significance number of old aged employees who lack the modern technological skills to match the change requirement;
- lack of training programs that match employees’ needs; and
- gap in transfer of experience and knowledge from superiors to juniors.

(3) To what extent the physical environment of the workplace had impact on the process of change projects?

- limitations to availability of internet network that necessitate employees perform their duties in their home.

The “desire” key element produced the lowest average level of perceived problems in questionnaire; it also exhibited the same result in the interview sample.

4.2.4 Overall view to individual questionnaire concerning key elements. An overall view of individual questionnaire concerning the five key elements that are awareness, desire, knowledge, ability, reinforcement was examined in order to analyze the significance of each element of ADKAR model in the public sector. The examination determined metrics such as the percentage of the less problematic response in each of the five key elements (see Tables AVI–AXVIII for details).

4.2.4.1 Testing hypothesis

H1. There is a difference between gender and ADKAR five key elements in change management.

An independent samples t-test was conducted to compare the gender scores for male and female. Tables VII and VIII show that the level of significance for awareness is 0.504 and scores for males (M = 3.55, SD = 0.570) and females (M = 3.42, SD = 0.811). Significance for desire is 0.769 and scores for males (M = 3.70, SD = 0.608) and females (M = 3.74, SD = 0.606). Significance for knowledge is 0.974 scores for males (M = 2.98, SD = 0.469) and females (M = 2.98, SD = 0.769).

|                | n   | Minimum | Maximum | Mean   | SD
|----------------|-----|---------|---------|--------|----
| Awareness_m    | 59  | 1.63    | 4.50    | 3.4831 | 0.70880
| Desire_m       | 59  | 1.46    | 4.46    | 3.7262 | 0.60253
| Knowledge_m    | 59  | 1.25    | 4.38    | 2.9831 | 0.64741
| Ability_m      | 59  | 1.50    | 4.75    | 3.3750 | 0.64703
| Reinforcement_m| 59  | 1.00    | 4.75    | 3.4322 | 0.82339

Table VI. Determination the barriers of change

Valid n (listwise) | 59
Significance for ability is 0.842, scores for males ($M = 3.35, SD = 0.528$) and females ($M = 3.39, SD = 0.740$) and for reinforcement significance is 0.803, scores for males ($M = 3.40, SD = 0.674$) and females ($M = 3.45, SD = 0.941$), which are all greater than significance 0.05. Therefore, there is no significant difference in scores for males and females to the five key elements:

**H2.** Change management project and awareness to change.

**H2a.** There is a positive relationship between qualification and awareness about change. According to the ANOVA test, the level of significance is 0.175 which is greater than 0.05. Consequently, there is no relationship between qualification and awareness about change as shown in Table IX:

**H2b.** There is a relationship between experience and awareness about change. Based upon the ANOVA test, the level of significance is 0.017 that is less than 0.05. Accordingly, Table X shows there is significant difference between experience and awareness, so the hypothesis is valid:

**H2c.** There is a relationship between level of career and awareness about change. According to ANOVA correlation, the level of significance is 0.03, which is less than 0.05. As a result, Table XI shows that there is significant difference so the hypothesis is valid. This indicates that when an individual who has a high level of career and is subject to change, they are more likely to have awareness about it in comparison with an individual who has a low level of career:

**H3.** Change management project and desire to change.

**H3a.** The desire to change is different according to age. According to ANOVA test, the level of significance is 0.408 that is greater than 0.05. Consequently, there is no relationship between age and desire about change as shown in Table XII. This means that age does not affect one’s desire to change and that age and desire have no correlation together when it comes to change:

**H3b.** There is a positive relationship between qualification and desire to change.
Table VIII.
Independent samples test for gender and ADKAR five key elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADKAR</th>
<th>Levene's test for equality of variances</th>
<th>t-test for equality of means</th>
<th>95% confidence interval of the difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>4.90</td>
<td>0.031</td>
<td>0.672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>0.692</td>
<td>0.492</td>
<td>1.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>0.084</td>
<td>0.772</td>
<td>−0.295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>−0.294</td>
<td>55.3</td>
<td>0.770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>6.85</td>
<td>0.011</td>
<td>0.033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>0.035</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>0.973</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td>0.065</td>
<td>−0.200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>−0.206</td>
<td>55.5</td>
<td>0.838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reinforcement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances assumed</td>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>0.045</td>
<td>−0.250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances not assumed</td>
<td>−0.257</td>
<td>55.6</td>
<td>0.798</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (two-tailed)
According to ANOVA correlation, the level of significance is 0.107 that is greater than 0.05. Thus, there is no relationship between qualification and desire to change (refer to Table XIII). This means that the level of qualification does not influence one’s desire to change and that an individual with low qualifications can still desire change and an individual with high qualifications can either desire or not desire change. Therefore, desire and qualifications are not dependent on each other in terms of change:

\[ H3c. \text{ There is a positive relationship between level of career and desire to change.} \]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADKAR</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Awareness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups of qualifications</td>
<td>112,650</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>56,325</td>
<td>1.800</td>
<td>0.175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups of qualifications</td>
<td>1,752,265</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>31,290</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,864,915</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Note:</strong> Correlation is significant at the 0.05</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADKAR</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Awareness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups of experience</td>
<td>365,780</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>91,445</td>
<td>3.294</td>
<td>0.017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups of experience</td>
<td>1,499,135</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>27,762</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,864,915</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Table IX.</strong> The correlation between qualification and awareness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADKAR</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Awareness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups of career</td>
<td>519,442</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>103,888</td>
<td>4.092</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups of career</td>
<td>1,645,473</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>25,386</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,864,915</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Table XI.</strong> The correlation between career and awareness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADKAR</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Desire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>181,037</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>60,346</td>
<td>0.983</td>
<td>0.408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>3,377,505</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>61,409</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>3,558,542</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Table XII.</strong> The correlation between age and desire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADKAR</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Desire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups of qualifications</td>
<td>273,135</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>136,567</td>
<td>2.328</td>
<td>0.107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups of qualifications</td>
<td>3,285,408</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>58,668</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>3,558,542</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Table XIII.</strong> The correlation between qualification and desire to change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to ANOVA test, the level of significance is 0.196 which is greater than 0.05. Consequently, Table XIV shows that there is no relationship between level of career and desire to change:

**H4.** The relationship between success of change and knowledge about change.

According to ANOVA test, the level of significance is 0.14, which is less than 0.05. Consequently, Table XV shows that there is a significant difference between experience and knowledge about change, so the hypothesis is valid, which therefore signifies the objective of understanding how knowledge management contributes to competitive advantage. Moreover, when employees are knowledge workers and have enough experience, the outcome of the change is most likely to be successful as the knowledge and experience of the workers will make it easier to handle, introduce and deal with the change:

**H4a.** There is a positive relationship between experience and knowledge about change.

Based upon the ANOVA test, the level of significance is 0.03 that is less than 0.05. Accordingly, Table XVI shows that there is significant difference between the level of career and knowledge about change, which indicates how knowledge management can be understood in terms of its contributions to competitive advantage. Also, the more experience and knowledge an individual has, the more likelihood the outcome of the change is to be successful:

**H4b.** There is a relationship between level of career and knowledge about change.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Desire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups of career</td>
<td>449.365</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>89.873</td>
<td>1.532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups of career</td>
<td>3,109.177</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>58.664</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>3,558.542</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table XIV.** The correlation between level of career and desire to change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups of experience</td>
<td>312.898</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>78.224</td>
<td>3.434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups of experience</td>
<td>1,230.017</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>22.778</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,542.915</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table XV.** The correlation between experience and knowledge about change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups of career</td>
<td>432.456</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>86.491</td>
<td>4.1289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups of career</td>
<td>1,110.460</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>20.952</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,542.915</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table XVI.** The correlation between level of career and knowledge about change
This means that age and ability are independent of each other in terms of change. The degree of ability could be the same regardless the number of age:

$H_{5b}$. There is a relationship between qualification and ability to change.

According to the ANOVA test, the level of significance is 0.032 that is less than 0.05. Consequently, Table XVIII shows that there is a significant difference between qualification and ability to change. So, the hypothesis is valid. A person who has high qualifications is more likely to have much more ability to change in comparison with a person who has no qualifications. Qualified people tend to have more knowledge and experience than people who does not, which increases their ability to change:

$H_6$. The relationship between success of change and reinforcement efforts.

$H_{6a}$. There is a positive relationship between experience and reinforcement efforts.

According to the ANOVA test, the level of significance is 0.461 that is greater than 0.05. Consequently, Table XIX shows that there is no relationship between experience and reinforcement efforts. It does not matter how much experience a manager has in order for him/her to initiate reinforcement efforts; a manager with less experience than a manager with high experience can still make reinforcement efforts regardless of the outcome and type of the reinforcement methods:

$H_{6b}$. There is a positive relationship between qualification and reinforcement efforts.

According to the Pearson test, the level of significance is 0.172 that is greater than 0.05. Consequently, Table XX shows that there is no relationship between qualification and reinforcement efforts. This indicates that the qualifications of a manager do not contribute to the efforts that are done in terms of reinforcement. Reinforcement efforts can be done regardless of the level of qualifications of an individual.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ability</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>107,997</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>35,999</td>
<td>1.369</td>
<td>0.262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>1,446,003</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>26,291</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,554,000</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table XVII.** The correlation between age and ability to change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADKAR</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>180,202</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>90,101</td>
<td>3.673</td>
<td>0.032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>1,373,798</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>24,532</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,554,000</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table XVIII.** The correlation between qualification and ability to change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ADKAR</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reinforcement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>159,963</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>39,991</td>
<td>0.916</td>
<td>0.461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups</td>
<td>2,356,681</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>43,642</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2,516,644</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table XIX.** The correlation between experience and reinforcement
In summary, as may be determined from the foregoing, the survey exposed the key determinants of change management barriers. The findings of the data provided responses for the research question and validated the study’s hypothesis. The next sections will discuss the findings and recommendation.

5. Findings, limitation, conclusion and recommendation

This section describes the main findings of the study. First, an overview of the findings is presented. This is followed by a discussion about the strengths and weaknesses of the study. Finally, a recommendation for future research is discussed.

Part of the objective stated in the introduction was to identify the barriers concerning the change management in the public sector: Ministry of Education.

5.1 Findings

This research has been successful in achieving the stated objectives of identifying the barriers in areas of management of change at the Ministry of Education through analyzing the significance of each element of AKDAR model in the public sector such as ministry of education, and understanding whether knowledge management contributes positively or negatively to competitive advantage. The change management at Ministry of education is relevantly a new issue that demanded attention and concern with some urgency. The survey itself appeared to be successful in identifying the issues. The responses to the survey yielded no major surprises; however, it provided essential data without which objective analysis could not have been achieved.

The research findings are summarized in the following sections.

5.1.1 Summarization of the strengths

5.1.1.1 Desire to change. The desire to change is evident by the result of the research and data collected through the questionnaire and interview, which show that there is a distinctive and a strong desire for making change. This positive attitude toward change will provide the assurances for change success as human being factor is the most essential part for change to succeed. This does not in itself overcome the natural fear of uncertainty in any new features of a new project, but staff are used having to cope with it (Carr, 2000; Hornstein, 2015).

5.1.1.2 Networking. Another strength is the fact that networking is perceived to be effective. The regular setting up and disbanding of project teams means that individuals meet a range of opposite numbers in different groups with which they must interface on each project. Groups of individuals who gain good experience from team members on one project can make useful contacts when difficulties arise on later projects.

This feature can at least partly explain why individuals generally perceive satisfactory interpersonal relationships while experiencing some remoteness from members of their home department and line management.

5.1.2 Discussion of the barriers

- Knowledge: knowledge key element has the greatest negative impact on change management success; developing knowledge requires a broad spectrum of activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table XX.</th>
<th>Sum of squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Between groups of qualifications</td>
<td>153.475</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>76.738</td>
<td>1.818</td>
<td>0.172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within groups of qualifications</td>
<td>2,363.169</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>42.199</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2,516.644</td>
<td>58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that enable each person to learn in a way that is most effective for employees (AL-Alawi et al., 2007).

- Leader's authority: another weakness is the fact that leadership is perceived to be ineffective and even discouraging. Employees in the public sector organization need a clear definition of authority and responsibility for leaders to take decisions of all kinds.

- Performance appraisal: deficiency in the performance appraisal for being infrequent and arbitrary. Linked to this perception is the perception that there is insufficient attention of rewards, recognition and encouragement with potential for linking such appraisal to rewards and recognition. The researchers believe in the importance of performance appraisal in encouraging creativity. In addition to the questionnaire, researchers during the interview also recognized the importance of less tangible elements like emotional support and commitment.

5.2 Limitations
The information and feedback collected from the questionnaire may not represent all of the facts of the questionnaire subject; therefore, the researchers may have to use unstructured interview to enhance the quality of information obtained. Due to the long bureaucratic procedures for issuance of permission from the higher research authorities (Scientific Research Directorate) to apply the questionnaire in the Ministry of Education, this took nearly three weeks, which was long considering the time available to end the research and resulted in a significant change in the project schedule. It also significantly affected the number of respondents proposed from 100 to 60 samples, and schools from 10 to 5, to ensure rapid data analysis and results. Nevertheless, the number of respondents for the questionnaire under manager title was only one, due to the absence of some managers during the survey; this caused a limitation in the analysis and the results obtained.

5.3 Recommendation
5.3.1 Measure of performance. As a short-term measure, managers should realize the importance of performance appraisal of individual staff on regular basis. The performance and rewards should be strongly linked to the performance appraisal.

5.3.2 Developing knowledge. Knowledge development is an essential part in the Ministry of Education development scheme, according to Hiatt (2006) the following tactics suggested for developing knowledge.

5.3.2.1 Effective training and education programs. Effective training programs are the most important means to develop knowledge, considering that it has to be properly designed and delivered. The modern techniques such as audio and video programs, web-based seminars and other multimedia programs should all be considered as essential means to develop knowledge. The training programs should also be structured in a way that fills the knowledge gaps existing between the present state and the future state needed. Training requirements and the resulting training programs should address how to operate in the future state and how transition is made to a new way of doing work.

One useful technique for filling and assessing gaps between the current state and future state requirements is by writing new job description for employees that contain details about the knowledge and skills required to perform that role both during and after the transition that is clearly stated in the new job description.

5.3.2.2 Job aiders. Many types of knowledge content go beyond what people can easily remember. Job aiders such as checklists and templates should be made available to enable employees to follow more complex procedures; it is found in many cases that mistakes can accrue simply because people are not able to memorize some complex procedures. Online help files and scripts can serve this role in an effective way.
5.3.2.3 One-on-one coaching. Since individuals learn in different ways and at different pace and each individual may have different needs, one-on-one coaching can address all these differences.

5.3.2.4 User groups and forums. Peers can be a very handy, reliable and powerful source of information and learning. During implementations, nominate a collection of employees who have mastered the implementation of the tools and can teach others. These super-users typically have their own forum for sharing and organizing forums for other employees that are new to the implementation.

5.4 Recommendation for future work
This study recommends that in any future research, close attention to be given to examine the knowledge and, hence, evaluate the effectiveness of training program in place.

5.5 Summary
The results suggest that out of the five change drivers considered in this study, knowledge key element has greatest negative impact on organizational change management success. Furthermore, developing knowledge requires a broad spectrum of activities that enable each person to learn in a way that is most effective for him/her. These activities should include:

- formal training and educational programs;
- job aiders such as templates, check list and online files all made available to all employees; and
- one-on-one coaching from supervisors or subject matter experts.

References


Further reading

Bezzubetz, J. (2009), “Creating sustainable organizational change: a grounded theory approach”, PhD in Management and Decision Sciences, Walden University, Minneapolis, MN.


Appendix 1

**Barriers to change management**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Ambition 1. Rehabilitate Bahrain’s manpower</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Labor market reform</td>
<td>Address the imbalance in the labor market as a first step toward the effective development of education and economic reform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy reform</td>
<td>Upgrade skills of Bahrainis through the development of education and training to enhance their capacities and to be able to meet the requirements of the labor market</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Adopted from Bahrain Economic Development Board
Appendix 2. Respondent’s categories and overall view of individual questionnaire concerning key elements

Respondents’ gender
Table AI shows that the percentage of male respondents was 45.8 percent, while the remaining 54.2 percent were female.

Respondents’ age
Table AII shows that the questionnaire covered four age categories: 11.9 percent respondents were between 21 and 29 of age, 33.9 percent in the range of 30–of age, about 39 percent in the range 40–49 of age and the remaining 15.3 percent above 50 years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>45.8</td>
<td>45.8</td>
<td>45.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AI. Respondents’ gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age (years)</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21–29</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30–39</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>33.9</td>
<td>33.9</td>
<td>45.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40–49</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>84.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 50</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AII. Respondents’ age

Source: Adopted from Bahrain Economic Development Board
Respondents’ qualification

Table AIII shows that the percentage of the respondents with a BS degree was 78 percent, with High Diploma 11.9 percent and with Master’s degree 10.2 percent of the total sample.

Respondents’ level of career

Table AIV shows that the percentage of respondents at the manager level was 1.7 percent, head of district 5.1 percent, school managers 3.4 percent, specialist 18.6 percent, teachers 64.4 percent and others 6.8 percent.

Respondents’ level of experience

Table AV illustrates that the questionnaire covered five categories of experience, respondents between 1 and 5 years’ experience were 16.9 percent, 5 and 10 years 15.3 percent, 10 and 15 years 16.9 percent, 15 and 20 years 11.9 percent and the remaining above 20 years 39 percent.

Overall view to individual questionnaire concerning key elements

To ease the analysis the researchers considered the terms "strongly agree and agree" as agree, while the terms "strongly disagree and disagree" as disagree.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Certification</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Diploma</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BS</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>78.0</td>
<td>78.0</td>
<td>89.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MD</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AIII. Respondents’ qualification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manager</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head of district</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School manger</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialist</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>28.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>64.4</td>
<td>64.4</td>
<td>93.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AIV. Respondents’ career

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experience</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1–5 years</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>16.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5–10 years</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>32.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10–15 years</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>49.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15–20 years</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>61.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 20 years</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AV. Respondents’ experience
Awareness response
The less problematic response was to Q-No. 5, “Communication about the change is limited to only those directly concerned with the project” to which 37.3 percent agreed (see Table AVI).
In contrast with the least problematic response Q-No. 4 to which 76.3 percent agreed that “there are logical reasons for change which is visible and the goals are transparent” (refer to Table AVII).

Desire response
Table AVIII shows the least problematic response was Q-No. 15 to which 64.4 percent agreed that on occasions, I would like to make changes in my job.
In addition to Q-No. 16, Table AIX illustrates that 89.8 percent agreed with statement indicated the responses constantly seek to improve the way they work.
In addition to Q-No. 17, Table AX shows that 89.7 percent agreed with the statement that the responses cooperate effectively in order to improve the work efficiency.

Knowledge response
The most problematic individual response was Q-No. 28 and Table AXI illustrates that 42.4 percent disagree with statement indicated “There are predetermined guidelines for how the system implementation is to be managed and these are followed.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>15.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>40.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>62.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>88.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AVII.
Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>23.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>55.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>44.1</td>
<td>44.1</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AVIII.
Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>35.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>74.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In contrast with the least problematic response Q-No. 25, Table AXII shows that 47.5 percent agreed with that statement indicated “Training is frequently given with supporting materials creating confidence with the system and the processes.”

Table AXIII shows that for Q-No. 23 the responses indicated with 45.8 percent agreed with the statement “Employees are cost conscious and seek to work efficiently.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>30.5</td>
<td>30.5</td>
<td>40.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>59.3</td>
<td>59.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXII. Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 25

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>42.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>67.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>89.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXI. Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 17

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>20.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>52.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>89.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXII. Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 28
Ability response
Table AXIV shows that the least problematic response was Q-No. 30 to which 72.9 percent agreed with the statement “My boss is supportive and helps me in my work.”
Table AXV shows that for Q-No. 32 the responses indicated that 76.3 percent agreed with statement indicating “During the change I need to put extra effort.”

Reinforcement response
The less problematic response was Q-No. 42, Table AXVI shows that 38.9 percent of the responses disagreed with the statement “Effects of change, positive or negative are measurable in quantities term or subjective rating.”
The least problematic response was with Q-No. 43 and Table AXVII shows that the responses indicated that 50.9 percent agreed with the statement “During the change, management provided those involved with possible support.”
Table AXVIII shows that the responses indicated to Q-No. 45 with 76.3 percent agreed to the statement “Change projects create resistance which has to be addressed.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>15.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>54.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>89.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXIII.
Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 23

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>27.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>30.5</td>
<td>30.5</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXIV.
Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 30

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>13.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>23.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>33.9</td>
<td>33.9</td>
<td>57.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXV.
Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 32
Dr Adel Ismail Al-Alawi is Associate Professor of Management and Information Systems at the College of Business Administration, University of Bahrain, and earned Bachelor’s and Master’s degrees (MBA) in Business and Information Systems (USA), PhD Degree in Management Information Systems (MIS) from the University of Leeds, UK. Previously, in his sabbatical leave, he was Head of Business Department at the Royal University for Woman in Bahrain, and Dean of School of Business at the University College of Bahrain. Dr Al-Alawi was Founder of Business Information Systems Department (BIS) and Chairperson of BIS Department at the College of Business in UOB and also one of the founder of College of Information Technology, and Head of BIS Department, where he served UOB for more than 25 years. Dr Al-Alawi intensively participated in the Board form by a degree from HRH PM the Prince Khalifa bin Salman for the development of Bahrain Internet Exchange (BIX) and substantially contributed in the Committee founded by HRH PM for the Preparation of the Government Program for Parliament. His research works have been published in several Scopus-indexed journals such as Journal of Knowledge Management, Journal of Computer Science, Information Technology Journal, Asian Journal of Information Systems, Issues in Information Systems, Research Journal of Business Management, Research Journal of Business Management, Journal of International Women’s Studies and

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>18.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td>39.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td>59.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>86.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXVI. Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 42

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>30.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>49.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>84.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXVII. Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 43

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of agreement</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Valid %</th>
<th>Cumulative %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>23.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>62.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table AXVIII. Respondents’ opinion on Q-No. 45

About the authors

Dr Adel Ismail Al-Alawi is Associate Professor of Management and Information Systems at the College of Business Administration, University of Bahrain, and earned Bachelor’s and Master’s degrees (MBA) in Business and Information Systems (USA), PhD Degree in Management Information Systems (MIS) from the University of Leeds, UK. Previously, in his sabbatical leave, he was Head of Business Department at the Royal University for Woman in Bahrain, and Dean of School of Business at the University College of Bahrain. Dr Al-Alawi was Founder of Business Information Systems Department (BIS) and Chairperson of BIS Department at the College of Business in UOB and also one of the founder of College of Information Technology, and Head of BIS Department, where he served UOB for more than 25 years. Dr Al-Alawi intensively participated in the Board form by a degree from HRH PM the Prince Khalifa bin Salman for the development of Bahrain Internet Exchange (BIX) and substantially contributed in the Committee founded by HRH PM for the Preparation of the Government Program for Parliament. His research works have been published in several Scopus-indexed journals such as Journal of Knowledge Management, Journal of Computer Science, Information Technology Journal, Asian Journal of Information Systems, Issues in Information Systems, Research Journal of Business Management, Research Journal of Business Management, Journal of International Women’s Studies and
Muna Abdulmohsen holds Master of Business Administration (MBA) from the French-Arabian Business School, Arabian Gulf University in the Kingdom of Bahrain. Moreover, Muna had an extensive experience extends to more than 30 years in both the education and administrative field where she has served as Senior Administrative. Muna participated in local, regional and international conferences; and she attended several specialized workshops on leadership skills all in education and public sector. She is a very active member of many professional associations.

Dr Fatema Mohamed Al-Malki is Assistant Professor of Philosophy in Gifted Education at the Bahrain Teachers College, University of Bahrain; Director of Managerial Training Office; and previously she was Director of Department of Information Data Analysis and Statistics in the University of Bahrain. Fatima holds PhD Degree in Special Education from Arabian Gulf University – Kingdom of Bahrain 2013; MSc Degree in Science Curriculum Development from Bahrain University in 2001; and BSc Degree in Chemistry and Education from the University of Bahrain in 1992. Additionally, she also holds a Postgraduate Certificate Academic Practice (PCAP) from York St John University in Teaching and Learning, and a Diploma in Governmental Leadership Program from Bahrain Institute of Public Administration (BIPA) in Kingdom of Bahrain. Moreover, Fatema had an extensive experience extends to 25 years in the field of education, science and administrative field where she has served in the academic and administrative field. Fatema participated in local, regional and international conferences; and she attended several specialized workshops on leadership skills. Fatima organized a series of workshops and seminars on topics related to teaching and learning, classroom management, lesson planning, innovation and cooperative teaching strategy, and self-esteem workshop. She is very active member of Bahrain Training and Development Society. Her area of research interest is innovation, creativity, strategic management, women studies, e-learning, teaching and learning.

Dr Arpita Mehrotra earned Bachelor’s and Master’s degrees in Commerce (India) and holds PhD Degree in Commerce from Lucknow University, India. She is Assistant Professor of Accounting, Finance and Management at the Royal University For Women (RUW), Kingdom of Bahrain. Dr Arpita is Head of Banking & Finance Department at the College of Business & Financial Sciences, RUW. She is also Chairperson of the RUW Alumni Committee and Co-chairperson of the Teaching and Learning committee at RUW. In her 15 years of experience, she has also served as Director of Marketing and Academics in Mumbai School of Business, India. Dr Arpita has been a leading academician with in-depth teaching experience in Financial Management, Accounting and Marketing both at the undergraduate and postgraduate levels. Further, she led a team that organized a national-level seminar on “The Emerging Economies and their rising Global Influence” in India. The seminar witnessed participation of professors, corporate dignitaries and university-level students. Dr Arpita has also presented several research papers in Banking & Finance in International Conferences, where in two of them she received the “Best Paper” Award.
Influences of working condition and faculty retention on quality education in private universities in Bangladesh

An analysis using SEM

Mohammad Ali Ashraf
Faculty of Economics, United International University, Dhaka, Bangladesh

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is twofold: first, to examine the influence of working condition on faculty retention and quality education in the private higher education sector; and second, to see whether there is any mediating role of faculty retention linking working condition and quality education in the private universities in Bangladesh.

Design/methodology/approach – To attain these objectives, a total of 516 data were collected from the faculty members of the private universities located all over the country based on random sampling procedure. Data were analyzed using structural equation modeling technique.

Findings – The findings of the study reveal that though working condition has a direct significant influence on both faculty retention and quality education and faculty retention has a partial mediating influence on quality education in private higher education institutes in Bangladesh.

Research limitations/implications – From a research perspective, the study results demonstrate once again the robustness of the Maslow’s hierarchy need theory of motivation for helping to explain the faculty members of the private universities. As more and more studies of faculty behavior and its antecedents are done within the similar framework, the author is more able to discover and confirm which antecedents are most important, helping the author build a robust theory of quality education affected based on human resource practices by the management of the institutes.

Practical implications – From a practical perspective, as a cumulative body of work on the nexus between human resource management and quality education emerges, the author will be better able to advise private university authorities on the elements they need to address in order to excel quality education. In this study, the one area of findings that may help university authorities the most concerns work environment. These findings imply that in order to excel quality education the authorities of the private universities should focus more on friendly and enjoyable working environment for prolonging faculty retention and excelling quality education.

Originality/value – This study has revealed an important contribution focusing the influence of working condition on faculty retention as well as quality education in private universities in Bangladesh.

Keywords Private universities, Quality education, Faculty retention, Mediating influence, Working condition

Paper type Research paper

Introduction

The private university concept was originated in Bangladesh during the early 1990s with the enactment the Private University Act 1990 (Ashraf et al., 2016). It is now almost three decades of which many of these private universities have been started its operations. As per UGC record, there are 97 private universities in Bangladesh most of which are located in the metropolitan region of the capital city of the country (UGC, 2017). Although there are few private universities whose quality of education have been substantially improved, still they have to go a long way to attain that level of excellence prevailed in the public higher educational institutes in Bangladesh (Mamun, 2011; Mazumder, 2014; Ashraf et al., 2016).

Quality education is, in fact, the prime concern of every educational institute irrespective of developing or developed countries of the world (Akareem and Hossain, 2012; Ashraf et al., 2016; Rodriguez et al., 2018). Nevertheless, this issue is more important in the educational institutes in all levels of education in developing countries than in that of developed parts of the globe.
In fact, Bangladesh is still passing the phase of trial and error in the pre-university education. There have already been successful education model existed in the OECD countries which are potentially building up skilled workforce for contributing in the GDP growth rate in an effective and efficient manner (OECD, 2017). The education sector can adapt this model in our schools and colleges for achieving similar quality education helpful for rapid economic growth and overall development of the country. In this respect, private universities are in right direction, because all of these universities have been following mostly the American university model in their course curricula of all educational programs (Ashraf et al., 2009; Mazumder, 2014).

Yet, there are myriads of challenges faced by these newly emerged private higher education institutes of Bangladesh (UGC, 2017). One of such challenges is rendering excellence in quality education to the students admitted in different programs of private universities. The strive for excellence is delayed due to many reasons one of which is postulated as high turnover rates of faculty members due to lack of enjoyable academic working condition in these private universities (Naser, 2008; Joarder, 2012). Thus, reducing faculty turnover in the private universities in Bangladesh through proper employee retention practice is an area of great interest to researchers, employers as well as policy planners of the country (Jahangir, 2011).

There have been several studies related to quality education in private universities in Bangladesh such as Haque (2004), Ashraf et al. (2008), Naser (2008), Ashraf (2009), Jalil (2009), Ashraf et al. (2009), Ashraf and Joarder (2010), Mamun (2011), Akareem and Hossain (2012), Joarder (2012), Mazumder (2014), Ashraf et al. (2016) and Alam and Parvin (2017), but none of these studies have dealt specifically with the influences of particular factors of working condition and faculty retention on quality education in private higher education sector. In this respect, the present study can have an important contribution in filling this research gap in the case of HRM practices of working environment which can significantly influence faculty turnover intention and in turn on quality education in the private higher education domain. In doing so, this research directs a path in facilitating the transformation of private universities in Bangladesh toward institution-wide quality education practices the insight of which is much needed by every private university in Bangladesh. In this respect, the present study can claim a particular novel contribution in the tertiary private higher education sector in Bangladesh.

The purpose of this paper is, therefore, to examine the relationships between working condition of the organization and faculty retention practices which, in turn, affect quality education. Specifically, how do faculty retention practices affect quality education as a mediating variable linking it with working condition of the universities? To answer this question, a theoretical framework using Maslow’s hierarchy of need theory, as its basis was established. Using measurement scales created to assess working environment, faculty retention as well as quality education, a survey instrument was developed to test this mediating relationships implied by the theory. Data were collected from the faculty members of several private universities in Bangladesh during the 2017 winter season and the analysis of these data helps answer questions about the aforementioned relationship.

The plan for this paper is as follows: first, the underlying theory is briefly reviewed, as are the relevant literatures on working condition, employee retention and quality education. Next, the research model and hypotheses are presented, followed by a discussion of the research method and findings from the data analysis. A discussion of the meaning of the results and their implications ends the paper.

**Underlying theory and past research**

*Maslow’s hierarchy of needs theory*

Abraham Maslow introduced the hierarchy of needs theory in 1943. Though the theory proposed a sequential hierarchy of five basic needs which are all-pervasive
(Shahrawat and Shahrawat, 2017), at the heart of the theory there is an aspiration to build up an affective and empathetic working condition to motivate the employees to retain in organizations (see Figure 1).

This theory was based upon the premise that higher-level needs are not important and are not manifested until lower-level needs are satisfied. The most basic needs of individuals are labeled as physiological needs and included such items as food, water, sex, sleep and other bodily needs (Martin, 2011). The next most important level of needs is safety. This included items such as security and protection from physical and emotional harm in the work environment which must be without fear and enjoyable (Robbins and Judge, 2007). The third level of needs is social needs. This level of need included affection, love and belongingness which can be dubbed as desire for social belonging (Martin, 2011). The fourth level of needs is esteem needs. This level included self-respect, status, prestige and recognition emanated from effective and efficient leadership in the work environment (Martin, 2011). The highest level of need is self-actualization. Self-actualization is the drive to become what one is capable of becoming and achieving their potential level of achievement in the career ladder (Robbins and Judge, 2007). The needs represented by Maslow’s hierarchy can be applied to the work environment as a way to motivate employees. In gist, pay and work hours can contribute to satisfying physiological needs. Safe working conditions, company, benefits and job security help fulfill safety needs. Friendly supervision and professional associations relate to social needs. Job title and social recognition help fulfill esteem needs. Finally, a challenging job, opportunities for creativity and advancement in the organization can mean to fulfill self-actualization needs (Shahrawat and Shahrawat, 2017). The challenge for organizations is to consider these employee needs as they implement work environmental practices (Martin, 2011).

An underlying premise of the current study is a sound or healthy working condition that is central to motivating the employee to stay longer with an organization. Maslow’s theory provides a robust theoretical basis for testing such a premise, along with an additional framework for testing whether quality education is affected by employee retention, which itself should be dependent on enjoyable working condition of the educational organization. Based on the theory, sound working condition in the higher education institutes should positively influence faculty retention practices. Finally, enhanced retention practices should influence as a mediating variable to influence quality education as well as directly influence quality education itself.

![Figure 1. Maslow's hierarchy of needs theory](image-url)
As indicated previously, safe and enjoyable working condition has been cited as one of the central concerns in Muslow’s theory of motivation. Working condition includes not only the physical elements around the work area of an employee but also all things that form part of the organization’s culture and employee’s involvement with the work itself (Edgar and Geare, 2005; Markowitsch, 2018). It is the total cluster of observable physical, psychological and behavioral elements in the workplace which operates in an increasingly complex and challenging environment (Psomas and Antony, 2017; Fomunyam, 2018). A positive working condition is believed to make employees feel good about coming to work and provide the necessary motivation to sustain them throughout the work. This observation is shared by Wells and Thelen (2002) as well. They suggest that organizations can improve the employee’s motivation and commitment by maintaining suitable levels of privacy and comprehensive controls at the work place which can increase the ability of the organizations to satisfy and retain employees (Imran et al., 2017). According to Heneman (2007), one of the most crucial elements of any organization is its reward strategy which enhances a positive work environment.

Alhosani et al. (2017) propose a conceptual framework to analyze the role of parental involvement in mediating the relationship between educational leadership and academic environment on students’ educational achievements in the educational institutes in a state of the Arab Emirates. Similarly, Al Mehrzi and Singh (2016) provide research models to project the factors of leadership, teamwork, perceived organization support and organizational culture that can reduce employee turnover intentions in the public sector. However, none of these studies had been intended to test the models empirically.

According to Raziq and Maulabakhsh (2015), organizations, in the modern era, are facing several challenges due to the dynamic nature of the environment. One of the many challenges for a business is to satisfy its employees in order to cope up with the ever changing and evolving environment and to achieve success and remain in competition. In order to increase efficiency, effectiveness, productivity and job commitment of employees, the business must satisfy the needs of its employees by providing good working conditions (Imran et al., 2017).

Most of the organizations feel the need of creating a motivating environment to help employees fully discharge their capabilities (Shalley et al., 2000). Employees get motivated by work environment that provides sense of belonging (Miller et al., 2001) and provision of generous personnel policies and sound control on workplace (Wells and Thelen, 2002), and enhances the motivation levels of employees to commit with organization for a longer period (Imran et al., 2017). A study done by Earle (2003) identifies that requirements of different generations varies and the way they prioritize the value of work environment differs. Hence, focus of organization must be on how to provide better working environment so as to maintain better relationship with employees (Levi, 2002).

The link between work climate and employees commitment toward organization has been mentioned as an important thing by many researchers such as Vanaki and Vagharseyyedin (2009), Valentine et al. (2002) and Stradinger (2015). In this way, organization provides employee-friendly work environment crating a good sense of trust among the employees that organization cares them and this will become a major factor considerably related to their commitment. Stradinger (2015) studies importance of innovation in the workplace and its effect on the employee’s emotional commitment. Results of this study demonstrate that there is a strong relationship between participation in creativity in the workplace and retention. This study has extensive academic and practical implications, suggesting creative participation significantly increases employees’ retention (Stradinger, 2015), by fulfilling the basic needs of the teachers based on current socioeconomic conditions of the respective country (Saiti et al., 2018).
Employee retention

Employees are the most valuable assets of an organization which can be termed the life-blood of an organization. Their significance to organizations calls for not only the need to attract the best talented employees but also the necessity to retain them for a long term. Retention is the ability of a company to keep valued employees who contribute to organizational success and the relationship is mutually favorable (Al-Jarradi, 2011). Employee retention is a systematic effort to create and foster an environment that motivates employees to remain employed by having policies and practices in place that address their diverse needs (Imran et al., 2017). Employee retention is concerned with keeping or encouraging employees to remain in an organization for a maximum period of time (Kossivi et al., 2016). According to Mita et al. (2014), employee retention is a technique adopted by businesses to maintain an effective workforce and at the same time meet operational requirements. Bidisha and Mukulesh (2013) described it as a process in which the employees are encouraged to remain with the organization for the maximum period of time or until the completion of the project. Al Matrooshi et al. (2016) and Bozionalos and Singh (2017) put forward research models to test the link between emotional intelligence and organizational as well as contextual performance in the case of the UAE.

A potential research model has been provided by Harhara et al. (2015) in order to predict the factor of organizational environment that can lead to influence on employee turnover intentions in the oil and gas industry in the UAE. However, the model did not present any empirical results collating data with the model.

Employee retention is currently one of the critical issues in organizations as a result of changing dynamics and turbulence being experienced in the general work environment as a result of various phenomena (Milman and Dickson, 2014; Imran et al., 2017). Advancement in technology has caused most organizations to be more and more technology driven. However, this situation does not reduce the value of employees in an organization because technology requires human resources to operate. With issues such as globalization, competition is becoming keener and keener in most industries (Imran et al., 2017). This situation also affects the job market in the sense that organization demand in human resources to remain competition in their respective industries is higher. To remain more competitive, organizations need, therefore, not only attract the best talents but also to retain them on the job for a long term. The toughest challenge that organizations encounter nowadays is not only how to manage the people but also how to keep them on the job as long as possible and how to maintain them vigorous and ambitious (Milman and Dickson, 2014). This study focuses on employee retention which can play a mediating role between working condition and quality education in higher education institute.

Quality education

Quality in higher education is not a new issue, and it has been the subject of debate for decades (Fomunyam, 2018). There are a large number of reports and theoretical works on quality from the perspective of quality assurance and quality improvement. In many of them, research scholars have identified different views on the issue of quality education and its determining factors (Biggs, 1995; Ashraf et al., 2008, 2009, 2016; Lim, 2008; Ehlers, 2009; Poole, 2010; Gallifa and Batallé, 2010; Tsinidou et al., 2010; Vnoučková et al., 2017; Choy et al., 2017; Rodriguez et al., 2018). However, a very limited empirical work is available on this particular issue of quality management in the case of Bangladeshi private higher educational institutions (Ashraf et al., 2009).

The term “quality” is evolved from the Latin word qualitas that means the degree of excellence of a thing (Oxford Dictionary, 2003). According to Tsinidou et al. (2010), qualitative dimensions mean more than the quality of education as customarily defined and
judged by student learning performance. The authors also emphasize that quality, in the case of Greece, also relevant to how well it fits the present and future needs of the students depending their particular circumstances and prospects (Psomas and Antony, 2017).

Gallifa and Batallé (2010) examine quality of education in one of the West European region. They state that quality assurance refers to service quality in terms of the determination of standards, appropriate methods and quality requirements by an expert body, accompanied by a process of inspection or evaluation that examines the extent to which practice meets these standards. The authors also add that consumer-driven quality refers to a notion of quality in which those who are to get a product or service make clarify their expectations for this product or service and quality is defined in terms meeting or exceeding the expectations of customers. Thus, customer evaluation of the quality of their education is considered to be a necessary part of total quality management which “quests for excellence” in all of the private universities in Bangladesh now (Haque, 2004; Markowitsch, 2018).

In recent years, quality assessment and assurance procedures in rendering tertiary education have received much attention nationally as well as globally. In this regard, Lim (2008) refers quality of education as the overall performance and services which an institution provides educational environments (Markowitsch, 2018), which enable students effectively to achieve worthwhile learning goals including appropriate academic standards. Indeed, the quality issue of higher education is considered to be one of the vital concerns in all of the developing countries of the world (Nguyen, 2009).

Vnoučková et al. (2017) explore quality education in the private university in the Eastern European region viewed from the students’ perspectives similar to the study of Ashraf et al. (2016). The study asserts that quality education assurance is a necessity for today’s competitive environment of the private higher education sector. For this reason, quality assurance standards and strategies are being set in most of universities and higher education institutions. However, the perception of quality standards is being usually seen from the perspective of university management practices.

Rodriguez et al. (2018) investigate on some critical factors in TQM implementation in the higher education institutes. The findings of the study reveal that continuous quality improvement, leadership commitment and stakeholder satisfaction are the determining factors to improve quality education in the tertiary education sector. The study intuitively implies that human management practices are important to implement TQM in the private universities (Psomas and Antony, 2017).

Yet, there has been scanty literature of investigations that are keen to examine the relationship between working condition and employee retention and their impacts on quality education in the private higher educational institutions. This issue is particularly important in Bangladesh, because private universities have been grown here in the country very rapidly within a small span of time. In this circumstance, private higher education sector is passing a transitional phase where myriads of challenges pose to be threats to achieve the “excellence in quality” of education in the private universities in Bangladesh. Among these issues, human resource practices are one of the neglected fields which are not conspicuously taken into consideration by the academics as well as the educational policy makers of the country (Akareem and Hossain, 2012; Ashraf et al., 2009). In this respect, Kohont and Nadoh (2010) stated that human resource management tools play important roles in developing the teachers, supporting changes in the organizational culture, and preparing managers, leaders and academic personnel for the higher education institutions. All of these four dimensions determine the quality of higher education. As the present study initiates to investigate the human resource dimension focusing quality education in the private higher education sector, it will fill up the existing gap of research specifically the impact of working condition and employee retention on quality education.
Research model and hypotheses

The research model used in the study, shown in Figure 2, is based on Maslow's hierarchy of needs theory. The ultimate object of the discussion is quality education, which was postulated to be influenced by faculty retention practices directly and by working condition indirectly. The four hypotheses embodied in the model are listed below. The directionality stated in each hypothesis is derived from the prior discussion about working condition and faculty retention from the basic structure of the underlying theory.

There have been several studies that examine the positive link between working environment and employee motivation, involvement, engagement, and above all retention (Wells and Thelen, 2002; Edgar and Geare, 2005; Heneman, 2007; Raziq and Maulabakhsh, 2015; Stradinger, 2015). Besides, Alhosani et al. (2017) and Al Mehrzi and Singh (2016) investigated similar relations of working condition and faculty retention in the educational institution in the Arab region. The findings of these studies imply that working condition should be associated positively with faculty retention in the university. Therefore:

\[ H1. \text{ Working condition is positively associated with faculty retention.} \]

Although a large number of studies examined the determining factors of quality education (Tsinidou et al., 2010; Gallifa and Batallé, 2010; Poole, 2010; Ehlers, 2009; Lim, 2008; Biggs, 1995; Ashraf et al., 2009, 2016), few studies have been initiated to explore the possible association between faculty retention and quality education in private higher education institutes. As such, Jalil (2009) and Joarder (2012) probed the significant link between faculty turnover intention and quality education in the private universities in Bangladesh. Given the reported concerns about employee retention that potential talented faculty members frequently change their jobs and this situation can have an impact on quality education in the university. Thus:

\[ H2. \text{ Faculty retention is positively associated with quality education.} \]

As mentioned earlier, Al Matrooshi et al. (2016) and Bozionalos and Singh (2017) identified that positive work environment through emotional intelligence can impact on the organizational performance-outcome. According to Alhosani et al. (2017), educational leadership and academic environment can have an impact on students’ achievement though parental involvement in the educational institutes in Arab region. Based on this type of stance in the past research, it is conjectured that enjoyable working condition is a precondition for the faculty to have enough freedom or autonomy to teach the students and do research based on their own interest. Thus:

\[ H3. \text{ Working condition is positively associated with quality education.} \]

\[ H4. \text{ Faculty retention positively mediates between working condition and quality education.} \]
Research design

Data collection took place in November and December 2017. A total of five undergraduate and postgraduate students were recruited from a university to complete a questionnaire that contained measures of the constructs of concern. Data were collected from 537 employees including faculty members working in private universities located all over the country based on a closed ended questionnaire through face to face interview. The respondents were selected based on random sampling procedure. Due to incompleteness and some errors left in the filled-in questionnaire, a total of 516 data were finally selected for the analysis. The questionnaire was pilot tested with a small sample of data. There were also seven demographic questions included in the instrument the statistics which are presented in Table I.

The approach to testing the model was based on that used by Edgar and Geare (2005), Milman and Dickson (2014) and Biggs (1995). The questions in the questionnaire were based on the Likert’s scale of seven ranging from “strongly disagree” to “strongly agree.” Measures of working conditions (four items), faculty retention (six items) and quality education (eight items) were based on Edgar and Geare (2005), Milman and Dickson (2014) and Biggs (1995), respectively. Brief summary of the measurement variables, the descriptive statistics and the correlation coefficients are included in Tables II–IV.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Valid percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20–25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26–30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31–35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36–40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41 and above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PhD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Designation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lecturer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior lecturer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant professor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate professor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Monthly income</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10,000–30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30,001–40,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40,001–50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50,001–60,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60,001–80,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 80,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tenure (in years)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1–2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2–5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5–10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I.
Respondents’ demographic profile
The data were analyzed following the procedure of structural equation modeling (SEM) using SPSS and AMOS software. First, the model in Figure 2 was run. The average variance explained for each construct was above the 0.5 cutoff level (Table IV). Next, item loadings were checked to make sure they were all above 0.5, and all were. Internal consistency reliabilities (ICRs) were then computed for each construct that had more than two indicators. The measurement model with item loadings appears in Figure 3. All constructs made up of four items and had ICRs of 0.9 or higher. Measures of reliability

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Internal consistency reliability (ICR)</th>
<th>Key citations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working conditions</td>
<td>Q1. Working conditions at my institution is good</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>Edgar and Geare (2005)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q2. I do not suffer due to working condition here</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q3. I always feel safe working here</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q4. This institution does everything to ensure the well-being of its employees</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty retention</td>
<td>Q1. I will not leave the present organization if similar job is offered by others</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>Milman and Dickson (2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q2. I feel homely in the job</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q3. I am satisfied with my job specification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q4. I am proud to work here</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q5. My job status of the institute is socially recognized</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q6. I try my best to uphold the interest of the institute</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality education</td>
<td>Q1. My institution curriculum is effective</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>Biggs (1995)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q2. In my institution, employees’ educational background is of good quality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q3. My institution is well-equipped with modern facilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q4. Overall reputation of my institute in the corporate sector is high</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q5. If I had to start fresh, I would select my university for education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q6. I would recommend my institution’s education to friends or relatives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q7. I would recommend my institution’s education to friends or relatives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q8. Overall, quality of education in my institute is excellent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Internal consistency reliability (ICR)</th>
<th>Key citations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working condition (WC)</td>
<td>516</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>7.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty retention (ER)</td>
<td>516</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>7.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality education (QE)</td>
<td>516</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>7.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reliability</th>
<th>WC</th>
<th>ER</th>
<th>QE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working condition (WC)</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty retention (ER)</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>0.644**</td>
<td>0.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality education (QE)</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>0.617**</td>
<td>0.728**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: **Coefficients are significant at 0.01 level

The data were analyzed following the procedure of structural equation modeling (SEM) using SPSS and AMOS software. First, the model in Figure 2 was run. The average variance explained for each construct was above the 0.5 cutoff level (Table IV). Next, item loadings were checked to make sure they were all above 0.5, and all were. Internal consistency reliabilities (ICRs) were then computed for each construct that had more than two indicators. The measurement model with item loadings appears in Figure 3. All constructs made up of four items and had ICRs of 0.9 or higher. Measures of reliability
Results and discussion

Several past surveys have studied about the quality education rendered by the private universities in Bangladesh but none of these studies have investigated the actual associations between human resource practices particularly the constructs of working condition, faculty retention and quality education. This study has demonstrated, at least for
this sample, that the working condition is much important to influence faculty retention which subsequently influences the construct of quality education of the private universities in Bangladesh.

**Direct impacts of the constructs**

Analysis of the data demonstrated (Figure 3) that minimum was achieved with $\chi^2$ of 430.794 (df = 101, $p < 0.01$). The statistics of fit model (Table VII) showed a good fit to the observed data indicating $\chi^2$/df = 4.265 < 5.0, CFI = 0.94 > 0.90, TLI = 0.93 > 0.90, NFI = 0.92 > 0.90, RMSEA 0.08 = 0.80 (Zainudin, 2012; Byrne, 2010; Hair et al., 2010). The results of direct impact of the constructs included in the fit model (Table V) indicate that there was a strong positive relationship ($p < 0.01$) between working condition and faculty retention ($H1$) and faculty retention had, in turn, a strong positive relationship ($p < 0.01$) with quality education supporting $H2$. Working condition was also observed to have a direct positive relationship with quality education ($H3$).

**Mediating effect of faculty retention**

However, it is obvious in the result of the fit model that the path coefficients between working condition and faculty retention ($H1$), faculty retention and quality education ($H2$), and working condition and quality education ($H3$) were observed to be 0.73, 0.64 and 0.18, respectively. This means that the path coefficients of $H1$ (0.73) and $H2$ (0.64) are much higher than $H3$ (0.18). Though the construct of working condition significantly influences the construct of quality education, the standard estimate of this relation in magnitude is

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Endogenous</th>
<th>Exogenous</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>$p$-value</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$H1$</td>
<td>Faculty retention ← Working condition</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>13.566</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H2$</td>
<td>Quality education ← Faculty retention</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>0.062</td>
<td>9.983</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$H3$</td>
<td>Quality education ← Working condition</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.037</td>
<td>3.391</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>Significant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ***Coefficients are significant at 0.01 level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Exogenous</th>
<th>Mediating</th>
<th>Endogenous</th>
<th>Indirect effect</th>
<th>Direct effect</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$H4$</td>
<td>Working condition → Faculty retention → Quality education</td>
<td>QC → FR, $\beta = 0.74$, Sig***</td>
<td>WC → QE, $\beta = 0.18$, Sig***</td>
<td>FR → QE, $\beta = 0.67$, Sig***</td>
<td>Partially mediating</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: ***Coefficients are significant at 0.01 level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of category</th>
<th>Name of index</th>
<th>Level of acceptance</th>
<th>Values extracted from fit model (Figure 3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Absolute fit</td>
<td>$\chi^2$</td>
<td>$p &lt; 0.05$</td>
<td>$p = 0.000$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RMSEA</td>
<td>RMSEA &lt; 0.08</td>
<td>RMSEA = 0.080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GFI</td>
<td>GFI &gt; 0.90</td>
<td>GFI = 0.913</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Incremental fit</td>
<td>CFI</td>
<td>CFI &gt; 0.90</td>
<td>CFI = 0.941</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TLI</td>
<td>TLI &gt; 0.90</td>
<td>TLI = 0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Parsimonious fit</td>
<td>$\chi^2$/df = Ratio</td>
<td>Ratio &lt; 5.0</td>
<td>Ratio = 4.265</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Zainudin (2012), Byrne (2010) and Hair et al. (2010)
much lower than other two hypotheses. That means, the direct relationship between working condition and quality education is much weaker than the other two relationships and according to Hair et al. (2010), faculty retention has a partial mediation of between working condition and quality education in the private universities in Bangladesh (H4). This result is included in Table VI.

In short, respondents who believed in the quality education of the universities and in their own abilities to successfully engage in knowledge production to excel in education actually realized through sound working condition and faculty retention practices. Hence, in order to achieve an excellence in education, it is imperative to enhance positive working environment and reduce faculty intention to quit from the universities off and on.

These findings are similar to those reported in other studies. Like Raziq and Maulabakhsh (2015), Vanaki and Vagharseyyedin (2009), Valentine et al. (2002) and Stradinger (2015), there was a strong relationship between working condition and faculty retention. Like Akareem and Hossain (2012) Ashraf et al. (2009), and Kohont and Nadoh (2010), there was a strong relationship between faculty retention and quality education. Like Stradinger (2015) and Kohont and Nadoh (2010), there was a relationship between working condition and quality education. As the present study is endeavoring to explore a new direction of quality education in the higher education sector to relate human resource practices with quality education, there are serious shortages of available literature to compare with the findings of the present one. However, it may, in this respect, claim its empirical outcomes as to disclose a very important dimension in the higher education particularly in the private university sector which seeks to excel in attaining excellence in education as a service industry.

In the current study, Maslow’s hierarchy need theory of motivation served as a useful foundation for helping explain faculty members’ motivational behavior to enhance quality education in the higher education sector. The relationship between working condition and faculty retention was strong and positive and it was partially mediated faculty retention. The direct relationship between working condition and quality education was supported here, but the relationship was weaker than the relationships hypothesized by H1 and H2.

As for the motivation studied, faculty decision to stay, the findings imply that faculty members are swayed most by their perceptions about the working environment. Sound working condition has also an important direct effect on quality education in the universities. These findings square with previous evidence presented by several studies that job satisfaction of the faculty members was not in satisfactory level due to unpleasant working condition prevailed in the overall human resource management practices of the private universities in Bangladesh (Jalil, 2009; Joarder, 2012; Ashraf, 2009).

Conclusions
As mentioned earlier, the concept of private higher education in Bangladesh is relatively a new phenomenon in the education sector which was entirely within the public domain before the 1990s. As a nascent sector, it has been suffering from myriads of management problems. Particularly, working conditions prevailed in these universities are not up to that level which is pleasant for the faculty members due to many of ill managerial policies (Joarder, 2012). The results of this study reveal that this factor is considerably important to maintain a steady faculty retention policy. There have been several studies that report that turnover intentions of the faculty member in these private universities in Bangladesh are significantly high which is responsible for reducing quality education. In this respect, the present study has offered important evidence that faculty working condition in the private universities in developing context can have significant influence on employee retention as well as on quality education in the private universities in Bangladesh.
Research implications
From a research perspective, the study results demonstrate once again the robustness of the Muslow’s hierarchy need theory of motivation for helping to explain the faculty members of the private universities. Other studies have also successfully used the similar motivational theories as a theoretical framework from which to explain job satisfaction (Ashraf et al., 2008; Joarder and Ashraf, 2012), working environment (Heneman, 2007; Edgar and Geare, 2005; Joarder, 2012), faculty retention (Milman and Dickson, 2014; Ashraf and Joarder, 2010) and quality education (Biggs, 1995; Ashraf et al., 2016; Ashraf, 2009). In addition to the importance of working condition toward quality education in the higher education institutes, some of these studies have found job autonomy as a part of working condition to also be important (e.g. Joarder, 2012), while others have found compensation package to also be important (e.g. Ashraf, 2009). Both cases demonstrate the increased power of Muslow’s theory of motivation. As more and more studies of faculty behavior and its antecedents are done within the similar framework, we are more able to discover and confirm which antecedents are most important, helping us build a robust theory of quality education affected based on human resource practices by the management of the institutes.

Practical implications
From a practical perspective, as a cumulative body of work on the nexus between human resource management and quality education emerges, we will be better able to advise private university authorities on the elements they need to address in order to excel quality education. In this study, the one area of findings that may help university authorities the most concerns work environment. We found that perceptions about sound work environment in the universities as a channel for conducting commitment with the organization were associated with enhancing faculty retention, and these positive attitudes were, in turn, associated with quality education. The implication is that university authorities can focus on promoting positive work environment, and in doing so, they can generate positive attitudes toward faculty retention. Such a strategy can be accompanied by steps to promote the sound working condition in order to make an environment conducive for excelling quality education in the private universities.

Directions for future research
This study considered only one antecedent to faculty retention. There may well be others that should be considered in future research, such as other aspects of motivational factors, such as compensation, career prospect, training and development, job autonomy and so on. Valid and reliable scales for these constructs need to be developed, however, in order to include them in future studies. As a matter of fact, there have serious shortages of studies that focused on the nexus between human resource management practices and quality education in the higher education sector especially in private education sector in Bangladesh. Future research could include those practices in their studies which will enable us to formulate a proper policy measure for ensuring higher level of quality education in the private higher education sector in developing country context like Bangladesh.

Limitations
As with any study, there are limitations to the study described here. One possible drawback is the use of both faculty members as well as university administrative staffs as respondents. Perceptions about work environment may have been differently perceived by the faculty members and administrative staffs. If the study were to include only the faculty members as respondents, the findings may have been different. Nevertheless, the usual cautions about overgeneralizing findings from this sample, to populations for
which it is not strictly representative, apply. Although the sample was randomly drawn to represent a population to which findings could be generalize, the ability to generalize the findings very far beyond the sample is limited due to the inclusion of only 20 private universities in Bangladesh.

References


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Volume</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OECD (2017)</td>
<td>“OECD education and skills. Directorate for education and skills”</td>
<td>OECD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poole, B. (2010)</td>
<td>“Quality, semantics and the two culture”</td>
<td><em>Quality Assurance in Education</em></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stradinger, H.J. (2015)</td>
<td>“Creativity in the workplace and its effect on faculty retention”</td>
<td>Research report, Department of Management, Texas Christian University, Fort Worth, TX.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Further reading


Corresponding author
Mohammad Ali Ashraf can be contacted at: mashraf@eco.uiu.ac.bd
The linkage between knowledge management practices and organization based projects for better learning outcome

A conceptual framework

Parijat Upadhyay
Institute of Management Technology Nagpur, Nagpur, India, and
Manas Paul
Institute of Management Technology Ghaziabad, Ghaziabad, India

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to provide a framework to understand and reflect upon issues, which can help in producing better industry-ready students graduating from business schools.

Design/methodology/approach – The paper examines research conducted in the area of knowledge management (KM) and proposes a conceptual framework that can be used by academic institutions to engage students and prepare them for industry needs so that they are better industry-ready graduates. A case study based approach has been adopted in this study.

Findings – In line with the literature-based analysis, a framework for better industry ready students has been proposed, illustrating the linkage between KM, learning from organization-based projects, industry feedback and inputs from international accreditation bodies in higher education.

Originality/value – This paper has provided a comprehensive framework that contributes to the understanding and refining the academic processes in a business school setting with the help of learning from academic KM process. Such a framework has not been previously developed by previous researchers.

Keywords Knowledge management, Higher education, Organization-based projects

1. Introduction

Knowledge is by far one of the most crucial assets for any organization (Almatrooshi Singh and Farouk, 2016). Moreover, appropriate and well-timed information and knowledge are necessary for organizations to make sound decisions (Pradhan et al., 2017). Learning and knowledge that do not get comprehended and exchanged all throughout the organization remain useless. This is particularly true for knowledge-intensive organizations (KIO) like institutions of higher education. However, knowledge management (KM) practices are thriftily used in educational institutes to fine-tune academic curriculum. The capability to share valuable insights from business processes can be an important means of introducing aspects of creative thinking and problem solving into the pedagogy of institutions of higher education. Once that gets done, such insights can get channelized into relevant knowledge creation and KM. Effective KM can be instrumental in creating sustainable competitive advantage in new and competitive markets. Elements of KM practices can be drawn into existing markets as well to sail through turbulence or overcome stagnation. Thus, this process can help in developing dynamic pedagogy for institutions of higher education those that automatically evolve according to the needs of the hour through knowledge assimilation and transfer.

KIOs have been characterized by Bettencourt Ostrom et al. (2002) as organizations whose essential contribution comprises of gathering, creating or distributing knowledge to build up a tailored service. Further definitions by Caniels and Romijn (2005), Simmie and Strambach (2006)
and Strambach also reverberate the aspect of organizations whose essential activities are reliant on learning and KM. Institutions of higher education, be it in developed or developing countries, are engaged in deriving valuable insights from their existing processes and seek to refine their pedagogy to create industry-ready professionals (Al Mansouri et al., 2018; Singh, 2017; Alhosani et al., 2017). KIOs and firms offering knowledge-intensive professional services are often equated with one another. Den Hertog, for instance, considered KIOs as companies/organizations offering products or services by a specific expertise or knowledge, related either to a (technical) discipline or a functional domain. It is in this perspective that in this qualitative case study, we explore the linkages amongst the academic processes in an institute of higher education that incorporates “learning by doing” pedagogy by initiating students in addressing organizational realities of the institute itself and helps in shaping industry-ready professionals. As a phenomenon though it might be present across different business schools, it finds seldom attention as a compulsory activity and falls short of viewing it through the lens of the KM literature. This is possibly one of the first attempts to link pedagogy enhancement in business schools with organization realities and putting it in the perspective of KM.

2. Theoretical background

The significance of KM and its advantages to business has been extensively reported in the published literature. While distinguishing the importance of KIOs, the European Commission defines a large gamut of organizations as knowledge-intensive services (KIS) (Eurostat, 2014; Bozionelos and Singh, 2017). There is a concept of knowledge-intensive service (KIS) together with that of KIO. Knowledge-intensive services organizations have also been defined as those organizations where knowledge is the main production factor and the good they offer. There are different types of knowledge as well as organizational forms (Singh, 2017). According to Polanyi (1966), in this respect, tacit (intangible) knowledge also needs particular attention along with factual/data knowledge.

On the one hand, there is limited literature available in this area, and on the other hand, there are significant observable gaps as well. While the idea of KIS perceives the entrenchment of knowledge in services, it can be taken well past that limit to a stage where business remains knowledge centric in its entirety. At the same time, the significance of KIOs and KISs has been expanding in numerous economies and across businesses around the world.

We assess that governance and supervision are serious challenges in such establishments as individuals are their key asset. Formations, procedures and practices have developed over time to meet specific requirements of the diverse areas of activities. Both similarities and differences exist between KIOs. Not only do they comprise knowledge-intensive commercial and professional services like IT, Finance, R&D, legal and creative businesses but also non-business services like education, cultural organizations and the civil service as well. Various studies (Al-Ali et al., 2017; Peltokorpi and Vaara, 2014; Zander, 2011; Corbett-Etchevers and Mounoud, 2011; Singh, 2017) have highlighted the use of SAP approach to study KM. This strand of literature explores the continual modifications in the daily practice and practical application by experts to enhance the understanding of creating organizational outcomes (Alhosani et al., 2017; Jarzabkowski et al., 2012). Practices imply “routinized types of behavior” (Reckwitz, 2002, p. 249) of specialists or practitioners during strategizing. Expositions of practical applications cover “the concrete, unfolding activity as it takes place” (Suddaby et al., 2013, p. 332). The external agents those who construe change and ordain strategy through praxis are the specialists or practitioners of strategy (Jarzabkowski and Spee, 2009).

Formations, procedures and practices have developed over time to meet specific requirements of the diverse areas of activities. Moves made in the execution of KM might be reflexive, in that they are altogether influenced by specific, authoritative, social and
psychological elements, which may thus affect how individuals accomplish their ascribed practices (Jarzabkowski et al., 2012). Also, in this view, the social realism is in a state of appropriateness, which implies that practice is progressing and will develop. Consequently, SAP is established in the possibility that there is a contrast between what individuals think and what individuals really do.

For a better understanding, let us discuss the types of knowledge and how they affect our processes and practices.

2.1 Explicit and tacit knowledge
Published literature on KM classifies two broad types of knowledge: explicit and tacit knowledge. Explicit knowledge may be defined as the knowledge that can be stored, spoken, transmitted, processed and disseminated comparatively easily. It expresses information that can be understood, contextual and secured in beliefs of individuals (Nonaka and Von Krogh, 2009) and which can be codified, stored and can be easily retrieved. This is the type of “knowledge” which many business firms and KIO are familiar with. In simple terms, explicit knowledge may be defined as the process and also the product by which knowledge can get disseminated throughout a firm or an organization systematically.

Tacit knowledge has also proved to be equally essential to the operation of an organization. It may be difficult to offer a simplified definition of tacit knowledge as much of it gets mirrored in the business procedures, ingrained in action and is generally acquired by sharing experiences and by reflection along with imitation. Tacit knowledge produces insights which are necessary for understanding the other form of knowledge. Kikoski and Kikoski (2004) were of the opinion that it is the tacit knowledge that enables creation of the learning curve which others may like to follow and eventually provides the firm the strategic competitive advantage. It is a management challenge to transform tacit knowledge into the other form, i.e., the explicit knowledge. In military, nonetheless, such transformation has been achieved through the “after action reviews” or through classifying “lessons learned” in business projects. This shows that despite difficulties, institutions are working to address such challenges.

2.2 Knowledge management in KIOs
Published literature in context to management practices in KIOs provided by Starbuck (1992) and Alvesson (2001) has been referred in this study to build our framework. Starbuck (1992) and Alvesson (2001) in their study have highlighted the challenges both at the individual level as well as collectively while implementing KM practices. Several researchers have investigated the identity work of knowledge actors. In KIOs, individuals engage to formulate coherent and distinguishing notions of personal and specialized self-identity (Singh, 2017; Sveningsson and Alvesson, 2003; Gardiner, 2016). Crane (2012) opined that knowledge workers tend to construct their identities in continual connection with practices in the domain of KM.

Explicit knowledge tends to get codified into reports or processes like software programs and denotes the part of explicit KM. This form of codified knowledge can then be easily stored in databases and can be queried and disseminated across the organization in any part of the world by the use of electronic medium like the internet or the intranets. Knowledge centers that are properly managed, checked for relevancy and scrutinized by subject matter specialists have been found beneficial for knowledge transference across the organizations (Al-Ali et al., 2017; Singh, 2017). Knowledge maps displaying where key expertise is sited within a firm are equally helpful and fairly easy to manage (Wang and Belardo, 2005).

However, the real challenge is to leverage on tacit knowledge of the specialist knowledge worker. Tacit knowledge exists within the individuals which results from collective
experiences, learning and reproduction. Such type of knowledge is tough to codify and its transmission across the organization is difficult for many reasons (Kikoski and Kikoski, 2004). Many subject matter experts have enormous knowledge in their areas but are unable to effectively articulate it. Some others may also not be aware as such with whom to connect within the organization for sharing the knowledge. It has also been reported by several researchers that if knowledge becomes a source of supremacy or job security, knowledge workers abstain from sharing it (Zhenhua, 2003). Polanyi (1966) in his study differentiated between forms of tacit knowledge. He emphasized on connoisseurship and expertise as requisite elements of tacit KM. According to him, tacit knowledge can be seen as having an appreciation as well as a skill feature.

The challenges before organizations to develop, accumulate and transfer knowledge are becoming increasingly important. Using a qualitative case study from the higher education sector, this paper analyses how KM practices can get embedded within industry standards and global benchmarking from the perspective of B-Schools pedagogy in creating industry ready professionals. The study of proposed KM practices in context to an educational institute is crucial as KIO (like an academic institution) tend to deal with high levels of ambiguity (Alvesson, 1993). Standards may be formulated which can act as a mechanism to lessen the levels of ambiguity. At the same time, the implicit knowledge both existing and those getting enhanced could get formally incorporated into the pedagogy formulation, which somehow already do exist but in a scattered format in several institutions and hardly get leveraged to its fullest extent.

3. Methodology
For developing a framework based on insights and their analysis, a qualitative case study approach was adopted in this study. This approach looks to clarify and decipher associations with the phenomenon. In this spirit, we began our examination to identify activities used by knowledge workers in their execution of knowledge practices (Johnson et al., 2003; Jarzabkowski, 2003). Such methodology has been used earlier in the literature as well (Ambrosini et al., 2007; Perrin, 2012). We narrowed down into our final research inquiry through the iterative process of hypothetical reflection (Suddaby, 2006; Glaser, 1978; Glaser and Strauss, 2009).

To explore the linkages amongst the processes in a KIO, we use an institution for higher education offering post-graduate programs in business as our case. In an institutional background, the knowledge workers get represented by the scholastic staff, as they produce, use, transfer and assimilate knowledge (Kelloway and Barling, 2000). The establishments of higher education thus come under the ambit of KIOs (Starbuck, 1992; Alvesson, 1993), as human capital turns out to be the primary asset for their survival. Our study centers on the formalization of learning system of a business school as a part of their strategy to prepare industry-ready business managers.

The framework that is currently in practice is shown in Figure 1.

3.1 Case study
Students undergoing two-year full-time post-graduate program in business management got introduced to a new course. The course was offered by the institute which is considered to be one of the premier B-Schools in India and amongst the select few having AACSB accreditation in the country. It is a privately funded institute. The course named as “Learning Organizational Realities through Organization-Based Projects” (OBP) has the distinct purpose of making the students learn the art of administration by getting engaged in institutional building activities.
The course is aimed at enhancing the students’ experience to address the challenges of collaboration, conflict resolution and timely and cost-effective execution of critical activities to achieve specific objectives/milestones in such institutional building activities.

Every first-year student is compulsorily a part of one committee or the other, and all committees have a faculty mentor attached to it, who acts as a facilitator. As a part of a committee, the student is empowered to take a lead or a collaborative role to envision the committee’s strategic goals, developmental goals and routine activities. Learning and KM take place through insights gained in these action-packed processes. As such, KM and skill development of the students happen not only through theoretical lectures and books but also through being and doing and then knowing as a part of this process.

Institutes of higher education have been and keep on being impacted by “changes in their ultimate markets (the businesses and other institutions that hire their graduates)” (Torraco et al., 2005, p. 858). Students herein are progressively seen as customers to whom scholastic services are provided with the intent of establishing the necessary qualifications to be attached to a prospective job. This has prompted a shift toward a student-focused/centered model of education away from instructor-focused or educator-focused model (Al-Ali et al., 2017; Singh, 2017; McCuddy and Pirie, 2007; Morse et al., 2007). One of the effective ways to do that is to fuse student input into curriculum design and course delivery assuming the minimum level of maturity expected from a post-graduate student to be conversant about the changing skill set requirements of industries in a dynamic global economy.

OBP as an initiative has all the ingredients in it to harness student feedback and benefit from it most efficiently. Chang et al.’s (1998) study emphasizes the importance of student participation in curriculum design by providing them an element of influence and thereby energizing them in their learning process. In their study in one small Midwestern US business schools (Schloemer and Brenan, 2006), they found that students involved in structuring the content of accounting classes showed more thorough yet objective and self-driven study habits, with a positive outlook and a superior level of responsibility to tasks in the corporate world.

This is not to mean that OBP needs to be driven by student feedback alone. Given the format of its delivery, it also gives the option to get adjusted against the realisms of the needs of eventual markets for the final product of higher education. According to Michael et al. (2008), the basic driver of educational modules improvement concerns the requirement and aspirations of knowledgeable individuals who have the vital expertise and proficiencies required for their organizations to succeed. Hence, it is true that institutions need to be mindful about the value and usefulness of student’s feedback in curriculum
design but, at the same time, their self-imposed restraint and objectiveness should not allow student’s desires alone to influence it in light of educational dollars they provide. The relevance of student feedback should get restrained to the extent of blending it with the actual requirements of the industry and needs of the prospective employers. Hence, so far the OBP process helps to map and merge the students’ feedback with the organization realities they are likely to face in the industry, it is expected to remain fruitful in exploring and upgrading educational program as an activity in overseeing change.

We study the relevance and impact of this course catering to the aspects of knowledge creation and management. Through a practice-based approach (Perrin, 2012), a conceptual mode has been presented that can result in better comprehension of institutionalized practices in KIO and continue to enhance KM through the assessment of processes and activities in KM (Perrin, 2012). The research question which we have predominantly explored is:

**RQ1.** How do members of a KIO can learn the implementation of formal KM strategies based on insights received from “learning by doing” in organization-based projects to emerge as market-ready professionals?

As mentioned in Navarro (2008), the records of explicit and comprehensible benefits of learning by doing go back all the way to Confucius, circa 450 BC, who wrote: “Tell me, and I will forget. Show me, and I may remember. Involve me, and I will understand” (p. 109).

Argyris (1997) expressed the significance of learning and tutoring pursuits that are driven by a theory of action perspective. He focused on the requirement for instructional method and approaches that present real-life problems for which the student gets attracted to the commitment of remaining associated with them. Oxendine et al. (2004) contended that experiential learning is a recurring procedure with various response loops. This procedure begins with arranging, defining objectives and thinking to authentic experimentation, perception and a cautious audit and review of the outcomes. Through this procedure, the experiential student can build up an arrangement of subjective, enthusiastic and physical aptitudes that altogether improve the incidence of learning while creating capacities helpful in solving real-life problems.

As a philosophy, experiential learning provides an all-encompassing model of the learning procedure for adult improvement, reliable with the comprehension of what is thought about how individuals learn, develop and create, underlining the principal part of involvement in the learning procedure (Kolb et al., 2001).

Experiential learning hypothesis (ELT) characterizes learning as the procedure whereby knowledge gets created through the change of proficiency. As indicated by Kolb (1984, p. 41), knowledge comes about from the mix of the effort to get a handle amidst changing experiences. The hypothesis has its underlying foundations in the experiential work of Dewey’s (1902/1916) philosophical sober mindedness, Lewin’s (1946) social psychology and Piaget’s (1954/1981) cognitive-developmental genetic epistemology that form a unique perspective on learning and development (Kolb, 1984).

The most widely recognized types of experiential learning in a business school incorporate group learning workout sessions, re-enactments, visitor speakers and practicums. These sorts of exercises bind together students and faculty instructors creating a symbiotic relationship to react and adopt to consistently changing requirements of real world (AACSB, 2002). However, to pick up the full advantages of experience-based learning, students need to get involved as individuals with the chance for self-reflection. They need the opportunity to get involved as an entire individual (and not just their intellect) including their faculties, their sentiments and their identities. This is the wisdom that impacts feeling (and not simply objective reasoning) and advances reflexivity (Parkes and Blewitt, 2011). OPB as a method has the potential to imbibe this.
The link between insights from learning by doing and formal strategies of members of a KIO is not limited in the perspective of ELT alone. Biggs (2012) and Whetten et al. (2009), for example, highlighted it as one of three crucial components that may have the most noteworthy impact on student learning[2]. Hoidin and Olbert-Bock (2014) in their study on curriculum[3] development for a post-graduate course in business administration emphasized that holistically oriented, learning-centered research curriculum provides students with rigorous, transmissible job-related expertise and aptitudes that successful professionals need to make judicious and relevant decisions within the ambiguities of complicated and dynamic industry and market environments. Again as a practice, OBP can get incorporated into the abovementioned framework.

A strand of existing literature (Teece, 2011) talks about the effectiveness of dynamic capabilities framework to invigorate and amalgamate educational programs of business schools. It is perceived to be befitting to the purpose as it puts structure and a frame around interdisciplinary scrutiny. This is in perspective of thought processes discussed in Thomas (2007, p. 13) that corporate “recruiters increasingly require higher level candidates who possess complex interactive skills (i.e. the ability to link things together and frame complex problems) involving an enhanced judgmental mindset.” As he continued, the challenge for business schools is to “produce students who have the skills, flexibility, and training to compete in the new economy defined by globalization and technological change” (Thomas, 2007).

Dynamic capabilities are both a descriptive and a normative framework which can be used to assist top management decision making. It provides a subjective structure to the business undertakings (particularly its senior administration) to create inferences and to approve or dismiss them, as organization acts to put together capabilities and realign resources to address future needs.

Developing and possessing dynamic competencies is particularly imperative in a fast-paced world where firms need to innovate to pioneer markets and product categories. The framework has risen as the conventional point of view in management studies. It gives the foundation to a more profound comprehension of the business endeavor and the reason for business-level wealth creation in advanced post-industrial, knowledge-based societies. On the face of it, OBP does seem to incorporate some of the attributes of this framework. By design it is expected to provide in-depth understanding of ways to develop conjectures and to validate or reject them. Whether in its present form it does incorporate other aspects of dynamic capabilities framework or can be redesigned to include them could be a matter of further study.

4. Discussion and theoretical implications

Despite studies on knowledge sharing and tacit knowledge (Nonaka and Von Krogh, 2009), the research on knowledge workers and knowledge sharing throws up distinctive questions (Gardiner, 2016). These individuals are exceptionally independent; however, their specific ability and expertise has a tendency to create silos of communication. Knowledge sharing may still be difficult to achieve even if enterprises provide necessary infrastructure (Gardiner, 2016). Researchers (Al-Ali et al., 2017; Pradhan et al., 2017) likewise recognize that enterprise-wide knowledge sharing cannot be accomplished just through arranging and giving infrastructure or institutional help. It is through every day individual or group exercises that socialization can unfurl (Gardiner, 2016) that can facilitate such sharing. Szulanski’s system on the stickiness of learning contends that information is hard to get exchanged and shared among various members. Factors, for example, low levels of ability and entangled connections and hierarchy, among others, can restrict expertise sharing in organizations. For our situation, KIOs posture particular difficulties while examining the sticky knowledge structure, at the back of elevated level of aptitudes and experiences of
their human capital (Starbuck, 1992). Prominent individuals in KIOs have a tendency to have formal education and experience proportionate to a doctoral degree manifesting large absorptive capacities (Pradhan et al., 2017). Moreover, different viewpoints, for example, the level of indistinctiveness surrounding the standard, distinctive differences of inspiration levels of those executing standard and social connections can in any case influence the level of knowledge exchange amongst members in the same group. Our examination centers around these components.

Critical and intermittent assessment of higher education business school curricula has been a subject of continuous research for many years and not a new topic by any means (Browne et al., 1981). In this respect, the study by some researchers finds that textbooks for core subjects in University and College lack in some areas of elevated level of thinking. Hence, faculty should unmistakably communicate the purpose of learning and evaluate the achieved outcomes. They brought up the issue that as students’ competing courses are in a specified order and do not involve communication at “higher cognitive levels throughout the curriculum, those skills learned in the early courses never are fully developed.” This finding has a few ramifications while considering a revision in a business core program, including caution in determining requisite reading material, appropriate faculty coordination and accomplishment of core learning goals along with understanding the distinctive learning styles of students. The diverse learning styles of students can get somewhat tended to by urging faculty to participate in an range of teaching modalities, especially dynamic learning systems, for example, simulations, case analyses and experimental learning (McCarthy and McCarthy, 2006) notwithstanding the traditional lectures and testing. The case being referred to “OBP” would connect most with parts of experiential learning.

Attempts by business schools to change program modules likewise have a component of strategic outlook added to it. It is identified with its prosperity against contending schools – a sound educational programs methodology to effectively fend off competitors. Evidently, most of the research on refreshing advanced education business programs centers primarily around the educational modules, and less on other strategic issues that might be critical.

For this, they have to likewise address the necessities of every single basic partner, for example, students, alumni, businesses, employers, etc. It is perceived that an organization’s stratagem includes the competitive changes, service delivery and administrative approaches that enhance execution and enable the organization to develop (Pradhan et al., 2017; Thompson et al., 2012).

Now once changes in curriculum are made, the utility of such changes needs to get assessed. In their study, Jeffrey W. Alstete (2013) proposed apparatuses like the competitive weighted strength assessments and strategic group map to help empower educational programs organizers to assess the impact of value creating measures and the competitive environment prior to, or concurrently with respect to, specific or general organizational development goals. Institutes (like the one presented here) could use such tools and deploy the proposed framework (Figure 2 below) to measure the impact and effectiveness of curriculum changes that it has undertaken recently.

5. Conclusion, limitations of this study and scope for future research

In the presence of idiosyncrasies pertinent to the education sector, we believe that similar questions like that faced by the educational institutes (referred to in this study) are also relevant to business organizations in sectors such as that of management consulting, companies in the engineering domain and information and technology services. Though in this study we have highlighted the results from a single case study analysis, future researchers can take input from the rich insights provided in this study and further investigate in a setting other than a business school. Also, future research can also explore
the difference in approach in context to the public and privately funded institutions to gain
deep insights into the dynamics those are affecting KM practices in KIO.

Knowledge is a crucial asset for KIOs. It not only serves as the source of constant
innovation by means of innovative ideas and process enhancement but also the real cause of
sustainable competitive advantage. Therefore, the ability to resourcefully capture as well as to
generate new knowledge/learning and disseminate it within the organization basically
constitutes the arena of KM. Here, initiatives like OBP in the specific context of the B-schools
can be useful both as an input as well as interface in harnessing implicit specialized
knowledge already present in the organization and develop it. This is extremely important to
prepare industry-ready professionals as industry remains effectively the end user of the
B-school product, i.e. the students. At the same time, it does empower students to suggest
changes to make the learning more apt and as per the industry needs thus providing them an
element of influence and thereby energizing them in their learning process. As mentioned
earlier, such practices might already be present in bits and pieces in various places of higher
learning but our proposition is to institutionalize it as a formal process in curriculum design
and innovation. The distinct purpose is to make the students learn the art of administration by
getting engaged in institutional building activities, addressing challenges of collaboration,
conflict resolution and timely and cost-effective execution of critical activities. This would also
facilitate in serving the final B-school customers the Corporates, by providing them with
industry-ready professionals. Our contention is that such type of KM processes can be devised
for any knowledge-intensive organization in sustaining their competitive advantage.

However, as of now, the research presented is at an ideation stage; in terms of future
research, it needs to get ratified in terms of actual case studies and data analysis surrounding
institutions including B-schools that facilitated KM in the way presented in this paper.

Notes
1. Strategic goals are those that have a strategic orientation for the institute and are measurable.
   Developmental goals are exploratory in nature and are not easily measurable, since no
   benchmarks exist at present. Routines are day-to-day activities to be followed in order to establish
   proper protocols.
2. Noteworthy learning objectives those students achieved upon the completion of the program; Progressive learning evaluations; and engaging learning pursuits.

3. Curriculum for course on research methodology.

References


**Further reading**


**Corresponding author**
Parijat Upadhyay can be contacted at: parijat.upadhyay@gmail.com

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
The effect of highly emotionally intelligent teachers on their students’ satisfaction

Bassem E. Maamari
Faculty of Business and Insurance,
Lebanese German University, Jounieh, Lebanon, and
Joelle F. Majdalani
Department of Marketing, Lebanese American University, Beirut, Lebanon

Abstract
Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to answer the basic research question “Do highly emotional intelligent teachers increase student’s satisfaction in the universities?”
Design/methodology/approach – The paper is a quantitative study using self-reporting questionnaires applied on 283 students and 10 faculty members.
Findings – The paper shows the importance of having high emotional intelligent teachers in the universities to increase students’ emotional intelligence (EI) and, therefore, their satisfaction. The results show that the primary factor that will increase the EI of students is not what most of the scholars mentioned, the EI of teacher, but the class interactions.
Practical implications – The paper makes a recommendation to universities to hire emotionally intelligent teachers who stress on increasing the EI of students. Universities, by increasing the EI of their students, will improve their business situation, since if students are happy they will remain in the universities, spending, therefore, more money and encouraging other students to do so.
Originality/value – No such research was previously conducted in Lebanon where still few people understand the meaning or the importance of EI. This study, therefore, is fulfilling a gap, a brick in the wall of knowledge on class interaction in bridging the link between teachers and students.
Keywords Education, Emotional intelligence, Customer satisfaction, Students, Teachers
Paper type Research paper

1. Introduction
As the concept of emotional intelligence (EI) aces managerial discussions (Goleman, 1995) and catches fire in the corporate world, the educational institutions that play the role of backyard kitchens for future executives should seek to play their role in the constant evolution process. This research paper focusses on the importance of EI as a factor affecting the human, managerial and educational fields and highlights the necessity of having high emotional intelligent teachers in the universities to be able to increase students’ customer satisfaction (SCS).

Could the level of education be increased by employing high EI teachers which might lead to higher emotionally intelligent students and thus better graduates and high customer satisfaction (Woodruff, 1997)? Universities seeking this path need to focus on this aspect of their operational functions as their mere financial inflows rely on this satisfied customer called student. To do so, involving the service provider, the teacher becomes focal. The question remains whether the level of EI of the teachers, with their classroom interactivity, personality, actions, emotional involvement, and classroom environment creation, can lead to generating the desired customer satisfaction at the student level through stimulating their EI?

The significance of the study is to identify a new tool that can positively enhance the human side of future executives, the survival and the improvement of the universities’ image. Investigating these relationships links between EI of teachers and improving the
behaviour of students in class as the challenge that the researchers are attempting to dwell into.

The following sections include a review of the pertinent literature, methods and results, academic and managerial implications and conclusions.

2. Literature review

EI attempts to study why a person succeeds and another fails in life, regardless of their cognitive abilities, and how some with less skills and abilities perform and succeed more than some of the better equipped (Bradberry and Greaves, 2009). As the missing link is neither intelligence nor education or knowledge, researchers are looking into other dimensions. Psychologists are looking into determining and measuring behaviour and personality traits, while others are suggesting EI as the answer.

2.1 Emotional intelligence

EI is concerned with the way people understand, manage and express their own emotions as well as other people’s felt emotions (Cherniss, 2004). It includes rationalising and bringing intelligence and cognition into emotional feelings (Goleman, 1995). It focusses on being aware of one’s personal and other people’s emotions, and on learning to manage one’s own behaviour or emotional quotient, in a way to enhance different relationships in the external environment or close circle of life, such as at home, work, and community where one normally dwells (Weis et al., 2009).

The historical origins of EI go back to Binet’s (1894) conceptualization of “total intelligence” (Kaufman and Kaufman, 2001). His work on the role of emotions in a person’s totality and intelligence highlights that we cannot separate one’s emotions and cognitive abilities. Earlier, Thorndike (1920) defined social ability as a type of intelligence, setting it away from the different mechanical and abstract intelligence forms. Since then, a sizeable volume of research effort is funnelled resulting in a multitude of definitions focussing on its importance as a human concept (Hedlund and Sternberg, 2000). The term “emotional intelligence” appeared first in Peter Salovey and Jack Mayer’s model defining EI as a cognitive ability that allows humans to rationalise and solve problems (Mayer et al., 1999).

This model encompasses four types of hierarchical abilities, namely, the emotional perception (identification of emotion), the emotional integration (the use of emotion in facilitating thinking), the understanding of emotions (ability to understand and interpret and communicate emotional information) and the management of emotions (the ability to control oneself, understand one’s feelings better and be open to growth).

Salovey and Mayer’s (1990) model is criticised as having no added value, where EI is neither different from any other type of intelligence nor from personality, and adds no validity beyond the cognitive ability (Landy, 2005; Locke, 2005). The popularity, however, of EI goes to Daniel Goleman’s (1995) book Emotional Intelligence: Why It Can Matter More Than IQ, in which he suggests a new performance-based model that includes self-awareness, self-regulation, motivation, empathy and social skills. He argues that most of the difference (80 per cent) in the success of people is not explained by IQ tests, but rather by the elements that constitute EI. A standing limitation for Goleman is his attempt to measure almost all factors but IQ (Verbeke et al., 2004).

In a parallel effort, Bar-On (1997), Psychologist, defines EI as “an array of non-cognitive capabilities, competencies, and skills that influence one’s ability to succeed in coping with environmental demands and determines one’s psychological wellbeing” (p. 14). His model includes five broad areas of skills, namely, the intrapersonal and interpersonal skills, stress management, adaptability and general mood. Both Goleman’s (1995) and Bar-On’s (1997) models are known as the mixed models as they combine mental abilities to personality and character skills. These two models have generated opposing views. The ability model presents
a restrictive view of EI relying on the ability of the person to understand and distinguish emotional signals and information (Mayer et al., 2000), while the mixed model presents EI in a broader frame including all what relates to success that the IQ test cannot measure (Bar-On, 1997; Goleman, 1995, 1998). Another major approach to EI is the trait approach by Petrides, referred to as an emotion-related disposition and self-knowledge method (Petrides et al., 2007). The model discusses self-perceptions and behavioural dispositions as affecting one’s ability to “recognise, process and utilise emotional information” (Petrides et al., 2004, p. 278). It suggests that people tend to behave and or react in a certain way at certain emotional situations, focusing on self-perception and self-efficacy.

2.2 Why do we need to study EI?
Emotionally intelligent people do better in life than others (Bar-On, 1997). They have better abilities in controlling their feelings, communicating, understanding themselves and others, and adapting to any changing situation (Bar-On and Parker, 2000). High EI is important because it improves the physical and psychological health of people, so their academic and work performances are enhanced (Bar-On and Parker, 2000). One way to prove the importance of EI is through proving that high EI people have a higher tendency to better perform in an assortment of aspects of life than those with lower EI (Bar-On, 1997); and have a high capability to assimilate and express their personal selves, to associate well with others, and to handle successfully the multiple demands of daily life (Bar-On et al., 2007).

To become better EI persons, they need to learn these skills. This will only work out if they are adequately motivated, sufficiently optimistic and relatively positive. It is proven that educating people to become emotionally intelligent is possible through teaching and training. EI education starts at home followed by school and university, then the workplace. The role that parents play is very important for increasing their children’s EI, by understanding and listening to them, and helping them build social bonds (Bar-On et al., 2007). In universities, high EI teachers resolve a number of the above-mentioned problems and help foster high EI students (students’ emotional intelligence (SEI)). The success of the university teachers in this endeavour allows for, and equips these young students with the tool they need to succeed in their future careers (Parker et al., 2004). It is important that these teachers increase the EI of students. The higher the EI of students, the more they will be able to engage in positive attitude toward study, the more they will control their emotions, which will help them prevent negative actions and decrease the feeling of anxiety and stress they face in universities (Wilbraham et al., 2018). Students with high EI have better educational achievement and become more engaged (Wilbraham et al., 2018). In the work field, empowering employees with EI proved to be a key success factor through its effect on their improved job performance, horizontal and vertical cooperation, and developed sense of teamwork. Workers with high EI deal better with arising issues and perform more effectively (Wolff et al., 2006). This is what employers are seeking from fresh graduates and newly recruited employees, since their EI and interpersonal communication skills add value to the corporate environment (Landau and Meirovich, 2011). Therefore, it is vital to improve the SEI or future employees, as once they have high EI, they will be able to think and lead differently, and create an engaging work environment. Thus, by teaching EI we can develop leaders that think differently, lead differently and are more positive (Joyner and Mann, 2011). Hence, the role of university teachers is important in developing the EI of the students.

2.3 Measuring EI
To uncover the importance of EI in the managerial context, scientific tools and measures are developed by several scholars. Since there are many models, many tests are used to measure EI, focusing on the mental life of the respondents.
First, the ability model, developed by the Mayer, Salovey and Caruso and known as the Mayer, Salovey and Caruso Emotional Intelligence Test, measures four variables or tasks that represent the four areas of EI, namely, perceiving, understanding, managing and regulating emotions (Daus and Ashkanasy, 2005). Second, the Emotional Competency Inventory put forth in 1999 (Boyatzis, 2001; Boyatzis and Goleman, 2001) measures emotional competency, based on Boyatzis and Goleman’s self-assessment questionnaire, and is composed of 18 competencies using 72 scale items put into the four groups (self-management, social awareness, self-awareness and relationship management) (Boyatzis and Sala, 2004). Third, Bar-On’s Model, using the self-report Bar-On Emotional Quotient Inventory (EQ-i) instrument, measures the ability to be aware of, understand, control and expresses emotions. Fourth, the Trait EI model uses the Trait Emotional Intelligence Questionnaire (TEIQue) to measure personality-based EI (Petrides and Furnham, 2003). Fifth is the Emotional Intelligent Scale, an easy-to-use and short tool consisting of 33 items (Schutte et al., 1998). Sixth, the Work Group Emotional Intelligence Profile for measuring EI of groups focussing on the ability to deal with one’s own emotions and others’ emotions. Finally, the Wong and Law Emotional Intelligence Scale (WLEIS) self-report test, based on Davies et al.’s (1998) four-dimensional definition of EI, composed of 16 scale items using a five-point Likert scale (Li et al., 2012). The test proved to be reliable (Li et al., 2012), valid and internally consistent (McCleskey, 2014).

2.4 Measuring EI in education

The importance of EI in education is that it can predict academic success much more than other traditional measurements of intelligence tools (Goleman, 1995), leading to student achievement and retention (Abdullah et al., 2004). The objective of universities is to hire teachers with high EI, who have empathy toward the students, understand them, and know how to interest them, motivate and engage them continuously in class. This will result in fewer absences and less dysfunctional behaviour among students, who become more engaged in class interactions and discussions. They, therefore, will be more interested, focus more in class, and surf less on the internet during class time (Moore and Mamiseishvili, 2012). In order to be more consistent in their study, researchers selected teachers who are giving similar instruction types of courses in order not let the nature of the course affect the relationship between the teacher and student, but to stress on the way the course is given. Therefore, the researchers selected teachers who teach theoretical and not numerical courses such as management, marketing and economics. The reason is that in these similarly designed courses, the teachers use similar skills. Therefore, they will be able to compare the teaching of high emotionally intelligent teachers to the ones with low EI.

The high EI teachers act differently than the low emotionally intelligent while teaching these courses in different universities. The teacher with high EI will encourage active participation in class will have more empathy toward the students, motivate them more and create a positive class climate and mostly encourage group activities in his class (Nizielski et al., 2012).

2.5 What is customer satisfaction and what increases the satisfaction of students?

For companies to survive, they should be customer oriented and concentrate on how to maximise customer satisfaction (Al Hakim and Maamari, 2017). It requires high EI to deal with demanding customers and to retain them in any kind of business (Singh and Singhal, 2015). Customer satisfaction can be conceptualised as a contemplative or emotional response to a judgmental process (Singh and Singhal, 2015). A satisfied customer is loyal and less price sensitive, which increases the profitability of the company (Helgesen, 2006). Therefore, one of the most important goals of the universities is how to satisfy their students and retain them (Grace, 2004). Satisfied students have a positive word of mouth and contribute to enhancing the image of the university. As a result, the university will make more profit and
have a better reputation. Studies have shown that there are three factors that cause student satisfaction: the faculty, the advisory staff and classes (Hameed and Amjad, 2011). It is, however, the class experience, the teacher–student relationship, that affects students’ satisfaction (Grace, 2004).

The students, as customers, mostly require a good class climate where interaction and a good quality of teaching occur (Douglas et al., 2006). Having high emotionally intelligent teachers will lead to that, since they know how to interact, motivate and deliver a win-win relationship for others and themselves, by spreading positive feelings all around them (Kunnanatt, 2004). If teachers succeed in doing that, it will lead to an increase in their students’ satisfaction. An emotionally intelligent individual is more optimistic, manage in a more lucrative way his emotions and is able to develop a stronger relationship with others, leading to better customer satisfaction (Singh and Singhal, 2015). However, the question remains whether we can consider universities as service companies and students as customers?

One of the most central stakeholders of any university are students (Fernandez et al., 2010). Universities today are managed as a business entity, similar to the service industries, with the goal of satisfying customers, for maintaining them and increasing revenues (Hameed and Amjad, 2011). There is a consensus in our days to consider students as primary customers of education services (Banwet and Datta, 2003). Desai et al. (2001) argue that “Teaching in a higher educational setting is analogous to service delivery in the business sector. Students, as consumers of professional output, have needs and wants which if better understood should result in an improved educational experience” (p. 136). Many researchers disagree saying that “The model (students as customers) is corrupt and corrupting” (Snyder, 2007, p. 3) and that faculty should refuse to treat students as customers. The reason for this rejection is that faculty know what is better for their pupils, and when these students are called or treated as customers, it changes the dynamics and the perceptions’ relationship between the faculty and the students, thereby negatively affecting the educational process (Snyder, 2007). Moreover, Clayson and Haley (2005) postulate that treating students as customers is harmful and that they rather be treated as partners of the shared educational experience. Furthermore, some researchers consider them as customers and as products (Obermiller et al., 2005). But when the student is viewed as a product of the university, the educational institution is oriented toward the satisfaction of its society and its expectations rather than the student (Vaduva et al., 2011). Whereas when the focus is on students as customers, the faculty and their teaching effectiveness become relevant (Muncy, 2008). Thus, the relationship relating the role of students with that of the university is complex in nature.

EI has been subject to many critics. Scholars criticised the fact that there are many definitions and models of EI, and whether it is a kind of intelligence or not. Landy and Locke claimed that EI does not add anything to other intelligence. Other scholars claimed that EI remains controversial with respect to its validity and its utility and might not lead to various forms of success (Miners et al., 2018). Waterhouse (2006) argues that EI creates confusion since there are many conflicting constructs of EI, and that it has not been differentiated from personality factors and IQ factors, and therefore adds little to understanding human behaviour. Landau and Meirovich (2011) argued that EI does not affect the performance and GPA of students, while Murphy (2006) found that the relationship between EI and student satisfaction is non-significant.

Moreover, some researchers declare that incorporating materials on EI into a curriculum in the university will only improve the knowledge of EI and not the actual students’ EI, and that EI is not related to GPA (Landau and Meirovich, 2011). What the universities should try to do is not only to integrate an EI course into their curricula, but also to train their teachers to become highly emotionally intelligent.
The literature gap that this research is attempting to unfold is two dimensional. First, that no previous research has studied such a model, attempting to establish a link between EI of teachers, EI of students, and whether this will lead to customer satisfaction. Furthermore, no similar study in this particular field was conducted in the Lebanese context. Second, that the majority of Lebanese universities are not realizing the importance of having high EI teachers and their role in improving the performance of their students, and therefore their academic level, and in enhancing the image of the university in this increasingly competitive environment, where the number of universities has increased from less than 10 to 53 in 20 years. Therefore, the topic is very important for both universities and faculty members, since teachers are playing an important role in students’ achievement and learning (Vesely et al., 2013).

In this paper, we will try to prove the importance of EI especially in university education.

3. Methodology

Based on the above literature review, higher EI of teachers might lead to higher EI of students (Woodruff, 1997). In this study, we test the postulated and not yet tested relationship between the EI of teachers and their respective students’ satisfaction, to see whether it is mediated by the SEI. A quantitative study is deployed for this social research, employing empirical statements and methods (Cohen and Manion, 1980) and deductive reasoning (Hair et al., 2007). The courses selected in this sample are those that teach theory such as management, marketing and economics and not courses of numerical application. The similarity between courses helps the researcher in comparing the performance of low EI teachers to the ones with high EI. Using numerical data and mathematical-based methods (Creswell, 1994), and following a positivist approach, the following research question (Figure 1) is tested. The researchers are resorting to a positivist approach, as they believe that EI is a skill that people can learn and acquire, adapt and change their behaviour accordingly. Moreover, the researchers are looking for correlations or relationships between variables, all of which take them away from interpretivism and closer to positivism:

\[ RQ1. \text{ Do high EI teachers increase students’ satisfaction in the universities?} \]

Based on the above-reviewed literature, the postulated hypotheses to test are the following:

\[ H_0. \text{ Teacher’s emotional intelligence (TEI) will not increase the SCS.} \]

EI can be built up with time. From home to school, the person acquires the skill by observation and example (Bar-On et al., 2007). Students sharpen this life-needed skill at the university with high EI teachers that foster high EI students (SEI), equip these young students with the tools needed for future careers (Parker et al., 2004). The higher the SEI, the more they are engaged (Moore and Mamiseishvili, 2012) and positive (Nizielski et al., 2012; Kunnanatt, 2004), control their emotional positions, and manage their anxiety, stress and fears (Wilbraham et al., 2018). Therefore, our first hypothesis is:

\[ H1. \text{ TEI increases SEI. The higher the teacher’s EI, the higher the respective students’ EI.} \]

High EI teachers can create a good class environment for learning and interaction, which is a key need for university students (Douglas et al., 2006). Such a class environment is
reported to lead to SCS (Hameed and Amjad, 2011). Therefore, if teachers can develop the EI of their students through engagement (Moore and Mamiseishvili, 2012) and interaction, this will definitely improve the student’s management of their emotions (Singh and Singhal, 2015), leading to a higher SCS. Thereby, our second and third hypotheses:

H2. SEI increases SCS.

H3. TEI affects SCS.

One of the major goals of universities is to attract and retain students. To retain them, these customers need to be satisfied with the service received. Studies show that class environment (Grace, 2004), faculty (Hameed and Amjad, 2011) and class interactions (Singh and Singhal, 2015) play a major role in SCS. Other studies report that EI is a skill that can be learned, and that faculty can affect their students in different aspects of this respect by boosting their EI (Wilbraham et al., 2018; Moore and Mamiseishvili, 2012; Nizielski et al., 2012; Kunnanatt, 2004). Thus, the literature provides indicators that TEI may affect SEI, which in turn leads to increased SCS. Thus, our fourth hypothesis is:

H4. SEI partially mediates the relation between TEI and SCS.

Our sample is selected from university teachers and their respective undergraduate students of the top-ranking four business schools in Lebanon using two questionnaires. These four universities are selected using the following criteria. First, they all use the English language as the instruction language. Second, they follow the liberal arts curricula. Third, they are all mature universities with more than 50 years of experience. Fourth, all four are internationally accredited. Finally, all their faculty members hold master's and terminal degrees and have teaching as a career (and are, therefore, either academically qualified or practically qualified in their respective teaching fields).

The first questionnaire used is for teachers, capturing demographic variables (age, gender, education level, teaching and work experience) and measuring their EI using the WLEIS survey. The second tests demographics, EI (WLEIS) and customer satisfaction of students (SCS) (Tinnesz, 2001). After piloting the questionnaires on 4 teachers and 15 students, the data are collected. The result is the responses from 10 teachers and 304 students. After data entry and cancelling the incomplete responses, the final respondents were 10 teachers and their respective 283 students. The WLEIS and the SCS tools used a five-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (totally disagree) to 5 (totally agree). The WLEIS is considered complete (Libbrecht et al., 2010), and its scores are related to satisfaction (Naseer et al., 2011).

4. Results

Data are collected during the Fall semester of the academic year 2015, through contacting and visiting universities that follow the American liberal educational system (credits). Only four universities took part in the study. The researchers were introduced by the teachers, introduced their research and collected the data on site. For a proper data entry, the researchers labelled the received questionnaires with the initials of the teacher; thus, they were able to relate the data of the students to their respective teachers in the various locations of data collection. SPSS 23.0 is used for data analysis, including reliability and validity of the scale. The KMO test results for all the parts of the scale used range between 0.705 and 0.809 (see Table I). The values of Cronbach’s α range between 0.684 and 0.892 and are considered acceptable. The Bartlett’s sphericity test value ranges between 0.04 < p < 0.000. The eigenvalues scale variation explained for SEI is 3.439 (cumulative 57.381 per cent) and 4.222 for teachers (cumulative = 3.976), SCS is 5.344 (cumulative = 77.681 per cent), all being acceptable at p < 0.05, allowing the researchers to reject the null hypothesis. Construct, content and criterion validity are
analysed through scale development process and data collection and entry steps, to conclude satisfactorily.

The data analysis is conducted using a number of statistical tools. These reveal a number of facts, beginning from the frequencies and cross-tabulations, to the correlations, and ending by linear regression analysis (Figure 2). First, the data analysis for frequencies reveals that the sample is composed of 283 students and 10 professors from four universities. These students are 236 Lebanese (83.4 per cent) and 47 non-Lebanese (16.6 per cent), the majority being from the age group 18–22 years old (85.5 per cent) (see Table II).

The gender distribution by university shows a slight male dominance. The students at hand have limited teaching or working experience. The majority (268 or 94.7 per cent) have 0–3 years of teaching experience and 93.3 per cent have 0–3 working experience, with the remaining few distributed with little statistical meaningfulness. Moreover, the teachers who took part in the study are five males and five females. Three of the teachers are from the age group 36–40 and seven are older, with five holding master’s degrees and five holding terminal degrees. Among the teachers, nine have more than ten years of university-level teaching experience, and one only with experience between seven and nine years. Finally, these teachers are also equipped with some corporate work experience, two having four to six years and eight having more than ten years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Scale items</th>
<th>Cronbach’s α</th>
<th>KMO</th>
<th>χ²</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>SEI</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0.774</td>
<td>0.741</td>
<td>1,268.550</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Customer satisfaction</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0.684</td>
<td>0.705</td>
<td>933.343</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>TEI</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0.892</td>
<td>0.809</td>
<td>987.359</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I. Tool and data checks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Females</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>17–18</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5.23</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>19–20</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>45.9</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>39.21</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>54.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>21–22</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>39.6</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>43.13</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>35.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>23–24</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9.80</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>25–30</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>31–35</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>36–40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>40+</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table II. Sample distribution

The gender distribution by university shows a slight male dominance. The students at hand have limited teaching or working experience. The majority (268 or 94.7 per cent) have 0–3 years of teaching experience and 93.3 per cent have 0–3 working experience, with the remaining few distributed with little statistical meaningfulness. Moreover, the teachers who took part in the study are five males and five females. Three of the teachers are from the age group 36–40 and seven are older, with five holding master’s degrees and five holding terminal degrees. Among the teachers, nine have more than ten years of university-level teaching experience, and one only with experience between seven and nine years. Finally, these teachers are also equipped with some corporate work experience, two having four to six years and eight having more than ten years.

![Figure 2. Regression results](image-url)
The statistical test of correlation is run using SPSS 23.0. The results show several relationships that need to be highlighted. First, gender is weakly negatively correlated with SEI with $r = -0.155$ at sig. = 0.000, $p < 0.05$, but is positively weakly correlated with SEI. Second, participating students’ education is positively weakly correlated with SCS ($r = 0.029$; sig. = 0.006). Third, students’ education is positively weakly correlated with SEI ($r = 0.019$; sig. = 0.074; $p < 0.05$). Fourth, the teachers’ teaching experience is positively moderately correlated with the students’ working experience ($r = 0.497$; sig. = 0.000; $p < 0.01$). Fifth, the teachers’ teaching experience is positively weakly correlated with the SCS ($r = 0.040$; sig. = 0.049; $p < 0.05$). Sixth, the teachers’ teaching experience is negatively weakly correlated with SEI ($r = -0.066$; sig. = 0.027; $p < 0.05$). Seventh, the teachers’ working experience is positively weakly correlated with the SCS ($r = 0.077$, sig. = 0.019; $p < 0.05$). Finally, the teachers’ working experience is negatively weakly correlated with the SEI.

To test the model and the hypotheses at hand, the researchers analysed the data for linear regressions (Table III). The results show the presence of a partial mediation and confirm $H1$, $H2$, $H3$ and $H4$. The relationship between teachers’ EI and students’ customer satisfaction is improved upon the insertion of the mediator variable “students’ EI”.

### 5. Discussion

These results highlight a general trend in the business education circles, where corporate entities are looking into what can improve the performance of managers and employees. The proof that EI has affected the analysed relationships is by itself a standing statement that understanding and managing the emotional state of the employees is adamant to its introduction to the corporate world as a manageable factor of high importance in human behaviour.

First, the fact that gender’s correlation is higher for female respondents who show higher EI and change in female behaviour is due to the increased EI in terms of understanding and managing own emotions, as well as understanding and managing others’ emotions. In a paternalistic environment, where females are trained to be precautious in expressing an opinion, the role of education and values of the teaching institutions that adopt, and actually apply these values, is high. These universities in which the study is unfolded embrace in their applied values and practices: equality, non-discriminatory environments, citizenship behaviour, altruism, civic engagement, etc.

Second, the class interactions of participants and their taking part in class discussions where the teacher has high EI have affected the SCS, raised awareness, respect, listening skills, and acceptance of the other, thus resulted in improved EI. Third, teacher–student classroom interaction improved SEI through sensitising the group members to the needs of their colleagues. This sensitivity, coupled with social skills applied for interaction in the group dynamics process, results in higher understanding and appreciation of the other, leading to a higher index of SEI. This allows these EI-trained students to play a better role in conflict resolution, as they actively seek understanding of the other and bridging the gaps among the group members. These students are considered equipped to be successful leaders in their respective environments. Fourth, there is no doubt that a more experienced teacher

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>$R$</th>
<th>$R^2$</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>$F$</th>
<th>$B$</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>$\beta$</th>
<th>$t$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TEI × SEI</td>
<td>0.338</td>
<td>0.114</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>39.626</td>
<td>-3.250</td>
<td>0.516</td>
<td>-0.338</td>
<td>-6.295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEI × SCS</td>
<td>0.693</td>
<td>0.497</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>3,033.066</td>
<td>1.043</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>0.693</td>
<td>55.073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEI × SCS</td>
<td>0.677</td>
<td>0.459</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>202.716</td>
<td>-6.222</td>
<td>0.437</td>
<td>-0.677</td>
<td>-14.238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEI × SEI × SCS</td>
<td>0.913</td>
<td>0.834</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>598.287</td>
<td>0.191</td>
<td>0.160</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td>1.195</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table III.** Regression results
conveys a better message, is received better, as well as applies a better teaching technique, thus resulting in a better effect on SEI and SCS. This creates an ambiance of harmony where all the components of interaction feel safe, are synchronized and have higher reception ability to the signals communicated by others. This general feeling of inclusion and participation by itself creates a feeling of satisfaction and organisational citizenship, fostering team spirit, leading to bonding and support, which have a direct impact on raising the SCS feeling. These felt feelings of inclusion play a role in developing balanced personalities of these global citizens (Moon, 2009).

Fifth, the teacher’s working experience improves SCS through conveying openness and two-way communication in class, in addition to reflecting the book’s message through non-book examples. These examples elevate students’ interest and value added, thus their SCS and commitment to the educational process. Sixth, the longer the teacher’s working experience, the larger the age and knowledge gaps between the teachers and students. This pushes the former to model an aspiring role, conveying to their young ears the tips they need for increasing their employability and understanding the real world.

Finally, the SEI development on their perception and feeling of SCS results from class interactions and activities. TEI increases SEI enough to increase SCS.

6. Research contributions
This study contributes to the academic and practitioner knowledge. Education is important in our days and has an important economic contribution to the labour markets. Lebanon is the educational hub for the Middle East. Lebanon has had a yearly growth in its university enrolment of 3 per cent of its population over the last two decades (Ministry of Education and Higher Education, 2015, interview with Dr Ahmad Jammal, General Director of Higher Education Department). Therefore, it could be concluded that TEI affects a large percentage of its population and largely affects its upper-education market. Therefore, this study will have an impact on many fields – academic, managerial and social. First, the model tested in novel by itself, and no previous study has dwelled on the Lebanese environment, where EI is emerging in the human side of management, educational management and marketing fields. Second, it highlights the importance of EI in the academic field, proving that creating a positive class environment conducive of motivation and communication boosts openness, understanding and other social skills through interaction, leading to essential educational and developmental benefits. The human communication factor is portrayed as a tool for educating future executives toward problem solving, conflict resolution and communication. When EI of students increases, the behaviour of students in class improves, they will be more motivated, participate more, surf less on the internet, show less misconduct behaviour which leads to better interaction with the teacher. All of this will improve the academic and social behaviour of the students which help the teacher in reaching their goals and the university in achieving its mission.

Third, managerially, we suggest to universities to hire teachers with high EI, train and develop faculty EI, as it improves SEI resulting in better education and bottom-line results, since if students are happy they will remain in their university. This commitment of the students to their respective universities helps in the students’ recruitment process through word-of-mouth, enhancing university reputation and image, ultimately leading to its success. Universities are subject to increasing competition. The best marketing tool that they can use is the positive word of mouth of their students, which creates a good positioning of the university in the mind of its customers, helps enhancing the image and rank of the university, which will lead to higher enrolment rates. We also recommend to universities to integrate within their faculty recruit and orientation processes, the analysis of applicants in EI, and since EI can be learned, to train on a continuous on-going basis their current teachers, on how to be more and more emotionally intelligent while dealing with their students.
Moreover, teachers are the managers and students are the customers, and the universities need to find ways to satisfy their customers, therefore the above-mentioned results prove the important role of EI, in enhancing the workplace communication, stress management, performance and cooperation, as also reported by Wolff et al. (2006).

Fourth, policy makers in the educational field may add a course or workshop on EI to the teachers’ preparation curricula, to equip these career-seeking persons in the teaching profession with this novel tool that is handy and essential in classroom management. As a result, both public and private educational systems would be ameliorated along time toward a better output, more satisfied students and much lower drop-out rates, thus better economic returns on investment.

Fifth, the social implications of the mediation of SEI relate to today’s social problems emanating from students withdrawing or dropping out of schools and universities, and falling victims to antisocial behaviour, poor mental health and involvement in aggressive acts of violence (Parker et al., 2004). EI is reported to improve the personal and mental health of people, equipping them to live as happier citizens, contributing positively to society, avoiding anxieties, depressions and stress through mature interactions and communication (Ogundokun and Adeyemo, 2010). EI reduces the misconduct behaviour of students and leads to a better quality of people who are more responsible and successful (Nizielski et al., 2012), thus preparing better future citizens. The importance of the study also lies in the fact that when improving the EI of students, the conduct of the students in a class will improve, their academic performance will progress as well as their behaviour, and they will become better leaders and citizens of the global and diversified world.

7. Limitations

The limitations of the study do not affect its integrity or reliability. The researchers are aware of the sample’s size of 283 students and their teachers, out of a total population consisting of approximately 190,000 students, representing only 1.5 per cent of the population. Second, the sampling or sample selection process relied heavily on personal contacts in receiving the permissions to conduct the study in these specific universities. Although the universities are sampled randomly, the researchers aimed at larger participation to improve the sample’s representativeness, especially that the universities whose branches are in rural areas were not approached for limitations in budget, weather and time.

8. Conclusion

The results of this confirmatory study on the role of teachers’ EI on the relationship between the students’ EI and their SCS are laid. The proof is that in the environment where the study is unfolded, the effect of this relationship is supported. Moreover, the role of TEI in enhancing SEI is established as well as the effect of TEI on the students’ feeling of customer satisfaction as university students using the services of these upper educational institutions. These results have many managerial implications. Managing staff and faculty in upper-level educational institutions needs to focus more on the importance of SCS as a factor to be used in recruitment planning. The changing effect of TEI on SEI is an eye-opener for those whose daily job involves dealing with students as customers, where the study proves the existence of this sentimental interchange of student–customer, and which becomes a tool that can be built upon in university branding, customer expectations, brand equity as well as employability investment. Moreover, the role that TEI plays in raising SEI is of essence in the recruitment of faculty members who first believe in the role of EI; second, who possess an acceptable level of EI; and third, who have an adequate tenure of teaching experience, and finally who can bring added value through their previous working experience. All these factors that compose a faculty’s curriculum vitae become essential tools that are vested in the
creation of a classroom atmosphere incumbent toward allowing discussion dynamics and opportunities for learning and expression among students, leading to their feeling of value learning where their benefit from all the presented components of the class session including the teachers' EI that nurtures the students' emotional development and intelligence.

References


Ministry of Education and Higher Education (2015), Interview with Dr. Ahmad Jammal, June 20.


Tinnesz, C.G. (2001), “American and international students: satisfaction within the university classroom”, PhD, ProQuest Dissertations and Theses, 304745346, State University of New York, Buffalo, NY.


Further reading


Corresponding author
Bassem E. Maamari can be contacted at: drbassem.maamari@gmail.com

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Parents’ involvement, identification and alertness and their children’s functioning in school

Shoshana Ben-Tov and Shlomo Romi
School of Education, Bar-Ilan University, Ramat Gan, Israel

Abstract
Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to examine the relationship between parents’ involvement related to their alertness of what happens in school and their identification with school and their children’s attitudes toward school, social adjustment, self-efficacy and academic achievements.

Design/methodology/approach – Questionnaires were answered by 339 parents and 343 students, and yielded 34 parents whose levels of identification with school and alertness were low, and 57 parents whose levels were high. 10; path analysis was used (structural equation model). The theoretical model was tested by a software AMOS 7.0.

Findings – Involvement characterized by low identification and alertness predicted a direct, significant and negative relationship with children’s self-efficacy; alertness predicted a direct, significant and negative relationship with self-efficacy. The group with high identification and alertness predicted a direct, significant and positive relationship of their identification with children’s self-efficacy.

Research limitations/implications – Further research is recommended because of the small sample in this study. In addition, especially it is recommended to add to the study parents whose identification is low and their alertness is high.

Practical implications – The way to solve problems is not by mutual accusations, but by trusting each other. Parents and school must create useful communication channels and forums for straightening out issues and find solution through cooperation.

Originality/value – This paper reveals that parents’ alienation from school is a predictor of their children’s negative functioning in school. This document is intended for school principals, educational staff and parents to improve students’ functioning.

Keywords Israel, Parents’ alertness, Parents’ identification, Parents’ involvement, Students’ self-efficacy, Students’ attitudes

Paper type Research paper

1. Introduction
Parents’ involvement in education has been a feature of school life since the 1980s, with dual outcomes – cooperation between teachers and parents, and crude and blatant parental interference. This duality has been the topic of studies of organizational management and leadership. According to Singh (2014), an organizational culture of transparency, openness and trust, shared understanding, and openly sharing information and fostering informality leads to positive relations within the organization. In our case, these successful relationships would be between principal and school team, parents, their children. Ali-Alhosani et al. (2017), who also focused on the role of school leadership and climate, noted the benefits of addressing the strengths and weaknesses of the school environment and recognizing the significance of parental involvement. They noted that changing a school’s climate may impact at the campus level, negatively or positively influencing the relationships between all elements in the system. They further recognized that the school leadership has the power to perform various moves and consider providing professional development opportunities for parents to contribute to the school process.

Another study (Almatrooshi et al., 2016) dealt with the determinants of organizational performance, noting leadership competencies, among them mentoring, leading, motivating
and problem solving. However, managerial competencies must include awareness and understanding of the feelings of the people in the system, avoidance of potential workplace tensions, and an ability to prevent all forms of aggressive behavior. Based on these studies, we may conclude that communicating and listening between principal and school team and parents can create a pleasant work environment and enhance advance students' achievements and behavior.

The research has indicated that parent-school cooperation has a positive effect on the children's functioning (Hoover-Dempsey et al., 2005; Morrison-Gutman and Midgley, 2000; Muir, 2012; Schultz, 2001). But, as Almatrooshi et al. (2016) demonstrated, a lack of understanding of the parents' feelings and insensitivity to these feelings and their desire to contribute to the system may lead to conflict situations and frustration. Parents' attitudes toward school are largely determined by the information they have about ongoing school life, and this information creates their relationship to the school – one of cooperation or frustration (Friedman and Fisher, 2002). Thus, if parents want to be updated and regarded as partners, but the school shuts them out and prevents them from receiving information about topics, parents may become aggressive or indifferent, including firing of teachers or principals. Such aggression or indifference indicate parents' negative attitude toward school.

Because the link between school leadership and students' academic achievements is mediated by parental involvement (Quin et al., 2015), we decided to examine two groups and find relationships between parents' involvement related to their high/low alertness and their high/low identification with school and their children's functioning at school. The four variables chosen for testing the children functioning were attitudes toward school, self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements. Attitudes are significantly related to children's behavior (Baron and Branscombe, 2012; McEvoy and Welker, 2000). Self-efficacy promotes motivation which, in turn, leads to successful performance (Bandura et al., 1996). Social adjustment is a major contributor to understanding the social problems associated with low achievements (Yarkoni-Zilberngal, 1998). Academic achievements is the most significant factor related to social mobility and professional status in Israeli society (Trager, 2003). Success in academic achievements is one of the main reasons for the child functioning in school and for preventing school dropout.

This is the first study to examine the relationship between parents' involvement related to different levels of identification and alertness, and their children's functioning and their academic achievements. Our purpose is to examine whether parents' involvement, related to different levels of identification and alertness, will have a different influence on their children's self-efficacy, social adjustment, attitudes toward school and educational achievements. The findings and conclusions of the study can serve as a basis for common discussions of the school's management, teachers and parents regarding their shared responsibility for the functioning of the children.

We will now turn to the literature review (Section 2) for a research-based understanding of parental variables and student variables and the relationships between them. The method section (Section 3) will detail the research model and tools and the research hypotheses. This will be followed by findings (Section 4), discussion (Section 5), practical implications and theoretical contributions (Section 6), and summary (Section 7). We hope that the research findings will help parents understand that they also have a responsibility to the functioning of their children at school, without detracting from the responsibility of the school principal and his staff.

2. Literature review

Identification, alertness and parents' involvement

Identification. Parents' attitude toward school is manifested in their identification and alertness. As we shall see below, parental identification and parental alertness can lead to
parental involvement. Studies that examined the concept of identification among students noted the emotional, feeling aspects. Identification is emotional connection to school which includes a high level of interest, liking, valuing of school or emotional engagement (Cross et al., 2016). Voelkl (1996) notes that identification means the acceptance of school values, attention, feeling of trust and belongingness (Voelkl, 1996). Friedman and Fisher (2002) emphasize the agreement and acceptance of school goals (Friedman and Fisher, 2002). This emotional engagement is a key component of academic engagement (Fredricks et al., 2004); this emotional connection to school is predictive of academic success (Finn and Rock, 1997). Several recent investigations provide support for relationship between identification with school and positive students behaviors (Voelkl, 1996). Of all the above, it can be assumed that identification with school may also lead parents to behaviors that includes parental involvement in their child’s education at home and at school.

Friedman and Fisher (2002, 2003) focused on the school aspect, and other researchers (Ashforth and Mael, 1989; El-Kassar et al., 2017) discussed it from a general organizational perspective. Ashforth and Mael (1989) claimed that identification induces individuals to engage, derive satisfaction from activities congruent with the identity, view themselves as exemplars of the group and reinforces factors conventionally associated with group formation. El-Kassar et al. (2017) concluded that employees with stronger identification with their organization will be better motivated, possibly leading to job performance that exceeds expectations, which forms the basic definition of organizational citizenship behavior. What all researchers share in the concept of identification is a positive view of the system and the desire to cooperate and contribute beyond what is needed.

Alertness means vigilance, awareness, attention and watchfulness (Even-Shoshan, 2004). To date, educational studies have focused on alertness in the physical realm — alertness or sleepiness in class due to lack of sleep (Drake et al., 2003) or insufficient nutrition (Widenhorn-Mueller et al., 2008). In our study, alertness means paying focused attention to the environment and to events within and around it. Alertness is the opposite of indifference. In the present study, alert parents are sensitive to what happens in their child’s school and weigh the contribution of these events to their children’s education (Friedman and Fisher, 2002). The practical expression of parents’ alertness is their actual involvement in the school (Friedman and Fisher, 2002).

Parental involvement includes a wide range of parental behaviors related to their children’s academic life (Epstein, 1996; Gur and Zalmanson-Levy, 2005; Trager, 2003; Walker et al., 2005). The research literature has examined various approaches of parents’ involvement, not only in the context of activity place (home, school, community) but also in the context of involvement level (from watching, an activity, to making decisions at the level of school policy) (Gur and Zalmanson-Levy, 2005). All activities of parental involvement, especially within the framework of school, are certainly possible in the collaboration between the school and the parents. Al-Mehrzi and Singh (2016) addressed employee engagement, and how appropriate guidance empowers employees to feel that their contributions are valued and important, an idea that can be applied to parents and their contribution to school success. Only proper work with parents can lead to healthy involvement. Healthy involvement is possible when a company believes in a culture of transparency, openness and trusting (Singh, 2014), focuses on school climate and leadership (Ali-Alhosani et al., 2017), and deals with the determinants of organizational performance as mentoring, leading, motivating and solving problem (Almatrooshi et al., 2016).

Identification and alertness are important in shaping parents’ positive involvement (Friedman and Fisher, 2002). Parents will become willingly involved with school if they feel emotionally connected to it, accept school values, and are interested in what takes place in school. Low identification or absence of identification and alertness may lead to negative
involvement. It is the combination of identification and alertness that determines the nature of this involvement – active or passive, positive or negative. Thus, the combination of high identification and high alertness may generate active involvement, even leading to a desire to be partners in the decision-making process regarding school policies. Conversely, the combination of low identification and low alertness may generate dissatisfaction and alienation, leading to frustration and hostility. Parents are the child’s primary role model (Fenstermacher and Saudino, 2006; Schunk and Zimmerman, 2007; Zimmerman and Schunk, 2003). Because a lack of cooperation between parent and school has a negative effect on the children’s functioning (Iflach, 2003), we sought to examine in the first stage two groups and see whether different parental identification and alertness would have a different effect on their involvement.

Two groups of parents were selected: Group 1 – parents with low levels of identification and alertness, and Group 2 – parents with high levels of identification and alertness:

H1. Group 1 – no predictions would be found between the independent variables identification/alertness and the mediating variable parent’s involvement.

H2. Group 2 – Positive predictions would be found for the relationship between the independent variables identification/alertness and the mediating variable parent’s involvement.

Student variables

Attitude toward school. According to the role model theory (Fenstermacher and Saudino, 2006; Schunk and Zimmerman, 2007; Zimmerman and Schunk, 2003), internalizing behaviors, thoughts and attitudes are related to an internal cognitive process, with self-efficacy being defined as such a process. Thorkildsen et al. (2002) viewed schools as ecological environments where children’s attitudes develop. Baron and Branscombe (2012) claimed that attitudes are often acquired by observing other people and comparing oneself to them. Attitudes are formed through social learning, and we compare ourselves with others to examine the correctness of our view of social reality. The abundance social networks mean that students’ attitudes may shift rapidly as they try to fit in with people who hold a wide range of attitudes. Khagurov (2011) demonstrated the power of television and the peer group on children’s lives, raising the question: Do attitudes always create behaviors? Baron and Branscombe (2012) claimed that the strength of an attitude influences the relation of attitude to behavior, and that one’s attitude is composed of emotional, cognitive and behavioral aspects.

Self-efficacy. Efficacy is individuals’ internal evaluation of their capability and faith in their abilities, and the control over moves and actions taken for achieving successful performance. These cognitive and motivational resources build self-efficacy (Bandura, 1989). According to Bandura’s social learning theory (Bandura, 1986; Fenstermacher and Saudino, 2006; Zimmerman and Schunk, 2003), parents serve as role models, also affecting their children’s efficacy. Self-models were used for improving class participation and learning (Edelstein, 2003) as well as in other models for improving learning abilities in reading and writing (Schunk and Zimmerman, 2007).

Social adjustment. Children’s adjustment includes academic, social and emotional components (Korem, 2004). Social adjustment, the variable examined here, is being composed of emotional, cognitive and behavior components (Ben-Tov, 2013). In the present study, we discussed the variable Social adjustment because of its major contribution to understanding the social problems of childhood which intensify in adolescence (Yarkoni-Zilberngal, 1998). Pasternak (2002) noted that socialization begins at the nursery-school age, and that the relationship between children and their parents and
the way parents educate their children affect the development of the child’s social adjustment. The emotional relationship with the child’s closest caregiver is a major contributor to the child’s development (Murray and Greenberg, 2006). In most cases, this caregiver is the parent, although there are other socialization factors that also affect children’s behavior (Baron and Branscombe, 2012). The socially adjusted child behaves in a way that expresses acceptance of social norms of behavior, an ability to meet demands and work as part of a team, maintain social ties, and know what is allowed and what is forbidden (Korem, 2004). The unadjusted child could behave aggressively, be over-shy, rebellious, lazy or – due to social isolation – over-diligent.

**Academic achievements.** Academic achievements are quantitative and qualitative measures for assessing education. In Israeli society, education is the most significant factor influencing social mobility and professional status. It is perceived to be a valuable economic-social resource. Schools, students, and parents all share great personal interest in improving students’ education and making the processes of acquiring education more efficient. The state tries to invest in weaker student groups in an attempt to prevent the perpetuation of social gaps (Trager, 2003). Teachers and schools are required to provide systematic internal and external feedback in the MEZAV (Hebrew acronym for school growth and efficiency measures) tests in Hebrew, Math, English and Sciences.

Having introduced and discussed four student variables, we will turn to examine whether there are predictive relationships between the parents’ involvement variable as related to identification and alertness and each of the students’ variables.

**Relationships between parents’ identification and alertness and student variables**

The school environment generally includes the principal and the staff, and parents and their children. As stated, a school organizational system that believes in transparency, openness and trust (Singh, 2014) can lead to cooperation, or conversely, insensitivity to people’s feelings can lead to stress and violent behaviors (Almatrooshi et al., 2016). These two different situations can lead to different feelings of parents. On one hand, they identify with school and are alert to what is going on in school, and, on the other hand, they experience a lack of identification and indifference to what is happening in the school.

The research literature does not indicate any connections between parental identification with school and parental alertness to student variables: student attitudes toward school, social adjustment, self-efficacy and academic achievements. In contrast, the research literature indicates that students’ identification with school is a predictor of their academic achievements (Finn and Rock, 1997; Fredricks et al., 2004), expecting for success, valuing schoolwork and show interest. A lack of identification and caring may cause to negative behaviors as failure to participate in the curriculum, feeling of distrust, suspicion, low levels of motivation and interest and high rates of juvenile delinquency (Voelkl, 1996). Since parents are the role model (Fenstermacher and Saudino, 2006; Schunk and Zimmerman, 2007; Zimmerman and Schunk, 2003), it can be expected that parents’ identification with school and their alertness (caring) can be also a predictor of students’ variables. First, we will discuss relationships between parents’ involvement and student variables.

**Relationships between parents’ involvement and student variables**

Parents’ identification and alertness, their involvement and their children’s attitudes toward school. Students’ attitudes are formed as they observe and absorb information from their environment (Baron and Branscombe, 2012), as we learn from the role model theory (Fenstermacher and Saudino, 2006; Schunk and Zimmerman, 2007; Zimmerman and Schunk, 2003) and the ecological environment theory (Thorkildsen et al., 2002). As parents are part of the school’s ecological environment, their involvement, if associated with identification with
school could transmit a message of positive attitude toward school, whereas a lack of
identification could transmit one of negative attitudes. As attitudes always include a
component of positive or negative assessment, children could develop positive or negative
attitudes toward school, following their parents’ attitudes and involvement.

Bartram (2006) and Francis and Archer (2005) showed that children’s attitudes are
related to those of their parents. Muir (2012) demonstrated a relationship between parents’
involvement and their children’s attitudes. Studies indicated (Wettersten et al., 2005) that
parents’ pro-educational verbal expressions and actual behaviors affect their children’s
identification with school. Furthermore, one of the variables that affect vandalism and
violence is the degree to which parents support school’s disciplinary policies (Horowitz and
Tobaly, 2003).

Parents’ involvement and their children’s self-efficacy. Walker et al. (2005) investigated the
relationship between parents’ involvement and their children’s efficacy. They presented a
five-stage model that describes the development of parents’ involvement, and ends with the
effect it has on their children’s efficacy, abilities and knowledge. Accordingly, when parents
believe that they have the necessary skills and knowledge to lead to their children’s success,
their children can learn from them and see them as sources of skills and knowledge.

Two studies (Marchant et al., 2001; Wettersten et al., 2005) revealed a relationship and a
prediction between students’ perception of their parents’ involvement and their own
learning efficacy. Correlations and predictors were found between parents’ involvement and
Math and English learning efficacy (Fan and Williams, 2010), and between parents’
involvement at home and science learning self-efficacy (Shumow et al., 2011).

Parents’ involvement and their children’s social adjustment. The relationship between
children and their parents and the way the parents educate the child are very significant for
the development of social efficacy abilities (Pasternak, 2002). Parents’ cooperative and
trusting involvement in school could create a foundation for the development of a healthy
relationship for the children’s wellbeing and their adaptation to the school system. However,
when parents are overprotective of their children, and come to school to try and solve their
children’s social problems, they may be robbing their children of the tools required for
handling disappointment, stumbles and frustration. In most cases, these children believe in
their lack of ability, are incapable of handling friends and adults on their own, and lack
significant life skills (Ifach, 2003).

Studies have shown a positive relationship between parents’ involvement and social
adjustment at nursery-school age (Kohler, 2007), lower grades of elementary school
(Korem, 2004; Schultz, 2001), elementary school (Ben-Tov and Romi, 2018) and middle
school (Simons-Morton and Crump, 2003). Despite the differences in age and samples, what
all these studies had in common was the finding that there is a positive relationship between
parents’ involvement and their children’s adjustment. At the same time, we must not
exclude additional possible environmental conditions which impact the child’s social
adjustment (Baron and Branscombe, 2012; Murray and Greenberg, 2006).

Parents’ involvement and their children’s academic achievements. To date, the research
literature has primarily noted direct and indirect positive relationships between parents’
involvement and their children’s achievements (Godber, 2002; Hoover-Dempsey et al., 2005;
Muir, 2012). Parents’ involvement has been identified as a factor that affects their children’s
achievements, and such involvement was encouraged because of the effect it has on their
children’s social, emotional and learning, and because it helped growth in order to narrow
learning gaps (Lee and Bowen, 2006). Other studies have not found this relationship
(Graves and Brown-Wright, 2011), or found negative relationships between parents’
involvement and their children’s achievements (Hill and Craft, 2003; Ben-Tov and Romi,
2018; Thurston, 2005). Several other points could explain the possible low positive, negative
or lack of relationship, among them the separation and individuation of in early adolescence (Pasternak, 2002) or other agents of socialization (Murray and Greenberg, 2006).

In accordance with the theoretical background, we present the following hypotheses:

**H3.** Group 1 – Positive predictions would be found for the relationship between the independent variables identification/alertness and the mediating variable children’s attitudes.

**H4.** Group 2 – Positive predictions would be found for the relationship between the independent variables identification/alertness and the mediating variable children’s attitudes.

**H5.** Group 1 – Negative predictions would be found between the mediating variable parent’s involvement and the dependent variables self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements.

**H6.** Group 2 – Positive predictions would be found for the relationship between the mediating variable parent’s involvement and the dependent variables self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements.

**Relationships among students’ variables**

**General attitudes toward school and self-efficacy.** The social learning theory (Bandura, 1986; Fenstermarcher and Saudino, 2006; Zimmerman and Schunk, 2003) posits that some human behaviors are learned by observing and emulating models, so that the ongoing interaction between students and models in their environment could affect their attitudes and self-efficacy. Broemer et al. (2000), who formulated the theory of attitude formation, claimed that individuals shape their attitudes, using their self-efficacy, when they assess available information related to the object.

Attitudes and self-efficacy were examined in studies of learning and learning motivation (Garcia-Sanchez and Caso-Fuertes, 2005). Other studies (Ben-Tov and Romi, 2018; Liu et al., 2006) revealed a positive relationship between students’ attitudes and their self-efficacy.

**General attitudes toward school and social adjustment.** An examination of the concepts of attitude and social adjustment reveals common cognitive, emotional and behavioral components (Ben-Tov, 2013). Students’ attitudes and adjustments are created by their interaction with the same environmental conditions, and it therefore seems reasonable to assume that their attitudes – and hence social adjustment – would be affected by similar conditions.

The research literature points to a relationship between students’ attitudes and their social adjustment (Coplan et al., 2001; Ochoa et al., 2007; Tartakovsky, 2011). A significant negative relationship was found between students’ attitudes toward school authority, teachers, and parents and violent behavior in school (Ochoa et al., 2007). A study among preschool children (Coplan et al., 2001) revealed an inverse relationship between children with attributes of lack of learning and social adjustment and their attitude toward school. In other words, the greater the children’s adjustment difficulties, the less positive were their attitude toward school.

**General attitudes toward school and academic achievements.** As mentioned, school and home are the primary ecological environments where students’ attitudes develop (Thorkildsen et al., 2002), among them the attitudes toward learning and reaching academic achievements. Some researchers view students’ attitudes toward school as an instrumental variable that can be used to foster academic achievements, or at least explain some of the variance in achievements (Ben-Tov, 2013).

In their survey of studies, McEvoy and Welker (2000) pointed to a clear and significant relationship between an anti-social attitude in school and low academic achievements. Francis and Archer (2005) confirmed the positive relationship between students’ attitudes
toward academic achievement, while they were influenced by their parents’ attitudes toward learning. Haapasalo et al. (2010) found that older students have less positive attitudes toward school, which, in turn, could affect their functioning in school.

In accordance with the theoretical background, we present the following hypotheses:

H7. Group 1 – Positive predictions would be found between the mediating variable children’s attitudes and the dependent variables Self-efficacy, Social adjustment and Academic achievements.

H8. Group 2 – Positive predictions would be found between the mediating variable children’s attitudes and the dependent variables Self-efficacy, Social adjustment and Academic achievements.

3. Conducting the research

Research goals

We examined the student variables against two groups of parents: Group 1 – parents’ levels of school identification and alertness are lower than or equal to a standard score of $-0.5$ ($Z \leq -0.5$); and Group 2 – parent’s levels of school identification and alertness higher than or equal to a standard score of $0.5$ ($Z \geq 0.5$). The four questions to be explored were:

RQ1. Would different predictions would be found between parents’ identification/alertness of two groups to parents’ involvement?

RQ2. Would different predictions would be found between parents’ identification/alertness of two groups to children’s attitudes?

RQ3. Would different predictions would be found between parents’ involvement of two groups to student’s variables: attitudes toward school, self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements?

RQ4. Would different predictions would be found between children’s attitudes of two groups to student’s variables: attitudes toward school, self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements?

The system of predictions among the model’s variables is shown in Figure 1.
4. Method

Sample
The research population consisted of a random sampling of 339 parents and 343 students, fourth-, fifth- and sixth-grade students from ten elementary schools in Israel. Only those questionnaires in which there was a common code for parents and their children were used, as we had to examine the ties between a given parent’s variables and those of his or her child. Within this sample, we found 34 parents with low levels of identification and alertness (Group 1) and 57 parents with high levels of identification and alertness (Group 2). The ten schools, located in six towns in the Ministry of Education’s Central and Tel Aviv Districts, included state schools and religious state schools. Five of the schools were defined by the Ministry of Education as requiring special attention and five were defined as established. In all schools the children were normative. School details and participants’ demographic information are presented in Table I, following the distribution of groups according to identification and alertness levels.

Research tools
The students filled in three questionnaires:

1. Self-efficacy questionnaire (Bandura et al., 1996) which was validated by Williams and Coombs (1996), and translated into Hebrew (Ben-Tov, 2013). Cronbach’s $\alpha$ values for this 50-item questionnaire were 0.90 for the entire questionnaire, 0.82 for the learning efficacy factor, 0.80 for the social efficacy factor and 0.76 for the self-regulation factor.

2. Quality of life in school questionnaire (Darom and Rich, 1982): Cronbach’s $\alpha$ values for this 64-item questionnaire were 0.93 for the entire questionnaire, 0.78 for the attitude toward school factor, 0.84 for the attitude toward teachers factor and 0.83 for the attitude toward studies factor.

3. Social adjustment questionnaire (Gresham and Elliot, 1990), which was translated into Hebrew by Yarkoni-Zilberngal (1998). Cronbach’s $\alpha$ values for this 34-item questionnaire were 0.80 for the entire questionnaire, 0.70 for the assertiveness-empathy factor and 0.76 for the cooperation-control factor.

The parents filled in four questionnaires:

1. Demographic questionnaire (Trager, 2003), for details about education, employment, socioeconomic status and parent’s profession. We added a question, asking whether the parent provided private lessons to help their children.

2. Identification questionnaire (Friedman and Fisher, 2003): Cronbach’s $\alpha$ values for this 17-item questionnaire were 0.86 for the entire questionnaire, 0.70 for the trusting teachers factor, 0.88 for the pedagogical qualities factor and 0.78 for the goals and values factor.

3. Alertness questionnaire (Friedman and Fisher, 2003): Cronbach’s $\alpha$ values for this 24-item questionnaire were 0.90 for the entire questionnaire, 0.82 for the school as an organization factor, 0.85 for the pedagogical content factor and 0.85 for the social aspects, discipline, and values factor.

4. Parents’ involvement questionnaire (Trager, 2003), based on Epstein’s (1996) typology. Cronbach’s $\alpha$ values for this 56-item questionnaire were 0.95 for the entire questionnaire, 0.74 for the parenting factor, 0.68 for the student learning at home factor, 0.91 for the school-home communication factor and 0.80 for the collaboration with community factor.

In addition, the school offices provided listings of students’ grades for Hebrew, Math, English and Sciences.
Research procedure

As a permit was given by the Chief Scientist’s office for distributing the questionnaires in the schools, meetings were held with school supervisors, principals and teachers. An explanation was provided about the objective of the research and its importance. During the distribution of the questionnaires, two issues were strictly observed: participants’ anonymity and the importance of matching the code of the student’s questionnaire to those of his/her parent’s questionnaire. Because the research objective was to examine the predictive ties between parent’s identification and alertness and their involvement and the functioning of the children, having this code match was of critical importance. For example: the student received code 01, and the parents of this student got the same code number – 01.

Research model

The research model (Figure 1) is a correlative array, not experimental, which examines predictions between the following groups of variables: independent (exogenous) variables – parent’s identification/alertness – and mediating variables – parent’s involvement/student’s attitudes; and mediating variables – parent’s involvement/student’s attitudes – and dependent (endogenous) variables – self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements.

Figure 1 shows the research model.

5. Findings

Path analysis findings among parents with low identification and alertness levels (Group 1)

The theoretical model presented in Figure 2 was examined using AMOS 7.0 software, which enables the examination of the correlation of the theory and the research data. The findings are presented in Figure 2.

Group 1: analysis of structural equation model – path analysis

According to the measures presented in Figure 2, the model that matches χ²/df data was not found to be significant, as the values of the correlations, especially the GFI which was greater than 0.95, indicate high compatibility. In addition, the error measure RMSEA was smaller than 0.05, which also testifies to a minimal error in the model’s compatibility. The NFI value was also 0.939, which indicates a good match between the model and reality. The following are the findings of the model.
First, contrary to the hypothesis, no predictive relationship was found between the Group 1 independent (exogenous) variable identification and the mediating variable children’s attitudes. In accordance with the hypothesis, no predictive relationship was found for Group 1 between the independent variable identification and the mediating variable parent’s involvement. Contrary to the hypothesis, no predictive relationship was found between the Group 1 independent (exogenous) variable Alertness and the mediating variable children’s attitudes; In accordance with the hypothesis, no predictive relationship was found between the Group 1 independent variable Alertness and the mediating variable Parents involvement. Second, in accordance with the hypothesis, the Group 1 mediating variable children’s attitudes predicts a direct, significant and positive association with their self-efficacy (β = 0.34**), but not with the variables of social adjustment and academic achievements; also, in accordance with the hypothesis, Group 1 mediating variable Involvement predicts a direct, significant and negative association with the children’s self-efficacy (β = −0.44), but not with social adjustment and achievements.

During the study, a direct, significant and positive predictive relationship was found between the dependent (endogenous) variables self-efficacy among the children of Group 1 and their social adjustment (β = 0.66**). The model also presented a predictive relationship between children’s self-efficacy and their academic achievements (β = 0.40**). The model did not find any predictive relationships between the Group 1 independent (exogenous) variable identification and the dependent variables social adjustment, self-efficacy and the children’s academic achievements. We were surprised to find a direct and negative predictive relationship to significance between the Group 1 independent (exogenous) variable alertness and the children’s social adjustment (β = −0.28+) and a direct, significant and negative one between Group 1 variable alertness (exogenous) and the children’s self-efficacy (β = −0.45***).

Findings of path analysis among parents with high identification and alertness levels (Group 2)

The theoretical model presented in Figure 3 was examined using the AMOS 7.0 software, which enables the examination of the correlation of the theory and the research data. The findings are presented in Figure 3.
Group 2: analysis of the structural equation model – path analysis

The measure in Figure 3 indicates that the model matching the $\chi^2$/df data was not found to be significant. The correlation values, especially the GFI, are greater than 0.95, which indicates high correlation. In addition, the error index RMSEA was lower than 0.05, which also testifies to a minimal error in the model’s compatibility, and the value NFI = 0.921 also indicates a good match between the model and reality. The following are the findings of the model.

First, contrary to the hypotheses, no predictive relationships were found between Group 2 independent (exogenous) variables identification and alertness, and the mediating variable children’s attitudes and parent involvement. Second, in keeping with the hypothesis, Group 2 mediating variable children’s attitudes predicts a direct, significant and positive association with their self-efficacy ($\beta = 0.48^{**}$), but not with the variables social adjustment and academic achievements. Contrary to the hypotheses – and to our surprise – no predictive relationship was found between parents’ involvement and the student’s variables.

During the study, a direct, significant and positive prediction was found between the dependent (endogenous) variable self-efficacy among the children of Group 2 and their social adjustment ($\beta = 0.95^{**}$). The model also presented a predictive relationship between self-efficacy and students’ academic achievements ($\beta = 0.41^{**}$). The model did not find any predictive relationship between the Group 2 independent (exogenous) variable alertness and the dependent (endogenous) variables social adjustment, self-efficacy and the children’s academic achievements. To our surprise, a direct, significant and positive prediction was found between Group 2 independent (exogenous) variable identification and self-efficacy among their children ($\beta = 0.24^{**}$). Table II presents the findings.

6. Discussion
Predictions between independent variables and mediating variables

(1) In Group 1 and Group 2, predictions of the independent variables identification and alertness were examined with the mediating variable student’s attitudes. The hypothesis for testing the predictive relationship between parent’s identification and alertness and their children’s attitudes was based also on the concepts of employee-organization identification and on attitudes that linked the two
variables together (El-Kassar et al., 2017). In parents’ identification also, there is an element of positive or negative attitude. Because parents are role models (Fenstermacher and Saudino, 2006; Schunk and Zimmerman, 2007; Zimmerman and Schunk, 2003), we expected to find a positive predictive relationship between parents’ identification and alertness in the two groups and their children’s attitudes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>Parents’ Identification</th>
<th>Parents’ Alertness</th>
<th>Parents’ Involvement</th>
<th>Students’ Attitude</th>
<th>Students’ Social Adjustment</th>
<th>Students’ Achievements</th>
<th>Students’ Self-Efficacy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parents’ Identification</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>No prediction as expected</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>No prediction as expected</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>0.24**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents’ Alertness</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>No prediction as expected</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>-0.28*</td>
<td>-0.45**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>No prediction as expected</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>0.34**</td>
<td>0.48**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents’ Involvement</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>No prediction as expected</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>-0.44**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>No prediction as expected</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>0.66**</td>
<td>0.40**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students’ Attitude</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>No prediction as expected</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>0.95**</td>
<td>0.41**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>No prediction as expected</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>No prediction</td>
<td>0.95**</td>
<td>0.41**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table II.**
Results: predicting paths in integrative models (path analysis) – Group 1, Group 2

**Notes:** *p < 0.05; **p < 0.01
depending on the level of identification and alertness. But contrary to our hypotheses, no predictive relationship was found between the variables identification and alertness to attitudes. Although the parent groups differ in their attitude toward school, the findings in our research model are similar in both groups. It seems that additional socialization agents, among them, friends and television (Khagurov, 2011) and computer and networks (Baron and Branscombe, 2012; Eijnden et al., 2010; Valcke, 2010) are as influential as parents.

(2) In Group 1 and Group 2, predictions for the independent variables identification and alertness were examined with the mediating variable parents’ involvement. The hypothesis for testing the predictions of parents’ identification and alertness with their involvement was based on the social identity theory (El-Kassar, 2017) and the identification, alertness and involvement theory (Friedman and Fisher, 2002), both of which talk about the implications of the employees’/parents’ identification on their functioning in the organization/school. In our study, parents who will cooperate with school will seek for involvement, while parents whose attitude toward school is negative would choose detachment (Pasternak, 2002).

As expected, in accordance with our hypothesis, we found no predictive relationship between identification and alertness to parents’ involvement among Group 1, possibly because identification and alertness in Group 1 are so low, so no prediction for their involvement can be found. In contrast to our hypothesis, we did not find any predictive relationship between the variables identification and alertness among Group 2 parents and their involvement, even though Friedman and Fisher (2002) claimed that these parents would usually have a desire for involvement. One may assume that there are probably additional variables in the daily reality that cause the decrease in parents’ involvement, such a lack of time, occupation, etc. (Lee and Bowen, 2006). Still it does not mean that these parents do not identify with school and do not alert to what is going there.

Predictions between mediating variables and dependent variables

(1) Prediction for the mediating variable children’s attitudes were examined together with the dependent variables self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements among students from Group 1 and Group 2. The hypotheses for examining these predictions were based on studies that found an association between: children’s attitudes and self-efficacy (Liu et al., 2006; Ben-Tov and Romi, 2018; Thomas, 2006), children’s attitudes and social adjustment (Ochoa et al., 2007; Tartakovsky, 2011), and children’s attitudes and their academic achievements (McCoach and Siegle, 2002; McEvoy and Welker, 2000).

According to our hypothesis, a direct, significant and positive prediction was found only between the student’s attitudes and self-efficacy. The relationship between attitudes and self-efficacy has been noted by Broemer et al. (2000) in their theory of attitude formation, and studies of learning have dealt with the variables self-efficacy and attitudes, as variables in learning motivation (Garcia-Sanchez and Caso-Fuertes, 2005).

Contrary to our hypothesis, in neither group did we find predictions between the variables Attitude and Social adjustment and the variable Academic achievements. Despite the different nature of the two groups, a similar picture emerged. Both showed a direct, positive and statistically significant relationship between attitudes and self-efficacy, and no relationships between attitudes and social adjustment and achievements. This is the uniqueness of the path analysis method, which presents a simultaneous and quite realistic picture of relationships among variables. It seems that the relationship between attitudes and efficacy is dominant, despite the differences between the two research groups.
Negative predictions for the mediating variable parents’ involvement were examined together with the dependent variables self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements among students from Group 1. We also examined positive predictions of the mediating variable parents’ involvement with the dependent variables self-efficacy, social adjustment and academic achievements among students from Group 2. The guidelines for examining the predictions were: According to the ecological theory (Thorkildsen et al., 2002), the surrounding conditions of the home and school add to the student’s experiences and his/her exposure to objects, situations, or ideas. These affect his/her emotional component and influence the behavioral one, shaping different patterns of behavior which include self-efficacy and social adjustment. Parents who do not identify with the school, and have a low level of alertness and are alienated from the school, will not be able to create a positive ecological environment that may contribute to their children. Second, parents’ negative behavior toward school and teachers has negative implications on their children’s efficacy and adjustment (Iflach, 2003). In accordance with our hypothesis, in Group 1, we found a direct, significant and negative prediction for the mediating variable parents’ involvement with their children’s self-efficacy. As we assumed, parents who alienate the school (Friedman and Fisher, 2002) and separate themselves from it may come to the school for personal reasons in order to “solve” problems concerning their children. When parents provide their little children with excess protection, they deny the child the opportunity to develop the tools required for handling disappointment, stumbles and frustration. The negative involvement makes the children believe in their helplessness, and if they do not have faith in their abilities, their self-efficacy is damaged (Iflach, 2003).

Contrary to the expectations, Group 2 did not produce any predictions of parents’ Involvement with the students’ variables. This fact may be explained by findings from other studies that have shown that parents’ involvement does not always promote academic achievements (Hill and Craft, 2003), and that the nature of parent’s involvement – whether cooperative or eruptive – is significant. At the same time, scheduling constraints or a heavy work load may also prevent parents from being involved. It is also possible that presence of these parents in school is insufficient due to time or other restrictions (Lee and Bowen, 2006). In total, 79 percent of parents in Group 2 are working (Table I). Maybe this is one of the reasons for the lack of the relationship between parental involvement and their children’s variables.

The model revealed additional – and interesting – findings that had not been part of the research hypotheses. In both groups, direct and positive predictions were found between self-efficacy and social adjustment and self-efficacy and academic achievements. Despite the difference between the groups, these similar findings emphasize the importance of the variable self-efficacy (Bandura, 1986; Fenstermacher and Saudino, 2006; Zimmerman and Schunk, 2003).
identification predicted a direct, significant and positive association with their children’s self-efficacy. This last finding adds to parents’ responsibility to their children’s success in school, and with the help of the principal and his staff, of course.

7. Practical implications and theoretical contributions

Practical implications

(1) We live in a new global world where there is a great influence of social networking on our lives. The information flows between countries almost without restriction, so there is nothing to prevent this subject from being investigated in other countries around the world. Therefore, we recommend conducting further research, also due to the small sample in this study.

(2) We recommend examining this study in other cultures and to compare the findings to our study in Israel.

(3) In addition, two groups should be added to the study: parents whose identification with school is high and their alertness is low, and a group whose identification is low and their alertness is high (Friedman and Fisher, 2002, 2003). The aim is to examine whether different functions of parents will have a different effect on the functioning of their children.

(4) Fathers’ percent in Group 1 was higher than in Group 2, and the percent of those with higher education was also higher than in Group 2. The percent of boys in Group 1 was higher than in the Group 2. Therefore, it would be interesting to see whether fathers’ involvement is associated with sons’ behavioral problems or whether fathers’ identification and alertness were lower than mothers’.

(5) To complete the overall picture, it is recommended to conduct future research that will consider parents’ gender and student’s gender and include additional items of information such as level of teachers’ trust in parents, and reports from the homeroom teachers about the students’ social adjustment and any disciplinary problems. These items are important for better understanding the background and incentives for the alienation of the parents who have a low level of identification and alertness with school, and whether fathers’ or mothers’ are more involved with problems regarding their children’s functioning at school.

Theoretical contributions

(1) Despite the theoretical background, we did not see predictions between parental identification and alertness and their involvement in both groups. But it is certainly possible to say that this study contributed to the research literature. The negative predictions between parents’ involvement and their alertness to their children’s self-efficacy, as opposed to the positive prediction between parents’ identification with school and their children’s self-efficacy, indicates the degree of influence of parents with different identification and alertness on their children’s functioning. This issue has not been investigated in the past.

(2) Exposure to diverse sources of organizational leadership (Ali-Alhosani et al., 2017; Almatrooshi et al., 2016), and access to tools to raise employees’ motivation and improve their performance and achievements can be utilized by educators to improve the relationship between the various factors in school. Although the parents are not official employees of the education system, they are a given within the school structure, and cannot be ignored. They put their trust in the school, and must be part of it.
8. Summary

The research allowed us to examine whether parents with different characteristics have a positive or negative influence on the functioning of their children in school. The main innovation derived from our research focused on the group of parents who have a low level of identification and alertness. This group is defined as a frustration-level group; it separates itself from school, but it also shows involvement. However, this involvement is, probably, negative involvement or "outbreaks involvement," which is related to their children's personal interests. This parent alertness and involvement predicted direct, significant and negative association with their children's efficacy and a negative association with a tendency toward significance between parent alertness and social adjustment. The group of parents with a high level of identification and alertness had a direct, positive and significant association with their children's self-efficacy, which may indicate that the parents are role models. The consistent positive prediction found between self-efficacy to social adjustment and academic achievements with any association to the characteristics of both groups of parents indicates the importance of the self-efficacy variable. The variable attitude was found to be a dominant predictor of the variable self-efficacy.

Our general conclusion is that parents and school must understand that they are facing new and strong socializing agents, which, at times, may be negative, and which can potentially influence their children's functioning. This is where the principal's leadership is put to the test. As the organizational leader, the principal plays a vital role in the achievement of organizational goals and objectives, and is the one who must create an environment that influences the teams' behaviors, attitudes and motivations. This atmosphere should also affect parents and their children, as the issue of parental attitudes does not begin and end with the parents, but is a problem for the entire system. The way to solve problems is not by mutual accusations, but by trusting each other. Parents and school must create useful communication channels and forums for straightening out issues and find a solution through cooperation. The presence of an organizational psychologist is essential in parents-principal and his/her team meetings.

References


Epstein, J.L. (1996), A Checklist for an Effective Parent-School Partnership: The Six Types of Parental Involvement, Johns Hopkin’s University’s Center on Families, Communities, Schools and Children, Baltimore, MD.


About the authors
Dr Shoshana Ben-Tov teaches at the School of Education, Bar-Ilan University, Israel, where she also obtained her BA, MA and PhD Ben-Tov served as School Principal in an inner-city elementary community school for 16 years. Under her leadership, parents were involved in making decisions regarding school policy and pedagogical issues, generating improved academic outcomes and school image. As a teacher, she headed sciences and mathematics studies, and served as a modeling teacher for teaching methods for mathematics, Biblical verse and "Instrumental Enrichment” curricula. She was also a pedagogical mentor to preservice teachers and a partner in developing Bible study programs and science for the Ministry of Education and Culture.

Professor Shlomo Romi was Head of the School of Education and now is Director of the Institute for Education and Community Research at Bar-Ilan University Israel. He obtained his BA and MA from Bar-Ilan’s Department of Psychology and his PhD in School Psychology from OISE, the University of Toronto, Canada. Professor Romi’s fields of research include non-formal education and parent-school relationships. He also studies the characteristics of at risk adolescents, as well as topics in educational psychology, such as classroom management and the integration of children and adolescents with special needs into normative educational frameworks. Shlomo Romi is the corresponding author and can be contacted at: shlomo.romi@biu.ac.il

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Preserving over 100 years of management research online

A lifetime investment for your institution, Emerald Backfiles will significantly enhance your library’s offering by providing access to over 125,000 articles from more than 260 journals dating back to 1898.

Visit emeraldinsight.com

Get Backfiles Collections for your library
Recommend Backfiles to your librarian today.
Find out more: emeraldpublishing.com/backfilescollections
eBook Collections

Research at your fingertips

Bringing together over 1,600 eBooks, the Emerald eBook collections are a cost-effective way of instantly expanding library holdings and increasing usage through an award winning platform alongside journals.

Visit emeraldinsight.com

Get eBook Collections for your library

Recommend eBooks to your librarian today. Find out more: emeraldpublishing.com/ebookcollections
The human side of management
Guest Editor: Sanjay Kumar Singh

1 Editorial advisory board
2 Guest editorial
5 Internal marketing in a higher education context – towards an enriched framework
Prakash Vel, Aakash Shah, Sunita Mathur and Vijay Pereira
28 Workplace spirituality, employee wellbeing and intention to stay: a multi-group
analysis of teachers’ career choice
Nimita Aboudaker, Manoj Edward and Zakkariya K.A.
45 Student–university identification and loyalty through social responsibility: a cross-cultural
analysis
Abdul-Nasser El-Kassar, Dania Makki and Maria Alejandra Gonzalez-Perez
66 Role of virtues in the relationship between shame and tendency to plagiarise: study
in the context of higher education
Deepika Pandoi, Sanjaya Singh Gaur and Anup Kumar Gupta
86 Building a culture of business analytics: a marketing analytics exercise
M. Elizabeth Haywood and Anubha Mishra
98 Continuing professional development: policies, practices and future directions
Davoud Masoumi, Javad Hatami and Javad Pourkaremi
112 Investigating the barriers to change management in public sector educational institutions
Adel Ismail Al-Alawi, Muna Abdalmohsen, Fatema Mohamed Al-Malki and Arpita Mehrotra
149 Influences of working condition and faculty retention on quality education in private
universities in Bangladesh: an analysis using SEM
Mohammad Ali Ashraf
166 The linkage between knowledge management practices and organization based
projects for better learning outcome: a conceptual framework
Parijat Upadhay and Manas Paul
179 The effect of highly emotionally intelligent teachers on their students’ satisfaction
Bassem E. Maamari and Joelle F. Majdalani
194 Parents’ involvement, identification and alertness and their children’s functioning in
school
Shoshana Ben-Tov and Shlomo Romi


www.emeraldinsight.com/loi/ijem