GUEST EDITORIAL

Nurturing the historic turn: “history as theory” versus “history as method”

Wim Van Lent
Department of Entrepreneurship and Strategy, Montpellier Business School, Montpellier, France, and

Gabrielle Durepos
Department of Business Administration, Mount Saint Vincent University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada

Abstract

Purpose – This paper aims to explore the turn in management and organization studies (MOS) and reflect on “history as theory” versus “history as method”.

Design/methodology/approach – Looking at previous research and the evolution of MOS, this paper situates the special issue papers in the current climate of this area of research.

Findings – The special issue papers included here each make a theoretical contribution to methodology in historical organization studies.

Originality/value – The eight articles featured in the special issue offer examples of innovative and historically sensitive methodology that, according to the authors, increase the management historian toolkit and ultimately enhance the methodological pluralism of historical organization studies as a field.

Keywords Historic turn, History as theory, History as method, Historiography

Paper type Editorial

Introduction

Ever since Booth and Rowlinson (2006) proposed a “historic turn” in management and organization studies (MOS), scholars have increasingly recognized the importance of history to understand organizational life (Durepos and Mills, 2012; Rowlinson et al., 2014; Bucheli and Wadhani, 2014; Suddaby, 2016). Indeed, the historical discipline provides an alternative to the dominant science paradigms in organization studies (Zald, 1993; Kieser, 1994), so studies using a historical approach have the potential to inform various aspects of organization theory (Álvaro-Moya and Donzé, 2016; Söderlund and Lenfle, 2013; Suddaby, 2016; Maclean et al., 2016). The past decade has witnessed the growth of a body of work on how, if at all, business historians can bridge the gap between the discipline of history and MOS (Rowlinson, et al., 2014; De Jong et al., 2015; Whittle and Wilson, 2015; Suddaby, 2016; Durepos, 2015). Scholarly discussions in this direction have developed along three broad dimensions. First, there is a debate on the feasibility of a historic turn in MOS, given the ostensible onto-epistemological differences between history and the social sciences (Rowlinson et al., 2014; Coraiola et al., 2015; Suddaby, 2016). Second, the scholars that do see potential for integration are theorizing the relationship between history and MOS...
(Usdiken and Kieser, 2004; Durepos and Mills, 2017a). Finally, on that basis, some scholars are seeking to identify the potential contributions of historical perspectives to MOS (Suddaby, 2016; Maclean et al., 2016).

However, despite these efforts, it seems that the historic turn has not yet fulfilled its promise (Greenwood and Bernardi, 2014; Durepos and Mills, 2017a, 2017b). As business historians keep struggling with the identity of their discipline (Ponzoni and Boersma, 2011), the historic turn does not seem to engage successfully in a wholesale transformation of MOS. Indeed, most scholarly work seems to focus on “history as theory,” or on describing the role of history in MOS and its theoretical benefits. Although “history as theory” legitimizes scholars that seek to enrich MOS with historically grounded studies, it does not entail the actual conduct of historical analysis for purposes of theory building and testing. It seems that in order for the historic turn in MOS to fully realize its potential, scholars need to draw on the wealth of quantitative and qualitative historical organizational data that MOS scholars are currently neglecting (Maclean et al., 2016; Mills et al., 2016).

The practice of integrating historical data collection and analysis into empirical strategies for performing theoretically motivated studies can be referred to as “history as method”. Unfortunately, recent attempts at empirically connecting history with MOS have borne limited theoretical fruit. Recent special issues published in leading business history journals (Mills et al., 2016; Decker et al., 2018) mainly contain work that confirms existing ideas about the role of history in management or apply theory for purposes of historical enrichment (instead of the inverse).

Through its wide applicability (Kipping and Usdiken, 2015; McLaren et al., 2015), the “history as method” approach allows for tremendous theoretical flexibility. Although methodological diversity could impede the progress of business history as a discipline (Alvaro-Moya and Donzé, 2016), it comes with potential, for example in terms of diversity of research questions and richness of historical knowledge (Decker et al., 2015). Naturally, the use of history as a method invokes scrutiny of the techniques and practices of history that can be used in MOS (Suddaby, 2016). Since the call for a historic turn, a wide range of methods that business historians can draw upon has been examined (Decker et al., 2015; Mills et al., 2016). However, despite incisive attempts at organizing the methodologies available to business historians (most notably Rowlinson et al., 2014), methodological discussions among business historians are ongoing (Durepos and Mills, 2017a) and don’t seem to have fully explored the variety and richness of the historical discipline relevant for MOS. We believe that advancing the methodological debate requires concrete work on generating what Decker et al. (2015) refer to as methodological pluralism.

The special issue of the Journal of Management History on “Uses of Methodology in Management History” contributes to enhancing the methodological pluralism of historical organization studies. Each in their own right, the eight papers showcase novel methodologies (Shaffner, Mills and Helms Mills; Tumbe; Quelha and Costa), encourage us to think more broadly and creatively about existing methodologies and forms of historical data collection (Bowie; Tumbe; Russell; Earnest) as well as introduce us to unique ways to combine methodologies (Ruel, Mills and Helms Mills; Olejniczak, Goto and Pikos) to yield insightful data and deeper contributions. We reserve a more thorough exploration of each special issue article for the last part of our introduction. In the next sections, we problematize the historic turn to offer context and rationale for the special issue theme and consequently the featured articles.

**The call for a historic turn in management and organization studies**

Toward the end of the twentieth century, criticism emerged that scholars in the field of management and organization studies (MOS) had become too “scientistic” in their approach
to organizational phenomena, focusing too strongly on scientifically verifiable, general models that were tested in highly controlled research contexts. As a result, the discipline had become “ahistorical”: cut off from historical context and configurations (Aldrich, 1999; Zald, 1993, 1996, 2002; Goldman, 1994; Kieser, 1994). According to the critics, the problem with the ahistorical approach was its tendency to yield “universalist” and “presentist” theory and empirics (Zald, 2002). Universalism refers to the view that contemporary theory applies to organizations across all societies and all times, while presentism alludes to research findings being reported as if they occurred in a decontextualized present (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006). Together, universalism and presentism lead to a narrow historical understanding of management as a static object rather than a dynamic phenomenon (Söderlund and Lenfle, 2013). Integral to the criticism was a call for MOS to become more engaged with history, as this would allow for more rigorous testing of organization theory, namely, against historical developments instead of short-term data (Kieser, 1994).

In the ensuing years, some scholars have taken a step further, arguing in favor of a “historic turn” in MOS (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006; Clark and Rowlinson, 2004; Rowlinson, 2013), which would represent a transformation of organization studies in at least three senses. First, it would entail a move away from the view that organization studies are part of the social sciences and thus questioning the scientistic rhetoric of MOS. Second, it would involve a turn towards incorporating history as processes and context instead of as a mere variable. Third, it would encompass the engagement with historiographical debates on the epistemological status of narrative. An important motivation behind the call for a historic turn was that history had already been incorporated into various branches of organization theory, which would offer opportunities for historical perspectives to further organization theory (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004; Booth and Rowlinson, 2006). These branches include neo-institutionalism (Khurana, 2007) and evolutionary approaches such as population ecology (Hannan and Freeman, 1977) that analyze the development of organizations and organizational populations over time (Scott, 2001; Aldrich, 1999). Similarly, critical approaches to management, which draw on Marxist, Foucauldian, Weberian, post-colonialist and feminist theories, rely on the past to understand current management practices (Weatherbee et al., 2012). More generally, the past is embedded in such concepts as “narratives” (Brown et al., 2008) and “longitudinal study” (Delios and Ensign, 2000).

The wake of the historic turn: “history as theory”
The call for a historic turn has spawned a significant body of work that explores the usage of historically grounded research in the study of organizations and critically appraises both history and MOS (Rowlinson et al., 2014; Bucheli and Wadhwani, 2014; Mills et al., 2016; Suddaby, 2016). It consists of several dimensions in which different topics related to the historic turn are discussed. Here we identify three:

1. the feasibility of a historic turn;
2. theorization of the relationship between history and MOS; and
3. the potential contribution of historical perspectives to MOS.

Together, these dimensions can be characterized as “history as theory”: the study of the relationship between the historical discipline and MOS and of the way in which it can advance the latter field.
Dimension 1: the feasibility of a historic turn
The first dimension concerns the sheer feasibility of a historic turn in MOS. Several scholars have noted the intellectual disparity between the historical discipline and MOS (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004; Lorenz, 2011; Weatherbee, 2012; Rowlinson et al., 2014; Suddaby, 2016), which would prevent business historians from contributing meaningfully to MOS with historical analyses. According to Suddaby (2016), there are two components to this disparity. The first is an ontological disagreement over what history is and how it is constituted. MOS commonly uses history based on the assumption that there is a knowable external past reality and that historical “truth” can be achieved through referential correspondence between historical “facts” and the past, where the past and history are synonymous (Weatherbee, 2012). However, historians attach different ontological status to “the past” and “history” (Jenkins, 1995) – while the former hints at reality, the latter forms a representation thereof (Van Maanen et al., 2007).

The second element that Suddaby (2016) identifies is that there are epistemological differences between MOS scholars and historians. Rowlinson et al. (2014) identify three “dualisms”. The first relates to evidence, or what constitutes historical fact. While MOS scholars prefer data constructed from replicable procedures, historians derive narratives from eclectic but verifiable documentary sources. Second, the dualism of explanation pertains to how historical facts might be used to construct knowledge about the world. In MOS, historical facts are used to build and test theory, while the subjective, irrational and volatile nature of human behavior and the crucial role of perception – key foci in history – receive less attention (Weatherbee, 2012). Historians generally accept that convincing historical narratives may contradict each other, which troubles the communication between historians and social scientists (Passmore, 2011). Finally, the dualism of temporality refers to the treatment of time. In MOS, time is often abstracted as clock time (Pedriana, 2005) and matters only in terms of specifying the chronological order of events in processes (Abbott, 2001; Pierson, 2004). In history, time, in the form of dates, resonates in collective memories and represents a historical context (Dray, 1986; Tosh, 2008).

The ontological and epistemological divergences between MOS and history seem to have devolved to the methodological level (Jenkins, 1995; Suddaby, 2016), as methodological preferences have bifurcated toward deductive rationalism and inductive empiricism, respectively. That is, whereas management scholars emphasize theory and are critical of pure empiricism, historians emphasize empirical data and are highly skeptical of theory. According to Suddaby (2016), the extent to which the theoretical potential as identified by those who called for a historic turn in MOS will be realized hinges on the (in)ability of history and MOS to relax their ontological and epistemological assumptions. While “purist” takes on either discipline will most likely compromise the options for bridging the ontological and epistemological gaps between them, an agreement on the use of historical methods might be reached by scholars working at the disciplinary periphery. After all, it is in this intellectual space where the boundaries that define the subject matter of MOS and history are more inclusive, which may allow the members of these disciplines to transcend debates over the differences between “social facts” and “historical facts” (Hayek, 1943).

Dimension 2: theorization of the connection between history and management and organization studies
In line with Suddaby’s (2016) reasoning about the potential for collaboration between MOS and history, Durepos and Mills (2012) argue that to determine what value history can add to knowledge of organizations, one must be clear about what history exactly is and how it should be written. Achieving this clarity requires what these authors call a contemporary
theory of history. Such a theory can be formulated if one assumes that theoretical and methodological debates between historians and MOS scholars can lead to disciplinary convergence (Weatherbee, 2012). The second dimension of the historic turn literature has unfolded along these lines, theorizing the relationship between history and MOS. In particular, it discusses the identity of the field of business history and the theory, epistemology and methodology of the historical discipline in relation to MOS (Weatherbee, 2012; De Jong and Higgins, 2015; Mills et al., 2016).

Business historians have developed different onto-epistemological positions that define how history can enrich MOS. For example, Üsdiken and Kieser (2004) identify three positions on the use of history in organization studies: the supplementarist, integrationist and reorientationist. First, the supplementarist position reflects the view that organizational studies are fundamentally a scientistic, theory-driven enterprise in which attentiveness to history may help in variable selection and hypotheses generation (Goodman and Kruger, 1988) and ultimately in confirming and refining general theories (Lawrence, 1984). Second, the integrationist position argues for a fusion of social scientific data gathering with the interpretivist aspects of history (Zald, 1993, 1996) to identify where and how the latter’s enriching potential can be activated. To realize this fusion, historians need to draw upon but also challenge the scientism of MOS, promoting links with humanist academic disciplines, such as literary theory and philosophy. This leads to the standpoint that although the development of organizational forms and arrangements is shaped by the past as a series of facts, these facts are represented through a contextualized mode of interpretation. Third, the reorientationist position is the most critical and challenges both the social scientistic and ahistorical framing of MOS and the atheoretical character of much of historical analysis (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006). On that basis, it promotes a move of MOS away from its scientistic aspirations (Carter, McKinlay and Rowlinson, 2002) and problematizes historical methods (Weatherbee et al., 2012).

Similarly, Rowlinson (2004) outlines three historical perspectives in organization studies – factual, narrative and archaeo-genealogical. The factual perspective, roughly similar to Üsdiken and Kieser’s (2004) supplementarist approach, views the practice of history as ultimately about uncovering facts. The narrative perspective resembles Üsdiken and Kieser’s (2004) integrationist approach and suggests that the past in this perspective is about stories constructed around “traces” of the past, which are the raw materials of the historian’s discourse rather than the events themselves’ (White, 1987). Historical accounts in this perspective begin to problematize the past in MOS – a practice that is further pursued in Rowlinson’s archaeo-genealogical perspective. This perspective arises out of the work of Foucault and focuses on the relationship between the present and the past, arguing that the present does not result from an inevitable series of events but rather from a discursive process that influences how events are read (Rostis, 2011). From this perspective it follows that there is an ontological and epistemological break between the present and the past, the latter being equally subject to discursively mediated understandings.

More recently, Durepos and Mills (2017a) have identified four co-existing and overlapping “phases” of work on the role of history in MOS: the factualist, contextual, methodological and ontological-epistemological phase. In the factualist phase, historical work is atheoretical and focuses on the discovery and reproduction of historical facts, (dis) confirming ahistorical organization theory (Leblebici and Sherer, 2008). The contextual phase echoes Kieser (1994) by providing comparative contexts for making sense of organizational phenomena. This type of analysis promotes understanding of contemporary organizations through their historical dimension. Approaches to history that belong to the methodological phase encourage reflection on the appropriate methods and styles of history.
writing in MOS. For example, Booth and Rowlinson (2006) highlight several perspectives that can benefit historical methodology, such as narrative analysis and Foucauldian inspired research. Finally, the ontological-epistemological phase draws on the work of postmodern historians (Bennett, 1987; Jenkins, 1991) and studies the nature of history and MOS and how they can be integrated. Most notably, Suddaby (2016) distinguishes between history as “text,” or manifest knowledge (i.e. “brute facts”) and history as “subtext,” or latent knowledge (i.e. a lens through which we view the present) and discusses three constructs that draw from the latter: ANTi-History, which analyzes the relational/organizational activities that go into the production of knowledge of the past (Durepos, 2009); rhetorical history, which studies the strategic use of historical discourse (Suddaby et al., 2010); and organizational legacy, which examines how historically shaped organizational or individual identities may drive competitive behavior (Feldman and Romanelli, 2013).

Dimension 3: the potential contributions of history to management and organization studies

The various “theorizations” of the relationship between history and MOS have enabled this group of scholars to formulate how the engagement with history, historical sources and historical methods can advance understanding of organizational phenomena. Typically, their contribution is formulated in more general terms. For example, Álvaro-Moya and Donzé (2016) argue that historical perspectives can shed new light on what companies, managers and governments know about the creation, development and transfer of organizational capabilities, the nature of innovation and entrepreneurship and the impact of institutional settings on firms’ competitiveness, among other issues. In addition, Palmer et al. (2007) contend that the embracement of history fosters the engagement in more generative discussions about new organizational forms, whereas Cummings and Bridgman (2011) maintain that doing history can contribute solutions to managerial problems.

Extending these arguments, Söderlund and Lenflé (2013) contend that because understanding of management is in perpetual development, there is reason to continually revisit the past. According to these authors, the iteration between past and present may actually be as important as the scientific processes of deduction and induction, because in it a particular kind of generalization can be found – one of rich stories and contextual understandings (Gaddis, 2002), filled with generalizable examples (Flyvbjerg, 2006). In turn, embedded generalizations may help scholars identify the interdependency of variables over time (Jones and Khanna, 2006; Bucheli and Wadhwani, 2014; Quinn, 2015). Chandler’s (1962) study of the emergence of the multi-divisional firm is just one example of how patterns can be identified in historical evolution. Based on their unique generalizability, historical accounts of corporate capitalism such as Chandler’s (1962) open up space for a broader debate about the role of the modern corporation in the current era of globalization in terms of economic growth, equality and democracy (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006).

Other scholars go beyond general formulations and suggest specific theories or concepts whose understanding might benefit from historical analysis. For example, Suddaby (2016) sees potential for contributions of history to institutional theory, which views organizations as the product of social rather than economic pressures (Suddaby, 2013). Institutional theory has an inherent historical component, because the meanings and values that organizations become infused with develop over time (Selznick, 1949). As Suddaby (2016) suggests, historians can enrich understanding of what institutions are and how they change because they can link institutional agency to unique and specific historical conditions. On that basis, historians might help resolve the paradox of embedded agency, which relates to the question of how actors can change the institutions that are supposed to shape their thoughts and actions (Battilana and D’Aunno, 2009). Other authors that target a specific theory are
Brunninge and Melander (2016), who argue that historical analysis may advance understanding of path dependency. The notion of path dependency is used in strategy to explain why firms are able to remain competitive in the face of market and industrial change. Path dependency exists where firms become locked-in onto a path of success (or failure) as a result of historical actions or decisions (Dobusch and Schüßler, 2012). According to Brunninge and Melander (2016), historical approaches allow scholars to study the interplay of self-reinforcing mechanisms at different levels of analysis.

Maclean et al. (2016) categorize the potential contributions to MOS of historical analysis based on four types of historical analysis: history as evaluating; history as explicating; history as conceptualizing; and history as narrating. Evaluative history confronts organization theory with historical evidence to test its explanatory power and identify limitations. This type of research can for example be used to test ecological theories (Hannan and Freeman, 1977) and aspects of the resource-based view of the firm (Wernerfelt, 1984), such as dynamic capabilities (Teece et al., 1997) and path dependency (Sydow et al., 2009). Explicatory history synthesizes theoretical ideas and historical evidence, fostering arguments based on reinterpretations of the past as well as theoretical refinements. For example, institutional theory benefits from historical perspectives (Suddaby et al., 2014) that recognize the importance of institutional path dependence and adaptation (Leblebici et al., 1991) in institutional agency. Historical approaches aimed at conceptualization use historical cases for inductive generalizations (Wadhwani and Jones, 2014). For example, Tushman and O’Reilly (1996) notion of strategic ambidexterity emerged from the observation that firms balance exploration and exploitation according to environmental conditions. Finally, history as narrating serves to explain significant organizational phenomena. Propositions and arguments emerge inductively from the historical evidence and exhibit a high level of context sensitivity (Lippmann and Aldrich, 2014). In Chandler’s (1962) work, for example, a mass of case evidence is deployed to explain the spread of innovations such as multidivisional structures and diversification.

Dissatisfaction with the historic turn: exploring “history as method”
Despite the identified potential of and the growing interest in the integration of history into MOS, the historic turn has arguably not yet fulfilled its promise (Durepos and Mills, 2017a, 2017b). First of all, the main streams of research that the historic turn has generated predominantly perform “history as theory,” as they focus on theorizing the role of history in MOS without actually making a theoretical contribution to practicing history. The ongoing theoretical debates about the use of historical approaches in MOS indicate that business history as a scientific discipline is still struggling with its identity (Ponzoni and Boersma, 2011). Beyond the ongoing navel-gazing of business historians, even where empirical attempts are made to connect history with MOS, the theoretical fruits of the historic turn seem to remain limited. This point can be illustrated with two recent and authoritative special issues on this topic. The first one was edited by Mills et al. (2016) and published in Management and Organizational History and explores the debates that have emerged from Booth and Rowlinson’s (2006) initial call. The second special issue appeared in Business History and was edited by Decker et al. (2018) and attempts at reconciling history and MOS by focusing on “Historical Research on Institutional Change”.

Mills et al. (2016) use their special issue mainly to discusses the practice of history in and around organizations. For example, Corrigan (2016) reveals alternative performances of history in municipal budget-making practices and finds that municipal managers use history and traces of the past to develop durable images to unify actor-networks. Furthermore, Marshall and Novicevic (2016) use the historical case of Mound Bayou, an all
African–American venture in Mississippi, to problematize and reconstruct present conceptualizations of conformance activities for gaining legitimacy as a social enterprise. In addition, Zundel et al. (2016) review the advantages and problems of the use history as a resource for establishing and maintaining organizational identity claims and examine how using history impacts on the appreciation of history itself. Although these papers are effective at showing the importance of history in organizational life, theoretically they mainly reiterate Suddaby’s (2016) argument that history has a “subtext” component. Therefore, the question that emerges from this special issue is how much theoretical ground can be broken, especially beyond the realm of institutional change, by focusing on the organizational use of history as opposed to history as a way to theorize behavior in and around organizations (Durepos and Mills, 2017a).

Decker et al. (2018) are also influenced by Suddaby’s (2016) treatise and include papers in their special issue that address the tension between large-scale shifts of institutional logics and the unique individual and organizational practices that facilitate these shifts. For example, Wadhwani (2018) uses historical institutionalism to examine the co-evolution of legal and organizational change in US savings bank regulation. Furthermore, Thompson (2018) examines the evolution of “record pools” in the US music industry, which enabled disco DJs to access new music, through the lens of institutional work. Moreover, in his analysis of Finnish hypermarkets, Seppälä (2018) uses the concept of legitimacy as a tool to understand the adaptation of Finnish hypermarkets to evolving environmental pressures.

What transpires from the papers in this special issue is that the editors have aimed to facilitate exploration of the opportunities of engaging with institutional theory for extending historiographical understanding of the past. However, from a MOS point of view, the contributions remain somewhat generic. Even if the papers invariably frame history by means of theoretical language, they are fundamentally historically motivated and perform history “for history’s sake”. Consequently, the theoretical contributions are formulated in a general way and thus enrich MOS to a limited extent only (Kipping and Usdiken, 2008).

In light of the aforementioned special issues, what seems to be of key importance for the historic turn in MOS to mature is the realization that the practice of history affords access to a wealth of both quantitative and qualitative organizational data that might be drawn upon by means of several methodological approaches and methods for the building and testing of theoretical ideas (Maclean et al., 2016; Mills et al., 2016). This idea can be summarized as “history as method”: drawing from what Suddaby (2016) refers to as the “text” component of history, where the “brute facts” are contained, historical practices of data collection and analysis can be integrated into empirical strategies for performing theoretically motivated studies. History as a method can be applied widely and thus allows for tremendous theoretical flexibility. Therefore, it enables business historians to further various debates in MOS (Decker et al., 2015). Indeed, historically grounded research has been performed in several management fields, including strategy, international business and entrepreneurship (Kipping and Usdiken, 2015; McLaren et al., 2015). Some scholars might caution that the approach to history as a method encourages the dilution of business history as a discipline, because communication across theoretical fields within MOS remains scarce (Álvaro-Moya and Donzé, 2016). However, it has also been argued that there is no prospect of a unified field of business history (Rowlinson et al., 2014), because historical theorists are suspicious of any attempt to impose paradigm consensus (Van Maanen, 1995; Megill, 2007).

The quality of the theoretical contribution expected in MOS and the historical veracity required in historical research approaches place demands on researchers such that their analyses should demonstrate “dual integrity” or demonstrable competence in both disciplines (Maclean et al., 2016). Assuming that the ontological and epistemological
differences between history and MOS can be bridged, the requirement of dual integrity raises particular attention to techniques or practices of history (Suddaby, 2016). While promoting a historic turn in MOS, Booth and Rowlinson (2006) called for alternate methods of historically studying organizations beyond the traditional descriptive case study (Alvaro-Moya and Donzé, 2016). Since then, a wide range of theoretical framings, methodological approaches and methods has emerged that scholars can access to develop understandings of the past (Decker et al., 2015; Mills et al., 2016). Rowlinson et al. (2014) provide some methodological organization by identifying four archetypical types of historical analysis that are suitable for MOS. The first is corporate history, which consists of a holistic, objectivist narrative of a specific corporate entity. Second, analytically structured history narrates conceptually defined structures and events. Third, in serial history, replicable techniques are used to analyze repeatable facts. Finally, ethnographic history aims at recovering social practices and meanings from organizations.

Although Rowlinson et al.’s (2014) typology constitutes a major reference point for business historians seeking to contribute to MOS, historical methods, sources and narratives are never static (Weatherbee, 2012), and the discussion around the methodological choices that are available to study history in MOS is ongoing (Durepos and Mills, 2017a). We are therefore left with the question: to what extent are efforts to categorize historical methodologies effective at fully capturing the variety and richness that exists in the practice of history? In this light, it is understandable that Decker et al. (2015) call for a broader debate about the methods for business historical research that appreciates the diversity of approaches that have developed in the past decade. If this debate is to be given further shape, business history scholars have to work concretely on generating what Decker et al. (2015) refer to as methodological pluralism. Doing so not only encompasses proposing and discussing specific historical methodological approaches and methods that are suitable for MOS; it also requires demonstrating their use empirically in theoretically motivated studies.

Introducing the papers
The papers featured in this special issue of the Journal of Management History each make a theoretical contribution to methodology in historical organization studies. Far from only describing the theoretical benefits of doing history (“history as theory”) in MOS, the papers discuss and demonstrate how to integrate the practice of historical data collection and analysis to provide an empirical contribution (“history as method”). Thus, the papers illustrate the theoretical point through a full-blown empirical study that features respective methodologies.

The first two pieces in our special issue (Shaffner, Mills and Helms Mills; Ruel, Mills and Helms Mills) feature methodological contributions to enhance the historical study of gender and diversity in organizations. Heeding to calls to explore gender and diversity in organization studies, Shaffner et al. combine research on intersectionality with the study of the past to examine discriminatory patterns at work over time. After outlining the facets of intersectional history, the authors provide an example of the method in use which features Qantas Airways and their treatment of Australian Aboriginal people. Ruel et al. also focus on methodology to study discrimination and gender in organizations. Their context is the Cold War space industry where women are almost invisible because they were either employed in low organizational positions (which did not get documented and thus, do not make the archive repositories) or absent all together. The absence of women makes their study very challenging. Ruel et al. overcome this challenge by combining archival data featuring Pan American Airway’s Guided Missile Range Division with an autoethnography featuring Ruel’s experience within the contemporary space industry. This innovative
combination of two existing methodologies allows Ruel et al. to foster deeper insight into discrimination in the space industry. The outcome is a unique study that links the past and present in a non-chronological way to offer a fresh perspective on gender relations in the space industry.

The articles by Shaffner et al. and Ruel et al. are each influenced by postmodern historiography (Jenkins, 1991; Munslow, 1997) where knowledge of the past is viewed as socially constructed. This perspective is shared by Quelha and Costa, the authors of the third article featured in the special issue. Quelha and Costa perform a unique ANTi-History to trace the emergence and constitution of the Memorial Resistance of São Paulo. In doing so, they surface the socio-politics of the human and nonhuman actors involved in the site of memory. Far from the usual reliance on archival materials to study the past, this study combines data including interviews, videos, books, newspapers and websites to offer an alternative historical version that surfaces the complexity of the memorial's history.

Archives are often assumed to be the preferred choice of historians, with some going as far as performing full archival ethnographies (Decker, 2014; Coller et al., 2016). The following three articles in the special issue (Bowie; Tumbe; Russell) each focus on the archive and its uses. The articles by Bowie and Tumbe focus specifically on newspaper archives. While Bowie praises them for their accuracy and cost-effectiveness and calls upon management historians to fully leverage their potential for contextualization, Tumbe demonstrates how the large-scale machine-readable texts ("corpus linguistics") available in digitized newspaper archives can be leveraged for analyzing the evolution of words, concepts and ideas across vast time periods and cultures, which in turn can lead to advancements in discourse analysis. The third paper, by Russell, is innovative in a different way, demonstrating how one can draw on extant sources that vary in form and periodization to provide coherent insights onto a phenomenon of interest. Russell uses three seemingly unrelated archives to paint the management experience in Canada from the 1960s to the 1980s. Despite the archives' divergent foci and the fact that their collections ostensibly offer little on the subject of the Canadian management experience, Russell finds sources in each of the three collections that allow him to shed light on the complexity of the management experience in post-World War II Canada. This analysis leads Russell to encourage management historians to be innovative in finding and using archival collections.

The last two articles featured in the special issue are empirically motivated case studies (Olejniczak, Tomasz and Pikos; Earnest) that offer theoretical insights for management historians. Olejniczak, Tomasz and Pikos' case study offers a multidisciplinary theoretical discussion of the concept of continuity, followed by its empirical illustration in a long-lived company, the Polish Jablikowski Brothers Department Store. The case study's featured organization offers an interesting context to study continuity because it has a discontinuous history. The authors capitalize on the longevity of the organization and its discontinuous history to offer insights on the notion of continuity in management history. From Poland, we travel south to Kosovo, the geographic context of Earnest's case study. In this special issue finale article, Earnest explores the multiple challenges of reconstruction and development in a war-torn Kosovo. The author focuses on the planning and implementation of projects while stressing the importance of historical, social and cultural contexts. This focus allows Earnest to outline the implications of project management practice and theory and show that international aid efforts do not always transfer easily to local community needs. Challenges identified include stakeholder communication, cost, quality and risk management. Earnest's case study demonstrates the need for more historically sensitive research on post-conflict communities and the insight they offer for modern project management knowledge.
Collectively, the eight articles featured in the special issue offer examples of innovative and historically sensitive methodology that we feel increase the management historian toolkit and ultimately enhance the methodological pluralism of historical organization studies as a field.

References


Quinn, J. (2015), Young Ireland and the Writing of Irish History, University College Dublin Press, Dublin.


Suddaby, R. (2016), “Toward a historical consciousness: following the historic turn in management thought”, M@n@gement, Vol. 19 No. 1, pp. 46-60.


About the authors
Wim Van Lent is an Assistant Professor of entrepreneurship and strategy at Montpellier Business School, France. He received a PhD in management from ESSEC Business School. His research interest lies at the intersection of strategy, sociology and history and focuses on the institutionalization of core management practices, power and organizational memory. His work has been published in Social Forces and Human Relations.

Gabrielle Durepos, PhD, is an Associate Professor at Mount Saint Vincent University in Halifax, Canada. Her co-authored book ANTi-History: Theorizing the Past, History, and Historiography in Management and Organization Studies addresses the call for a historic turn by drawing on actor-network theory. She is also an Associate Editor at the Academy of Management Learning and Education and Qualitative Research in Organization and Management. Gabrielle is a co-editor of both the SAGE Encyclopaedia of Case Study Research and the SAGE Major Work on Case Study Methods in Business Research. Gabrielle Durepos is the corresponding author and can be contacted at: gabrielle.durepos@msvu.ca

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website:
www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Intersectional history: exploring intersectionality over time

Ellen C. Shaffner
Saint Mary’s University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada

Albert J. Mills
Department of Business, University of Eastern Finland, Kuopio, Finland and
Department of Management, Saint Mary’s University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada,

Jean Helms Mills
Department of Management, Saint Mary’s University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada

Abstract
Purpose – This paper aims to outline the possibilities of intersectional history as a novel method for management history. Intersectional history combines intersectionality and the study of the past to examine discrimination in organizations over time. This paper explores the need for intersectional work in management history, outlines the vision for intersectional history and provides a brief example analyzing the treatment of Australian Aboriginal people in a historical account of Qantas Airways.

Design/methodology/approach – This paper contends that intersectionality is a discursive practice, and it adopts a relational approach to the study of the past to inform the method. This paper focuses on the social construction of identities and the enduring nature of traces of the powerful in organizations over time.

Findings – The example of Qantas Airways demonstrates that intersectional history can be used to interrogate powerful traces of the past to reveal novel insights about marginalized peoples over time.

Originality/value – Intersectional history is a specific and reflexive method that allows for the surfacing of identity-based marginalization over time. The paper’s concentration on identity as socially constructed allows a particular focus on notions or representations of the marginalized in traces of the past. These traces may otherwise mask the existence and importance of marginalized groups in organizations’ dominant histories.

Keywords Management history, Methodology, Power, Intersectionality, Intersectional history

Paper type Research paper

Introduction
Over the past two decades, there have been various calls for a “historic turn” in management and organization studies (MOS) (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004). These, and other calls, have focused on ontological, epistemological and methodological issues (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006) that have helped to effect a small but, arguably, significant shift in the way we think of the past and history (Munslow, 2015). This has been witnessed through increasing numbers of postmodernist and narrative accounts (Jacques, 1996; Rowlinson, 2004), as well as more recent amodernist accounts (Durepos and Mills, 2012). While gender and diversity have been included in the debates (Jacques, 1996; Mills, 2006; Phillips and Rippin, 2010a, 2010b), much of the focus has been on the onto-epistemological character of history and the past. For example, in several recent special issues on the historic turn in MOS, only one (Cruz, 2014) included any discussion of race and gender. Beyond this rare exceptions are the 2010 special
issue of *Management and Organizational History* on “Women in Management and Organizational History” (Phillips and Rippin, 2010a), Corrigan and Mills (2012) and the recent work of Durepos *et al.* (2017). Outside of MOS and management and organizational history (MOH) there have been more powerful and consistent links between intersectionality and history-making (Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016; Silverstein *et al.*, 2017; Rose, 2010; Scott, 1990)[1].

Similar to the absence of feminist theory in the debate around the historic turn, postcolonialist organization theory has also been neglected (Faria *et al.*, 2010; Ibarra-Colado, 2006) – two epistemological frameworks that, respectively, put a focus on gender and diversity to the fore. Arguably part of the problem with unifying these debates has been at times the sheer specificity involved (e.g. debates around the ontological character of history and the past), alongside a quest to reveal the gendered and colonial thinking of the field of MOS and of MOH.

In our attempt to fuse the insights of these various debates – the past-as-history (Munslow, 2015), feminist organizational theory (Calás and Smircich, 2006) and postcoloniality (Faria *et al.*, 2010) – we were drawn to the idea of intersectionality. The term has grown in usage among feminist and diversity scholars over the past two decades but in the process has spawned a multitude of understandings and applications (Hearn and Louvriere, 2016; Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016; Mercer *et al.*, 2016). Our perspective draws on the work of Ruel *et al.* (2018) who contend that intersectionality is the study of how individuals are “positioned through difference in gender, class, sexual orientation, ethnicity, national belonging and more” (Ruel *et al.*, 2018, p. 18). We also agree that these intersections “of identity categories can position individuals in society, creating an order” (p. 18).

Paradoxically, our attempt to use intersectionality as a heuristic for making sense of gender and diversity in the social construction of history runs into the problem of the largely ahistorical character of the term in concept and use (Yuval-Davis, 2006). Yuval-Davis (2006), for example, has suggested that study of the way that intersectional divisions are constructed should focus on how they are intermeshed in each other in specific historical conditions; however, this has not been a prevailing focus of intersectional work (Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016). Researchers have not necessarily considered the historical context of intersectionality. We therefore attempt to include the context in which histories are themselves embedded in specific historical conditions. For example, in an analysis of a history of Qantas Airways, we examine not only the way that forms of intersectionality are produced but also the discursive context, or broader societal discourses, in which the account itself was produced (Hardy and Phillips, 1999). We suggest this approach reflects the need to reveal how intersectional categories and historical accounts are produced.

Our paper strives to address this by setting out a method for studying the past, using intersectionality. We call this intersectional history. We argue this method is important because our notion of intersectional history integrates the theorizing of intersectionality with a critical investigation of representations of an organization’s past. In other words, we use the framework of intersectionality to explore how an organization’s history has the potential to reveal insights about the experiences and marginalization of those less privileged in the organization’s story of its own past (Rowlinson and Procter, 1999) and the role of history itself in the process.

This paper unfolds with a brief discussion of intersectionality and the debates about the use of intersectionality in academic work. This is followed by a review of our position on the past and how we conceive of history work. We then envision what intersectional history might look like, outlining four key philosophical tenets. We provide a loose framework of guiding questions to help with intersectional history research and then proceed to an
empirical example of our method of intersectional history. We use a history of the Australian airline Qantas, as written by its cofounder Sir Hudson Fysh (1966, 1968, 1970), to study the privileging (of white upper-class men) and marginalization (of Australian Aboriginals) of selected actors over time and the context in which those accounts were written (namely, the late 1960s). We close with a discussion of the insights raised by our exploration of our method termed intersectional history and a reflection on the implications of this method for the MOH.

Intersectionality

Despite the increasing use of intersectionality, academics continue to debate what intersectionality is, why it matters and how it should be used in research (Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016). Part of this debate involves underlying philosophical positions: some feel that intersectionality must be defined and bounded (Hancock, 2007a), whereas others, embracing a more postpositivist notion of feminism and critical race studies, argue that intersectionality flourishes because of its resistance to a hegemonic, positivist notion of theory (Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016). We agree with Hill Collins and Bilge (2016) that much of the appeal of intersectionality lies in its vagueness. Intersectionality is not one particular definable thing, but rather a lens that is concerned with power, privilege and marginalization of those who can be seen as disadvantaged based on their social categories (Mercer et al., 2016). How this lens gets applied depends on the researcher and the researched, and bounding this space is difficult. That said, a focus on power and disadvantage tends to be central to any intersectional analysis (Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016).

The definition by Brah and Phoenix (2004) states that intersectionality is:

> Signifying the complex, irreducible, varied, and variable effects which ensue when multiple axis of differentiation – economic, political, cultural, psychic, subjective, and experiential – intersect in historically-specific contexts (p. 76).

Intersectionality involves some form of accounting for the complexity of social life across multiple dimensions and that the impact or effect of these multiple axis of differentiation will vary. Interestingly, Brah and Phoenix (2004) do not address the issue of historically specific contexts in greater detail. We suggest that here we see a recognition of the need for historical work as a feature of intersectionality; however, there has been little work done in this area.

Dhamoon (2011), following Hancock (2007a, 2007b), suggests that intersectionality can be considered a paradigm, which may be broadly applied “to various relations of marginality and privilege” (Dhamoon, 2011, p. 1). At its most basic, intersectionality is concerned with the processes or relations of marginalization and privilege and the connection of these processes to socially constructed categories of identity, such as gender, race or class. Crenshaw (1989, 1991) popularized the term intersectionality with the intersection image of many city streets, in which each street is a category of identity, such as gender, race or class. The overlapping of streets at the intersection is a metaphor for the way in which the combination of gender, race, class and other categories of identity combine to create a unique position of either advantage or disadvantage. However, as others have pointed out, intersectionality was recognized and lived, in particular by female, black activists for at least over a century prior to the coining of the term (Brah and Phoenix, 2004; Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016). The experience of living at the margins has found voice in varying outlets, including through academic scholarship in the early 1980s. Scholars such as Hooks (1981) and Hill Collins (1986, 1989) began to crystallize these lived experiences into
Intersectionality, as it was to be coined, was borne out of this tradition of examining the experiences of black women in relation to gender, race and class. Intersectionality gained traction somewhat slowly before the early 2000s (Bannerji, 1995; Brah, 1996; Hill Collins, 2000); however, intersectional research began to appear more regularly in the early 2000s (Bowleg, 2012; Cole, 2009; Valentine, 2007; Verloo, 2006). The work across qualitative and quantitative realms speaks to the philosophical fragmentation of intersectionality. McCall (2005) drew attention to this, noting that intersectionality is dangerously simplified when identity categories are taken as fixed instead of problematized as a social construction. Yuval-Davis (2006) also emphasizes the importance of recognizing categories of identity as socially constructed and suggests that categories of identity are discursively constructed. This reflects the notion that identities are constructed through social practice, across time (e.g. the past) and context (e.g. organizational structures and culture) and that these notions get reproduced over time. Like Yuval-Davis (2006), we suggest that it is difficult to call something intersectional without a focus on destabilizing the fixed notion of these identity categories.

Intersectionality has also been a central focus for scholars studying postcolonialism, decolonialism and transnational feminism. Postcolonial work destabilizes oppressive, colonized notions of race, gender and class (Anthias, 2012; Anthias and Yuval-Davis, 1983; Holvino, 2010) and as such engages with the past because the impacts of colonialism emerge from the past. It is important to note that this engagement between intersectionality and the past in postcolonial and decolonial work can take many forms; however, it is centered on several key points:

Altogther, theorizing the intersections of race, gender and class is at the core of postcolonial/transnational feminism in the following important ways: a focus on the simultaneity of oppressions; a goal of understanding and rewriting history from the social locations of women of colour; a recognition and interest in women of colour’s agency; attention to the role of the state and the interrelations between colonialism, racism, and gender in women of colour’s lives and a recognition of the importance and difficulty of forging women’s alliances for change (Holvino, 2010, p. 260).

The focus in the excerpt provided above is to situate women of color within the framework of analysis that seeks to destabilize oppressive and marginalizing systems that have governed them in the past and continue to do so today. While intersectionality can be used to consider marginalized groups beyond women of color (Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016), this focus on intersectionality by post and decolonial scholars is necessarily an important reference for our understanding of intersectionality.

Although intersectionality is broad, for us, intersectionality involves problematizing the social construction of categories of identity and exploring the processes of marginalization and privilege and their connections to both discursive and positional power. Such flows and exercises of power we see as conferred through multiple, contextual, time-specific and discursively constructed identities. We see intersectionality as a fluid, necessary, discursive concept that provides a way to consider, and contend with, the social construction of categories of difference over time and the ways in which those categories of difference have been used to afford power to some, while marginalizing others. As Dhamoon (2011) puts it, intersectionality:

Was premised on a dynamic notion [...] whereby the roads emerged from various histories, became politically relevant because of historical repetition, and were constituted through movement that affected people and existing structures (p. 3, emphasis ours).
The roads described here emerge from histories that are power-laden, we argue; they become politically relevant through the reproduction of these power-laden histories. And so, we suggest that intersectionality needs to be thought of over time, or at the very least, in a way that involves a consideration of the past when it is used in MOS.

**The study of the past**

Just as our view on intersectionality involves an emphasis on the discursive construction of identity categories, so too is our view of history that it is discursively constructed. Following Jenkins (2003), we argue that things happened in the before-now, but what remains of it are traces and that these traces get preserved and reassembled for certain purposes. Yet traces, like facts, are not simply there to be found. Just as facts do not speak for themselves (White, 1984), traces refer to certain phenomena that have been designated as important by historians and others in a discursive process. For example, in the case of Qantas Airways, which we will discuss in more detail below, cofounder Hudson Fysh wrote a history of the organization, which set down a record of the company’s important events and achievements for posterity (Fysh, 1966). In the process, he focused on traces that were ultimately associated with the successful foundation, growth and longevity of the airline. These traces included information about his own ancestry, diaries he had kept and the memories of selected people whom he reached out to in the process of writing his history. We contend that the traces were not simply selected by Fysh, but that his choices were influenced by the powerful discourses of which he was a part, both as he lived these events and retrospectively reconstructed them when writing his history.

We take the position that the past is not a truth that is found through the seeking out and verification of facts (Jenkins, 2003). There is always a point of view or a researcher’s narrative that is navigating the process of fact-finding, making objective or true history an impossibility. Although many accept this, there is an overarching concern with a factualist approach to history (Rowlinson, 2004). The factualist approach uses verifiable facts to underwrite a historical account and provide plausibility. In this way, Jenkins (1995) argues that history also has a discursive power because as a meta-discourse it is a strongly held belief in the factual or real basis of a historical account. We challenge this factualist approach in our own philosophical position and study of the past, focusing instead on the way that the factual history of Fysh (1966, 1968, 1970) in our example of this paper serves to marginalize others, such as Australian Aboriginals.

**Management and organization studies and reflections on the historic turn**

Our belief that there is a space for the method we term intersectional history is based on our reflections on the historic turn in MOS (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004). Some of the key insights from the call for an historic turn in MOS have been the various contentions that history is a representation of the past (Elton, 1969), a meta-discourse (Jenkins, 1995), a meta-narrative (White, 1973), an effect of socio-political relations (Durepos and Mills, 2012), ontologically dissonant from the past (Munslow, 2010) and a non-corporeal actant (Hartt, 2013). While each of these takes a position on the relationship between the past and history, they all help us to analyze how history is produced and accepted.

In considering these approaches to the study of the past and the space for intersectional history, we acknowledge that organizational scholars have approached history in a multitude of ways: to challenge the hegemony of key management concepts (Bruce, 2006; Bruce and Nyland, 2011; Cooke, 1999); to examine how organizational culture emerges from the past (Rowlinson and Hassard, 1993; Rowlinson and Proctor, 1999); and, importantly, to explore discrimination in organizations over time (Helms Mills, 2002; Mills, 1998;
Myrdon et al., 2011). Amid this broad variety, there have been empirical studies that consider intersectionality and the past (Ruel, Mills and Thomas, 2018; Shaffner et al., 2017; Weigand et al., 2017). However, we feel there is a need to delineate a method for “doing” intersectionality over time. Intersectional history then, is the merging of intersectionality and the study of the past to create a framework for considering traces of the past in a way that centers marginalized identities. While intersectionality is far from ahistorical (Brah and Phoenix, 2004; Yuval-Davis, 2006), there is a great potential for intersectionality to recover women and other marginalized identities in hegemonic organizational histories and archives (Phillips and Rippin, 2010a) when intersectionality is methodologically combined with the theorizing of the past that has characterized much of the historic turn era in MOS (Mills et al., 2016).

**A vision of intersectional history**

We have suggested that intersectionality is embedded in the past yet read discursively in the present. However, there has been little research that attempts to situate intersectionality over time (Shaffner et al., 2017; Weigand et al., 2017). Similarly, while there has been a fair amount of intersectional work in organization studies, intersectionality has not been a focus of MOH. In this section, we outline our vision for intersectional history. We premise this vision on our theoretical position that the social construction of categories under study in intersectional work emerge through historically specific contexts, and over time (Brah and Phoenix, 2004; Dhamoon, 2011; Yuval-Davis, 2006). We also suggest that applying our vision of intersectional history to the context of organizations over time provides the opportunity to evaluate how the privilege and marginalization of particular groups has emerged and endured. In particular, intersectional history could help us cope with the ways organizations use and tell the stories of their past and the ways in which these stories reinforce a status quo that makes minorities invisible. By directly incorporating an intersectional approach with the study of the past, we embed a focus on the social construction of identities and overlapping systems of oppression (Hill Collins, 2000) in a more specific way than existing methods, such as critical discourse analysis (Fairclough, 2013). We hope our brief example in the next section will help demonstrate these possibilities. To begin, however, we suggest four tenets of intersectional history.

Although intersectional history is conceived of as a method, we suggest that this method be underpinned by a philosophical position that is fundamentally aligned with both intersectionality and the study of the past, as we have conceived them in the previous section. Therefore, we suggest the four key tenets as: concern with critique, commitment to reflexivity, centering of power and consideration of time.

**Concern with critique**

We suggest that intersectional history be undertaken from a position that is motivated by a fundamental concern with critique. History work in MOS has long been seen as a potential vehicle for critique (Durepos, 2017), and we consider that this underlying motivation to study the past must be a focus of scholars engaged with intersectional history. Past MOH work has undertaken critique through attempts to destabilize commonly held assumptions and narratives about organization studies (Cooke, 1999; Jacques, 1996). Additionally, MOH work challenging dominant and hegemonic accounts of organizational histories that suggest a singular, factualist truth have served to denaturalize and reveal alternative pasts (Durepos, 2017; Rowlinson and Hassard, 1993; Booth et al., 2007). Working to develop alternative versions of the past which reveal the political nature of an authoritative history is a primary goal of an intersectional history approach. We contend that when undertaking
intersectional history, researchers must seek to destabilize and denaturalize singular, apolitical versions of the past and surface alternatives that disrupt the status quo (Durepos, 2017; Rowlinson, 2004). Therefore, a concern with critique is a key tenet of intersectional history.

**Commitment to reflexivity**

We suggest that intersectional history research also needs to be fundamentally committed to reflexivity. Like critique, reflexivity has been an important part of MOS, particularly in critical management research (Ford et al., 2010). Reflexivity has also been a hallmark of feminist scholarship, including intersectional work (Davis, 2008; Wasserfall, 1993). Reflexivity involves recognizing “all social activity, including research as an ongoing endogenous accomplishment” (Cunliffe, 2003). While there is no single definition of reflexivity, the acknowledgement of research as a process in which we must question the nature of knowledge, language and truth claims is central to our inclusion of reflexivity as a guiding principle for intersectional history (Cunliffe, 2003, 2016).

Pollner (1991) suggests that a radical reflexivity involves “an insecurity regarding the basic assumptions, discourse and practices used in describing reality” (p. 370). This notion of insecurity aptly describes what we suggest is useful for researchers doing intersectional history. Traces of the past may act as truth claims, suggest dominant narratives, and appear to be factual. However, by inhabiting a space of insecurity through a commitment to reflexivity, the researcher is able to question what these traces may be representing and how. Importantly, this commitment to reflexivity involves skepticism by the researcher of their own role in imbuing meaning to the traces being studied. Reflexivity allows for multiple meanings and narratives to arise through historical traces and permits interrogation of these traces and one’s own role in this investigative and meaning-making process (Barros et al., 2018). There is an inherent closeness to the research that is not only encouraged, but required through all parts of the research process, including writing (Grey and Sinclair, 2006). By being insecure about the past, the nature of knowledge, one’s own social construction of reality, and the truth claims that dominant historical narratives make, researchers doing intersectional history will be able to destabilize factualized accounts of the past that they may encounter in their research.

**Centering power**

We suggest that a focus on power is a necessary part of intersectional history. Power is a central feature of intersectional analysis (Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016), and it must be a central feature of intersectional history. Power is a broad, complex concept and we provide only a brief discussion here of how we envision power as a central feature of intersectional history.

The relationship of intersectionality to power is multi-dimensional (Hill Collins, 2017). Intersectional analysis may involve a consideration of “structural, disciplinary, cultural, and interpersonal dimensions of power” (Hill Collins, 2017, p. 22) and how these dimensions intersect to result in oppression. Such an analysis of the power relations within each of these dimensions power may help explain how oppression occurs. We suggest that centering power in intersectional history involves considering these dimensions of power. However, it also involves taking a macro-level approach to understand what Hill Collins (2000, 2017) calls the matrix of domination. This “refers to how political domination on the macro-level of analysis is organized via intersecting systems of oppression” (Hill Collins, 2017, p. 22). According to Hill Collins (2017), examples include patriarchy, racism and imperialism, among other broad discourses that are constructed and reproduced across social contexts.
When applying these insights on power and power relations to intersectional history, we suggest that researchers must be concerned with macro-level political domination or powerful discourses that serve to characterize the preservation of historical narratives and traces. By this, we mean that power and politics impacts how the past is told, preserved and reproduced in formal settings such as archives (Barros et al., 2018; Decker, 2013), and researchers must acknowledge the existence of these matrices of domination (Hill Collins, 2000, 2017). However, it is also necessary for researchers to center power further within these matrices by focusing on how power relations emerge through traces of the past that can indicate structural, cultural and interpersonal dimensions of power within a social context such as an organization (Hill Collins, 2000; Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016). For example, researchers may gain intersectional insights by considering who is present, talked about, photographed and ignored within historical material of organizations. These insights may be accessed by asking who is included and who is excluded, as an initial starting point for analysis, rather than taking the traces as factually for granted (Decker, 2013). Ultimately, our position is that when researchers interact with the traces, they must start from the assumption that power is multi-dimensional within them.

Consideration of time

The final tenet of intersectional history is time. Researchers doing intersectional history must consider time in their analysis. Like power, time is a complex concept. We begin from the standpoint that time is not a neutral construct, but rather that it is positional (Ermarth, 1992). In modernity, time has been conceived of as linear and historical; however, Ermarth (1992) suggests that unproblematized historical time is a particularly powerful Western discourse. She rejects that it is possible to know a time before now through traces that can be seen to represent some kind of past reality (Ermarth, 2011). Taken in this way, time is closely connected with our position on the past. Time must be considered as a discourse, rather than taken for granted. Time passes, however the way we conceive of time, be it in eras, hours, years or descriptively as good or bad, is discursively constructed (Ermarth, 2011). Therefore, we broadly follow Ermarth when we suggest that those engaged with intersectional history must consider the meaning that time imbues to their research material and traces of the past. By rejecting the notion that traces are able to provide meaning as historical representations of a particular time, it leaves us to consider the traces of the past as once again discursive and subject to our own reflexivity as researchers.

We emphasize that those engaged with intersectional history must undertake to disrupt historical time (Ermarth, 1992). By disrupting historical time as described above, it then allows for time as an apolitical construct to be dismantled and considered in a way that may be more useful. For example, time can be thought of in junctures (Mills, 2010) which signal a context of dominant societal discourses that are reproduced in particular ways over some period. Thinking of time in this junctured way may allow for a comparison to occur in terms of how social identities are constructed and reproduced in traces of an organization’s past. Additionally, the disruption of historical time does not necessitate a decoupling from a chronological analysis (i.e. beginning at an organization’s founding and moving chronologically forward). Instead, the linear representation of that chronology is problematized. However, it is still possible to frame an analysis over or through some time period or chronology.

In summary, time must be challenged as an apolitical and neutral concept and instead placed in a discursive frame (Ermarth, 2011). For the purposes of doing intersectional history, how researchers examine their traces over time will be dependent on many factors; however, time as a historical linear representation of a past reality should be destabilized. We suggest that ultimately an intersectional history analysis should engage over periods of
time through which the social construction of identities in extant traces can be surfaced and their reproduction considered in connection with organizational practices.

These four tents of intersectional history are meant to provide a guiding philosophical framework through which we envision intersectional history work emerging. While we hope that intersectional history is interpreted and applied in multiple and heterodox ways, we also suggest that intersectional history requires a commitment to these four tenets. Critique, reflexivity, power and time, as we discuss these constructs above, play an important role in positioning intersectional history as a form of analysis that can provide important insight into intersectional identities and the reproduction of oppression within organizations over time.

**Intersectional history as method**

We now turn to the guidelines for doing intersectional history, with the caveat that these guidelines are intentionally broad. While we emphasize the philosophical position of intersectional history as described above, we suggest that intersectional history may take many forms in praxis. We suggest then that four key questions may help guide an intersectional analysis: what is studied, who is present/absent, how is it studied and when is it studied. We will discuss these guiding questions before diving into our own example to help demonstrate how intersectional history might be usefully operationalized.

**What is studied?**

Intersectional history involves choices about the traces of the past. Those conducting intersectional history work must determine which traces to rely on, or interrogate, for their work. Depending on the research, these traces may be primarily archival sources in the classic sense (i.e. a specifically collected and housed set of materials such as company documents) and of the broader Foucauldian sense of spaces where certain discursive rules are produced, such as collections of newspaper accounts of social life (Mills and Helms Mills, 2011; Rostis, 2015).

**Who is present/absent?**

Once a researcher has identified their traces, we suggest that important questions arise around who is present and who is absent. By asking questions about who is included in the traces, who wrote them, who popularized them and who preserved them, together with questions about who is absent, who is silent and who is demeaned, it allows one to reassemble and identify the features of intersectionality within the context of organizations. By asking who, we are asking questions about power, privilege and marginality. We can see who is privileged in the traces of the past and who is marginalized and what notions of race, gender, age, class or other socially constructed categories this marginalization may be based on. By examining the processes of power through questions centered on who is privileged, and who is marginalized, it is possible to make novel interpretations from traces previously taken for granted.

**How is it studied?**

While we keep the specifics of how to surface intersectionality through traces of the past purposely vague to avoid privileging a single way of doing intersectional history, we do suggest that a good place to start is through a close reading of the traces. Through this careful examination, we suggest that researchers take note of how different individuals or groups, in particular those at less-privileged intersections of gender, race, age and class are
portrayed in different traces over time. Highlighting themes surrounding the portrayal of different groups over time, or how they are incorporated or removed from things such as company documents or histories, can provide insight. Most importantly, we contest that it is crucial through this process to challenge the fixed nature of identity categories. A trace may mention women, but what notions of women are communicated through this mention? How is the idea of, for example, women at work, being constructed through the trace? How does this change, over time? Destabilizing the notion that categories of identity are fixed is fundamental to an intersectional history because it allows us to explore how certain notions of who is important to the organization’s success become engrained in organizations over time (Mills, 2010).

When is it studied?
We include another mention of time in this section on operationalizing intersectional history. When reviewing traces of the past for the ways in which we can surface intersectionality over time, it is important to consider the time the trace was developed as political. It is also important to consider context. We can expect certain discriminatory practices by certain people from certain time periods, for example. However, how those discriminatory practices or characterizations change over time provides us with important information about how overlapping systems of oppression based on identity (Hill Collins, 2000) get reproduced in various and lasting, if less overt ways. For example, by examining when the trace was produced, and what it preserves, it may be possible to understand why certain stories of an individual inhabiting a marginalized intersectional space may be subjugated in something like an organization’s origin story (Mills and Helms Mills, 2018).

These four broad questions are intended to help guide an intersectional history analysis. However, they are not intended to be prescriptive, as we suggest that intersectional history may take a variety of forms. In the next section, we move to our example of intersectional history using the case of Qantas Airways. In our example, we will identify the ways in which the guiding questions have helped surface the key insights of our intersectional analysis.

Qantas rising: an example of intersectional history
In this section, we provide a working example of what intersectional history may look like in practice. We conduct an analysis of *Qantas Rising*, an early history of Australian airline Qantas Airways by its Cofounder Sir Hudson Fysh (Fysh, 1966). *Qantas Rising* is the first of three books written by Fysh on the history of Qantas, and in this book Fysh focused on the early founding years of the organization (1920-1934). Our intersectional history analysis of this text seeks to surface how Fysh wrote about categories of people involved in the early years of Qantas. We examine how categories of people are constructed and discussed and which categories of people are thereby privileged, marginalized and/or ignored in the process.

We use Fysh’s account of Qantas for several reasons. First, Fysh was a powerful actor at Qantas, and his account of the organization’s early years has endured as a dominant narrative of the company’s history. For example, details shared by Fysh in *Qantas Rising* are reproduced on the official history section of the company website (The Qantas Story, 2019). Because Fysh was a powerful and founding member of the organization, his accounts of the past have been reproduced and possibly taken for granted as a factual version. *Qantas Rising* has remained in print for years, which suggests that people are still reading this version of the past. What was written then, by Fysh, about the founding years of Qantas is being reconstructed now through current readers as the story of Qantas. What we do by
engaging with this text is to interrogate Fysh’s version of the past, tracing the privileged and the marginalized in his story of the organization as these relationships evolve and endure over time. In this way, we can begin to understand not only that Fysh’s version of the history of Qantas is but one version, but also that an intersectional lens of those featured, or not featured in Fysh’s histories, can reveal stories of the past that have remained obscure.

Our method for this example follows closely what we have outlined above as a method for intersectional history. The what that is studied is *Qantas Rising*. We each read this text multiple times and conducted a close and careful reading during which we made note of any mentions of race, gender, age, class, ability and other identity features to understand what categories of people were presented in the text. This is the who that is studied: through our intersectional focus on identity categories, we were able to draw insight into who was present and who was absent in the text. We focus in particular on the role of Australian Aboriginals as they are portrayed in Fysh’s text and we noted how these individuals are constructed in the story of Qantas. We considered how Fysh’s (1966) constructions are laden with dynamics of marginalization and privilege. We also examined how the characterizations of Australian Aboriginals changed over time in the text, taking a linear approach. We begin our analysis with the representations during the early years of Qantas and follow the changes over subsequent years. This is the when.

Surfacing these changes through the texts was an iterative and flexible process, which allowed us to eventually facilitate the emergence of plausible, intersectional themes. Throughout this process, we attempt to be transparent about our concern with critique, our commitment to reflexivity, our centering of power and our consideration of time.

**Australian Aboriginals**

Australian Aboriginals are regularly mentioned in *Qantas Rising* (Fysh, 1966). They are one of the primary categories of people who appeared in the text, which is somewhat surprising given their status in Australia in the first half of the twentieth century (Bashford and Macintyre, 2013). Australian Aboriginals were not employed by Qantas until well into the post-World War II era. Even in the early 1990s, Qantas’ internal newsletter carried stories of the recent employment of Australian Aboriginals in 1988 and shared how the organization was “taking a marketing lead” by employing “13 young Aborigines on an engineering pre-apprenticeship course” (Qantas Airways, 1991). It is perhaps unexpected then, that Australian Aboriginals were so present in Fysh’s (1966) book about the first three decades of the twentieth century. We suggest that Fysh wrote about Australian Aboriginals as foil for the white and imperial founders of Qantas, who represented the rugged, masculinist modernization of Australia. For example, Fysh (1966) often constructed Australian Aboriginals as clear binary opposites of ideal individuals of European descent. Early in *Qantas Rising*, Fysh writes about his lineage and provides the first contrast between Europeans and Australian Aboriginals following a description of the pioneering spirit and paternalist religious values of Henry Reed, Fysh’s grandfather. “In the spring of 1835 Henry Reed went over to the new settlement with the idea of saving the natives...[from extermination]” (Fysh, 1966, p. 5). Here, Fysh demonstrates a colonial sensibility of paternalism, which casts the European as the savior and the Aboriginal as a weak person in need of saving.

Fysh’s history continued with a description of warfare, through which we gain insights into the notion of white, Australian manhood. World War I marks “the appearance of young Australia and the first glimmerings of a virile new country on the scene of world affairs” (Fysh, 1966, p. 25). The process of the War is said to have produced – “out of the great attributes of courage, patriotism, comradeship and discipline – personal and natural virility”
These attributes were seen as essential to the building of an airline system that would play a part in linking the “the white population” of Australia (p. 68) and, in the process, overcoming dangers posed by the non-white Australian Aboriginals. Australian Aboriginals are portrayed primarily as dangerous, with violence being a possible outcome of interactions between whites and Australian Aboriginals. For example, Fysh and Qantas Cofounder Paul McGinness are warned off of a land survey for possible air routes, being told “the white population was non-existent” and “the blacks are bad” (p. 68). Mention is also made of an Australian Aboriginal outlaw known as “murdering Tommy” (p. 68). However, Fysh and McGinness fearlessly continued on with their survey, despite the risks of danger, which positioned them as white men, in a heroic way. They faced the danger to fulfill the quest of providing a way to connect the white population of this remote area with others. The danger of Australian Aboriginals is highly present in the text, such as in this example:

After being regaled with tales of the aborigines and of bad characters such as Murdering Tommy, the local aboriginal outlaw, we ended our first day [...] Our next day’s run was to Wollorgorang station [...] here again we were regaled by the manager with tales of early fights with the aborigines whose love of spearing cattle always got them in trouble with the station people. We found the sturdy station spear-proof. (p. 74)

Here we see that Australian Aboriginals are characterized as bad characters, outlaws and fighters. Fysh highlighted that the dangers were so bad, the station was fortified against attack. Just after these representations, however, Fysh wrote that Australian Aboriginals “helped” at the station, with both women and men being employed in some fashion for labor – whether paid or unpaid it is not clear from Fysh’s text (p. 74). The threat of Australian Aboriginals as dangerous was emphasized over the casual discussion of their servitude at the station.

Despite the emphasis on danger, Australian Aboriginals are also made out to be less intelligent and useless by Fysh, despite the fact that Fysh and McGinness relied several times on the help of Australian Aboriginals during their land survey (Fysh, 1966). Instead of acknowledging the help provided by them, Fysh undermined their role in helping by making fun of their English speech and their eagerness for tobacco. For example:

Here also we met royalty in the form of an old aboriginal smoking a pipe made from a piece of bamboo. He announced, “Me kingy alonga big fellow water. Me Kingy Paringi, plenty big fellow.” We soon fixed “Kingy” up with a supply of tucker and tobacco [...]”. (p. 78)

Fysh seems to suggest that despite the threat of aboriginals as dangerous, they can be easily subjugated by the intelligence of the white man. He also does not acknowledge the fact that he and McGinness relied on their help several times:

Here again the local aborigines were pressed into service in return for a few sticks of tobacco and some tea, and after five hefty natives had pushed us through the sand, they were put to work cutting away this bank. By evening the job was done, the whole thing being treated as great joke, and the lubras and their piccaninnies looking on [...]”. (p. 82).

Through these examples, we can see that Australian Aboriginals, being non-white, are seen as lower in a socially-constructed racial hierarchy at this time. While they feature in Fysh’s account of the past, they are criminals, unintelligent, uneducated, non-white – they are other in every way to those who found and run Qantas successfully, and therefore their role in the organization’s success is completely erased by Fysh (1966, 1968, 1970). And yet, they are included in Qantas Rising (Fysh, 1966) – for what purpose, we can only speculate, but it seems likely that they are featured as a way to show the adversity that faced Fysh and his cofounders as they struggled to succeed with the founding of Qantas.
What should be noted as we consider the construction of Australian Aboriginals by Fysh is that Fysh wrote and published *Qantas Rising* book 50 years after the fact, at a time when attitudes and treatment of Australian Aboriginals in Australia had begun to change fairly significantly (Cowlishaw, 2004). Fysh wrote retrospectively about the role of Australian Aboriginals in relation to Qantas’ early years (Fysh, 1966), but he does not challenge or apologize for his characterization of Australian Aboriginals whatsoever. Fysh instead draws on various derogatory notions to paint a picture of the ideal typical “Aboriginal” of the time. These include racial characteristics of color (“Bludger Bob, a big black fellow, Fysh, 1966, p. 75); language use (“we heard an aboriginal in his queer lingo,” p. 75); work ethic (“the aborigines being worse than useless for heavy work,” p. 84); gender relations (“the work being done by black gins while the lazy work-shy bucks looked on,” p. 86); and the treatment of Australian Aboriginal women by their menfolk (pp. 216-217). Fysh’s (1966) construction of Australian Aboriginals positioned them as unimportant in the story of Qantas. However, by interrogating some of the passages above, it is possible to see that Australian Aboriginals were interacting with the founders of Qantas and the organization in its earliest years. These insights provide an alternative version of the history Fysh wrote.

**Australian Aboriginal women**

To this point, we have referred to Australian Aboriginals in a collective sense. However, female Australian Aboriginals, at the precarious intersection of race and gender, are written about as even less significant than male Australian Aboriginals – who are primarily the dangerous and the criminal. Because female Australian Aboriginals do not carry the same threat of violence, perhaps, they are debased even further in *Qantas Rising* (Fysh, 1966). Fysh called Australian Aboriginal women “lubras” (Fysh, 1966, p. 82), a racially offensive term. He also called them black gins in several places (p. 86), another derogatory term (Evans, 1999). While it may be possible to place Fysh’s terminology into the context of the officers working with Australian Aboriginals in the Northern Territories were forbidden to use the term “lubra” in 1963 (Conor, 2013). There was at least the beginning of changing attitudes toward racism against Australian Aboriginals when Fysh published his book; however, in *Qantas Rising* (Fysh, 1966), he freely used racially charged terminology, which serves to place Australian Aboriginals, and Australian Aboriginal women in particular, in a marginalized position in the story of Qantas.

In *Qantas Rising*, Australian Aboriginal women are often seen doing hard labor, such as helping to push Fysh and McGinness’ car: “Another character at Wollgorang was Bludger Bob, a big black fellow who with several gins had helped to push us out of the creek bed just short of the station” (Fysh, 1966, p. 75). Again, although this help is mentioned, it is not made significant. We also see that although these are Australian Aboriginal women, they are seen as suitable for heavy and hard labor in a way that white women would not be (Fysh, 1966, p. 86). They are female, but they are not feminine in the way of white women, such as Fysh’s mother and his wife, who are both featured prominently and femininely in the text. Instead, there is a different notion of woman which is particular to being Australian Aboriginal, female and colonized. We choose here to highlight one place where Australian Aboriginal women appeared in the text, the building of “North Australia’s first cleared aerodrome” (p. 86). Fysh describes that McGinness, needing an aerodrome cleared as part of their land survey work, had Australian Aboriginals do the work:

At Newcastle Waters [McGinness] made history by getting work started on North Australia’s first cleared aerodrome, the work being done by black gins while the lazy work-shy bucks looked on. The payment was 2 bags of flour, 20 yards of Turkey red material, and 24 sticks of tobacco […] (p. 86).
Fysh focused on McGinness as the history-maker while using racist language to demean the Australian Aboriginal women actually doing the work. Again, Fysh seemed intent on stating the terms of the contract, perhaps to underscore just how little these unintelligent Australian Aboriginals would work for (Fysh, 1966). Once we begin to unpack this passage however, we can see the important role that Australian Aboriginal women played in this scene, and the way in which Fysh, intentionally or not, excludes their importance from the story of Qantas.

Overall, throughout Fysh’s (1966) history Qantas Rising, we can see that Australian Aboriginal men and women were included in the story of Qantas and its founders; however, the nature of this inclusion is derogatory and demeaning. The construction of the term “aboriginal” by Fysh centered on themes such as dangerous, criminal, lazy and stupid, and there is little acknowledgement of the ways in which Australian Aboriginals played important roles in the story. We also note that they are kept external to the organization: we are left unsure what, if any, official role Australian Aboriginals played within the organization as there is no record that we can find of their employment with the organization in this era. However, Fysh, (1966) includes Australian Aboriginals in the story of Qantas’ founding by continually referring to their interactions with the organization. Australian Aboriginal men occupied a particular intersection of race, gender and colonized, which, while making them less than a white man, made them more powerful than an Australian Aboriginal woman, by Fysh’s account. Australian Aboriginal women, as non-white, non-male and colonized, were either sexualized through mentions of their nudity (p. 78), seen as free labor (p. 75; p. 86), or even killed, as seen in a story Fysh includes in which an Australian Aboriginal man beats his wife so badly she dies. When a doctor comes to treat her, Fysh includes a description of the smell she emanates – despite her suffering, she was made an object of ridicule (pp. 216-217).

Our focus in this example is Fysh’s construction of Australian Aboriginals in Qantas Rising. However, if we briefly consider the second book in the trilogy, we can provide some insight into how the construction of Australian Aboriginals as a category of people changes over time in Fysh’s version of history. The second book, Qantas at War, encompasses the years from 1934 to 1945 (Fysh, 1968). During this time, Qantas headquarters had moved to Brisbane, and throughout the text, there is a marked decrease in the number of mentions of Australian Aboriginals. As Qantas expanded and grew to an international airline, Fysh’s recorded interactions with Australian Aboriginals seemed to decline. We suggest that as an external force to be reckoned with, Australian Aboriginals become less significant as the airline moved from the outback to the city, and therefore they became more invisible in Qantas at War. One significant mention of Australian Aboriginals in Qantas at War we suggest showed the importance of Australian Aboriginals to the story of Qantas and reflects how this importance has been left largely unacknowledged. Fysh described how a pilot, lost along the Australian coast, made a forced landing, “hopelessly lost” with “only one hour’s petrol left” (Fysh, 1968, p. 12):

Captain Wilson then chose a high headland area for a forced landing, which he pulled off with great skill. But where were they? Some Australian aborigines came up and enlightened them (p. 12).

This is reminiscent of the help provided by Australian Aboriginals in the earlier years of Qantas, when they would often be the only witnesses to remote crashes and forced landings and would arrive on site to help restore the aircraft to the air (Fysh, 1966). As Qantas expanded to an international airline, however, these sorts of stories stop being told. Instead, Fysh focuses on the indigenous populations of other countries, such as New Guinea and the...
East Indies. He described these populations in exotic terms, focusing on their dress and customs, as well as their wonderment at seeing aeroplanes (Fysh, 1968). Against this new, international otherness, Australian Aboriginals seem to fade in the story of Qantas, and their role in the success of the organization, particularly in its early years, is minimized and ignored by the authoritative account of Fysh (1966, 1968). Where Australian Aboriginals appeared was photographs included in the text. Here there is evidence that non-white males worked in some capacity for Qantas throughout this era. For example, we can see they acted as rowers from flying boats to ports at Darwin (Fysh, 1968, p. 69). Although it appeared that Australian Aboriginals were working for the company, they were not acknowledged or discussed. Their position as non-white (Australian Aboriginal), colonized and lower-class made them apparently unimportant to the history of Qantas, as told by Fysh. Similarly, the female Australian Aboriginal were neither written about nor pictured in the text. Altogether, the Australian Aboriginals are erased from the story of Qantas when they no longer provide apparent exotic and dangerous fodder against which to hail the success of the organization (Fysh, 1968, 1970). However, our intersectional history analysis has briefly shown that Australian Aboriginals were present, and alternative versions of the past that interrogate Fysh's dominant account of Qantas can begin to surface their presence.

This analysis has attempted to provide one path of the many roads we feel intersectional history may take. We start our analysis with our four guiding questions about what, who, how and when and use these guiding questions to develop insights about how Fysh constructed Australian Aboriginals as a category of people. By focusing on Fysh's construction of Australian Aboriginals, we are able to surface intersectional, identity-based processes of privilege and marginalization. We suggest that by focusing on intersectionality in our analysis, we have destabilized Fysh's dominant historical account and presented plausible alternatives. We also suggest that the construction of Australian Aboriginals by Fysh has served to reinforce a status quo that resulted in the contribution of Australian Aboriginals to Qantas in its first 30 years of operation being made and kept invisible.

Although our focus in this paper was on Australian Aboriginals, it is important to note that intersectional history is not solely a postcolonial undertaking, and we do not suggest that what we have done could be achieved through a postcolonial lens. Instead, intersectional history challenges the nature of identity categories as they are constructed and reproduced through traces of the past and how these categories overlap in systems of oppression (Hill Collins, 2000). These identity categories are neither fixed nor prescriptive. Intersectional history may consider any categories of identity, including but absolutely not limited to race, gender, ethnicity, age, class, sexual orientation, ability and many other possible identity points (Ruel et al., 2018). Intersectional history may overlap with postcolonial thought depending on the socially constructed categories of people under investigation; however, the broad potential for categories of identity means that intersectional history is not only appropriate for studying those who have been oppressed by colonial regimes.

We also contend that intersectional history is markedly different from other existing methods, such as critical discourse analysis and narrative analysis. Although the focus on stories, language and power may be familiar to readers who engage in these methods, we suggest that intersectional history offers a way to examine specifically how categories of identity are constructed and reproduced in traces of the past while committing researchers to a method that emphasizes critiquing, destabilizing and providing alternative versions of hegemonic accounts of those pasts. We are attempting to intersectionalize the study of the past in a way that specifically brings in the social construction of identities, language and power through the useful theorizing of intersectional work (Hill Collins, 2000, 2017).
Conclusion
This paper has presented our envisioned method of intersectional history. We see the method of intersectional history as having value for those engaged with the study of the past, in particular those who wish to surface the stories and experiences of marginalized groups over time. By applying the method of intersectional history, the status quo enforced by dominant accounts of the past can begin to be destabilized. Destabilizing the status quo is an important aim of intersectionality (Hill Collins and Bilge, 2016). Additionally, we suggest that intersectionality has been lacking a consideration of the past and that studying intersectionality over time using our method of intersectional history can reveal novel insights about the social construction of marginalized identities in historical accounts. Intersectional history, we suggest, is focused on critique, is committed to reflexivity, centers power and considers time. In our example application of intersectional history, we show how asking questions about who is included in what traces of the past, and how they are characterized and constructed based on identity categories such as gender, race and class, can guide an intersectional history analysis. In our Qantas example, we show how the inclusion of Australian Aboriginals in the organization’s early history portrayed Australian Aboriginals as negative (Fysh, 1966) and served to marginalize their role in the success of the organization. We suggest that Fysh’s authoritative historical account of the organization, which is largely derogatory and dismissive toward Australian Aboriginals, has served to continuously obscure their role in the organization (Fysh, 1966, 1968; Shaffner et al., 2017). The power of historical accounts as meta discourses cannot be underestimated.

We feel that intersectional history has the potential to be applied in much more depth and breadth across MOH. Using intersectionality to explore the treatment of marginalized groups in organizations over time can plausibly help revise status-quo stories of the organizations’ pasts, such as we have done in our Qantas example. We also feel that intersectional histories of organizations can be used to uncover long-ignored stories and contributions of those who have traditionally been kept absent from authoritative histories of organizations. These investigations and interrogations of the taken-for-granted may help us understand features of discrimination over time in organizations and how systemic patterns of oppression based on multiple identity factors such as race, gender, age and class become engrained and enduring in organizational accounts of the past.

Notes
1. We are grateful to an anonymous reviewer for directing us to Silverstein et al. (2017) and the Australian Women’s History Network.
2. A racist term that had various derogatory meanings, including reference to Aboriginal women who were used for sex by white males (Evans, 1999).

References


Evans, R. (1999), Fighting Words: Writing about Race, University of Queensland Press, Brisbane.


Fysh, W.H. (1968), Qantas at War, Angus and Robertson, Sydney.


Hooks, b. (1981), Ain’t I a Woman: Black Women and Feminism, South End Press, Boston, MA.


Further reading


Corresponding author
Ellen C. Shaffner can be contacted at: ellen.shaffner@smu.ca

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Gendering multi-voiced histories of the North American space industry: the GMRD White women

Stefanie Ruel
Department of Management, John Molson School of Business, Concordia University, Montreal, Quebec, Canada

Albert J. Mills
Department of Management, Saint Mary’s University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada and Department of Business, Ita-Suomen yliopisto Yhteiskuntatieteiden ja kauppatieteiden tiedekunta, Kuopio, Finland, and

Jean Helms Mills
Department of Management, Saint Mary’s University, Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada and Jyväskylä School of Business and Economics, University of Jyväskylä, Jyväskylä, Finland

Abstract

Purpose – The authors focus on “writing women into ‘history’” in this study, embracing the notion of cisgender and ethnicity in relation to the “historic turn”. As such, the authors bring forward the stories of the US Pan American Airway’s Guided Missile Range Division (GMRD) and the White women who worked there. The authors ask what has a Cold War US missile division to tell us about present and future gendered relationships in the North American space industry.

Design/methodology/approach – The authors apply Foucault’s technology of lamination, a form of critical discourse analysis, to both narrative texts and photographic images in the GMRD’s in-house newsletter, the Clipper, dating from 1964 until the end of 1967. They meld an autoethnography to this technique, providing space for the first author to share her experiences within the contemporary space industry in relation to the GMRD White women experiences.

Findings – The authors surface, in applying this combined methodology, a story about a White women’s historical, present and future cisgender social reality in the North American space industry. They are contributing then to a multi-voiced, cisgender/ethnic “historic turn” that, to date, is focused on White men alone in the US race to the moon.

Social implications – The social implication of this study lies in challenging perceptions of the masculinist-gendering of the past by bringing forward tales of, and by, women. This study also brings a White woman’s voice forward, within a contemporary North American space industry organization.

Originality/value – The authors are making a three-fold contribution to this special issue, and to an understandings of gendered/ethnic multi-voiced histories. The authors untangle the mid-Cold War phase from the essentialized Cold War era. They recreate multi-voiced histories of White women within the North American space industry while adding an important contemporary voice. They also present a novel methodology that combines the technology of lamination with autoethnography, to provide a gateway to recognizing the impact of multi-voiced histories onto contemporary and future gendered/ethnic relationships.

Keywords Autoethnography, Cold War, Critical discourse analysis, Lamination, North American space industry

Paper type Research paper

The authors wish to thank the editors of this special issue and the anonymous reviewers who provided valuable insights throughout the process.
The North American space industry has significant and important histories with respect to the race to the moon (e.g., Chaikin, 2007; De Groot, 2006; Launius, 2005, 2007). This race, primarily run by the US and the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR), sees a variety of events and experiences, along with political posturing, within the uncharted space dimension (Hartt et al., 2009; Logsdon, 2007). In these refined events and discourses, the launch in 1957 of the Russian Sputnik satellite, aboard a Soviet R-7 intercontinental ballistic missile, is often characterized as a key turning point (Launius, 2007) with respect to the “awakening” of the competitive, militarization of space (Maier, 1997). We agree that Sputnik is one of a number of tangible symbols with respect to the impending “Soviet threat” (Hartt et al., 2009, p. 236) to the US and its interests. However, while the launch of Sputnik provides an ideological context of sorts (Durepos et al., 2019) with which to frame our understanding of Cold War histories, there needs to be a finer-grained approach to untangling the ambiguities of the North American space histories, beyond a consideration of such a contingency (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004).

Some authors suggest, in their respective attempts to introduce a finer-grain, the presence of an early Cold War, from 1945 to 1965, and a late Cold War era beginning in 1969 (e.g., Logsdon, 2007; McLaren et al., 2009). These early and late clock-based framings to the Cold War are the subject of a number of studies (e.g., Engelhardt, 2007; Hartt et al., 2009; Logsdon, 2007; McDougall, 1985; Robin, 2001). We argue that the mid-Cold War phase, and its particular ideologies, needs to be the teased out from the early Cold War framing. The ideologies surrounding the mid-Cold War phase should include not only the technological advances of space militarization but should also include the North American space industry’s White women and the roles they fulfilled, along with the discourses that surrounded them. Fundamentally, we believe that the race to the moon is not “just” a story about the pioneering White men (McQuaid, 2007), but that there were many individuals involved in this race who were and continue to be hidden in the ambiguities of histories.

We are concerned in this study then with surfacing the larger context of meanings in discourses (Saleebey, 1994) with respect to cisgender White women’s historical and contemporary subjection experiences in the North American space industry. Discourses are sets of statements and practices that bring an object or set of objects into being (Parker, 1992). As for cisgender[1] White[2] women, feminist (new) historicism tells us that “history” is a tale of many voices” (Newton, 2013, p. 152), but tales of, and/or by, cisgender women within the North American space industry are few and far between (e.g. Ruel, 2018; Sage, 2009), and those of Black cisgender women even less so (e.g. McQuaid, 2007; Ruel et al., 2018; Shetterly, 2016). Many-voiced histories hold “inherent ambiguity” (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004, p. 331), just as a White or Black cisgender woman can be characterized as having fluid, ever-changing identities[3] (Aikau et al., 2003; McKibbin et al., 2015) in these riven histories. Similarly, the cisgender woman identity, that is socially constructed and is interdependent with her other identity categories (Collins and Bilge, 2016), encompasses the feminine/femininities experiences[4] within a particular context (Butler, 1990). The fluid and unstable nature of these categorizations of individuals relies on the idea of social construction/reconstruction via discourses and her subjection (Butler, 1990; Foucault, 1978). The cisgender White women’s subjection refers to particular, historically located disciplinary processes which enable us to consider ourselves as individuals and which constrain us from thinking otherwise (McHoul and Grace, 2007). This subjection can be seen in various evidentiary discursive processes, such as in the privileged right to speak during an interview, or in photographs and accompanying descriptive narrative texts that positions an individual below another.

In surfacing the larger context of meanings with respect to the North American space industry, we look to the White women’s experiences and social interactions in the US Pan American (Pan Am) Airway’s Guided Missile Range Division (GMRD). Pan Am was
responsible for many activities within the various phases of the Cold War, including building Cape Canaveral in 1953[5] (Turner, 1976). The airline provided not only the infrastructure, and support services, for the Cape’s missile range, but also established and maintained various missile test ranges scattered globally to support Cold War activities. These missile test ranges collectively became known as the GMRD (Turner, 1976). At its peak, there were 7,000 people employed in this organization, mostly White men (Hartt et al., 2009). While the White men of the GMRD fulfilled different roles, from the scientific to the blue-collar/laborer, the White women of the GMRD were, in the majority, responsible for administrative and supportive roles (Dye and Mills, 2012). Black women were also present in Pan Am and in the GMRD; they held mostly blue-collar positions in various installations across the world[6] (Hartt et al., 2009).

Creating a finer grain to the North American space histories along with melding multi-voiced, ambiguous histories in this industry is important when we consider the influences on the present and future gendered relations in this particular industry. As such, we untangle the mid-Cold War phase from the early Cold War phase, integrating cisgender and ethnicity within a “historic turn” (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004). We also provide space for the first author, a former Life Sciences Mission Manager within the Canadian space industry, to add her voice to this “historic turn”. We integrate the GMRD White women stories with the first author’s tales in such a way to surface how their states of being and of becoming could answer our research question: What has a Cold War US missile division to tell us about present and future gendered relationships in the North American space industry?

In this postmodern archival study (Mills and Helms Mills, 2018), we look at discourses within the GMRD Clipper newsletter, a monthly Pan AM glossy in-house newsletter for employees and for families of employees. The GMRD Clipper newsletters[7], from 1964 to the end of 1967, are analyzed using a critical discourse analysis (CDA) based on Foucault’s technology of lamination (McHoul and Grace, 2007). We specifically explore narratives and photographic images, found within the Clipper, in such a way to surface the discursive reproduction of GMRD White women. We also present the first author’s contemporary experiences, within the Canadian space industry, framing her experiences within an autoethnography (Denzin, 2006; Ellis, 2004). We move to first-person accounts, embracing the “I” of the present, in such a way to study the influences of these multi-voiced histories on the present and on the future.

We are making a three-fold contribution to this special issue and to our understandings of gendered/ethnic multi-voiced histories. We untangle the mid-Cold War phase from the essentialized Cold War era. We recreate multi-voiced histories of White women within the North American space industry, during the mid-Cold War phase while adding an important contemporary voice to the debates surrounding “contentious”, “ambiguous” histories (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004; Durepos and Mills, 2012). We also present a novel methodology that combines the technology of lamination with autoethnography, to provide a gateway to recognizing the impact of multi-voiced histories onto contemporary and future gendered/ethnic relationships.

We begin by presenting the Cold War era in such a way to situate the reader and to tease out the mid-Cold War phase. We then introduce the reader to the GMRD organization. The theoretical framework of Foucault’s notions of discourses and of subjection, within the lens of poststructural feminism, are then presented. We move to our methodology, spending considerable time in outlining our approach and how to use it, as one of our three contributions. We present the findings and results of our application of Foucault’s technique of lamination to archival data. The discussion section integrates in the first author’s autoethnography, moving the reader from the third-person to a first-person account, weaving the laminated fragments of GMRD’s White women into these accounts. In the
process of presenting the first author’s autoethnography, she provides one possible answer to our research question. We conclude with a summary of this work’s contributions.

Untangling the Cold War era
Orwell would, in 1945, foreshadow an era by:

[...] looking at the world as a whole, the drift for many decades has been not towards anarchy but towards the reimposition [sic] of slavery. We may be heading not for general breakdown but for an epoch as horribly stable as the slave empires of antiquity. James Burnham’s theory has been much discussed, but few people have yet considered its ideological implications — that is, the kind of world-view, the kind of beliefs, and the social structure that would probably prevail in a state which was at once unconquerable and in a permanent state of ‘cold war’ with its neighbors (Orwell, 1945).

This Orwellian ideology with its stable slave empires, experienced during the post-Second World War between the US and the USSR, underscores how each neighbor was deemed unconquerable in the race to space. The Orwellian “cold war”, a measure of who would “win” this race, laid the groundwork for what is now widely acknowledged as an unwinnable contest.

Orwell’s slave empires and “cold war” reflects an unprecedented expansion in military capabilities, from the US and the USSR. Specifically, physical structures mirror these respective countries capabilities, establishing a world-view of the importance of being “first”. These structures include ballistic missiles, the construction of the Berlin Wall, war actions in the “third world” Southeast Asian war and the Cuban missile crisis, just to name a few (Chaikin, 2007; Launius, 2007). The Orwellian beliefs are represented in the creation of organizations and accompanying legislations and policies that protect the US and its interests. These organizations include the establishment of the US Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), the National Aeronautics and Space Agency (NASA) and the US Air Force (Hartt et al., 2009). The US Air Force in partnership with NASA relied on commercial entities, such as Pan Am, to further support these beliefs when it came to space and being pioneers in this new dimension. Social structures, reflected in important political rhetorics such as the protection of the “Free World” and of “free peoples” (Robin, 2001), match the establishment and proliferation of these physical structures and beliefs. This then becomes a framework of sorts to recognize historical contingencies as reified elements representing the Cold War.

The North American space industry has significant and ambiguous histories during this Cold War era. Attempts to categorize this Cold War era, as we introduced earlier, result in various stable, time-dependent phases. For example, one Cold War phase, from 1945 to 1965, is recognized by some as the early Cold War period (McLaren et al., 2009). This time period is extensive, however, with respect to turning points (Launius, 2007). These turning points include the end of Second World War, the “all-pervasive Cold War” (McQuaid, 2007, p. 408) becoming established in societal structures and beliefs, the death of Stalin and the vacuum created by his death in space knowledge, President Eisenhower’s attempts to control spending on ballistic missile development and his inability to do so, the “surprise” launch of Sputnik, the establishment of NASA, President Kennedy taking office and his lack of knowledge about space, the flight of Yuri Gagarin, John Glenn orbiting earth, President Kennedy’s pronouncement about sending men to the moon, the launch of the first US and Canadian satellites, just to name a few (Jelly, 1988; Launius, 2007; Logsdon, 2007; McDougall, 1985; Ruel, 2019). These turning points, and the larger context of meanings surrounding them, become overwhelming to study, and so we set out to untangle this phase.

This treatment of the early Cold War surfaces several concerns for us. We can characterize this phase as the beginning of the militarization of space that is supported by the political arm (McDougall, 1985). As such, if we rely on technology innovations to define this early phase
(Peoples, 2008), the development, testing, launch and use of Earth observation satellites, such as the Canadian Alouette I in 1962 (Godefroy, 2017; Ruel, 2019) and the USSR’s scientifically planned [8] and subsequent launch of Sputnik in 1957 (Jelly, 1988; Peoples, 2008), could be one central ideology. The construction and proliferation of ballistic missiles and rockets could be another central ideology (Godefroy, 2017; Jelly, 1988; Launius, 2007). Layering the military-based science and engineering work, such as studying the ionosphere, is another important consideration. The social reality of women is also an important ideology of this phase. Notably, when we reflect on cisgender/ethnicity, we find that we must look at the US Food and Drug Administration (FDA) approval of the use of the birth control pill (Burrows, 1998). This approval heralds the arrival of important changes for women in US society and in the role they play in a workforce (The Canadian Press, 2010) that is focused on “winning” the race to militarize space. We are then reflexively building ambiguous histories (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004) of the early Cold War phase into something that is bounded by technologies, science achievements and by societal considerations with respect to cisgender White women.

We are cautious in this framing to the early Cold War phase, as we do not wish to reify this phase into solid pronouncements of “facts” and “truths”. Our focus in this work is not on defining this early phase extensively. We are more interested in untangling the mid-Cold War phase from this early phase, moving away from a focus on Sputnik as THE event that defines the militarization and then the eventual exploration of space. We believe that this mid-Cold War phase needs to be teased out from the solid pronouncements of the early Cold War and from reification of “all-pervasive” events and technologies.

From approximately[9] 1963, where “strategy, diplomacy, and bureaucratic politics all converged to make 1963 the first great turning point in the US military space program” (McDougall, 1985, p. 341), we draw inspiration to recreate fragments of multi-voiced histories (Foucault, 1969, 1980; McHoul and Grace, 2007) with respect to the mid-Cold War phase. While some argue (e.g. Launius, 2007) that President Kennedy’s assassination, in late 1963, and his particular discourses led a nation to the successful moon landing in 1969, we contextualize 1963 across an understanding of change ideologies as opposed to reified actions and decisions. This idea of change extends to approximately 1968, with President Nixon’s arrival in office and the assassination of Robert Kennedy and Martin Luther King Jr. (Whitaker and Hewitt, 2003). We “see”, in this process of untangling and building fragments, a contrast start to emerge with the early Cold War phase and its solid pronouncements; that is, that the larger context of meanings for the mid-Cold War phase is significantly diverse and changing, when we compare it to the early Cold War phase (McLaren et al., 2009).

This mid-Cold War phase is remarkable for its fluidity and change, across various dimensions. This includes the movement toward an end to the Cuban Missile Crisis, and the eventual installation of a “hot line” between US President Kennedy and Russian President Khrushchev (Carew, 2018). This “line” notably, opens the door to a practice of “open” communication between these two political figures. By 1968, the meaning-making surrounding the US and its presence in the Vietnam War (Bates, 1996) and important racial tensions in the US itself (Walsh, 2017) signal a boundary of sorts for these fragments.

This mid-Cold War phase also sees discourses centered on a “push for equal social and political opportunity” (McQuaid, 2007, p. 408). The establishment of legislation, such as the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission and National Organization for Women (Freedman, 2002), are exciting aspects of this phase. These legislations signal an important movement for women, who were typically clerks, typists, “human computers” or who worked in the home, to join or to re-join the workforce. These legislative frameworks also incite a larger number of women to undertake technical and undergraduate/graduate professional training in engineering and physical sciences.
“Second wave” feminism (Calás and Smircich, 2006; Freedman, 2002), in particular, speaks to the economic hardships that women face at this time, and their attempts to control their bodies through reproductive rights. Friedan’s (1963) *The Feminine Mystique* galvanized the White, highly educated women who were trapped in either domestic life, or in administrative/clerical office “hostess” roles.

Ontologically, the oppression of women in this mid-Cold War phase is located in the condition of being “woman” (Calás and Smircich, 2006). Also, the galvanization of liberal feminists[10], in this second wave, would see political, legislative and grassroots initiatives take center stage to fight for control of women’s bodies and for women’s rights. This galvanization is built on the idea of minimizing differences between men and women in such a way that women compete as equals with men in the workplace (Meyerson and Kolb, 2000). The idea here is that a “woman” is responsible for her own sense of self, which pushes the idea that a “woman” is responsible to minimize differences with a “man” (Rottenberg, 2017). This state of being is premised, in part, on the woman’s experiences of gaining “control” of her reproductive life with her use of the birth control pill (Green, 2008). The rhetorics of the mid-Cold War phase also signal the attempts to put an end to the proliferation of the White-masculine-ideal, in the workforce and at home. “Second wave” feminism begins to try to dismantle these rhetorics. The changing role and responsibility of women, in the US in particular, coupled with the political and civil rights movements (Freedman, 2002), provides an important layer to understanding this mid-Cold War phase. This framing then underscores our notion of change ideologies for this phase.

As for space, we see a proliferation of scientific and military attempts to continue to run this unconquerable race in this challenging environment. Notably, there were over 34 satellites launched into orbit during this time, studying not only Earth, but the Moon, the Sun, Venus and Mars. The first successful circling of the Moon, by the Apollo 8 crew, was accomplished at this time also (Logsdon, 2007). The halving of NASA budgets for space militarization initiatives, after the peak spending of 1966, are also part of this phase. This halving of space budgets, it is important to underline, was done a full three years prior to the US men landing on the Moon, in 1969 (McQuaid, 2007). This moon landing, as a technological fragment, coupled with Nixon’s political initiatives and the radicalization of the feminist movement (Freedman, 2002), signals a movement away from the mid-Cold War phase into something more solid and yet still ambiguous. This space militarization larger context helps us frame this mid-phase then within ideologies of conservativism and of cutting in war-type spending, along with a proliferation of exploration initiatives.

Our attempt to embrace ideological contexts to define a finer grain to the Cold War is similar to Green’s (2008) exploration of gendered history with respect to women’s healthcare and fertility control. Notably, she did not build women’s healthcare as a “fact”, but rather she embraced a gendered meaning-making exercise (Mills and Helms Mills, 2004) around histories surrounding women’s healthcare. We apply some of Green’s approach by reconstructing a mid-Cold War phase by incorporating political rhetorics and moving beyond those discourses into retrospective meaning-making. The continuing physical presence of the arsenal of intercontinental ballistic missiles and the beginning of diplomatic solutions between the US and the USSR provides one possible framework to our mid-Cold War phase. However, we need to look beyond the diplomatic solutions and the ballistic missiles. The changing role of women, the women’s rights movement, race-relations, legislative actions, conservatism with respect to war-time spending and the proliferation of space initiatives, are all part of this mid-Cold War phase. To underscore this framing, we now turn to an introduction of Pan Am’s GMRD organization framed within this mid-Cold
War phase. We do this to situate the reader within this organization and in this phase, prior to considering our methodology and our findings on the GMRD White women.

Pan Am’s GMRD organizational context
Pan Am was one of the few US commercial airlines to be involved in the early- and mid-Cold War efforts. Notably, Pan Am, and its predecessor, American Overseas Airlines:

[...] kept the air lifeline open between the Free West and Berlin. Under authorization of the four Occupying Powers, Pan Am continue[d] to provide and improve air service with 682 flights a week in and out of Berlin (GMRD, 1965a, p. 25).

Pan Am was also responsible for the transportation of personnel and military supplies to the Philippines, Okinawa, Japan and Vietnam. They evacuated more than 800 military dependents during the Southeast Asian crisis in 1965 (GMRD, 1965a), along with operationalizing other US strategic initiatives.

With respect to the space race, Pan Am provided the infrastructure and support services for the first missile range, Cape Canaveral, as we introduced earlier. They also offered services with respect to the transportation of military personnel. The company established, and maintained, various missile test ranges scattered around the world. These missile test ranges collectively were known as the GMRD in 1953 and were staffed with a total of 55 employees (Hartt et al., 2012). By 1964, the GMRD was the prime contractor to the US Air Force and was responsible for the Cape Kennedy Missile Test Center and the Atlantic Missile Range. The GMRD participated in 88 major missile launches, such as the Ranger and Mariner missile launch vehicles, and of other automated spacecraft necessary for the development of the Gemini two-man space capsule program (GMRD, 1965a).

By 1967, the GMRD, now renamed the Aerospace Services Division (ASD), employed over 7,000 people (Hartt et al., 2009). ASD was responsible directly to NASA for its American space-exploration initiatives. These responsibilities included the launch of Apollo 8 (GMRD, 1967a), which would see three White, US military trained-men orbit around the moon for the first time.

Given this understanding of the mid-Cold War phase and our introduction to Pan Am’s GMRD, we move to the theoretical framework for this study. We begin by presenting post-structural feminism, and then consider two of Foucault’s technologies.

Poststructural feminism, discourses and subjection
The poststructuralist perspective is founded on the notion of “difference”. The reader is cautioned to not confuse poststructural “difference” with implying that the opposite of “difference” is “sameness”. Difference, as we frame it within Foucault’s technologies, is used in the sense that we reproduce uncertainties and a range of beliefs/meanings that we do not necessarily aim to resolve (Belsey, 2002). This notion of difference can be reproduced, and this can be done within systems that we learn, assign meaning to and enact. As such, a post-structuralist examination of a social reality, in this case, one that focuses on cisgender/ethnicity as part of multi-voiced histories, compels the researcher to move away from binary oppositions, as such comparisons invoke sameness and difference arguments that are not appropriate within this perspective.

Given this understanding of “difference”, poststructural feminism compels us to focus on a variety of cisgender/ethnicity social realities via discourses and values and norms (Weedon, 1991, 1997). Poststructuralist feminists have no doubts that there is a world. Their questions lie in what they can know of this gendered/ethnic world and how they can know this world. That is, they question the claims of certainty, or of “fact”, stable “truth”, about the gendered/ethnic world (Belsey, 2002; Weedon, 1997). Foucault’s approach to post-
structuralism, in particular, compels us to consider the reconstruction of the various social worlds, based on webs of power-relations, among individuals, that are capillary and travel through the social (Foucault, 1980, 1982, 1983). This reproduction among these webs can lead to fragmented “truths” that can reveal or shine a light on the social.

In our reading of Foucault’s scholarship, specifically his later work after *Discipline and Punish* (Foucault, 1977), we recognize that he did not explicitly address gender and feminism. We are not the first, or even the second, to surface this limitation to Foucault’s scholarship; Fraser (1989) and Hekman (1996) consider this shortcoming extensively. Melding in their work here in gendering poststructuralism, we cannot ignore the first author’s experiences of power-relations and discourses in the contemporary Canadian space industry and how they play an integral part in “who she is” and “who she is becoming” (Ruel, 2019). Her fractured state of being, within the Canadian space industry, is closer to Foucault’s reconstruction of the self within a gendered social world, than what we see in such standpoint perspectives as liberal feminism and radical feminism. As such, we embrace Foucault’s (1977, 1978, 1982, 1984a, 1984b) teachings, specifically his “bodies of knowledge (discourses) as potentially discontinuous across history rather than necessarily progressive and cumulative” (McHoul and Grace, 2007, p. 4). We do this to frame our theoretical understanding of a cisgender/ethnic individual, in multi-voiced histories, along with an individual in the present and in the future.

Foucault’s notions of discourses, and the subjection of the self, are central to framing these discontinuous bodies of knowledge. The definition of discourse can be influenced by both the theoretical perspective and the methodological approach taken (Grant et al., 1998). Foucault’s concept of discourse, in particular, can be characterized as a critical lens that looks to conflict and to power-relations as a counter-position to social conditions (McHoul and Grace, 2007). This type of discourse is historically situated and is reflective of a system of power-relations that constitute objects and subjects (Fairhurst and Putnam, 2004). Discourses, and their production, go beyond language, texts and semiotics. In other words, Foucault’s macro concept of discourse does not refer to language or how individuals use language, such as measuring interruptions in a conversation. Foucauldian discourse and its analysis are rather related to mundane social life[11], to social knowledge creation and recreation and to their fragmented nature. Discourses can, therefore, be found in social processes and in historical, fragmented genealogies (Foucault, 1978).

With respect to the self and her subjection, Foucault’s “subject” is understood to be as “tied to his [sic] own identity by a conscience or self-knowledge” (Foucault, 1982, p. 781). This self, as Foucault (1988a) argues, is brought into existence by disciplinary practices. The self is persuaded into existence as a self-regulating subject, not as a “one” or identical subject (Sökefeld, 1999), but as a product of relationships and interactions. Foucault asks, for example, how a discursive representation of the self “set boundaries and give[s] direction to future creative effort” (Hutton, 1988, p. 122). This question introduces the techniques of ethics and of self-care (LeCoure and Mills, 2008) into this construct of the self. These techniques are concerned with “how an individual is supposed to constitute himself [sic] as a moral subject of his [sic] own actions” (Foucault, 1984c, p. 352). The question of the technology of self then is not only an ontological question but an ethics/morals/values epistemological question as well.

Foucault charges us to consider how best to tell the multiplicity of “truths” concerning this subject, the self. In particular, he asks us to study the consequence (s) of subjection. Subjection can be historically located, as disciplinary processes, which enables a subject to consider themselves as an individual, and how they are constrained from thinking otherwise (McHoul and Grace, 2007). The categorization of a subject via identities, say a “woman”, below another subject who is similarly categorized as a subject, say a “man”, could be a
simplified example of subjection. This subjection does not negate the act of resistance, however. The woman, who has been categorized as being under a man, can resist this categorization norm with reverse discourses (Foucault, 1984a, 1984b). Related to these ideas, the subjection of the self consists of a set of processes that includes the influence of the discursive processes between oneself and others, and the technologies of individual domination[12] (Foucault, 1988b, 1993). These technologies of domination can be presented in historical rules, styles and cultural inventions within a specific formative (values) context (Foucault, 1988a; Unger, 1987a, 1987b). The subject is, therefore, in a state of being and of becoming that is self-regulating, influenced and limited by a variety of ideological contexts, including organizations, formative contexts and multi-voiced, ambiguous histories.

With this theoretical framework of discourses and subjection of the self, the methodological approach must support our ontological and epistemological understandings. We turn now to Foucault’s technique of lamination, how we can apply this type of CDA to collected data and how we can meld this technique with an autoethnography.

Methodology
The methodology we use in this study is premised on answering our research question: what has a Cold War US missile division to tell us about present and future gendered relationships in the North American space industry? At the center of this question is how GMRD’s White women are discursively created, within the ideologies of the mid-Cold War phase. We recognize that, to surface these GMRD White women, we need to work within a type of CDA that allows multi-voiced histories to speak, and that influence the reader to “see” these histories in the present and in the future gendered relationships. We acknowledge that a CDA working by itself is insufficient to answer this question. As such, we meld the first author’s recreation of the present, contemporary space industry, with this CDA. To do this, we integrate an autoethnography (Denzin, 2006; Ellis, 2004) with Foucault’s technique of lamination (Foucault, 1978; McHoul and Grace, 2007; Phillips and Hardy, 2002). By integrating these two methods together, we investigate what these multi-voiced histories can tell us about the present and future cisgender relationships in the North American space industry.

We consider, in this section, these two methods one after the other. We begin by outlining the nature of the data and the method of data collection. We then present our methodology framework, pulling on specific examples from collected data, to showcase the how of the technology of lamination. Our goal in presenting our methodology in this way is to make it an attainable device for others.

Nature of data and method of collection
The body of evidence in this study involves two distinct sources: the company newsletter, the GMRD’s Clipper, collected by the second and third authors from the Pan Am World Airways archives at the Otto Richter Library, University of Miami, as part of a larger project; and, the first author’s personal data focused on her experiences within the contemporary Canadian space industry. With respect to the Clipper, this newsletter includes highlights of annual reports, key summaries of events, stories of life in and around GMRD, pictures, activities, humor/jokes and cartoons. This body of evidence also has multi-voiced stories and narratives that come from a variety of individuals at the GMRD, the Clipper editors and the Clipper’s editorial board members.

As for the first author’s personal data, she kept personal diaries, personal photographs and emails, along with notes taken while she worked within the Canadian space industry for close to 20 years. She began to inspect these personal items when she started reading through the Clippers, not looking necessarily for parallels in the web of power-relations, but
nonetheless finding themes that were parallel to her experiences. She reviewed her work diaries, remembering events or dates, and then moved from these events/dates to other experiences through pictures. She captured these data in her research diary for this study, being careful not to compromise protected, confidential or secret information related to the work that she did while employed in the contemporary Canadian space industry.

Data analysis
After reading through a total of 61 *Clippers* and building the first author’s research diary, we re-examined each individual newsletter. We did this to surface discourses that caught our attention within the notion of cisgender/ethnicity multi-voiced histories and the mid-Cold War phase. We extracted and grouped data across various themes, keeping a running summary in a Microsoft Word database. We organized these themes by date of publication as a way to keep track of these themes, ensuring traceability back to the source once our lamination work was complete. We annotated these themes with our own comments, in anticipation of the application of the technique of lamination and the integration of the autoethnography to this laminated story. We now turn to a description of this lamination technique, providing specific examples to show the reader how this method can be applied.

**Technique of lamination.** The technique of lamination can be broken into six areas of concern, according to McHoul and Grace (2007). These are as follows: building up citation upon citation, juxtaposing official and marginal discourses, quoting at length, rarely making interpretative comments, allowing cited text to carry the work and arranging historical fragments such that the order speaks for itself. With respect to this technique of lamination, the reader is cautioned to not confuse this technique with Goffman’s (1974) lamination or Boden’s (1994) lamination methods. Goffman’s lamination considers layered activities with “keying” and “transformations”, creating and leading to layers of understanding. Boden’s lamination, on the other hand, sees:

> [...] members draw from past circumstances, overarching organizational rationalities, or rules and structural forms, and selecting those features that are immediate and locally relevant to their behavior. Selections from past practices applied to the here and now laminate or layer one upon the other as conversations unfold (Fairhurst and Putnam, 2004, p. 17).

Foucault’s technique of lamination is a methodology unto itself. Integral to this technique is that we limit our interpretive comments, thus allowing the cited text to carry the work (McHoul and Grace, 2007). In other words, we guide the reader to apply their own interpretations to the cited text. This guide is captured within our presentation of the mid-Cold War phase and our theoretical framework on discourses and subjection. We must also build citation upon citation, resulting in an arrangement and collection of fragments done in such a way that the order, and their arrangement, speaks for itself (McHoul and Grace, 2007). The result of this citation building is “[...] all that we see is all that there is” (Burrell, 1996, p. 654). The cited text, with a few interpretative comments from the authors here and there, recreates a rich story as the output. This recreation is presented as fragmented temporary “truths” that are laminated one after another.

By applying this technique, in this way, we are able to embrace Clark and Rowlinson’s (2004) “historic turn”. Specifically, we use their question: How is history like and unlike fiction? (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004, p. 331), to reconstruct multi-voiced histories into a story based on fragments. We also acknowledge the “contentious” nature of history, as being not as well defined as others would have us believe (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004), within our story. We recognize, in the use of this technique, that histories are “ambiguous” narratives of the past (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004), where the past is understood as “a realistic record of every event

Gendering multi-voiced histories
and experience in time” (Suddaby et al., 2010, p. 152). This approach, we believe, allows for reverse discourses (Foucault, 1984a, 1984b) to be surfaced along with those dominant discourses that surface the subjection of an individual.

As is to be expected with Foucault’s work, the actual application of this technique of lamination is not laid out as a step-by-step activity. That the historical fragments can be built together into uniting discourses, into temporary gendered “truths” (Foucault, 1969), we believe, can be one way to surface the subjection of the GMRD White woman during the mid-Cold War phase. Also, we believe that Foucault’s view of discourses in relation to his history of ideas, one of four of his critical operations (Foucault, 1978), is most instructive. That is, we are able to view discourses in a “describable relationship with the ensemble of other practices” (Foucault, 1978, p. 19). This “describable relationship” does not involve defining a cause-and-effect type of relationship, but rather provides a view into conditions that are intrinsic to the discourses themselves (McHoul and Grace, 2007). We, in other words, consider interrelationships among discursive fragments and the historical practices, such as the mid-Cold War phase, holding no one individual responsible for the emergence of an event (Foucault, 1980).

Returning to our Microsoft Word database of themes, each theme that we surfaced, such as the feminine-ideal, provides a foundational laminate for a fragment of our story. Each fragment is recreated one at a time, to ensure consistency across the social processes and to help maintain our focus on the mid-Cold War phase. Traceability and reproduction of these discourses are important aspects of this work, where constant verification back to the archival source is done (Mills and Helms Mills, 2018). Once the fragments are considered sound – consistent, traceable and plausibly reproduced – we arrange the various fragments into a running story, in such a way that Burrell’s (1996) notion of “all that we see is all that there is” prevails.

The following example, based on two Clipper newsletters, is used here to showcase how we can approach this technique of lamination (Figure 1).

**Figure 1.**
“Karen [...] makes a visit to Security Administration **pleasurable**” (emphasis added)

**Source:** GMRD, 1966a, p. 18. All the photographs in this article are reproduced and used with permission from Pan Am Airways, Inc. Records, Courtesy of Special Collections, University of Miami Libraries, Coral Gables, Florida
This particular fragment represents some of the security protocols at the GMRD; that is, a need for proper badging and security screenings that need to be conducted by a specific organizational division called “Security Administration”. This fragment also presents cisgender practices, namely, using sexual innuendo with respect to the young, White woman who is shown in the picture. She, in essence, makes a visit “pleasurable” for the men who visit the security department. This fragment, we find, highlights a moral tradition that enacts, and reconstructs, an individual in daily GMRD work activities. Furthermore, “Karen” is brought into existence for the reader via disciplinary discourses that are at work in this particular context. Notably, her self is presented as a self-regulating subject, who gives men a “pleasurable” experience within a business context. Such a subject, who is clearly identified to be there for the pleasure of others, perpetuates the feminine-ideal within a specific context (Foucault, 1988a). “Karen” is limited and bounded by organizational and historical ideologies into being a “pleasurable”, subjectified self in the GMRD context.

We went into considerable detail in this first example to showcase “Karen’s” subjection. Foucault’s technique of lamination requires, however, that we limit our interpretive comments. This interpretative limit allows the cited text to carry the story, as one of the goals of the technique of lamination. To continue this act of lamination, with this limited interpretation, we now move to our next Clipper story that we laminate to “Karen’s” fragment (Figure 2).

Figure 2. “Mrs Conley’s [receptionist in Purchasing] mass arrangement of fresh cut plant materials won a ribbon”, in a section titled “June is Bustin’ Out All Over” (emphasis added)

Source: GMRD, 1965b, p. 16

The “June is Bustin’ Out All Over” fragment is permeated with sexual innuendo: her “mass” arrangement, and her physical representation as “bustin’ out” (that is, of being physically well-endowed). Interestingly, while the narrative refers to her as “Mrs Conley”, the section refers to her as “June”. Putting this fragment with “Karen’s”, we invite the reader to reflect on the social values and norms expressed in these fragments, within the larger meanings associated with the cisgender organization (Saleeby, 1994). One reflection could be that the feminine-ideal, as represented by the White woman at the GMRD, is one of pleasure and of being physically attractive to men. Another possible reflection could be that
these two White women represent the feminine-ideal candidate at the GMRD, regardless of their status as being either married or single: these GMRD White women are “eye candy” for the GMRD men, with their subjection reflected within their sexuality and cisgender perceptions of what is expected within the feminine-ideal.

Summarizing this example, we provide a cisgender and ethnic “historic turn”, in the form of a laminated story of the GMRD White woman. We draw attention to the “truths” or “fictions” of this fragment by the use of bold/italic emphasis, or by our comments before or after, the presentation of the fragment (s). The whole of the story is more than the sum of the individual fragments; they showcase the subjection of the GMRD White women. We also provide room for the reader, within the act of lamination, to consider this whole. Room is used here in the sense that we guide the reader to understand the meso and the macro contexts while looking at the micro experiences of the GMRD White women.

The multi-voiced histories though do not stop with historical “fictions” (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004); we integrate these histories with the first author’s story, by applying an autoethnography. This is done in such a way to bring these multi-voiced histories forward into the present and into the future. In this way, we consider the influences of these histories on the cisgender/ethnic relationships through time. We now turn to this autoethnographic method.

Autoethnography. The type of autoethnography we chose to use is referred to as a personal narrative, “where social scientists view themselves as the phenomenon and write evocative stories specifically focused on their academic as well as their personal lives” (Ellis, 2004, p. 45). While there can be a degree of fictionalization used in this type of writing (Doloriert and Sambrook, 2009), the first author chose not to use this framing. She chose specifically to embrace, once again, Clark and Rowlinson’s (2004) understanding of “how is history like and unlike fiction?” (p. 331), the “contentious” nature of history and that histories are “ambiguous” narratives. The “truths” and “facts”, as the first author saw and experienced them, are reproduced within these ideas of histories being like/unlike fiction, contention and ambiguities. In other words, to the best of her recollection, her personal diaries, her notes, etc., she recreates an understanding of her personal story to share with others.

The autoethnography method helps to frame the first author’s collection of pertinent data, as we highlighted previously. This method also assists her in showcasing her personal experiences, her varied identities and her relationships with the social world in concert with the GMRD White women’s story (Boje and Tyler, 2008; Ellis, 2004; Sparkes, 2000). Her voice, represented by the use of the first-person “I”, speaks to her subjection within the space industry as she constructed this social reality (Doloriert and Sambrook, 2009). Her voice also reflects looking at the “big picture”, of the macro space industry, while looking at the “small picture” of the self and her subjection. The first author considers the “smaller picture”, focusing her lens on herself in an attempt to reveal one possible self (Learmonth and Humphreys, 2012). She melds this into a personal narrative to teach, empower, embody and grow both the writer and the reader (Ellis, 2004). These personal narratives embrace the idea of personal growth that could impact the reader, just as it does the writer. This personal growth, furthermore, involves a responsibility on the part of the first author to encourage the reader’s own self-development, to invite the reader to be an active participant in their own lives and in their own experiences (Ellis, 2004). The author of the autoethnography then becomes a sort of co-author to the reader’s future storytelling efforts, bridging knowledge generation from one to the other, and so on, to other future readers.
Writing in the first-person, within this notion of the “small picture”, is one aspect of producing an autoethnography. The “big picture”, as the other important notion, also requires her to include looking outwardly to the cultural and social realities that influence her and to her experiences within the particular ideological context of space (Ellis, 2004; Learmonth and Humphreys, 2012). These influences can be historical in nature, such as the experiences of the GMRD discourses in the mid-Cold War phase, or in the contemporary influences, such as the macro contemporary understanding of exploring space for scientific purposes.

Integrating lamination with autoethnography. We strive for an epistemological contribution with this combined methodology of not isolating histories to their own understandings and interpretations. We want to expand our understanding of the role of discourses in larger contexts, incorporating multi-voiced histories to reach into the present and the future. The implication of this epistemological contribution is that undertaking an ambiguous, contentious historical study, we must enable the examination of the role that these multi-voiced histories can play in defining the present and future cisgender/ethnic relationships.

The notion of the first author being a co-author with the reader is integrated into the technique of lamination to achieve this contribution. By providing room for the reader to first build an understanding across various themes of the GMRD, and then second to be part of the “small” and “big” picture, we develop the reader’s knowledge and their interpretative abilities with respect to the production and reproduction of a cisgender/ethnic “historic turn”. These multi-voiced histories are contentious, ambiguous and a “fiction or not” tale that influence and transform social orders in a particular context. The combined methodology then develops not only the authors’ experiences of multi-voiced histories, the present and the future, but also the reader’s experience of traveling through time.

We now present the findings and results of our application of the technique of lamination. The autoethnography, where we move to a first-person account, follows in the discussion section, integrating the experiences of the first author to those of the Cold War GMRD White women.

Findings and results: the Cold War and the GMRD White women’s fragmented story

We found the following themes across the Clippets we examined: the Cold War; the economics of the Cold War; the feminine and masculine-ideals; and, emergent science and technology discourses. Due to space limitations, pun intended, we could not present in detail all of our findings related to each theme. As such, we chose to focus on two themes. The first, the findings related to the Cold War, is presented briefly, to give the reader an idea of the discourses, and to support our untangling of the early and mid-Cold War phases. The second theme, the feminine-ideal, is presented to showcase cisgender/ethnicity in the “historic turn”.

The early and mid-Cold War phases

Some of the Cold War rhetorics we extracted had similarities with the earlier phase of the Cold War. Notably, the “traditional” Cold War rhetorics, such as the “Free West”, “Occupying Powers” (GMRD, 1965a, p. 25) and “keep[ing] our Country strong and free” (GMRD, 1966b, p. 2) were found. The early Cold War theme, which sees a reduction in the responsibilities and roles of women in organizations following the Second World War, provides a counterpoint to an increase in weaponry production and an overemphasized technology focus.

However, we also found interesting rhetorics that emphasized our mid-Cold War phase of change such as establishing “manned colonies” and “colonizing another remote wasteland” (that is, the moon) (GMRD, 1965c, p. 6, p. 4). We also found discourses surrounding industrial preparedness, at various Cape’s, with respect to a nuclear attack that are post-structurally different than those of the early phase, such as the following:
[...]
a nuclear attack is the least likely to occur, but is, of course, the most catastrophic disaster we may face. 'It is also the disaster for which we are least prepared' Fisher commented (GMRD, 1966c, p. 15).

We also found discourses showcasing the juxtaposition of missile testing and the beauty of space bodies, such as:

The tracking sites on the island have probably seen more reentries than any others, for they cover the end of the ballistic flight of several families of ICBM's. The nosecones and following parts burn into the atmosphere there at night like clusters of meteors (GMRD, 1966a, p. 5).

We found discourses surrounding the Vietnam War, which demonstrate the presence of reverse discourses (Foucault, 1984a, 1984b) with respect to this controversial war:

The soldier finds sleep where he can – mostly on the wet earth. It brings blessed, but only brief oblivion from the nightmare around him [...] P.S. It sure isn’t fun over here (GMRD, 1966d, p. 14).

Interestingly, we found no evidence of reporting on accidents, failures or challenges with respect to space initiatives. Case in point, the Apollo 1 fire occurred in late January 1967; the only reference to this tragedy was a few commemorative words dedicated to the three astronauts in the Clipper of March 1967. The editorial board of the Clipper did start to incorporate a new section titled "A glimpse into the past" (e.g. GMRD, 1967b). These glimpses did not include human tragedies or failures but rather focused on physical structures as contingencies of the Cold War. These structural-based glimpses included mostly the first launch of a rocket or a missile.

GMRD White women’s fragmented story
The theme of the feminine-ideal, we found, could be broken across sub-themes that included the cisgendering of space structures, the role of the White women in the GMRD and at home, their eroticization and their resistance discourses with respect to this feminine-ideal. The discourses surrounding the first sub-theme, which compared space structures to the cisgender feminine-ideal, include the intervention of men. These interventions showcased a wish to control the feminized space structures. At times, some aspect of these feminized space structures would be dramatized, sexualized or, in some cases, romanticized, as the following two examples show:

Gentle Giant[...]. Capable of lifting 60 tons of missile hardware, it does the job with the tender loving care of a mother holding a child[...]. Even for smaller jobs, a minimum of five men are needed to operate the crane of a type known as a stiff-leg derrick[...]. Oddly enough, the man at the control console may never see the load he is moving about (GMRD, 1965d, p. 10, emphasis added).

Cape Night spectacular: By day this space hub of the free world lends glamour to even the most mundane tasks. And by night the Cape takes on a special glamour. It's a beauty enhanced by the shroud of darkness and tempered by the occasional flaring thunder of a missile piercing the night as it rumbles down the Eastern Test Range[...]. Along with sophisticated photographic equipment operated by Pan Am, RCA, and Technicolor photographers, are advanced techniques and a few special effects 'tricks' thrown in to enhance the true beauty of missiles and gantries (GMRD, 1967c, pp. 5-8, emphasis added).

The next sub-theme, focused on the GMRD White women’s role, centers on her attractiveness and her role in work and home life:

An attractive woman recently walked into the Pass and Identification office at the South Gate requesting a new badge. Security employees noticed she already was wearing a badge and inquired why she wanted a brand new one. 'I've had my hair style changed and friends say the picture on my badge doesn't look like me anymore,' she replied[...]. the Pan Am badge men [have] no intention to draw the ire of the ladies upon [them], Brown concedes the
gals are more fussy than men when it comes to having a picture snapped [...] ‘Most will powder up in the rest room,’ he said. ‘One woman combed her hair and put on makeup right in front of the camera,’ Brown chuckled (GMRD, 1965c, p. 15, emphasis added).

Komic Kaptions: Man, that new secretary is really a knockout, (emphasis added) (Figure 3).

The GMRD White woman’s role in work and at home surfaces some elements of her subjection:

Just plain Vi From People to Propellants: Viola Nash (better known to her friends as Vi), a former Ohio welfare worker who dealt with sensitive human problems, is now a staff clerk in GMRD’s Liquid Propellants section dealing with sensitive fuels. Of course Vi does not work directly with the propellants, although she does keep inventory and issue records and handles all other clerical duties for the section. She is quick to say that while she doesn’t have the technical background necessary to understand these exotic fuels, she nevertheless thoroughly enjoys hearing her supervisor Tom Parsons and the other men discuss the various properties and uses for the propellants they handle [...] Vi takes great pleasure in meeting people and making new friends and she considers herself fortunate to have a job where she can meet and talk with many different people (GMRD, 1965d, p. 8, emphasis added).

Still within this idea of the feminine-ideal and the role of the GMRD White women, the organization celebrated these individuals through Secretaries Week. During this celebration, one White GMRD woman was chosen as the “universal” representative of this feminine-ideal in the workplace, fulfilling the role of an efficient office “hostess”:

For Secretaries Week, a Clipper feature on [...] Linda Frye: Linda Frye is featured this year representing all GMRD secretaries. Linda, the Administrative Secretary for Contract Administration, started her Pan Am career in 1959 [...] Each girl is assigned to work
for one of the contract administrators, but *Linda* sees that the overall work load is properly distributed [. . .] *Linda is a charming person with a keen interest in and concern for people* and this, coupled with her *secretarial abilities*, make her a first rate secretary in the *best Pan Am tradition* (GMRD, 1965e, p. 13, emphasis added).

Sometimes, that feminine-ideal was not defined just by a secretary fulfilling her occupational role, but could also be seen in other stereotypical cisgender feminine-ideal responsibilities, such as those emphasized in the previous fragment of being “*charming [. . .] with a keen interest in and concern for people*”. The following fragment also supports this expectation:

*Queens* of the road: Seventeen Pan Am *lady drivers* are on the job ‘*round the clock serving* contractor personnel at launch complexes, industrial areas and virtually any place at the space center where fixed food services are not available (GMRD, 1966f, p. 14, emphasis added).

Carrying this further, as Dye (2006) found, Pan Am Airways events and celebrations invariably included beauty contests of some sort, “thus supporting the requirement for beauty” (p. 121). Not surprisingly, GMRD, as a division of Pan Am, also assigned value to these beauty contests. The *Clipper* referred to these beauty contests extensively and would showcase either White women employees or daughters of GMRD employees. One such example, “*Miss Sun and Space*” was indicative of this sub-theme (Figure 4).

![Figure 4.](image)

*Source:* GMRD, 1967d, p. 6

*Miss Sun and Space Takes the Cape* A *pretty blue-eyed blonde* was the guest at Pan Am facilities at Cape Kennedy recently to launch a weather rocket and communicate with a satellite in outer space. Paula Balberchak, 20, named *Miss Sun and Space* during September festivities in the City of Cape Canaveral, visited Atlas Complex 36 [. . .] *The*
A willowy blonde is employed as a security receptionist with Lockheed at the Cape. As the pictures on this page will attest, she's a welcome visitor to Pan Am anytime, (emphasis added).

The next sub-theme of the feminine-ideal, the blatant sexual references and the erotization of the GMRD White woman, were extensive across the Clipper (Figure 5).

Figure 5.

They have 10,000 patients [...] Medical Records: The girls dip in and out of them some 300 times a day [...] That's a big job, but Jean, Carolyn and Cathy enjoy meeting new challenges [...] In a moment's notice, Medical Records' McMasters, Lee and Waltman can turn up the file of any employee, (emphasis added).

Mills (2006) found that the eroticization of women working within various airline companies, in the 1960s, was used for commercial/marketing purposes. We found that such arguments did not hold for the GMRD and their presentation of the White women. The plausible “truths” surrounding the erotization of GMRD White women are left to the reader to reflect upon.

There were some exceptional discourses that did not seem to “fit”, which we categorized as a sub-theme of resistance discourses with respect to the feminine-ideal. These exceptions are important to consider in these laminated stories because they demonstrate that there is evidence of reverse discourses (Foucault, 1984a, 1984b) during this mid-Cold War phase. One Clipper section, titled the “Cape Cool Spots”, pictured a secretary in her bikini sitting on a massive ice block. Underneath this picture, there was another picture of a man in a full parka in the same ice vault as the bikini-clad GMRD woman. This woman, a secretary in this photo, exclaimed in the caption to this picture that “Bikinis are fine for the beach”, Sue said with a chatter, “but not in an ice house” (GMRD, 1966e, p. 8, emphasis added).

Another interesting fragment, which stood out from the repetitive feminine-ideal discourses, was from a missile range missionary. This fragment, reproduced below, provided a glimpse into life on the range for the GMRD men:

Missile Range Missionary: 'The typical personality down there is a myth,' he says. 'The men have the same kind of problems – financial, marital, emotional release – that we in the states [sic] have. But there is a desire in part of man to get out of the regimentation caused by
industrialization – to revert back to the individual type of life. The beatnik does it by painting his house black and growing a beard. Some people drink, or try other escapes. There is a man who resents the competitiveness modern life forces us into. Just how man is to retain his individuality in face of growing regimentation is one of the severest problems facing modern society. There is a line of demarcation between conformity and compliance; the downrange man defines this line a special way of compromise (GMRD, 1966a, p. 9, emphasis added).

By 1967, evidence of subtle changes with respect to the subjection of GMRD White women started to be reproduced in the Clipper:

Two Lively, Lovely Livesays: Take equal parts of sun, surf, and sand. Add two tanned, beautiful girls. Toss in national fashion modeling and beauty honors plus high scholastic averages, and you'll have some idea of the busy, glamorous lives of Mark Livesay's two daughters – Karen and Viki. Mark, an 11 year GMRD veteran […] has served extensively as Base Operations Manager at various stations on the Eastern Test Range […] Karen is a freshman at S.M.U. majoring in electrical engineering (GMRD, 1967c, p. 12, emphasis added).

The following fragment underscores an extension of this idea that a White woman could indeed pursue a technical degree (while fully clothed) (Figure 6).

Scholarship for two: Marlo, a 'straight A' student […] now a sophomore at Stetson University. Marlo attended Melbourne High School and the University of Florida. She is majoring in bio-environmental engineering […] The scholarship awards, presented at the August meeting of the Pan American Management club, are representative of the Club's program to recognize outstanding and deserving students of Pan Am 'families' (emphasis added).

There is a visual shift to the feminine-ideal in this fragment and in others after this one, in addition to an emphasis on grades and the pursuit of engineering degrees. The shift from the barely clothed GMRD White women to this reverse discourse (Foucault, 1984a, 1984b) on educational and recreational pursuits had some vestiges of good looks and being a representative of a feminine-ideal. However, there appeared to be a shift toward acknowledging that women, whether daughters of employees or employees themselves, were no longer “objects” that were office "hostesses", or that could be eroticized in the workplace. These fragments heralded shifts in the Clipper articles well into 1968, where
scholarship and education pursuits were beginning to be part of the feminine-ideal discourses.

We now move to the first author’s autoethnography, presented in the first-person. She framed this as a discussion with the reader, moving among the “big picture” and the “small picture” issues.

**Discussion: an autoethnography of my experiences in the contemporary space industry**

I must take a moment to situate myself for you, the reader, in the present day. I am a White, highly educated, science professional woman who, until very recently, worked in the space industry. I was, in “fact”, the only Canadian woman working as a Life Sciences Mission Manager, leading and managing scientific, operational life sciences missions into space. To give you an idea of what this means to be a Mission Manager, I led two life science-based missions on the International Space Station (ISS). The first mission studied how astronauts could create a culture during their six-month stay in space. The second mission studied how our visual perception changes as a function of being in space. Adding another layer to my self and to the role I fulfilled in the space industry, I was also the Head of Mission Planning. I was responsible for a satellite payload that took images of the Earth and delivered these images to global clients. I supervised and managed a cross-functional dynamic team of engineers, IT professionals and scientists, all working in an operational environment of 24/7 responsibilities.

I recognize now, after presenting my research at academic conferences (e.g. Ruel et al., 2015a, 2015b), completing my doctoral dissertation research (Ruel, 2017) and after this particular study focused on the GMRD, that I used to adopt certain discourses in the workplace that are troublesome. These discourses are not influenced solely by the lack of ethnic, race, gender, sexuality, etc. diversity within this industry, but are also, I believe, influenced by discursive practices in humanity’s race to the Moon, as I began to “see” with the stories and the accompanying themes my co-authors and I found within the Clipper. I must admit that what surprised me the most while doing this particular study was our discovery that, for close to 20 years, I too embraced the cisgender discourses, assigning the feminine to various space structures. This exercise that I would reproduce on a daily basis included: naming satellites – “Oh no, she’s acting up again!”; computer systems – “Darn it, she crashed while I was trying to plan something!”; microgravity vehicles – “The Falcon is out of oil. She won’t let us do anymore parabolas for the day”. I do not remember the first time I assigned the feminine to a space structure, but I did note down when I stopped this practice. This awakening occurred when I read “Countdown for a Modest Matriarch” (GMRD, 1967e, p. 14) in the Clipper, which I reproduce in part here:

> There she stood – cables to her top, cables to her feet, and cables to her sides. The countdown began. Newspaper men, photographers, men and women workers, drivers and the wrecking crew watched expectantly to see a gallant old lady, the Complex 11 gantry, tumble in ignominy. She had watched as one of her babies (an orbiter) left her arms in December 1958 to see the world, carrying with it a Christmas message from the President of the United States. This mother of modern Atlases had opened her arms for the training of civilian and Air Force launch crews […] Pounds and pounds of rustproofing make-up had been applied to her skin over the years, and once a complete sand blasting made a new base for her face-lifting […] Still proud, and not feeling overweight despite her 400 tons, the camera-shy, sturdy dame stood her ground […] On a quiet Sunday, when there were no reporters or photographers to view her demise, the grand old lady swooned as gently as possible. Without the aid of man, she finally knelt on the ground, her girders draped around her.
While this story was and continues to be a powerful and romantic dramatization of the act of demolishing an Atlas gantry, I recognized at the time that it was also a powerful tale of Man controlling Woman. While reflecting on this story and others in the Clipper, I slowly started to recognize that the feminine-ideal continues to be practiced in the present day space industry. Perhaps, these practices are not as blatant as expecting women to don bathing suits and sit on top of missiles or in ice block houses, but there are more subtle practices in the day-to-day activities that need to be surfaced. Worse still perhaps, I like other women in this industry, use these feminine-ideal discourses without realizing we do so.

There are three small stories I would like to share, at this time, that showcase these feminine-ideals in the contemporary space industry. The first example centers on a meeting where I, as usual, was the only woman at the table. One of my male colleagues and I were arguing a rather technical, contentious point. He all of sudden challenged me to an arm wrestle. Most people want to know what I did; I obliged him, we laughed it off and continued on with the meeting. I had enough sense to capture this exchange in my diary, not quite sure at the time, what it meant but aware enough that “something” was happening with respect to cisgender. Some people point out to me that this was a sign of respect, that I was considered “one of the guys” to be challenged in such a fashion. But did “I”, a White science professional woman, not have a say in how to resolve an issue without reverting to being “one of the guys”? Why was the masculine-ideal something that I had to strive to achieve to be accepted in this workforce?

The second small story, also within the setting of a meeting, goes to the other side of the cisgender spectrum; this time, I was singled out as representing the feminine-ideal, the office “hostess” as we saw in the previous section (e.g. GMRD, 1965e, p. 13). I was asked to get a cup of coffee by a visiting European White man. I let another White, professional man defend my position at the table; that is, I was chair of the meeting. I was mute; I could tell you that I hid, trying not to acknowledge that I did not “fit” in. I could also say, possibly, that my colleague spoke first, not giving me a chance to speak up. The “truth”, as I recall it from my notes of this meeting, was that I did not know what to say: part of me wanted to get up and get this visiting dignitary a coffee; the other part of me was frustrated that I was not recognized as a technical expert at the table. Again, “I” appeared to be lost within the cisgender feminine-ideal.

My last small story focusses on a brief narrative in an interaction in the hallway before going into a meeting. I was told by a senior executive that it was great to have a woman at the table, and that he was counting on me to act as the nurturing and caring voice. This is similar to other “caring” discourses found in the Clipper (e.g. GMRD, 1965d, p. 10, 1965e, p. 13). I did my best to assume this temporary feminine-ideal, in this male-dominated meeting, noting down that this had been asked of me (and sharing in my notes how excited I was to fulfil this role!). Apparently, “I” was THE representative of the feminine-ideal, in this particular situation, in such a way that the men needed me to be that “only girl” (Ruel, 2019) so that they do not act up, following stereotypical extremes for the masculine-ideal.

I finally “see” these discourses I was a party to, and subjected to, and how they contributed to my sense of “fit” into/with the dominant group of White men I worked with. This sense of “fit” came at a cost; “I” became lost trying to navigate the daily demands of being acceptable, of navigating the spectrum of cisgender ideals. I also now understand that some of the historical discourses of the space industry, which inspire and ignite the imagination of the world, made its way into the contemporary context. The problem with this state of being, as I “see” it, is that these subjections will continue to help perpetuate
discriminatory practices in this industry. We are at risk of losing our potential to explore the stars, in the future, while we embrace such extreme cisgender relationships. Case in point, I left the industry because I could no longer play the game, as it was defined so many years ago and how it is played in contemporary times. Other White STEM professional women and White corporate/administrative women are also leaving, as I found not only in my research (Ruel, 2019) but also in the academic literature (e.g. Hewlett et al., 2008).

I shudder at the idea that this may be the legacy for White women working within the space industry. This says nothing to the ethnic minority women who also work in this industry – their numbers are embarrassing low, even in today’s space industry (Catalyst, 2013). The dividing practices, along feminine and masculine-ideals, and ethnicity will continue to be perpetuated if all we strive for is the technological framing of being among the stars. To be clear, the feminine and masculine-ideals are not solely based on the mid-Cold War phase; there are important influences that run further back in time also. However, by taking a fragment, and then another, and again another, a multi-voiced story begins to emerge. This story, unfortunately, showcases the lack of development and progress for White and for ethnic minority women in the North American space industry, even in 2018.

Conclusion
In this study, we write White women back into Cold War space histories, taking an important step toward a multi-voiced, cisgender/ethnic “historic turn”. Our approach embraces this idea of an “historic turn” to shine a light on possible discriminatory practices that can be systemically reproduced in daily everyday social interactions. We also recognize that this “historic turn” can surface reverse discourses that problematize these practices. We bring these multi-voiced histories of the GMRD White women forward to the present and to the future, revealing the subjection and the discourses and how they can influence relationships within the contemporary North American space industry.

A CDA, such as the technique of lamination, cannot work by itself in this type of work as this methodology alone does not allow us to travel through time with respect to refashioning the social. The first author’s recreation of the present space industry via an autoethnography, melded with this technique of lamination, permits us to investigate these multi-voiced histories building a richer experience of these data. As such, we are advocating, with this work, for an awakening with respect to the role that multi-voiced histories can play in defining cisgender/ethnic relationships in the present and in the future. We are inviting others who work in various ideological contexts, such as medicine and healthcare, to consider integrating the cisgender/ethnic multi-voiced histories with the present in such a way to surface important influences on these relationships.

Notes
1. We embrace cisgender as a performance of gender roles, across the spectrum of masculine and feminine-ideals that are socially constructed and are enacted in the day-to-day activities (Boje, 1991; Butler, 1990).
2. We are using cultural allegiances to characterize White and Black not as an essential, binary representation of two collectives. We are underscoring here that White women, as a cultural influence, can be studied within ethnicity discourses (Friedman, 1995). We are also making a point...
that the experience of the GMRD White woman, who typically worked in an administrative role, cannot have had the same experiences as that of the Black women who worked in the GMRD.

3. The notion of identity comes to us via many different schools of thought. We frame our understanding of identities via the social-interactionist perspective, which later becomes the symbolic interactionism perspective (Anderson, 2016). This is to say that we embrace that a social world is always evolving, and how individuals are shaped by that social world is also evolving.

4. Experience is used here in an anthropological sense, where “knowledge and experience are not monolithic, but rather are reliant on the cultural perspectives of both the observer and the population being studied” (Grant, 2016, p. 238).

5. NASA was established in 1958 and would assume responsibility for the Cape and Merritt Island thereafter (Anderson, 1981).

6. The ethnic minority women, who were part of the GMRD, must also be the subject of further study. Their experiences and roles are beyond the scope of this present study.

7. Hereafter, we refer to this newsletter as the Clipper.

8. In 1955, both the US and the USSR announced that they had plans to build satellites. By 1957 and 1958, designated the International Geophysical Year, scientists from 66 nations agreed to jointly conduct worldwide studies of the earth’s environment. This scientific collaboration is one of the primary reasons why scientific communities in various countries were able to record the beeps of Sputnik within hours of its launch (Jelly, 1988).

9. The transition from one theme into another does not necessarily flow linearly in time. As such, by maintaining the notion of an ideological context (Durepos et al., 2019) for the Cold War, we cannot state explicitly that the mid-phase began at the end of 1965, after what some consider the end of the early Cold War. Time is not the central issue here; however, we recognize that the reader may need this framing at this point.

10. There is an important branch to this “second wave” of feminism, radical feminism, that took form during this time. We specifically narrowed our focus to liberal feminism.

11. Social life refers to the “interconnected networks of social practices of diverse sorts (economic, political, cultural, family and so on)” (Fairclough, 2001, p. 27).

12. Technologies of the self takes this notion further than technologies of self-management (e.g. Foucault, 1988a).

References


Fraser, N. (1989), *Unruly Practices: Power, Discourse, and Gender in Contemporary Social Theory*, University of MN Press, Minneapolis, MN.


GMRD (1965a), The Clipper: June 1965, box, 343, folder 2, Pan American Airways Collection, Otto Richter Library, University of Miami.

GMRD (1965b), The Clipper: May 1965, Box, 343, folder 2, Pan American Airways Collection, Otto Richter Library, University of Miami.

GMRD (1965c), The Clipper: Jack Ass Flats, Nevada, January 1965, Box, 343, folder 2, Pan American Airways Collection, Otto Richter Library, University of Miami.

GMRD (1965d), The Clipper: February 1965, Box, 343, folder 2, Pan American Airways Collection, Otto Richter Library, University of Miami.

GMRD (1965e), The Clipper: April 1965, Box, 343, folder 2, Pan American Airways Collection, Otto Richter Library, University of Miami.

GMRD (1966a), The Clipper: Special Downrange Issue, September 1966, Box, 343, folder 2, Pan American Airways Collection, Otto Richter Library, University of Miami.

GMRD (1966b), The Clipper: June 1966, Box, 343, folder 2, Pan American Airways Collection, Otto Richter Library, University of Miami.

GMRD (1966c), The Clipper: February 1966, Box, 343, folder 2, Pan American Airways Collection, Otto Richter Library, University of Miami.


About the authors
Dr Stefanie Ruel is an Assistant Professor in the department of Management, John Molson School of Business, Concordia University, after leaving her position as a Life Sciences Mission Manager at the Canadian Space Agency. Her research was recently recognized by the Academy of Management Critical Management Studies Division with the 2018 Best Critical Dissertation Award. She is the
author of a number of publications including her book entitled *STEM-Professional Women’s Exclusion in the Canadian Space Industry: Anchor Points and Intersectionality at the Margins of Space*, published by Emerald. Stefanie Ruel is the corresponding author and can be contacted at: stefanie.ruel@videotron.ca

Albert J. Mills is Professor of Management at Saint Mary’s University (Canada) and 0.2 Professor of Innovation Management at the University of Eastern Finland. He is the author/editor of 46 books and special issues, including *Insights and Research on the Study of Gender and Intersectionality in International Airline Cultures* (Emerald, 2017); *The Routledge Companion to Management & Organizational History* (2015) and *The Oxford Handbook of Diversity in Organizations* (2015).

Jean Helms Mills is a Professor of Management at Saint Mary’s University, Professor (.02) at Jyväskylä University School of Business and Economics and International Reader at University of Helsinki, Swedish School of Social Sciences. She is Co-Editor of the journal *Qualitative Research in Organizations and Management* (QROM), an Associate Editor for *Gender, Work and Organization*. Jean is past Co-Chair of the CMS Division of The Academy of Management and her research interests are in the areas of Gender, Critical Sensemaking, Historiography, Intersectionality and the Sociology of Knowledge.

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: [www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm](http://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm)
Or contact us for further details: [permissions@emeraldsight.com](mailto:permissions@emeraldsight.com)
In search of transparency: ANTi-History, memorials and resistance

Renata Guimarães Quelha de Sá and Alessandra de Sá Mello da Costa
Department of Business Administration, Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Abstract

Purpose – This paper aims to discuss the constitution of the Memorial of Resistance of São Paulo (MRSP) by adopting the ANTi-History approach, thereby providing greater transparency to the socio-political relations of multiple actors involved in the constitution of this place as a site of memory.

Design/methodology/approach – By adopting the principles of ANTi-History, the researchers focused on the socio-politics of different human and nonhuman actors to examine how this site of memory was constituted. The researchers sought to turn the process of constituting the MRSP more transparent, putting together one of the possible historical versions of this phenomenon. The data collected included oral and documental sources (interviews, videos, books, newspapers and websites).

Findings – The findings support the notion of history as a socially constructed narrative that emerges through associations of heterogeneous actors in a dynamic and continuous process of (re)configuration. Additionally, by exposing the power relations and negotiations manoeuvres used by multiple actors, it allowed the researchers to highlight the complexity of the Memorial’s history as a black box, contextualizing them in a period of intense social upheaval, re-democratization and transitional justice within Brazilian society.

Originality/value – The paper outlines the process of listing the DEOPS/SP building and the social mobilization movements during the 1980s and 1990s in Brazil, illustrating some of the results obtained from a more extensive research project that dealt with the MRSP’s constitution process. It offers an in-depth example of using the ANTi-History approach in Organizational Studies, allowing the researchers to remove the organization’s veil of apparent simplicity and to bring back to life voices and actors that have been erased, disguised and silenced by the dominant version of events.

Keywords Resistance, Historical research, ANTi-History, Historic turn, Clandestine memories, Sites of memory

Paper type Research paper

Introduction

In align with the call for reflections about uses of methodology in management history, this paper seeks to outline and discuss the constitution of the Memorial of Resistance of São Paulo (MRSP), by adopting the ANTi-History approach. The MRSP is dedicated to the preservation and sharing of the memories of resistance and the struggle for justice that occurred during the Brazilian civil-military dictatorship (1964-1985). By providing greater transparency to the socio-political relations involved in its constitution process and by legitimizing multiple accounts of the past, we emphasize how histories are unstable realities which veracity depends on the strength of their networks.

Funding: Fundação Carlos Chagas Filho de Amparo à Pesquisa do Estado do Rio de Janeiro (FAPERJ).
Inaugurated in 2009, the MRSP is a public, not-for-profit organization located in São Paulo/Brazil, in a building that housed one of the most violent and truculent police forces in the country during the military regime, namely the State Department of Political and Social Order of São Paulo (DEOPS/SP, its acronym in Portuguese also known as DOPS) which was in the building until 1983, when it was finally shut down by law.

In Latin America, with its recent past dominated by dictatorial regimes, many public or clandestine buildings were used for detaining, torturing and killing those opposed to the regime. In Brazil, among many such buildings we have one that served as the headquarters of the old DEOPS/SP, a space that during decades witnessed systematic abuses of human rights and repression by government agents.

Considering the role played by the DEOPS/SP and the Brazilian context, the constitution of the MRSP as a site of memory dedicated to resistance, is even more critical. In recouping previously silenced memories from a period of repression and abuse of human rights as was the civil-military dictatorship in Brazil, our society now has the chance to assess other versions and historical references to put together and reconcile a memory that has a common foundation (Pollak, 1989).

In this sense, the MRSP plays an essential role as a bridge between past and present, as well as promoting and reinforcing the defence of human rights, citizenship, resistance and resilience through social mobilization. By arguing that the social construction of memory is a continuous process carried out in the present (Pollak, 1992), or a dynamic and ongoing process of negotiation (Misztal, 2003), it becomes equally important to delve into the power relations that are intrinsic to any movement of memory so as to critically reflect on the intentionality of what is forgotten and what is remembered. In this way, it is possible to argue that there is a relationship between remembering and transformation, as “memory is not solely constrained by the official narrative” (Misztal, 2003, p. 68).

In a social construction view, as Pollak (1989, p. 4) argues, “it is no longer a matter of dealing with social facts as things […] but of analyzing how social facts become things, how and by whom they are solidified and endowed with duration and stability”.

Revealing clandestine and hidden memories by bringing back to life those actors that have been erased, disguised and silenced by the dominant version, allows Brazilian society to evaluate and reflect on the recollections of former prisoners and the politically persecuted. By giving these relations transparency, the researcher can expand on and delve deeper into our understanding of this phenomenon. Adopting ANTi-History entails a shift of focus from looking at static events or categories to tracing the movements and relationships between processes and actors that intervene in the work of constitution of memories and histories (Durepos and Mills, 2017).

In this way, the transformation of a space, previously used for torture and human rights violations by the Brazilian dictatorship, into a site of memory dedicated to resistance is the result of a complex and dynamic socio-political process, which involves a series of articulations and movements between actors with very different interests and whose negotiations and mobilisations are often hidden from view.

This analysis, from a relational and critical perspective using the ANTi-History approach:

- allows one to understand reality, social and organizations, such as the MRSP, as transitory and unstable processes that result of continuously (re)constituted and (re) configured associations of heterogeneous actors;
- offers one the opportunity to expose the many power relations, negotiations and manoeuvres used by multiple actors during the 33 years of MRSP’s constitution process; and
- challenges the apparent simplicity and linearity of MRSP’s official history as one traces the socio-political relationships between actor-networks while doing history.
By assuming that the organization is an entity undergoing constant change, and that history is not a static and immutable representation of the past, but instead emerges as an outcome from multiple relations and movements carried out by heterogeneous actors, one can better observe the relevance and contribution of each of these at different stages of the process that led to MRSP’s constitution.

Thus, the ordering of the traces and vestiges left behind by the actors during the translation process (drawn from ANT fundamentals which argue that translations are responsible for the associations formed between actors and the consequent configuration of the heterogeneous networks that model reality and society) should result in one possible version of the history that helped create the Memorial. The more extensive and substantial the constituent connections of this emerging outcome, the greater stability this particular historical version has, to the extent that all associations, negotiations, manoeuvres and configurations which resulted in its very existence, become invisible to other entities.

In this way, histories are black boxes formed following a successful translation process, made up of extremely well-aligned elements that are capable of “concealing the social complexity that has allowed for its emergence” (Durepos and Mills, 2011, p. 709). In other words, “a black box contains that which no longer needs to be reconsidered, those things whose contents have become a matter of indifference” (Callon and Latour, 1981, p. 285). By increasing its capacity to legitimize itself as the dominant version, a black box becomes able to silence all alternative versions and make those associations that culminated in its emergence and constitution completely invisible. The result of this is that only the entries and exits of a black box are notable as the extreme alignment between its constituent actors guarantees a simplification and the sound of one single voice in unison – even if temporarily (Callon and Latour, 1981; Durepos, 2009; Durepos and Mills, 2011).

By adopting ANTi-History, the researcher’s conscience and critical perspective can be expanded as it allows for a more in-depth and detailed contextualization of the analysis of the phenomenon, removing the organization’s veil of apparent simplicity. The focus is, then, shifted to the dynamic relations between actors. In this sense, by identifying, recouping and demonstrating their movements and its implications, one can, thereby, reveal any potential cases of effacement and silencing.

Within the scope of the context presented here, the researchers came up with the following research questions:

*RQ1.* How can ANTi-History provide critical insights into multiple histories of the MRSP constitution?

*RQ2.* How can ANTi-History assist the researcher in bringing to light the complex and multiple socio-political relations once concealed in the official history as a black box?

*RQ3.* Who are the actors involved, what are their roles and how do they compete in a struggle for constructing collective memories of the past?

To answer the above questions, we investigated several documental and oral sources, adopting ANTi-History premises and orientations. The analysis showed the actors involved, and placed them within the context of a period that saw considerable social upheaval and political re-democratisation that were a feature of this critical transition in Brazilian society. As the main result, we were able to identify forty actors involved in the constitution process, a number much higher than the two actors listed in the MRSP’s website, which exposed the simplification of the black boxed official history and the
concealment of various relations and movements performed by multiple actors that were silenced.

The emancipatory potential of ANTi-History lies in its ability to legitimize multiple accounts of the past, questioning history as a pregiven, static, absolute, imposed and unique interpretation of the past. According to Durepos and Mills (2012, p. 131), “providing multiple histories creates the conditions for liberating actors from interpretations of the past that are constraining or disenfranchising.” Multiplicity, therefore, “pertains to the emergence or performance of different versions of one phenomenon that stems in different sets of relations” and “assumes that there are active conditions of possibility within the relations of actors, which allow for different enactments of one phenomenon” (Durepos and Mills, 2012, p. 107, emphasis in original). In this way, previously silenced actors that were taken-for-granted in official histories can be heard or are given a voice in alternative historical narratives.

For a better understanding of ANTi-History potential and its empirical use, the work was structured as follows: the article begins with a brief review of the Historic Turn and the valuable approximation of Administration and History areas, in order to contextualize the emergence of ANTi-History. Then, is presented a discussion of ANTi-History main concepts and premises, including Actor-Network Theory (ANT), that supported its development as an alternative historical method. The third section contextualizes the organization, namely, the MRSP, and defends the importance and the re-significance of its constitution within the context of uncovering the hidden memories of repressive regimes as required by transitional justice. Finally, we illustrate this empirically by adopting ANTi-History to follow multiple actors and their translation movements during the early stages of MRSP’s constitution process. We contend that by giving transparency to the mobilizations of actor-networks within the process and to the actors’ negotiations and power disputes over memory, it is possible to give a voice to the silenced actors in the MRSP’s official history.

**ANTI-History and the historic turn in management and organization studies**

During the second half of the twentieth century, when it developed as a distinct and separate subject, Management and Organizational Studies (MOS) was strongly influenced by the North American scientific view that resulted in History being side-lined and research assuming a singularly ahistorical nature (Kieser, 1994; Üsdiken and Kieser, 2004). This situation remained until almost the end of the twentieth century. From the 1990s onward, however, we saw the emergence of a movement to reunite these two fields, which has continued to this day (Zald, 1993; Kieser, 1994; Üsdiken and Kieser, 2004; Booth and Rowlinson, 2006; Mills et al., 2016).

This “increasing call for an historical perspective” movement in MOS was labeled as historic turn (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004, p. 331) and sought to promote a more profound and critical problematization to the ‘universalist’ approach – when theories are applied to phenomena in any society at any time – and ‘presentist’ – when there is no contextualization or historical precedents considered for the analysis – of the organizational theories in the social sciences. It is, therefore, an alternative path to a mainstream positivist MOS, where ‘the search for general and abstracted laws’ made ‘social science cut itself off from history’ (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006, p. 6). Thus, continue the authors, “we would therefore expect the historic turn to lead to greater reflection on the historical methods appropriate for studying organizations” (2006, p. 9). It also allows for the development of views and knowledge that differ from those that are hegemonic or “naturalized” by society, thereby enriching our knowledge of organizations in the present, as highlighted by Kieser (1994).
To that end, Booth and Rowlinson (2006) encouraged a historical orientation in MOS, whose agenda included calls for “historical methods and styles of writing – alternative methods and diverse styles of writing appropriate for studying organizations historically” (2006, p. 5). In particular, the authors expected that a “methodological reflection and experimentation in historical writing” would involve “further engagement with the philosophy of history and historical theorists” (2006, p. 10).

Aligned with this call to adopt a more conscious and reflexive attitude of the researcher and assuming that historical accounts are not unchanging traditions, insofar as the researcher looks at the past from the eyes of the present, one can expect that new interpretations and new historical narratives emerge over time. In this sense, ANTi-History is “both an answer to and a problematization of the call for more history in MOS” (Durepos and Mills, 2017, p. 53). Durepos and Mills (2017) contend that the development of ANTi-History approach went to “explore the various relational activities that go into the production of knowledge of the past” (2017, p. 57) and emphasize that:

[...]

In other words, a relational history is “localized” and “engender a strong political engagement with the real world” (2017, p. 59).

As a consequence, the researcher is allowed to investigate phenomena and understand the current conditions of the organizations, the actors involved and the context in which they are inserted in a more comprehensive, critical and ethical way. It is also possible to question the bases on which the historical knowledge itself is generated and to investigate which groups are benefited by a specific interpretation of the past, besides possible silencing of alternative versions.

**ANTi-History as an alternative critical historiography**

Created by Gabrielle Durepos and Albert J. Mills in 2009, ANTi-History was a response to the call of the Historic Turn as a historicized methodology. The approach “draws on and extends beyond three literatures, namely, ANT (Lee and Hassard, 1999; Latour, 2005), the sociology of knowledge (Marx and Engels, 1846/1971; Mannheim, 1968/1985) and postmodern historiography (Jenkins, 1991; Munslow, 2010, 2012)” as theoretical contours (Durepos and Mills, 2017, p. 53).

ANTi-History is a relational approach to doing history. In other words, it assumes a history socially constructed that emerges from interactions of heterogeneous actors, and it is, thus, situated as an outcome of its constitutive relationships (Durepos and Mills, 2011, 2012, 2017). It is important to highlight that by actor it is considered every element, human and nonhuman, with capacity to act on or alter the course of action of others, in this way, it “denies that people are necessarily special” (Law, 1992, p. 3) in the study of social phenomena (Durepos and Mills, 2011, 2012), according to the principle of symmetry drawn from ANT (Latour, 2005).

It is important to note, therefore, that as the (re)configuration of the social goes through constant and dynamic modifications, history, as knowledge of the past, keeps on changing configurations as its constituent actor-networks keep moving and establishing new connections in an on-going movement. By assuming these premises, ANTi-History rejects the notion of a singular history and legitimize multiple ways of telling historical narratives, instead. In this sense, history is not a static representation of the past and ANTi-History
approach allows us to explore the conditions in which histories, or knowledge of the past, are produced.

Besides relationalism, another central aspect of ANTi-History is reflexivity. Durepos and Mills (2012, p. 5) emphasize the importance of recognizing the role of the researcher in the narrative and contend that the adoption of ANTi-History approach:

Should involve clear attempts by the researcher to situate themselves as part of their research and illustrate how their presence acts as an active force in creating and influencing the history that is told.

That is, to explicitly assume that the interpretation of the researchers of any phenomenon is based on their experiences, idiosyncrasies and experiences, which must result in their inclusion as an element in the heterogeneous network from which a possible historical narrative will emerge. It is, therefore, a sine qua non premise for an ANTi-History researcher to adopt a reflexive posture and include herself/himself as an actor in the phenomenon investigated.

The three main concepts and premises of ANTi-History for a better understanding of its potential contribution and adoption in Management and Organizational Studies are briefly presented below.

**A modern ontology and social constructionist epistemology**

Because of its ontologically amodern nature, ANTi-History draws on ANT and renounces all categorisations imposed by modern thinking, counters dualisms and reductionisms and adopts a relational approach to study phenomena. There is no absolute and universal truth, and there are no beginnings or ends (Durepos and Mills, 2012). Instead, what we have is a continuous process of becoming, as reality is socially constructed by ever-changing actor-networks in continuous translation movements. One can assume, therefore, that different forms of social understanding are always partial, to the extent that they are constructed based on the reference framework of an entity or actor-network and its dynamic relationships.

In this sense, amodern academics have redirected the focus of their attention to the processes of transitory, dynamic and unstable (re)arrangements of the social, adopting a relational lens and moving away from pre-established visions and categories, such as human and nonhuman. In other words, they started looking “processually” at the relations between heterogeneous actors (Durepos and Mills, 2011, p. 709, emphasis in original).

By challenging the privilege conceded historically by modern thinking to unobtrusive, permanent, structured, stable, ordered and preconstituted representations of the social, one can assume the impossibility of creating knowledge of the social based on certainties. Durepos (2009, p. 109, emphasis in original) reiterates the criticism of this realist ontology, arguing that “it is impossible to assume certainly that our knowledge of the past can represent the past as it was”, as one assumes the past as “ontologically unavailable” (Durepos and Mills, 2017, p. 57).

**Relationalism**

Given its ontologically relational nature, ANTi-History seeks to understand emerging social phenomena through interactions among their constituent actor-networks. Social is understood as a verb, as “an emergent process of becoming” (Durepos and Mills, 2011, p. 710) and no longer as a noun. In this sense, any phenomenon can only be analysed as part of a set of established relationships and not in a separate way, as its very characteristics and attributes are only obtained because of such associations.

Contrary to ANT, the focus of ANTi-History is not directed at the study of phenomena in the present time, but rather at understanding the present constitution based on a past...
condition. Thus, ANTi-History puts forward arguments aimed at breaking with the static concepts of the past and history, endowing the production of knowledge of the past with a more fluid, variable and relational nature. Therefore, it considers that the constitution of society at a time-before-now, or the socio-past, also occurs as a result of associations and translations between actors while they dedicate themselves to doing or performing history (Durepos and Mills, 2011, 2012, 2017).

In this way, “relationalism means looking at the politics of representing the past by tracing actors symmetrically (treating each with the same curiosity) and surfacing the past-as-history in its multiplicity” (Durepos et al., 2012, p. 269). By assuming that all knowledge about the past is partial, positioned and distributed through a heterogeneous network, one can argue that the construction of knowledge per se occurs through socio-political relations and power established during the translation of multiple actor-networks. Hence, there is no “neutrality”.

**Performative anti-History: socio-past and the multiple possible ways of (re) telling the past**

If one considers that for ANT, knowledge is the product of the ordering of human and nonhuman elements, then the creation of knowledge with regard to the past, in other words, history, is also the result of the ordering of actor-networks through a dynamic process that occurred in the socio-past and was not defined a priori (Durepos, 2009; Durepos and Mills, 2011; Myrick et al., 2013). History is not given, but rather constituted and performed through the associations of actors, emerging as an extreme-aligned actor-network that is the result of such movements, associations and negotiations. Thus, these actors, by translating and associating with each other, make history, perform history and establish distinct results, in other words, different versions of history: “a specific constitution of the past comes into being through the associations and translations of actors as they engage in doing history” (Durepos and Mills, 2011, p. 711 – emphasis in original). The creation of knowledge about the socio-past is, therefore, multiple. According to this statement, ANTi-History is “prohistories” and “anti-History” (Durepos and Mills, 2012, pp. 118-119, emphasis in original).

**Clandestine memories and sites of memory dedicated to resistance**

In the case of the present study, understanding the MRSP’s official history, as a black box, using an ANTi-History approach, primarily allows one to recognize the multiplicity of possible versions of the history that led to the creation of this organization, as well as the actors and negotiations involved. It also allows one to recognize the contribution that the MRSP makes as a site of memory in the fight against forgetting and silencing violations against human rights that occurred in the building that once housed the DEOPS-SP.

Memory, according to Nora (1989, pp. 8-9), is “perpetually current”, spontaneous, dynamic, multiple and subject to constant evolution because of its nature that is “vulnerable to manipulations and appropriations”. Because it is socially constructed on a continuous and collective basis in the present (Pollak, 1989, 1992), memory is configured as a link with the past, a bridge in constant change, as each coming and going of memory between the present and the past ends up changing its constitution.

In this way, no dialogue involving the past and the present can possibly be neutral and ANTi-History approach inquiries what “interests are served by a particular historical telling” (Durepos and Mills, 2012, p. 88), considering the multiple possibilities of creating knowledge about the past (Myrick et al., 2013). As pointed out by Rigney (2012, p. 252), “collective forgetting and collective remembering are equally complex processes”. In this sense, one should carefully consider the power relations that lie subjacent to any movement of memory, as the sharing – recovery, diffusion and consequent position strengthening – or
the forgetting of certain interpretations of the past are aligned with the objectives of a dominant group, which defines, as per its own unique agenda and interests, whether this version of history should be on exhibition, or be buried.

However, there are silences and “things unsaid” that are transformed into contestations and demands, such as the ones raised by transitional justice context, that only emerge under certain circumstances and socio-political conditions, to give voice, before society as a whole, to hidden memories whose sharing had previously been restricted. More than a mere dispute between antagonistic versions of history (official, formal, hegemonic vs unofficial, silent, forgotten), Genro and Abrão (2010, p. 21) argue that in a “post-authoritarian and traumatic scenario for a political society, we need to exercise our memories”. As Zerubavel (1993, p. 458) highlighted, this is possible because of the dynamic nature of the past as “as our present social situation changes, so does our perception of our common past”.

The verification of crimes and human rights violations committed during the Brazilian dictatorship (1964-1985) within the context of transitional justice involves analysing documents and witness statements that enable one to revise and readdress the official hegemonic and dominant versions (Costa and Silva, 2017). A process that was legitimized through a series of international policies, transitional justice seeks to overcome the legacy of authoritarianism and effectively establish the constitutional right to reparation in those countries that experienced dictatorial regimes, as in the case of Brazil. The search for reparation, truth and justice can be achieved in a variety of ways. These include the opening up of political police archives, exposing torturers through public initiatives, changing the names of streets, schools, monuments and others that exalt military leaders of the period, revising the history as told in school books and finally, but no less importantly, seeking legitimacy for sites of memory dedicated to resistance, such as the MRSP (Almeida, 2014).

If one of the requirements for constituting a site of memory is a desire to remember (Nora, 1989) and that, in principle, memory is selective and the result of a conciliation between individual and collective memories, then giving a voice to memories that have been silenced becomes all the more critical in reconstructing the recollections of a society. This is the case of memories of resistance, which remain hidden and clandestine until the moment they can bring their narratives and declarations to the public’s attention.

It is essential, then, to give visibility to the process of constituting sites of memory dedicated to resistance in any society. Analysing and understanding how sites of memory dedicated to resistance, such as the MRSP in the Brazilian socio-political context are created allows us to reflect on the multiplicity of the possible narratives that lie behind a hegemonic version of events, as well as uncovering the movements of the actors involved, their power relations and their political agendas during the whole process.

Thus, assuming that “memorial spaces are spaces of organizing where the staging and arrangement of collective memory is negotiated and contested” (Allen and Brown, 2016, p. 11), the initiative to investigate the constitution process of the MRSP, takes on an important role in the process of organizing and legitimizing these alternative or clandestine memories. In a broader and more current sense, sites of memory still serve as an:

[...] extrajudicial mechanism of symbolic reparation and as a way to involve the State in its management, publicly and officially expressing its rejection of the violations committed by its agents, which have so often been denied (Soares and Quinalha, 2011, p. 80).

Thus, highlighting and giving transparency to the socio-political and power relations that are subjacent to the constitution of an organization such as the MRSP, as well as the ongoing process of (re)configuration and resignification of the space as a site of memory dedicated to resistance, only increase the importance of looking more closely at the
intentionalities associated with that which was “recovered” and the interpretations of the past according to the agendas and interests of specific actors.

One should carefully analyse the process that led to the organization’s official history from a critical perspective, as the selection and recovery, sharing, diffusion and strengthening of certain views may corroborate versions of history, narratives or memories to the detriment of others, which in turn, will be silenced. Uncovering clandestine and hidden memories as an integral part of the minority and dominated cultures has the potential to rehabilitate that which is peripheral and marginalized and its opposition to the official memory (Pollak, 1989).

Methodology
According to the principles of ANTi-History, by following the movements and focusing on the relationships of different human and nonhuman actors, the researcher privileges the empirical traces over any theoretical, pre-given framework and does not impose, under any circumstance, a pre-created plot. Thus, all the associations, translations and negotiation efforts, persuasion and (de)mobilization manoeuvres performed by the heterogeneous actors were identified empirically, after analysing multiple sources. The researchers sought to turn the historical narrative related to the MRSP’s constitution process more transparent, putting together one of the possible versions of this phenomenon by (re) assembling the socio-politics of its constituent actors.

As ANT scholars have shown, all forms of knowing – and actors of different natures – should receive the same curiosity and attention, that is, they should be treated symmetrically (Law, 1992). In this way, the search for data to be used in the present analysis resulted in the selection of a variety of different oral and documental sources, including – but not restricted to – interviews with former political prisoners, institutional books and videos, archives of testimonials, newspaper reports, dissertations, the websites of actors identified during the investigation, the Centre for the Preservation of Political Memory, the Forum of Former Inmates and Political Prisoners of the State of São Paulo, the Culture Secretariat of the State of São Paulo, Laws, the MRSP organization itself and reports from the Brazilian National Truth Commission.

Analysis
Point of departure
We began by searching the organization’s official website and according to the information found there, the MRSP “is an initiative of the Government of the State of São Paulo run by its Culture Secretariat”. “Linked to the Pinacoteca Art and Culture Association (APAC)”, the Memorial is described as “an institution dedicated to the preservation of references to the memories of political resistance and repression in Brazil” (MRSP, 2017).

From the outset, therefore, the official website appears to highlight, including through the use of visual aids such as logotypes and links, just two actors involved in the creation of the MRSP. Nevertheless, throughout additional searches and analyses of documents from other sources, including visits to the MRSP to look through its archives and to take part in educational initiatives, interviews, and additional investigations into the path taken in preparing the Museological Plan, other elements, both human and nonhuman began to emerge.

One of these elements was the very building in which the MRSP is currently located, one with a vast and rich history that was mentioned in some detail in a number of different sources (Almeida, 2014; Gumieri, 2012; Neves, 2011a). Unfortunately, the recent past of human rights violations, that took place during the civil-military dictatorship (1964-1985),
somewhat overshadowed part of the building's history and led to a series of political disputes that resulted in a gap of 23 years between the first request (made in 1976 and shelved) and the official listing of the building announced in the Official Federal Government Gazette (Diário Oficial da União) in 1999.

Numerous reasons were found to support the central role assigned to the building within the process of the MRSP's creation, and the central ones are listed below:

- The importance of symbolic and moral reparation to former inmates and political persecutees, those killed or missing and their families, within the context of transitional justice.
- The vital role of exercising the duty of memory and social mobilization to ensure that human rights violations of the past are never forgotten.
- The moral, extensive and official condemnation of crimes committed as a cornerstone of the construction of the memory of individuals that are part of our society within a culture of human rights and citizenship.
- The preservation of the memory of individuals who were victims of the severe violations of human rights, as per Guideline No.28 of the report by the National Truth Commission, whose objectives, among others, were: “to preserve, restore, and promote the listing or the creation of memorials in urban or rural buildings in which serious human rights violations were committed” (Brasil - CNV, 2014, p. 974).

In view of this, the building – a non-human element – was considered as one of the main actors in this process, influencing and guiding the negotiations and actively engaging in socio-politics with other actors through its significant standing within Brazilian society, until it was finally reinvented as a site of memory dedicated to resistance. For this reason, the listing of the building in 1999 (Figure 1) was chosen as the first step of our investigation. Nevertheless, it is important to highlight that even though the building’s listing was considered an essential and fundamental condition, it was not sufficient to ensure or guarantee the transformation of the space into a site of memory, as it took a further 10 years – from 1999 to 2009 – of negotiations and translations of multiple actors to establish and open the MRSP to the general public.

Definition of the Turning Points in the process of constituting the MRSP

According to the concept of a network envisaged by the ANT, it is understood that the characteristics of ordering and stability are not necessarily associated with the alternative topology of a network. The integrity of the constituted network is based on the stabilisation of these sets of relationships and this subverts some of the dichotomies imposed by Euclidian geometry – and its “natural” forms –, such as “inside/outside”, “far/close” or “big/small” (Latour, 1996, p. 6). A network is only as strong as its capacity to disseminate and to latch/plait/connect its weakest links/elements (Latour, 1996, 1999).

In an attempt to draw a schematic model with the Turning Points identified during the analysis without a false chronological linearity being imposed, we decided to use a mesh or net, through which concepts such as fluidity, folds and overlaps in a topology that can vary according to the associations made by its constituent elements might be more visible to the reader (Figure 1). It is worth noting, however, that there is an intrinsic and inexorable simplification in the proposed model, given the impossibility of capturing all the interrelated events that took place between or simultaneously at the Turning Points.

In considering:

- the very long period it took to constitute the MRSP (33 years), from the very first request for the building to be listed, in 1976, to its inauguration, in 2009; and
the multiplicity and complexity of the actor-networks established during this trajectory, the researchers were able to define six Turning Points (six defining moments that helped ensure that the MRSP could be constituted and eventually inaugurated).

Below, we present a brief narrative of two Turning Points (out of six) – the listing of the old DEOPS/SP building and the manoeuvres related to social mobilization’s actors – to illustrate how the actors were followed and their socio-political movements identified at early stages of the MRSP’s constitution process.

In this sense, it is important to emphasize that the purpose of this article was to present ANTi-History’s potential contribution as an alternative critical approach to doing history and to illustrate its ontological power through an empirical research in MOS. Therefore, this paper limits itself to offer an in-depth example of adopting ANTi-History, as it presents only some of the developments from a broader research that resulted in a new historical narrative of MRSP’s constitution. We will not go into too many details regarding the other Turning Points; instead, we will provide a broader perspective of these at the end of the Analysis section.

First turning point: the listing of the DEOPS/SP building
On 9 July 1999, the old DEOPS/SP building was listed after 23 years following the filing away of the first application made by the CONDEPHAAT (Council for the Defence of
At this initial stage, it was not possible to identify any trace of specific mobilization by the actors involved in terms of transforming this space into a site of memory dedicated to resistance. Instead, the move appeared to be focused on merely listing the building, along with other buildings located in the central region of São Paulo, as part of a heritage policy brought in by CONDEPHAAT, a public entity created by the government of São Paulo through Law No. 10,247 of 1968.

This heritage policy was the result of concerns at the CONDEPHAAT over a possible break with the city’s past and the destruction of its symbolic heritage caused by real estate speculation, which was already doing away with much of the region’s old structures and characteristics (Almeida, 2014; Gumieri, 2012). According to the document that reopened the collective listing process, No. 24,506 in 1986 (São Paulo, 1986), “a significant set of buildings and urban spaces remain as invaluable testimonies of the period of formation and development [of the region]”. Thus, it seems reasonable to assume that the listing application for the building made in 1976, filed away in 1980 and then reopened in 1986, was largely based on the building’s architectural features and eclectic style, rather than on the fact that it had been occupied by the DEOPS/SP from 1940 to 1983 (Almeida, 2014; Neves, 2011b). This observation was shared by Almeida (2014, p. 278), who stated that “an important part of the building’s history would be silenced through the listing process”, and supported by the document No. 24,506 (São Paulo, 1986) and CONDEPHAAT resolutions (Secretaria de Cultura, 2017), which makes no mention of the DEOPS/SP, but rather refers to the value of this architectural complex in the region.

One should point out, that in 1976, the year in which the listing process was initiated by CONDEPHAAT, the building was still occupied by the DEOPS/SP, which may explain why the entity’s technical team had so much difficulty in obtaining the necessary permits to carry out inspections at the site and to access the building’s blueprints, which eventually led to the application being denied and archived in 1980 (Almeida, 2014; Neves, 2011b). In this way, it is possible to argue that CONDEPHAAT’s efforts in negotiating with DEOPS/SP, however persistent and significant, were not successful and could not enroll and mobilize this key actor, in line with ANTi-History principles.

It is important to stress that the reopening of the application for a collective listing in 1986 – after a gap of 10 years –, and now with all the necessary documentation duly attached, only occurred after the civil-military dictatorship ended (1985), and the DEOPS/SP was closed down (Decree No. 20,728 of 04/03/1983). This fact offers a relevant indication as to the political power relations that prevented the listing process from proceeding during the dictatorial regime years.

Further regarding this and according to the National Truth Commission (CNV) report, the general management of the DEOPS/SP between 1977 and 1982 was in the hands of the former head of the Secret Service, Romeu Tuma. This police chief later became Federal Police Superintendent for the State of São Paulo between 1983 and 1985, after the DEOPS/SP closed down, and was then promoted to General-Director of the Federal Police Force, a position he held until 1992. Romeu Tuma was also elected twice as Senator for the State of São Paulo.

Although:

[...] there is no proof that Tuma took part in sessions of torture at the DEOPS/SP, the fact is that he worked for years in a building where such activities took place, as head of its Secret Service (Brasil - CNV, 2014, p. 166).
This proximity raised some questions about his knowledge of these acts of violence: “a reserved document from the extinct Deops proves that Federal Police Superintendent, Romeu Tuma, […] knew the whereabouts of at least six missing political prisoners” (Filho, 1992).

By investigating his biography, one can observe how strong and powerful his socio-political ties were within the State of São Paulo. Therefore, it is not unreasonable to attribute some of the difficulties encountered in accessing the building and obtaining the necessary documentation for the listing process to his administration and political influence (Filho, 1992; Mayrink, 1992; Quadros, 1992, 1994a, 1994b). According to ANTi-History, it is then perfectly plausible to consider that this actor’s translation movements were able to counter-enroll other actors, by obfuscating various efforts made to list the building.

In other words, the DEOPS/SP actor, represented by its spokesperson, Romeu Tuma, was not translated or mobilized by the other actors. Neither social mobilization, nor the efforts of CONDEPHAAT staff, nor even the building’s social history were able to negotiate the building’s listing process with DEOPS/SP management during its administration of the same. In this way, the changes that occurred in the Brazilian context during the past years of the civil-military dictatorship, with the slow opening up of political freedoms and the closing down of this particular department of the political police force, may have contributed to the listing process being completed, thereby reducing its powers to veto access for CONDEPHAAT employees to the installations occupied by the DEOPS/SP up until 1983.

This change in the Brazilian social and political context could also be observed in the text of the listing resolution No. 28 of 1999 (São Paulo, 1999), where it is possible to identify a new narrative that recognizes the recent history of the building’s occupation by the DEOPS/SP. The document seems to reinforce this change by increasing the historical value of the building to beyond its mere architectural style, to additionally include the structure of prison cells and the use of the place by the DEOPS/SP, thereby recognizing, if only in passing, its recent past under the dictatorship, as highlighted below:

Article 1 – We confirm the listing, as a cultural asset of interest to the social memory of São Paulo, of the building located at Praça General Osório, Nos 66, 88, 120 and 136, “the former DOPS”, which was built to house warehouses for the Sorocabana Railway […] The complex of cells, the result of the occupation of the building by the DOPS, represents a significant portion of its historical value. This complex will be preserved together with the original elements of the project (São Paulo, 1999– italics by the researchers).

The listing of this building can, therefore, be defined as an Obligatory Passage Point (OPP) in the network constituting this Memorial, as it represents a question of interest to all the actors – regardless of how their individual objectives might differ – and without which not one of them would be able to achieve their goal, as explained by ANT (Callon, 1999). The building’s listing constituted an essential stage in the process, a necessary hurdle to ensure that actors such as CONDEPHAAT, the Culture Secretariat of the State of São Paulo, the building itself and different Social Mobilizations might be able to achieve their goals, which was only made possible in 1999 after the demobilization of the DEOPS/SP actor and the emergence of a socio-political conjuncture that favoured popular demands, as shown below in Figure 2.

Focusing on the actors’ movements identified in the early stages of the process to constitute the MRSP allowed researchers to begin to understand the complexity of the socio-politics performed by the actors involved in the phenomenon. To illustrate this, we can highlight the building itself, whose listing process, contrary to what one might have initially assumed, was not primarily motivated by the transformation of the space into a site dedicated to the memory of resistance. One of the actors identified in the First Turning
Point, social mobilizations, performed a critical role in the transformation process of the DEOPS/SP’s building and its trajectory will be presented in the following Turning Point.

**Second turning point: social mobilization, an ever-changing and essential actor**

The Brazilian socio-political context of the 1980s and 1990s, marking as it did the end of the civil-military dictatorship, the shutting down of the political police, the emergence of initiatives and vindications of different social groups in the sense of bringing to light and giving transparency to the events of that recent past in accordance with the guidelines of transitional justice, may have jointly helped to confirm the listing of the building in 1999, 23 years after the first application was made by CONDEPHAAT.

In this way, other actors, besides CONDEPHAAT, appeared in the documents as crucial participants in the translation process to ensure the listing took place, forming a dynamic movement of social mobilization. However, unlike CONDEPHAAT, which was demobilized once the building was listed, these social mobilization actors appeared to perform continuously until the MRSP was finally opened, changing its shape and constitution along the way, in a continuous process of becoming. By looking processually at the interactions and focusing on these actors’ translation movements, new insights have emerged regarding our social understanding of the MRSP’s constitution, as proposed by the ANTi-History principle of relationalism.

According to the documents investigated, the 1980s and 1990s period was marked by a number of initiatives on the part of these social groups, in which they mobilized commissions and organizations and confronted the Public Authorities to demand that the past be brought to light. Members of the Commission of the Families of the Political Dead and Missing, claimed in an interview that this period was an “immense pilgrimage” in the
search for information in various government offices (Filho, 1992). Another newspaper article emphasizes the mobilisations and manoeuvres performed by this actor, stating that:

[... ] after more than a year of trying to obtain permission to search the Deops archives, the Family Commission managed to visit the secret room where they were kept eight years ago, on the 5th floor of the Federal Police building [...].

On that occasion, Romeu Tuma handed over the custody of DEOPS/SP archives to São Paulo Government (Jornal do Brasil, 1991).

This plethora of documents revealed the continuous efforts and negotiations performed by these groups, which included the opening up of the DEOPS/SP archives, that were only made public at the end of 1994 after being transferred to the Culture Secretariat, as shown below:

The Department was shut down in 1983, but its archives were transferred to the headquarters of the Federal Police in São Paulo, where they remained for eleven years inaccessible to the public. During this period, the documents were placed under the custody of today’s senator Romeu Tuma, the last director of Deops who transferred it to the Federal Police in 1983. There is a suspicion that the archives were ‘sanitized’ (Marques, 1997 – italics by the researchers).

It is possible to observe the vestiges of the different struggles that took place at that time, beginning with access to the archives and the location of the remains of missing political prisoners, as well as the symbolic and financial reparation of those who had had their human rights violated by practices of torture perpetrated by government agents. The role of such social mobilizations was even more relevant in light of the reactive posture, with a characteristic emphasis on secrecy, of the Brazilian Government when confronted with demands for access to archives from the dictatorship period (Rodrigues, 2011, p. 258).

Thus, traces of social mobilization could be found in the foundation of commissions and NGOs, including, among others, Tortura Nunca Mais (França and Falcão, 1996; Folha de São Paulo, 1992a, 1996; Neri, 1995) the Commission of the Families of the Political Dead and Missing (Jornal do Brasil, 1991; Marques, 1997; Folha de São Paulo, 1990a, 1990b, 1990c, 1992b, Galhardo, 1998; Rossetti, 1992; Styker, 1994) and the Special Commission for the Political Dead and Missing (CEMDP – initials in Portuguese – created by Law No. 9,140 of 1995) (França and Falcão, 1996; Folha de São Paulo, 1996). These organizations appeared for the first time as relevant actors whose members later founded other groups throughout the process of constitution of the MRSP, such as the Centre for the Preservation of Political Memory and the Forum of Former Inmates and Political Prisoners of the State of São Paulo.

In the case of the latter, the documents investigated indicated a desire for symbolic, moral and financial reparation for former political prisoners of the State of São Paulo as being the main objective of the Forum, showing a strong commitment to this cause. By enrolling and mobilizing other actors, the Forum expanded its associations and its capacity to act before the Public Authorities and other entities involved in the search for reparation. Initiatives such as the continuous monitoring of laws, from their drafting to their publication, as in the case of the sanctioning of the Reparation Law in the state of São Paulo (No. 10,726 of 2001) before a similar law was passed at federal level, corroborate the strength and significance of the role played by the Forum.

According to the traces we found, it seems that some of the Forum members were demobilized once reparation had been granted by the Government, while others remained very active and participative during some of the most critical stages of the MRSP’s creation. The latter attended meetings with the Culture Secretariat representatives to argue for the conversion of the space into a site of memory and with the multidisciplinary team
responsible for the Museological Plan’s elaboration and execution. Later, they founded the Centre for the Preservation of Political Memory.

During an interview, a former political prisoner explained that the Forum “was basically constituted to help in the reparation process” and that some of its members wanted to “position the Forum in claims other than that of financial reparation alone”, so they founded the Centre for the Preservation of Political Memory “dedicated to education initiatives and promotion of the past directed to the youth” (Interview M.P., 2017).

Even though it was not possible to learn all the reasons behind some of the actors’ actions, whether performed as representatives of the Forum organization or independently, it is plausible to conclude that those actions played a relevant role in the process and that the constitution of these NGO actors was fluid and very dynamic.

Nevertheless, it was not only through the actions of human elements that the process discussed here unfolded. Nonhuman actors were also identified as being part of the process of mobilizing society in the search for truth and reparation for human rights violations committed during the dictatorship. In this sense, books such as Direito à Memória e à Verdade “Right to Memory and Truth”, Dossiê Ditadura: Mortos e Desaparecidos Políticos no Brasil (1964-1985) The Dictatorship Dossier: Political Dead and Disappeared in Brazil (1964-1985) and “Brasil: Nunca Mais” Brazil: Never Again, were identified as immutable mobiles – a concept drawn from ANT – for their “capacity to fix knowledge and allow it to be disseminated far beyond its point of origin” (Hassard and Alcadipani, 2010, p. 9).

These books’ competences to retain, preserve and disseminate the histories and memories of former political prisoners and their relatives, transformed them into actors with a capacity for action from a distance, expanding associations and mobilizing more allies in the struggle for reparation, one of the fundamental dimensions of the process of democratic opening (Abrão and Torelly, 2010). In this way, it is plausible to assume that these non-human actors translated information, providing a greater awareness of the practices of torture and violations against human rights that occurred during the dictatorship, to the point of being cited in interviews with former political prisoners and appearing in various documents related to the Brazilian transitional justice process, as shown below:

[...] there is a milestone [of the transitional justice in Brazil], when President Lula launches the book Direito à Memória e à Verdade Right to Memory and Truth [he stands up and brings the book to the room, placing it in the center of the table where the interview was being conducted]. This is the result of a 10-year work by the Special Commission for the Political Dead and Missing [CEMDP] [...] and it is the first publication of the Brazilian Government that recognizes its role in the deaths and disappearances] (Interview M.P. - former political prisoner, 2017).

The initiatives of these different social mobilization actors were multiple, simultaneous and widespread during this time, reliving memories and claims of past violations in Brazilian society. These could be seen in the mass media coverage given to these actors at the time and in their successes in obtaining reparation from the Public Authorities. A schematic and simplified representation of the social mobilization actor-network is shown in Figure 3:

Finally, based on the actors’ social mobilization negotiation manoeuvres, it seems reasonable to assume that the intense struggles observed were mainly related to two dimensions of transitional justice:

(1) the search for the truth and the construction of a collective memory that takes into account those silenced during the dictatorship; and

(2) symbolic and moral reparation for former political prisoners and the relatives of the dead and missing.
The question is, what effect did these different actor-networks (counter)enrollments and (de)mobilizations have on the transformation of DEOPS/SP building into a site of memory of resistance? Is it plausible to link the search for transitional justice for a particular period in the Brazilian context with the MRSP’s constitution process?

In response to these questions, one may refer to Guideline No.28 of the National Truth Commission’s report, mentioned earlier in this study, that states that:

[...] measures should be taken to preserve the memory of the serious violations of human rights that occurred during the period investigated by the National Truth Commission [...] whose objectives, among others, were to preserve, restore, and promote the listing or the creation of memorials in urban or rural buildings in which serious human rights violations were committed (Brasil - CNV, 2014, v.1, p. 974).

Therefore, even though different actors have participated more actively in social mobilization according to one of the dimensions, it is reasonable to acknowledge the synergistic effect as a *sine qua non* condition for the legal-political scenario to be opportune to transitional justice and its practical proposed measures, such as the transformation of spaces of torture and violence during a dictatorship, like the DEOPS/SP building, into sites of memory of resistance, in this case, the Memorial of Resistance.
Other turning points: moving beyond simplification

By following the movements of the different actors over the course of the MRSP’s constitution, it was possible to observe that some were demobilized, new ones appeared at different stages and others simply changed their shape and constitution in accordance with the contexts of each one of the six Turning Points. It was possible to identify very different actors with very different interests, including NGO’s and books (already mentioned in the previous section), academics, exhibitions, plays and art shows (“Monitored Daily Life – Repression, Resistance and Freedom in the DOPS Archives 1924-1983” and “To remember is to resist” that were performed in the building before and during the refurbishment work), Laws and Amnesty Committees, just to name but a few.

In following the movements of the actors involved in the MRSP’s constitution process, some interesting points come to light. The most important of these refers to the time the process took to complete, having begun in 1976, when the civil-military dictatorship was still in power, only to be completed in 2009, no less than 33 years later. In this sense, one can trace a parallel with the process to constitute the Irish National War Memorial, as described by Ann Rigney (2008). The “stone”, the edification or the physical space only becomes a site of memory when it is recognized as such by the community within which it is located, which accepts and legitimizes certain memories as being part of national memory, bringing to the fore voices previously silenced. In other words, the listing of the old DEOPS/SP building did not necessarily signal the constitution of a site of memory dedicated to resistance but rather represented the first step to a new period of multiple projects and negotiations between groups to define the use of the space.

The Memorial of Resistance is, therefore, the result of a series of mobilizations that occurred at different stages of its constitution, whose processes of translation by the different actors involved resulted in the formation of actor-networks with intermediate purposes until the concept of resistance emerged and was consolidated through the transformation of the space into a site of memory of resistance. Therefore, understanding the context in which such claims were made, in different instances and by different actors within Brazilian society, was fundamental in helping us understand the relevance of the role of social mobilizations at the different stages of the transitional justice process until the moment of transformation of the old DEOPS/SP building into the Memorial of Resistance.

Conclusion

After years of intense negotiations and disputes involving various actor-networks, the Memorial of the Resistance of São Paulo was inaugurated on January 24, 2009 – 33 years after the first request to list the building of the old DEOPS/SP. The long process was marked by different (de) mobilizations of multiple actors and an ever-changing actor-network configuration, in a constant process of becoming, marked by translations that made up the social.

This article illustrates some of the results obtained from a more extensive research project that dealt with this important site of memory dedicated to resistance in Brazil. By adopting an ANTi-History approach, the researchers were able to bring to light certain complex socio-political relations concealed in the simplified official historical narrative of the MRSP’s creation. Although not all of the six Turning Points were presented in the article, the early stages of its constitution process (represented by the first and second Turning Points) demonstrated how the actors negotiated and mobilized allies to achieve their goals. Through their demands to have access to the archives and to be informed of the location of the remains of missing political prisoners, as well as their claims for symbolic and financial reparation, these actors’ manoeuvres and their implications were fundamental to the MRSP’s constitution.

In total, we identified forty actors, including ourselves in the actor-network according to ANTi-History’s premises, a number much higher than the two actors listed in the MRSP
official website (Pinacoteca of São Paulo and the Secretariat of Culture of the State of São Paulo). The prominent role conferred to just these two actors in the MRSP’s official history conceals the multiple associations made during the process to constitute this organization. Nevertheless, one could observe that some of them were not referred to in the official website, even though they played an essential role in the process, and this included the Forum and its members, who actively participated in different phases of the 33 year-process.

The present study also offers an empirical example of using the ANTi-History approach in the study of organizations. In demanding a reflexive and critical posture on the part of the researchers involved, this approach contributes to a deeper understanding of the phenomenon of constituting the MRSP and its official historical narrative, not to mention, providing a more contextualized understanding of this organization’s dynamics at the present time. Perhaps, this is the greatest challenge facing the researchers: letting go of preconceived ideas and becoming an apprentice when investigating the “associations between humans and nonhumans in their orchestration of the social” (Durepos and Mills, 2012, p. 106).

We contend that ANTi-History strength, that is its amodern and relational ontology in practice, was central for this research. By focusing on the interactions between actors and their efforts to mobilize allies during translations, it was possible to give transparency to relationships that became invisible and to identify silenced actors in the official version of the MRSP’s constitution. Also, by adopting a relational lens and privileging the actors’ voices instead of a preconceived framework, as proposed by ANTi-History, the researchers were able to follow the actors’ translation movements while they were performing history, which provided a degree of freedom but required, at the same time, an even more disciplined, critical and reflexive posture from us.

It should be stressed that the objective of our study was to bring to light what was left subjacent, unspoken or hidden under apparent simplicity stated in the official version. Thus, by recognizing the MRSP’s official history as being a black box, one is suggesting that the associations, mobilizations and negotiations that took place during the translations between the actors involved in the process of its constitution remain subjacent and invisible to all the other entities. As the constitution of the MRSP involved a large number of actors, including individuals from civil society, academics, politicians, social movement representatives, government representatives, artists and representatives of other memorial sites, in giving greater transparency to the power disputes and negotiations involved, different versions begin to emerge, evidence of the formation of actor-networks with different configurations and objectives up until the moment the MRSP was finally inaugurated, in 2009.

By adopting ANTi-History as an alternative critical historiography in the present study, the researchers were able to outline and clarify the different associations, negotiations, power relations, socio-political disputes and (de)mobilizations of multiple actors to be evidenced and become visible through their analysis. Thus, by investigating the phenomenon from a relational perspective, assuming that all knowledge about the past is collective, partial, distributed and constituted from heterogeneous materiality relations, the authors of this research were able to broaden the analysis framework and promote a deeper understanding of the context in which the constitution of the MRSP took place.

References
anchor=4074263&origem=busra&pd=2a698c58923c3250d49e26aa43b59d3 (accessed 5 December 2017).


Interview M.P (2017), Personal interview with M.P., former political prisoner and founder of the Centre for the Preservation of Political Memory, October 2017.


Further reading


Corresponding author
Renata Guimarães Quelha de Sá can be contacted at: renataquelha@gmail.com

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Contextual analysis and newspaper archives in management history research

David Bowie
Oxford School of Hospitality Management,
Oxford Brookes University, Oxford, UK

Abstract
Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to reveal, how newspaper archives can support contextualisation in management history research by providing quantitative and/or qualitative, accurate, contemporary and cost-effective, data which is not always available elsewhere.


Findings – The findings reveal that the concept of contextualisation is absent from recent management history articles and that few management historians use newspaper archival sources as a data collection strategy.

Research limitations/implications – There is compelling evidence to suggest that contextual analysis can – perhaps should – be incorporated into management historians’ research strategies because managerial organisations operate in open systems, which are influenced by external factors.

Originality/value – This paper juxtaposes two neglected aspects of management history research, contextuality and newspaper archives, and proposes that a key source for historic contextual analysis is newspaper data.

Keywords Methodology, Mixed-methods, Research methods, Case study research, Trade publications

Introduction
Historians are currently engaged in a philosophical debate about the uses of methodology in management history and the relationship between theoretical/empirical perspectives and post-modern critiques of history writing. One aspect of these debates is the role of contextual analysis, which incorporates external situational influences in management research (Galvin, 2014). Another aspect is the role of newspaper archives as source material, especially in case studies, which require multiple sources to support data collection and analysis (Batiz-Lazo, 2016). This article explores an often neglected data source in management history research – newspaper[1] archives – and investigates, how newspaper data can provide relevant contemporary perspectives to support contextual analysis in management history research.

Academic interest in the conceptualisation of context has developed significantly during the past two decades across a wide range of disciplines including management research (Johns, 2017). The growth is, especially, noteworthy in organisational
behaviour with its rich stream of contextual-driven research, since Rousseau and Fried’s (2001) seminal paper. Contextual analysis incorporates both a broader perspective of multiple environmental dimensions and specific contextual variables to ensure that external organisational drivers are fully recognised (Johns, 2006). Context is important because environmental influences have a significant impact on management and organisations (Tsui, 2006). One of the reasons why contextuality has emerged as a key construct in the design of management research is the recognition that heterogeneity exists across a wide range of organisations and people, both within and across countries; so much that one management journal actively encourages context-specific research (Galvin, 2014). Indeed Bamberger’s (2008, p. 839) call for management and organisational scholars to engage in more contextualisation in theory development, and his suggestion that “context counts [...] (and) [...] shapes the phenomena and relationships we study” is pertinent to management history researchers. Academics involved with contextuality research recognise the value of newspaper archives as a source of contemporary perspectives on the environmental context (Tsui, 2006).

The benefits of using newspaper archive data in historical research are well-documented. Newspapers offer an extensive range of easily accessible historic data (Hansen, 2004), providing a day-to-day chronology of events with contemporary political, economic and social commentary that was significant to people at the time (Tosh, 2010). “Newspapers provide long records of historical processes often not available” elsewhere and “much can be gained from their use” (Franzosi, 1987, p. 14). Indeed, important historical interpretations can be based upon the evidence from newspapers – especially about companies (Hansen, 2004) and management. Also, the “unique periodicity of the press” (Nicholson, 2013, p. 64) enables the studying of continuity and change in a myriad of ways. Bingham (2010) explained that because newspapers played a central role in British political, economic and cultural life, these archives are now an important source for historians – and this feature of the press is replicated in many other countries. Today, the ease with which academics studying both American and British history can access online digital newspapers from the seventeenth-century onwards has simplified the search function even further. So the advantages of using the press in historical research are significant. Clearly, newspaper archives provide relevant, rich and temporal data, which are used by historians in other fields (for example, political history) to support their discussion.

However, a survey of the management history literature reveals that many management historians are reluctant to use newspaper archives. The reason for this remains unclear; perhaps, it might be the complex issue of bias in print media. For example, Lamberg et al.’s (2014, p. 241) Nokia case study in Management and Organizational History (MOH) states, all articles published in newspapers and business magazines were excluded because “a set of exclusion criteria was established to reduce any bias related to subjectivity”. Because the theoretical benefits of contextualisation are well documented, the focus of this paper is the following question: “How, if at all, can newspaper archives be used for the purposes of contextualisation in management history research?”

The remainder of this paper is structured as follows. First, contextual analysis theory and the newspaper archive literature are succinctly reviewed. This review is followed by a description of the methodological procedure that was used to select and analyse publications that have drawn upon newspaper archives in the field of management history. The paper then discusses, how newspaper archives are currently used by management historians and what role, if any, contextualisation plays in it. The paper closes with a discussion/conclusion
section in which suggestions are made as to how newspaper archives can be successfully used for purposes of contextualisation and, indirectly, for the enhancement of management history theory development.

**Literature review**

**Contextual analysis**

The academic debate concerning “the conceptualisation of context and its role in management theory” has been discussed since the late 1970s (Bamberger, 2008, p. 839) and has produced a rich stream of research in contextualisation theory that continues to this day. Indeed, in an editorial for the *Journal of Management and Organization*, Galvin (2014, p. 1) explicitly called for context-specific research stating that “context matters”. Johns (2017), in his reflection on a decade of incorporating context in organisational research, observed that numerous disciplines and management studies have focussed on the critical role of context as part of a trend away from universalism.

Johns (2006, p. 386) defined context “as situational opportunities and constraints that affect the occurrence and meaning of organizational behavior as well as functional relationships between variables”. Poulis *et al.* (2013) suggest that context is a multi-dimensional array of phenomena, sites and events as opposed to a monolithic, homogeneous construct based on a single dimension. The external environment provides the context in which organisations operate; and the organisational environment provides the context in which individuals work. A contextual analysis means describing, understanding and theorising the phenomena within it. Contextual phenomena simultaneously provide opportunities and boundaries for organisations and individuals, which can enable or constrain actions (Welter, 2011, p. 165). Tsui (2006) argues that contextualisation is more than simply evaluating environmental opportunities and constraints; contextualisation comprises cognitions at the individual level, the organisation of role relations at the institutional level, the values and beliefs at the societal level and serendipity – described as major events such as wars, famine and discoveries, which significantly influence historical development. The 11 September 2001 terrorist attack in the USA is an example of an event, which has stimulated contextual analysis into work attitudes and behaviour (Johns, 2006). Context also includes “the culture, the political and legal system, the stage of economic development, or the economic system [...] the history, the geography, its ecology [...] and why a context is the way it is today” (Tsui, 2006, p. 1). Critically, a contextual environment fluctuates between periods of change and stability depending on the temporal dimension (Zahra *et al.*, 2014). Rousseau and Fried (2001, p. 2) emphasised the importance of contextualisation for organisational behaviour research “because it makes our models more accurate and our interpretation of results more robust”.

Johns (2006, p. 391) suggests two different levels of contextual analysis, namely, omnibus and discrete. The omnibus dimension takes a broad perspective using many variables; while the discrete focus on a specific contextual variable. The discrete variable nests within the omnibus context. Johns (2006) uses a journalistic story-telling analogy to explain an omnibus approach – the who, what, where, when and why – to place events in a comprehensive setting; and he draws on social and environmental psychology using task, social and physical variables to express the discrete dimension. In their analysis of contextualisation in international business case study research, Poulis *et al.* (2013, pp. 312-313) explore a wide range of contextual dimensions including “consumers’ cultural diversity, industry/product category, competitive, organisational, geographic, retail, and the temporal”.
From a historian’s perspective, the temporal dimension – “the time-frame associated with causal effect” (Rousseau and Fried, 2001, p. 8) is especially pertinent. Temporal factors influence economic and social relationships, which underpin organisational behaviour (Johns, 2006); and from an entrepreneurial viewpoint windows of opportunity, which are time-sensitive (Zhara et al., 2014). Johns (2006, p. 392) notes that “key contextual conditions underlying time effects include secular trends, changing institutional patterns, evolving technology (and) major organizational change”. The consequences of managerial strategic decisions become more evident with the passage of time (Zhara et al., 2014), although “the time lags in causal effects at the individual and firm levels probably differ” (Rousseau and Fried, 2001, p. 8). Bamberger (2008, p. 843) focusses on “how the meanings attached to different organizational phenomena vary across situations, time frames, and social units”.

A key approach to contextual research is the emphasis on “rich detailed description and informed reflection on the role that context plays in influencing meaning, variation and relationships among variables” (Rousseau and Fried, 2001, p. 7). This focus on the rich description at the micro level, linked to omnibus and/or discrete contextual variables, involves a multi-level analysis incorporating micro/macro levels and potentially intermediate meso-levels (Johns, 2006). The rich description is intrinsically connected to qualitative research methods and such an approach is inherent to contextualisation (Rousseau and Fried, 2001; Johns, 2006; Poulis et al., 2013; Johns, 2017). The importance of contextual analysis is derived from the fact that organisations are open systems, which are palpably influenced by external factors outside their control (Tsui, 2006); thus, context is a major influence in understanding the actions and behaviour of organisations and managers. Finally, Tsui (2006) suggests that to develop deep knowledge of the contextual situation, the research strategy should incorporate an analysis of relevant newspapers.

Newspapers
The locus of a newspaper ranges from the local, to the regional, national and international. Local media focus on the local news and events affecting local government, local companies, local people and organisations. Hansen (2004) suggests that local newspapers can provide a strong contextual perspective about a company; adverts, advertorials and press releases, which are authored by the business are a valuable data source for researchers. Some cities have strong links to specific industries and their local newspaper will chart the development of organisations, managers and the workforce involved in that industry over generations. Sheffield is internationally recognized as a centre for British cutlery manufacturing and its local newspaper, The Star, was a key source in Tweedale’s (2013) qualitative analysis of nineteenth-century local family cutlery firms.

The financial media, newspapers and magazines such as the Financial Times, Wall Street Journal and the Economist, are significant sources of the company, management and industry data. Hansen’s (2012) search for “shareholder value” in the New York Times from 1851 to 2011 revealed that the first time the phrase was used was in 1982. The phrase was then repeated more and more frequently into the twenty-first century; thus, demonstrating that the concept of shareholder value has had a significant impact since the 1980s, but is not intrinsic to capitalist society.

There are a vast number of special interest publications, which provide in-depth coverage of business, finance, literature, politics, society, hobbies and specific sports. There is a curious silence concerning the use of business and consumer magazines in the research methods literature. This is surprising, given the extensive number of publications devoted to specialist subjects in magazine publishing – especially business magazines. In the UK alone there are 5,100 business/trade magazine and 2,800 consumer titles (Magforum, 2018).
and many other countries also have comprehensive trade magazine archives. Mollan and Tennent (2015, p. 1058) note that the “trade press typically operated to supply practitioners with valuable information affecting their behaviour, giving us an insight into industry structure and practices”. Sedgwick et al. (2014) relied upon the Australian film industry’s weekly trade journal Everyones to provide extensive qualitative and quantitative data to evaluate competition in international film distribution in the 1930s.

Newspaper archives

Although “archival holdings are essential to historical scholarship” (Tosh, 2010, p. 90), Decker (2013, p. 159) notes that the “methodological treatment of archival work are rare”; and the methodological treatment of newspaper archives is even rarer. The Cambridge University Press (2017) defines an archive as “a collection of historical records relating to a place, organization or family”. A key issue relates to the authenticity of the records in an archive. Authenticity is dependent upon the provenance of the archival records from their creation and ownership throughout time to the present day (Theimer, 2012); thus, provenance is central to archive management (Jordanova, 2006, p. 162). Despite bias and the “silence” in archives (silence is a media studies concept where print media deliberately or unintentionally omits data, facts and information when reporting an event), archival material remains integral to historical research and “a sound anchoring in the past, the evidence, the archival record” underpins the historical narrative of reconstruction and representation (Decker, 2013, p. 161).

The role of newspaper archives in historical research is dependent upon the characteristics of the research question and the problem definition (Hansen, 2004). As newspapers and periodicals are public documents, which reflect issues relevant at the time of publication, they are unable to provide data about confidential, internal organisational matters. However, in the pre-internet era “newspapers […] often constitute the only available source of information” (Franzosi, 1987, p. 6) and “are useful, sometimes indispensable (sources) to the business historian” (Hansen, 2004, p. 99). Bingham (2010, p. 2) suggests that “perhaps the greatest virtue of newspapers for scholars is the wealth and diversity of content” and emphasises the enormous newspaper readership in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. This readership must have included virtually all businessmen, managers, politicians and trade union leaders. Indeed, newspapers are the most comprehensive and diverse public record of important events, issues and opinions – via the editorials and correspondence columns – of the time; and this record of events is not obtainable from other sources (Tosh, 2010). There is a strong tradition dating back to the mid-nineteenth century of investigative journalists carrying out in-depth research to highlight economic and social injustices (Tosh, 2010). Investigative reporting includes exposes of business and management malpractices, especially in broadsheets and the financial press. Journalists with established and credible reputations also write informed articles at the intersection between the private sphere of a company and the public sphere (Franzosi, 1987). A unique aspect of newspaper archives is their chronology of events, as they happened and from multiple perspectives. This feature enables the historian to analyse phenomena through the lens of the time, obtain deeper insights into the actions and reactions of the key players involved and use this circumstantial evidence to reveal hitherto unknown insights (Hansen, 2004).

Online newspaper archives

The digitalisation of newspaper archives has transformed the search process and this explosion of information on the Web has changed how archives are used. Theimer (2011,
p. 61) suggests that archives are now “open not closed […] transparent not opaque […] (and) […] user-centred not record centred”. Nicholson (2013) observed that the aggregation of online multi-title databases coupled with individual major title sites has enabled access to thousands of English language newspapers, magazines and periodicals. Newspaper archives can be used for quantitative and/or qualitative research; this flexibility enables historians to use newspaper sources either as the principal data collection method or as part of a mixed methods strategy. Batiz-Lazo (2016) cites numerous authors, who support the strategy of collating multiple sources of evidence, including newspapers and magazines, as relevant for obtaining contemporary perspectives. For historians wishing to adopt a triangulation methodology, the inclusion of newspaper archival sources is particularly pertinent. The debate about the primacy of primary over secondary data is less of an issue when using newspaper archives in historical research. Black and MacRaild (2007, pp. 90-92) suggest that the distinction between primary and secondary sources is “actually quite blurred” and separating sources into precise categories is not helpful.

Validity and bias
A key issue for historical researchers is determining the authenticity of relevant documents – this is called external criticism, which focusses on the credibility of the date of the document (Wood, 1990). Although there can be a problem with some forged historical documents, this is less of an issue with newspapers. In the case of newspaper archives, the provenance of titles and individual editions of a newspaper are well-established; it is rare for a newspaper document to be challenged on the grounds of its authenticity.

Another fundamental challenge is to determine whether the details in the document are credible – this is called internal criticism (Wood, 1990). Internal criticism focusses on individual statements within the document and is based upon the source. Sources can either be eye-witness or a non-witness. When an author is an eye-witness, and therefore, present at the event they are a primary witness and they are regarded as more credible than non-witnesses. This temporal proximity to the event lends credibility to the primary witness’s account; the greater the time-distance from the event, the less credible the account (Wood, 1990). Additional and critical elements in evaluating the credibility of an account are whether the primary witness was willing and able to tell the truth; and the competence of the witness – witnesses with “expert knowledge” are deemed to be more credible. Another way to explore the credibility of the witness is to understand the author’s motivation, the purpose of the document and who was the intended audience (Wood, 1990).

Different newspapers have different political stances, which cater for specific audiences, influence how proprietors, editors and reporters respond to events, and consequently shape how events are recorded. Hansen (2012) suggests that several documents should be evaluated from different sources to provide comparative and competing versions of an event; this helps to reduce the impact of bias from a single source. If possible, independent corroboration of the primary witness’s details are required, but sometimes so-called independent sources have derived their data from a solo source, so researchers need to explore and locate the origins of a source (Wood, 1990).

Bias in newspaper reporting can take many forms. The Gramscian perspective argues that newspapers and mass media are an integral element of capitalist societies and that journalism and news reflect the interests of the dominant economic group, especially when reporting on class and labour issues (Franzosi, 1987). Clearly, newspaper owners and their editors are selective in what and how events are reported in terms of political or social agendas (Agiridas, 2015). Another perspective recognises that editorials and features, which represent the newspaper’s viewpoint, are prone to
bias; but that the reporting of dates, hard facts and the people involved in an event are reasonably accurate (Franzosi, 1987). There is also the issue that bias in the mass media consists of emphasis and silence. The press as a source of historical data might omit information rather than be erroneous; and of course, information can be manipulated and distorted by the use of language – “language is the tool of media manipulation” (Franzosi, 1987, p. 7). A caveat concerns the relationship between companies and the media. Press statements, business personality profiles and adverts are an “expression of the company’s view” and constructs of the desired “public image” of the company, which therefore, need to be treated with caution (Hansen, 2004, pp. 109-110).

While bias is inherent in newspapers, bias can be managed. As the partisan opinions of a newspaper are discernible, authors should be able to balance differing political perspectives to reduce any potential bias by ensuring that multiple sources are incorporated in the analysis of an event. Although Mollan and Tennent (2015, p. 1057) recognised the “risk of the subjectivity of journalists and editors”, they justified the use of newspaper articles as an established business history research technique; particularly, where corporate archives are non-existent or difficult to access. They selected The Times, Financial Times and Economist as key sources because “they generally provided reliable business reporting […] they also operated as industry journals for finance in this period”. Indeed, in a Journal of Management History (JoMH) editorial note, Bowden (2016) argues that researchers need to know their sources; understand the historical context of the events and people involved; and use multiple sources to cross match evidence. The use of multiple sources enables authors to avoid the potential bias of depending upon only one source to represent press opinion of the time.

There appears to be a limited discussion of contextualisation in the management history literature. In fact, a keyword search of “contextual analysis”, “contextuality” and “situational analysis” in two leading management history journals, the JoMH and MOH, between 2013 and 2017 revealed that no article matched these words or phrases. Subsequent content and textual analysis of methodology sections confirmed that management historians did not incorporate contextual or situational analysis as a formal element in their research strategies. The absence is puzzling, given that contextual analysis has become such an important concept in the organisational literature. This suggests that two neglected aspects of management history, the theory of contextual analysis and the role of newspaper archives as a data collection strategy, require further research.

Data and method
A survey of research in management history was undertaken to establish the extent to which management historians use newspaper archives as a data collection method and to explore how management historians can adopt contextual analysis as an element in their research methodologies.

The process of reviewing the use of newspaper archives in the management history literature was akin to a systematic literature review (Fink, 2005), where a comprehensive search incorporated a wide range of journal databases and included articles published in two leading management history journals: JoMH and MOH. These journals were selected because of their close relationship in historical subject matter (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006). To ensure that a comprehensive coverage of historians’ output was achieved (Stemler, 2001), a proximate five-year time period was considered; and to ensure contemporary currency (Crawley, 2007), data collection was focussed on the years 2013 through 2017. The editorials; a special twentieth anniversary celebratory edition of JoMH reflecting aspects of the Journal’s development; and five interview articles with senior scholars were excluded from the study. The JoMH’s article guidelines clearly state, how newspaper articles should be
referenced: “Surname, Initials (year), ‘Article title’, Newspaper, date, pages. e.g. Smith, A. (2008), ‘Money for old rope’, Daily News, 21 January, p. 1, 3-4” (Journal of Management History, 2018). This enables easy identification of the vast majority of newspaper sources in the text, notes and references. Occasionally, when an international source was not easily identified, then an online search provided clarification; for example, De Stentor in de Jong et al. (2017) was identified as a Zwolle-based Dutch regional newspaper. In the articles, where newspapers sources were integral to data collection, the approach was discussed in the methodology – for example, Varje, Anttila and Väänänen (2013a, p. 36) analysis of job advertisements in the Finnish newspaper Helsingin Sanomat was explained in depth.

The number of newspaper sources referenced in each article was manually counted. The coding scheme (Franzosi, 1987) comprised four categories: no newspaper references; minimal (1-4); modest (5-10); and substantial references (over 10). Table I provides a summary of recent newspaper archive usage by management historians in JoMH and MOH.

The 11 articles with more than 10 newspapers sources were analysed in depth to evaluate how, if at all, newspaper archives can be used for the purposes of contextualisation in management history research. Content analysis (Krippendorff, 1989) of articles was the prime method used to analyse how management historians use newspaper archives as a data collection method. Each article in the database was read, and the notes and references were carefully scrutinised to determine the extent of newspaper, magazine and trade press sources. One of these articles, Tikhomirov (2017) has not been included in the detailed analysis and discussion because its focus on F W Taylor’s publication strategy for his Principles of Scientific Management in the American magazine does not incorporate contextuality.

A textual analysis was then used to analyse each of the remaining 10 articles to evaluate elements of contextuality in the texts. This “involves a prolonged engagement of the chosen text using [...] narrative [...] approaches to qualitative analysis” (Fursich, 2009, p. 240). The articles were analysed using the dimensions (omnibus or discrete); levels (macro, meso and micro); and variables (geographic, political, economic, social, cultural, organisation and competition) discussed in the contextual analysis literature. All but one of the articles adopted an omnibus dimension; there were seven macro and three micro studies; and a wide range of variables were used, but only one variable was included in all the studies – the economic context. Table II provides a succinct summary of these articles.

The use of newspaper archives in the recent management history literature

The textual analysis of those articles, which used substantial data from newspaper archives provides evidence to support the proposition that newspaper archives can facilitate elements of contextual analysis in historical research, even though the authors did not formally research contextuality. The key newspaper archival sources used in these articles were broadsheets such as the Guardian and New York Times (Riad, 2014) and the Chicago Tribune (McLarty and Rosen, 2014); financial and business media such as Het Financieele

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of newspaper sources</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1-4</th>
<th>5-10</th>
<th>&gt;10</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JoMH</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOH</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I.
Analysis of newspaper sources in JoMH and MOH, 2013-2017
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Country/ies</th>
<th>Sector/Industry</th>
<th>Field of study</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Contextuality</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Variables</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>JoMH</em> Varje, Turtiainen and Väänänen (2013b)</td>
<td>1949-2009</td>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>Psychological management</td>
<td>Longitudinal, mixed methods study of 1,305 manager job advertisements in Finnish newspaper, with quantitative and qualitative analysis examining the evolution of ideal manager traits</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Macro</td>
<td>National Political Economic Social Cultural</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riad (2014)</td>
<td>100-1963</td>
<td>West Europe and the USA</td>
<td>Literature and film</td>
<td>Leadership</td>
<td>A longitudinal qualitative analysis of leadership retelling the story of Anthony and Cleopatra within the social and economic context of the Roman, Elizabethan, Georgian and Hollywood eras</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Macro</td>
<td>International Political Economic Social Cultural</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McLarty and Rosen (2014)</td>
<td>1906-1911</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Meatpacking factories</td>
<td>Employee and public health</td>
<td>A qualitative study of archival newspaper clippings, original journal articles and books written by physician Dr Caroline Hedger, which helped improve working and living conditions of American workers</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Micro</td>
<td>Local Political Economic Social</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prieto and Phipps (2016)</td>
<td>1888-1951</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Financial services</td>
<td>Management philosophy and practice</td>
<td>A longitudinal study analysing the influence of Charles Clinton Spraulding, a prominent black business leader, based on his own writings published in history journals and newspapers</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Macro</td>
<td>National Economic Cultural</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>de Jong et al. (2017)</td>
<td>1971-2001</td>
<td>The Netherlands</td>
<td>Health technology</td>
<td>Marketing communication and financial performance</td>
<td>A quantitative and qualitative longitudinal case study examining the relationship between CEO strategic announcements and share price reactions; data obtained from 451 articles in the Dutch financial newspaper Het Financieele Dagblad</td>
<td>Discrete</td>
<td>Micro</td>
<td>National Economic Organisation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennent (2017)</td>
<td>1918-1935</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Public transport</td>
<td>Profit-maximisation</td>
<td>Longitudinal, archival, micro case study of British municipal tramways response to the political and economic context using multiple sources</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Micro</td>
<td>Local Political Economic Organisation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(continued)*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Country/ies</th>
<th>Sector/Industry</th>
<th>Field of study</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Variables</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Varje, Anttila and Väänänen (2013a)</td>
<td>1949-2009</td>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>Psychological</td>
<td>Using the same data as Varje (2013a), a longitudinal, mixed methods study using qualitative and quantitative analysis, exploring the ideal manager in Finland within the changing historical context of the period</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Macro</td>
<td>National, Political, Economic, Social, Cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proctor (2013)</td>
<td>1790-1902</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Watch-manufacturing</td>
<td>Industry decline</td>
<td>Longitudinal qualitative case study analysing the decline of British watch-manufacturing primarily based upon data from specialist technical print media archives</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Macro</td>
<td>National, Political, Economic, Cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lubinski (2015)</td>
<td>1890-1914</td>
<td>India</td>
<td>Gramophone industry</td>
<td>International expansion</td>
<td>Longitudinal, qualitative, mixed methods case study of domestic/international competition within the context of consumer, economic and political drivers</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Macro</td>
<td>National, Political, Economic, Competition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matos (2016)</td>
<td>1959-1986</td>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>Management trade organisation</td>
<td>HRM</td>
<td>Longitudinal, qualitative study, supported by trade magazine content analysis, of human resource management models within the context of Portuguese political changes</td>
<td>Omnibus</td>
<td>Macro</td>
<td>National, Political, Economic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dagblad (de Jong et al., 2017); local newspapers such as the Yorkshire Post and York Evening Press (Tennent, 2017); specialist technical print media such as The Horological Journal (Proctor, 2013); and professional organisations’ publications such as Indústria Portuguesa and Pessoal (Matos, 2016).

The articles demonstrate the wide range of rich sources available in newspaper archives, which is not available from other sources. In some studies, newspaper data were the key source and integral to the data collection strategy. Newspaper data were the primary data source for Varje, Anttila and Väänänen (2013a) and Varje, Turtiainen and Väänänen (2013b), in their analysis of ideal manager characteristics in Finland; and for de Jong et al. (2017) study of Philips’ share price movements following CEO strategic announcements. At least four of the studies adopted a mixed methods data collection strategy with three including a quantitative element as well as qualitative (Batiz-Lazo, 2016).

Riad’s (2014) analysis of Cleopatra and Anthony’s conspicuous consumption demonstrates different moral perspectives on leadership, ostentation and social responsibility across centuries. Riad (2014) used twenty-first century newspaper archives to analyse contemporary contextual data and her comparative analysis using diverse sources effectively illustrates how meanings vary across several temporal dimensions (Bamberger, 2008).

McLarty and Rosen’s (2014) study of the physician Dr Caroline Hedger’s description of the appalling working and living conditions of meat packers in the USA in 1906 includes several direct quotes from newspapers, illustrating the unhealthy environment of the factories and nearby housing. For example, “The poor health of these children is directly traceable to bad sanitary conditions […] both along Bubbly Creek and surrounding this dump at Forty-seventh and Robey streets”, Chicago Tribune, 1909 (McLarty and Rosen, 2014, p. 66). McLarty and Rosen’s newspaper archival research provides historians with a richer understanding of Dr Hedger’s motivations to improve the working/living conditions of families. The complex contextual environment, which Dr Hedger presented in her newspaper articles emphasised the significance of context (Galvin, 2014) in addressing the well-being of workers and their families.

de Jong et al. (2017) evaluated the financial performance of Philips following the public announcements of their strategic decisions using both quantitative and qualitative methods. Philips announcements in Het Financieele Dagblad, the Dutch daily business and finance newspaper, and share price movements were analysed between 1971 and 2001. Adopting the event study method, which measures share price changes following new market data, de Jong et al. (2017) analysed 451 announcements and subsequent share price reactions. This article incorporated contextual data from multiple sources, including financial broadsheets, to explore the relationship between CEO public announcements and the market’s reaction measured by share price fluctuations.

Tennent (2017) analysed the changing political, economic and technological environments, which impacted on British public transport systems between 1918 and 1935, using the City of York as a case study. Local newspapers, such as the Yorkshire Post and York Evening Press, provided contextual data on economic facts such as tram fares and routes; and political controversies within the New York Corporation (the local government authority) – for example, quoting councillors’ detailed comments in committee meetings.

Matos (2016) explored fluctuations in the dominant managerial discourses in Portuguese businesses, between 1959 and 1986, by analysing articles in the magazine Indústria Portuguesa published by the Portuguese Industrial Association and Pessoal published by the Association of Portuguese Personnel Heads and Directors. The turbulent political and
economic context during this period in Portugal is critical to Matos’s (2016) analysis of managerial discourses and relevant data is derived from these professional magazines.

Clearly, these management historians have effectively used newspaper archives as a key source in their data collection research strategies. However, although there are elements of contextualisation derived from newspaper data in the articles, the authors do not formally discuss contextual analysis in the methodology sections of the articles.

Discussion and conclusion
The focus of this research is to examine “how, if at all, can newspaper archives be used for the purposes of contextualisation in management history research?” The evidence from the survey of management history articles suggests that newspaper archives can be used to research contextuality in management history research. The contextualisation theory discussed in the literature review provides several justifications as to why management historians might adopt contextual analysis in their research strategies. Such justifications include the fact that management organisations are open systems, which are influenced by external factors (Tsui, 2006); that a contextual environment fluctuates between different temporal periods (Zahra et al., 2014), which consequently influences changing contexts in management history research; that the “meanings” of different organisational phenomena change through time (Bamberger, 2008); and finally, contextual analysis engages in rich, qualitative research (Johns, 2006), which is also a feature of much management history research. This is a convincing argument for management historians to incorporate contextualisation, where appropriate, into their research strategies – and one data collection tool, which is available to help facilitate contemporary contextual analysis is newspaper archives.

Much of the research undertaken by management historians involves businesses and organisations, which operate in open systems, and are, therefore, influenced by external factors. Relevant newspaper archives are an effective research tool to assess contemporary awareness and opinions about political, economic, socio-cultural and technological external factors. These data enable researchers to develop a deeper understanding of the context in which organisations and individuals are working. Lubinski’s (2015) analysis of the Indian gramophone market between 1890 and 1914 included American, British and German trade journal archives, Indian newspaper advertisements and different companies’ record catalogues, which helped her to capture deep insights into PEST drivers and international corporate competitor strategies in the sub-continent’s record market.

The temporal focus of many research studies in management history range across decades and even centuries. Given the fluctuating contextual environment between different temporal periods, newspaper archives are uniquely capable of providing contextual macro- and micro-level temporal data about environmental and societal influences relating to explanations of an individual or organisational behaviour (Johns, 2006; Johns, 2017). Because of the extensive period of many local and national print publications (The Times, London, has been continuously printed since 1785), newspaper archives are especially suited to longitudinal research, which can reveal a chronology of events, as and when they happened from multiple perspectives (Hansen, 2004). Examples of management history longitudinal research using local newspaper archives include Tennent’s (2017) microanalysis of public transport in a British city over a 17-year period, which utilised newspaper archives to chart political developments in York; and Varje, Anttila and Väänänen (2013a) and Varje, Turtiainen and Väänänen’s (2013b) analysis of job advertisements in Helsingin Sanomat between 1949 and 2009, which explored the changing qualities of ideal managers in Finland.

Given how much management history research spans generations, another complex and critical issue for our research is to recognise how the meanings of phenomena change
through time (Bamberger, 2008). An interesting example of how meanings can change in different eras in the management history literature is Riad’s (2014) analysis of how Cleopatra and Anthony’s conspicuous consumption was interpreted in the Roman, Elizabethan, Georgian and 1960’s Hollywood periods. Although Riad (2014) only uses newspaper archives for a comparative contemporary twenty-first century political and social context; clearly, the data derived from newspaper archives can help support contextual analysis from the late seventeenth- and eighteenth-century onwards.

In this analysis of management history articles, the concept of rich, qualitative research seems to be well-embedded in the research strategies of management historians (McLarty and Rosen, 2014; Riad, 2014; Lubinski, 2015; Matos, 2016; Prieto and Phipps, 2016; Tennent, 2017; de Jong et al., 2017). As rich, qualitative data are also embedded in contextuality (Johns, 2006), this aspect of contextual analysis seems to be a natural fit with existing management history research strategies.

Newspaper archive research could also support contextualisation in management history fields such as, but not only, colonialism; gender issues; labour relations; historical process research; institutional theory; and organisational identity. Potential studies could include cross-sectional research, historical process research, institutional theory research and organisational identity research. For example, cross-sectional research into high-profile labour disputes, which have been extensively reported in newspapers across the political spectrum, and could provide in-depth coverage from multiple perspectives to illustrate how different sections of society responded to labour conflicts (Franzosi, 1987).

Historical process research, which explores changes in “the processes of management in organisations” over time from a social construction perspective (Foster and Suddaby, 2018, p. 1), clearly requires an element of contextualisation, which the print media can provide within the corresponding timeline of the period under study. Institutional theory research, which is predicated upon the premise that individuals create organisational social structures out of shared assumptions about the nature of reality (Suddaby et al., 2014), requires an understanding of the historical context of the period and this can also be derived from an analysis of newspaper archives. As times change, so newspapers reflect the changing values, which underpin the rules and belief systems of the environment in which they exist (Weerakkody et al., 2009). In organisational identity research, Foster and Suddaby (2018, p. 10) observe the close links between organisational identity and organisational history; and as “constant identity adaptation and change is a sine qua non of organisational life” (Balmer, 2017 p. 1475) – both planned corporate communications and extempore events, which are chronicled in print media over time, can be researched in newspaper archives.

Newspaper archives are an appropriate source for at least two reasons. First, they provide an extensive range of data, with a day-to-day chronology of events seen from the perspectives of people living at that time. This long period of historical processes is not available from any other source and because of the central role of print media as the principal communication medium in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, newspapers enable management historians to research the facts of events and the opinions of contemporaries. Indeed, one eminent historian, researching in the field of political biography revealed that newspaper archives are an essential source, providing a veritable “treasure trove” of data to mine (Howell, 2018). Newspaper archives can be used in both quantitative and qualitative research; and as a principal research method or in mixed method case studies. This flexibility, combined with the emergence of online access to multiple newspaper archive databases, provides management historians with a powerful research tool, which could be more used.
Second, the use of newspaper archives as a data source is not dependent upon a historian’s epistemological and ontological perspective. Although many of the articles analysed for this paper adopt a reconstructionist form of narrative, constructive and deconstructionist researchers (Godfrey et al., 2016) can also use data derived from newspaper archives. Researchers, who want to adopt a positivist or a phenomenological or a mixed-methods approach to their data collection can incorporate newspaper archive analysis into their research strategy. As newspaper archives reflect the authentic voices of people involved with or commenting on, events at that moment in history – almost in real-time – they provide an opportunity to capture those attitudes and opinions of both actors and observers in a variety of different genres of management history research.

There are a number of limitations to this research. Newspaper data are not appropriate for certain categories of management and organisational history research. Topics covering pre-newspaper publication eras or in countries, where newspapers were not produced or were produced but not effectively archived, cannot be clearly researched in newspaper archives. Also, subjects, which were not in the public domain at the time, such as confidential government or internal organisational issues, will not have been published in newspapers; and of course, silence in the archives can inhibit data collection on some topics. The author is an English speaking, solo researcher based in the UK; this means that the review of the literature could not incorporate research into newspaper archives written in other languages. Another limitation is that the viewpoint of research-active management historians is absent; a survey exploring the opinions of management historians towards research methods in general and the use of newspaper archives in particular would be revealing.

Hopefully, the argument and evidence presented in this article is sufficiently compelling to demonstrate to management historians that the newspaper archives can provide quantitative and/or qualitative, accurate, cost-effective and insightful data to support contextual analysis, as well as other research objectives, and help to enhance management history theory development. It is expected that the article will stimulate significant interest in the use of newspaper archives by management historians in their future research strategies, and that Tosh’s (2010, p. 78) declaration that the “most important source for the historian is the press” will also apply to research in management history.

Note
1. Throughout this manuscript, the word newspaper/s refers to newspapers, magazines and trade print media.

References


Further reading


About the author

David Bowie holds an MBA from Manchester Business School and is a Senior Lecturer in Marketing at the Oxford School of Hospitality Management, Oxford Brookes University, UK. His principal research interest is nineteenth-century hotel history. His recent articles include Bowie, D. (2018). Innovation and nineteenth-century hotel industry evolution. Tourism Management, 64, February, pp. 314-323; and Bowie, D., 2016. Pure diffusion? The great English hotel charges debate in The Times, 1853. Business History, 58 (2), pp.159-178. David Bowie can be contacted at: decbowie@brookes.ac.uk

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Corpus linguistics, newspaper archives and historical research methods

Chinmay Tumbe
Economics Area, Indian Institute of Management, Ahmedabad, India

Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to demonstrate the utility of corpus linguistics and digitised newspaper archives in management and organisational history.


Findings – The paper argues that corpus linguistics or the quantitative and qualitative analysis of large-scale real-world machine-readable text can be an important method of historical research in management studies, especially for discourse analysis. It shows how this method can be fruitfully used for research in management and organisational history, using term count and cluster analysis. In particular, historical databases of digitised newspapers serve as important corpora to understand the evolution of specific words and concepts. Corpus linguistics using newspaper archives can potentially serve as a method for periodisation and triangulation in corporate, analytically structured and serial histories and also foster cross-country comparisons in the evolution of management concepts.

Research limitations/implications – The paper also shows the limitation of the research method and potential robustness checks while using the method.

Practical implications – Findings of this paper can stimulate new ways of conducting research in management history.

Originality/value – The paper for the first time introduces corpus linguistics as a research method in management history.

Keywords Management history, Corpus linguistics, Text analysis, Research methodology, Newspaper

Paper type Research paper

Introduction

With the advent of mass digitisation of historical prints over the past two decades, researchers now have access to a unique but under-appreciated source of data – Words. Billions of words have entered online repositories as hundreds of millions of pages of old books and newspapers have been digitised by firms and organisations. Words in these real-world texts form a “corpus” and corpus linguistics refers to a branch of linguistic studies that systematically analyses them (Biber et al., 1998; Oakes, 1998; McEnery and Wilson, 2001). At its simplest, it can be defined as a “methodology that uses computer support – in particular, software called ’concordance programs’- to analyse authentic, and usually very large, volumes of textual data” (Mautner, 2009, p. 122). Alternatively, it may be defined as “the study of language data on a large scale – the computer-aided analysis of very extensive collections of transcribed utterances or written texts” (McEnery and Hardie, 2012). Both these definitions highlight the existence of a corpus of text that is sufficiently large in scale and machine-readable in nature. Scale is important to differentiate it from standard
qualitative research software used which is used to analyse transcribed interviews. Further, concordance software in corpus linguistics can aid both quantitative and qualitative research.

Corpus linguistics grew substantially in the 1990s with a spate of publications by linguists and is now an important branch of linguistics with dedicated journals, associations, research groups and conferences. It is slowly being applied to legal studies (Cotterill, 2001; Vogel et al., 2018) and political studies (Baker and McEnery, 2005; Fairclough, 2000). One study in management research compared letters to shareholders in two different years using corpus linguistics techniques to draw novel inferences (Pollach, 2012). The rising popularity of corpus linguistics can be attributed to the growing attraction of “data science” and “Big Data” research methods across disciplines. These methods essentially seek to unravel trends and patterns using large bodies of data and are used in a variety of for-profit organisations. They have their own set of limitations when the methods are used without adequate theory or applied with little understanding of the context in which the data was produced. Despite this, they are slowly being used for academic research, as exemplified in a special issue in 2018 in Organisational Research Methods devoted to “Big Data and Modern Data Analytics”. When the basic form of data is textual in nature, text mining techniques analyse the properties of the text such as structure and grammar through machine learning, statistics, computational linguistics, natural language processing and corpus linguistics (Kobayashi et al., 2018). The evolution of corpus linguistics as a method has to be seen against this backdrop of a revolution in computing power, rapidly proliferating text mining techniques and the availability of readily accessible corpora of billions of words.

Corpus linguistics is now weaving its way into historical research. A recent study, based on collaborative work between a historian and a linguist, unearthed new evidence on prostitution in seventeenth century England (McEnery and Baker, 2016). Their work approached the matter separately from the historian’s and linguists perspective and then in combination, to generate new insights and hypotheses. While their corpora include books and texts, linguists have also begun exploring the potential of unravelling patterns in linguistic evolution using digitised newspaper databases (Westin and Geisler, 2002; Fries and Lehmann, 2006; Bamford et al., 2013; Buntinx et al., 2017).

Corpus linguistics is also being used to contribute to discourse analysis (Baker, 2006; Mautner, 2007; Orpin, 2005). Discourse analysis refers to “the analysis of language as it is used to enact activities, perspectives, and identities” (Gee, 1999, pp. 4-5). It is interested in naturally occurring language, studies the context in which the language is used and can also include non-verbal forms of interactions such as images and gestures (Wodak and Meyer, 2009). The word “discourse” itself is now part of mainstream media reflected in the usage of phrases such as the discourses on racism, caste, gender, populism, globalisation and other phenomena which have particular vocabularies attached to them. Discourse analysis can identify loaded words and unravel different perspectives on commonly used words. From a historian’s perspective, it can also identify when certain words belong to or drop out of specific discourses. Corpus linguistics enables discourse analysis to work with a much larger quantum of data, reduces researcher bias and provides qualitative and quantitative insights on texts (Mautner, 2009). Apart from frequencies and statistical significance tests, it can qualitatively examine semantic patterns and collocational environments.

This paper argues that there is considerable scope to apply corpus linguistics to research in management and organisational history through discourse analysis, especially when the corpus consists of digitised historical newspaper databases. Firms that provide these databases now provide a number of research tools that enable historical analysis without
any additional software requirements. They can provide insights even when the entire corpus is not available to researchers in its rawest form.

The rest of the paper is arranged as follows: The next section describes the standard methods of research in corpus linguistics and the significance of digitised newspaper archives as major corpora. This is followed by an exposition of two of the most commonly used methods in corpus linguistics – term count and cluster analysis, using management concepts and newspaper archives. The limitations of the method and potential robustness checks of the method are then highlighted. This is followed by a discussion on how corpus linguistics can add to the theory and practice of management and organisational history and a final concluding section.

Corpus linguistics research methods

Types of corpora and the significance of newspaper archives

A corpus is defined as “a body of text which is carefully sampled to be maximally representative of a language or language variety” (McEnery and Wilson, 2001, p. 2). It should also be machine-readable. Corpora are available at different scales, broadly categorised as “do-it-yourself corpora and “reference corpora” (Mautner, 2009). In the first instance, researchers themselves assemble corpora from various sources. Once a corpus has been built, freely available concordance programs or software for corpus linguistics such as Antconc and Wordsmith Tools are relatively easy to use for analysis with minimal technical requirements. This is useful to address small-scale research problems.

Reference corpora refer to readily available corpora assembled by research teams over several years. Linguists have compiled extensive “corpora” or body of texts for the analysis of specific languages (Kennedy, 1998). They include databases such as the British National Corpus that contains millions of words. In 2009-2010, Google launched its freely accessible NGram Viewer enabling keyword search through millions of books it had digitised, written between 1500 and 2008. The NGram Viewer provides a simple graph as the output on the popularity of the word over time, if and only if the word appeared in at least 40 books. The simplicity of the search led to the growth of a field called “culturomics” that compared the popularity of different words and attracted research attention in reputed journals such as Science (Michel et al., 2011). However, researchers have also outlined the pitfalls of using the Google books database, as results can be influenced by prolific authors and further, the nature of the corpus changes substantially over time with more publication of scientific literature in recent decades that uses different words (Pechenick et al., 2015). For instance, the popularity of the word “autumn” as per Google Ngram declines over the twentieth century, but it is almost certain that this has more to do with the rising stock of scientific books in the corpus which refer less to “autumn” than any meaningful change in the day-to-day popularity of the word.

In contrast, newspaper archives can be superior to historical book databases, as they are more standardised and less affected by prolific writers. They arguably capture the zeitgeist or the spirit of the times better than hundreds of books written on different themes. So far, newspapers have been an important source of data in management and organisational history research to locate events, advertisements and triangulate narratives with other data sources. The advent of digitised newspaper databases provides a new dimension to existing archive-room research practices as software-based quantitative and qualitative research methods can now be used to discern patterns in linguistic data. Traditional methods would entail collecting or downloading historical news items and coding them into fields relevant for the research project. However, certain historical newspaper databases now provide
research tools that enable term count and cluster analysis that enable research, without having to manually collect thousands of articles.

There are over a hundred digitised historical newspaper databases around the world today, mostly related with America and Europe, but not all of them are currently amenable to linguistic research. Most databases enable basic and advanced search features but do not necessarily provide research tools. The Google News Archive Project, launched in 2006, was a promising database, but it collapsed mid-way and its future remains uncertain. Wordbanks Online consists of more than 500 million words of mostly American and British text, including a sub-corpus of 60 million words from the articles of The Times, a daily British newspaper (Mautner, 2009). ProQuest and Gale Cengage Learning are currently two data providers that have developed research tools and contain a corpus of over 35 and 15 million digitised pages, respectively, covering over 50 English language newspapers in the USA and UK, and also a few in other countries such as China and India.

The large sample size of these newspaper archive databases is ideal for linguistic research. For instance, the ProQuest Times of India historical database from 1838 to 2007 covers over seven million news items, of which nearly half are categorised as “articles” and a fourth have been classified as display and classified advertisements. Other items in the database include editorials, stock-quotes, letters to the editor, obituaries, weather notices and so forth. The Gale Cengage Financial Times historical database from 1888 to 2010 contains over four million articles. Even the non-daily Economist historical database from 1843 to 2014 contains nearly half a million articles. Both these newsprints are based in Britain. In America, the ProQuest historical newspaper collection on the New York Times (1851-2015) contains 11 million articles and the Wall Street Journal (1889-2001) contains 3 million articles.

**Concordance software and analysis**

At the heart of corpus linguistics lies the concordance software that can analyse large volumes of textual data. With digitised newspaper archives, it is always possible to download a set of articles and load them onto such a software for further analysis. Concordance software provide quantitative evidence in the form of absolute and relative word frequencies. On the co-occurrence of words, they also provide statistical significance measures such as t-scores and Mutual Information (MI) scores. t-scores signify the certainty of collocation of two words and MI scores show “whether there is a higher-than-random probability of the two items occurring together” (Mautner, 2009, p. 125).

To illustrate this, we use an example provided by Mautner (2009) for an analysis of the word “unemployed” that occurred in The Times database of Wordbanks Online 567 times. Table I shows the t-scores and MI scores of the collocates. The top ranked t-scores are

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Collocate</th>
<th>t-score</th>
<th>MI score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. An</td>
<td>6.65</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Are</td>
<td>6.23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. People</td>
<td>5.78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Who</td>
<td>5.72</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. And</td>
<td>4.84</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Term</td>
<td>4.21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Steelmen</td>
<td>13.46</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Househusband</td>
<td>11.78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Unemployable</td>
<td>11.23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Housewives</td>
<td>8.73</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. 4m</td>
<td>8.07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Youths</td>
<td>7.90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table I.** Illustrative example of concordance software analysis of the word “unemployed”

**Source:** Mautner (2009, Table V.1), based on The Times corpus of Wordbanks Online
grammatical items that are usually not of interest. It measures the certainty of association between two words. The MI scores, however, reveal important information on words that appear more often together than separate. That is, “an” may appear with “unemployed” yielding a high t-score but a low MI score because “an” also appears along with other many other words in a sentence. In the particular context of Britain, words like steelman, househusband, housewives and even a particular statistic of “4m” appear tightly associated with “unemployed”. Here, corpus linguistics provides a useful way to do discourse analysis, by reducing the bias of selectively using words that researchers deem to be collocated with “unemployed”.

Concordance software can also display output amenable for qualitative research. It can show a list of sentences in which the word of interest is collocated with another specified word, thereby yielding inference on whether the word implies a positive or negative connotation or some other attribute, a process known as establishing semantic prosody. Similarly, it can show the flow of words used in conjunction with the key word of interest, a process known as establishing semantic preference. Concordance software can, therefore, identify semantic prosody and preference in qualitative research and t-scores, MI scores and absolute and relative frequencies in quantitative research (Mautner, 2009). In the research tools provided by digitised newspaper archives, frequency analysis is known as term-count analysis and analysis of collocation is referred to as cluster analysis. The next section describes the tools of these historical databases and how they can be leveraged in research.

Applications of corpus linguistics using newspaper archives
In the case of certain digitised newspaper archives, it is possible to analyse the textual data with available research tools without loading them on to any particular concordance software. Two methods stand out: term-count analysis and cluster analysis. Term-count analysis
One of the simplest research methods of corpus linguistics is frequency count of the word or phrase that is being searched. When the database has a time dimension, these frequency counts can attain a distribution over time and enable an analysis in absolute terms. The time frequency could be as short as on a daily basis for daily newspapers and can be aggregated at longer durations such as months, years and decades. Absolute term counts do not reveal a clear trend because the underlying corpus may change its size and nature over time. This is why normalised term counts or relative frequency counts are more insightful, as they account, to a certain extent, for the changes in the underlying corpus.

Before analysing historical newspaper archives, it is worth commenting on the more easily accessible Google NGram Viewer. The Google NGram Viewer output presents a graph with years on the x-axis and the relative frequency count or the number of times the keyword appeared in a year as a percentage of the total corpus. Figure 1 shows a sample output from the NGram Viewer for some of the key actors in management history – “worker”, “owner”, “manager”, “entrepreneur” and “shareholder”. It shows that in the nineteenth century, the word “owner” was much more popular than the other words and that its popularity declined over the twentieth century with a brief uptick towards the end of the century. The evolution of the word “manager” shows a different trend, that of a gradual increase between 1860 and 1920, stagnation for four decades and then growth over the past five decades such that it has a higher count than “owner” today. “Worker” follows the same broad trend of the “manager” till 1930, then increases in popularity such that it is the most popular of the five keywords between 1950 and 1990. The popularity then declines in the subsequent two decades. Compared to “owner”, “manager” and “worker”, the two words –
shareholder and entrepreneur — show less popularity but a rising graph over time. While broad ideological shifts towards labour and capital such as the rise of the welfare state in the 1930s and the move towards liberalised market-based economies in the late 1980s can explain the evolution of the term “worker”, the evolution of the “manager” is counter-intuitive and invites further research. That is, if one accepts the Google database to accurately reflect popularity.

We can now perform a similar analysis using newspaper archives. The ProQuest and Gale historical newspaper databases provide a histogram of search hits by time. The histogram itself reveals the number of news items that contain the search keyword and not the number of times the keyword has appeared in totality. That is, if a keyword appears five times in an article, then that article is counted as one hit for the keyword. News items can be filtered by document type such that researchers can focus on “articles” or “advertisements” or the relevant type of document in the research project. Researchers can manually code the frequency counts by looking up the displayed histogram or in the case of Gale Cengage, download the data in spreadsheet format.

Absolute term counts would be misleading as the size of the underlying corpus has changed over time. For instance, Figure 2 shows the rising number of articles published in the Times of India and Financial Times in most decades over the past century and the brief dip in the 1940s on account of World War II. As a result, a simple keyword search would almost always show a rising graph with a dip in the 1940s. As a measure of normalisation or relative frequency, one can therefore compute the percentage of articles or specific news items containing the keyword in a given time period. This statistic when presented over time serves as a powerful way to depict the evolution of its usage, similar to the output shown by the Google NGram Viewer.

Figure 3 mimics the keywords displayed in Figure 1 using a different corpus — the articles published in the Financial Times — and shows some similar as well as conflicting results. The word “Worker” in particular appears to exhibit a similar inverted-U shape pattern in the end of the twentieth century in both databases though the inflection points are slightly different. The word “entrepreneur” has relatively lower usage and exhibits a pickup at the end of the twentieth century in both databases. The word “shareholder” has a much higher usage in the Financial Times as may be expected and rises rapidly from the 1970s in both databases. The word “owner” has a much lower usage in the Financial Times corpus as compared to the Google Books corpus and shows different evolution trends. The word

---

**Figure 1.**
Google NGram keyword search on key actors in management history

**Note:** Y-axis shows relative frequency count of keyword in corpus

**Source:** Google Ngram Viewer, Scaling Factor-10, Corpus English (2009)
“manager” was used extensively in the Financial Times before the 1930s as designations of people mentioned in firm’s annual statements, classified as articles in the database. Once this practice stopped, we observe a similar trend in both the databases – stagnation till the 1970s and then a take-off. It is instructive that in both databases, the relative frequency count of the “manager” today is highest among the five words.

Figures 4 to 6 show the term-count trend analysis for the word “management” using the Financial Times, Economist, NY Times, Wall Street Journal and Google Books corpora. The figures show broadly similar narratives of “management” picking up from the middle of the twentieth century. The inflection point in the Google database lay in the 1930s, while in the newspaper archives, it lay in the 1960s. Though subsequent decades in the UK saw more usage of the word in the Financial Times than in the Economist, partly because of a dedicated column on management, the upward trend is unmistakable. The absolute
magnitude has also consistently been much higher in the USA than in the UK with “management” occurring in around 15 per cent of articles in the Wall Street Journal compared to only 3 per cent in the Financial Times by the beginning of the twenty-first century.

This exercise of comparing management keywords in different corpora is useful to discern trends that may be considered as robust, versus trends that may be superfluous or deserve further scrutiny. Indeed, broadly similar trends in all five databases in the keywords mentioned above after the 1950s appear to be quite striking. Such an exercise is therefore

Figure 4.
Percentage of articles in the financial times and economist historical databases containing “Management”

Source: Gale Financial Times and Economist Historical Database

Figure 5.
Percentage of articles in the Wall Street Journal and New York Times containing “Management”

Source: ProQuest Historical Newspaper Database of Wall Street Journal and New York Times
useful to locate broad patterns and relative popularity of words and can serve as an innovative way to understand the evolution of management concepts and its differences across countries. It can ultimately serve the purpose of discourse analysis in management and organisational history.

One application of term-count analysis in management history research has been done in the context of marketing history in India (Tumbe and Ralli, 2018). As Table II shows, that study traced the usage of the following keywords – selling, marketing, advertising and branding – in India using the *Times of India* historical database. It found that “marketing” slowly grew in importance over the twentieth century and finally displaced “selling” as the dominant word used in the literature. It also mapped the evolution of the terms with the economic ideology of the state. Further, the trend analysis discovered a sharp rise in “marketing” in the 1930s that was found to be associated with the establishment of rural marketing boards and marketing officers in the agricultural sector. This opened a new line of research on marketing history and countered the existing literature and intuition which claimed that “marketing” arrived in India in the 1960s through Western-oriented management school curricula. Similarly, by comparing trends on marketing keywords in India and Britain, inferences were gathered on the pace of adoption of modern marketing methods. Term-count trend analysis with multiple databases, therefore, has the potential to foster cross-country research in management and organisational history.

Another similar application of term-count analysis was done on the evolution of retailing in India (Tumbe and Krishnakumar, 2018). The words searched were retail, bazaar, shop, shopkeeper, shopping, consumer cooperative, fair price shop, supermarket and shopping mall. The term-count analysis clearly showed the relationship between state patronage towards particular forms of retail in certain eras – that being the identified discourse – and the relative presence or absence of those words in those eras. It showed the relative decline of the “bazaar” form of retail in India since the late nineteenth century and the constancy of the word “shopkeeper” in the general English-language discourse of consumption in India over more than a century.

*Cluster analysis*

Equally illuminating is the research tool on cluster analysis provided by the data provider Gale. The tool uses an algorithm to process the subjects, titles and roughly the first hundred top results linked with the keyword. It then provides a visual output that shows words
closely associated with the keyword that is being searched. It is essentially an exercise in collocation, described earlier.

Figures 7 to 9 show the words closely associated with “management” in the articles of *The Economist* for the periods 1850-1900, 1900-1950 and 1950-2000, respectively. It shows that “bank” was the main word used in articles related with management in the late nineteenth century and its relative decline over the next century. Similarly, sectors like agriculture, mining and railways were no longer associated with “management” in relative terms by the end of the twentieth century. “Meeting” and “Labour” appeared in these charts only in the early twentieth century, while unions appeared in both halves of the twentieth century. “Managers” appeared in the early twentieth century and rose to more prominence by the late twentieth century, while “Board” appears to be a significant term in all three sub-periods. More generally, locations and sectors gave way to words like “business”, “managers”, “government”, “industry” and “market” as key markers of management. Management “Guru” and “Gurus” appeared in the late twentieth century as did negative words such as “bad” and “wrong.”

Cluster analysis is useful not only in confirming priors but also revealing new trends. For instance, the Chandlerian paradigm in business history credits the railways as the first major sector where management and managerial skills came forth, but as Figures 7 and 8 suggest, banks were equally important, if not more important, as sites of “management” in Britain.

### Limitations

The validity of corpus linguistics is highly dependent on the size and nature of the corpus that is analysed. Newspaper archives are useful because of their large sample and standardisation, but they have their own limitations.

#### Size and nature of corpus

Larger corpora are preferred to smaller corpora but both can be analysed to inspect robustness and validity. For corpora that are hand collected from newspaper archives,
Corpus linguistics, newspaper archives

Figure 7. Cluster analysis of “management” in The Economist articles, 1850-1900

Figure 8. Cluster analysis of “management” in The Economist articles, 1900-1950
researchers need to be aware of the universe from which the texts are being sampled and the representativeness of the underlying sample in terms of language use, dialect, time period and genre. For management and organisational history, the *Economist* and *Financial Times* serve as two excellent databases to inspect validity as they both tend to use similar English and cover topics of interest in the fields of business and management, largely pertaining to Britain. However, the validity of analyses using the *Economist* would be generally lower than that in the *Financial Times* because of its substantially smaller corpus. In choosing the newspaper, representation of issues is also a matter of the researcher’s concern. One study on the relationship between political activism and stock prices in the US based on newspaper archives (without corpus linguistics methods), for instance, argued that the New York Times was more representative of the issue than the Wall Street Journal (King and Soule, 2007).

**Choice of words**

Researchers have to choose one or many of the forms of the keyword – noun, adjective, adverb, etc. In general, if the word form is less popular than other forms, then it tends to hold more validity in corpus linguistics. Words can have multiple meanings and interpretation of trends is also clearer when the word in question has a very restricted meaning. A simple search of “right” and “left” to understand shifts in ideological stances would lead to far too many errors in interpretation as both words can be used in different ways. A measure of robustness would be to inspect variation in trends between search hits on singular and plural forms of the same noun or searching with the first letter capitalised and again in a non-capitalised form. This “plurality” and “capital-letter” test can be used to pare down keywords of interest in a research project.
Digitisation of old prints is usually done through “Optical Character Recognition” (OCR) and there are chances of errors in recognition, especially in old prints. Certain characters may be swapped leading to new meanings, for instance “fin” could be read as “sin” as the “s” and “f” in many older font type faces are similar. As Figure 9 shows, the software erroneously recognises “[...]” as a word. A simple robustness check would be to download a small sample of articles containing the keyword in each sub-period and inspect the usage of the keyword to ascertain accuracy.

**Corpus linguistics and the theory and practice of management and organisational history**

Historical research is based on “distinct epistemic assumptions” that need to be carefully understood by organisational scholars interested in learning from the past (Wadhwani and Bucheli, 2014, p. 3). Over the past decade, several studies have noted the need for more transparency and discussion of historical research methods in management and organisational studies. It has been argued that three basic elements – source criticism, triangulation and hermeneutics – should inform the description of sources used in historical management research (Kipping et al., 2014). Further, four distinct research strategies of organisational history have been pointed out – corporate history, analytically structured history, serial history and ethnographic history – closely tied with dualisms in explanation, evidence and temporality (Rowlinson et al., 2014). Additionally, periodisation has been identified as a core function of historical approaches to organisational research (Fear, 2014).

As a method of research, corpus linguistics based on newspaper archives is well suited to address several of these issues.

Corpus linguistics can serve as a powerful tool for triangulation of sources in three of the four research strategies identified in organisational history – corporate history, analytically structured history and serial history – with lesser scope for usage in ethnographic history. Corporate history refers to objectivist, holistic narrative accounts of corporate entities and is often built using historical documents pertaining to the firm or a set of firms based on business archives (Rowlinson, 2004). Given a large corpus of text based on documents internal to the firm such as bulletins, memos, letters and reports, corpus linguistics is not entirely different from standard methods used in qualitative research that codify and analyse text. However, in conjunction with the usage of the firm name in newspaper archives, researchers now have a potential tool for triangulation of sources and evidence. For instance, the first mention of the firm name in a major newspaper and the evolution of its relative frequency over time can be an important indicator of the firm’s growth or engagement with public relations. If these trends coincide with what researchers have found in documents within the firm, then it serves as an important measure of triangulation. And if it does not, then it merits a closer introspection of which narrative to use, as the historian has to decide “which accounts he or she will use, and why” (Howell and Prevenier, 2001, p. 69).

Analytically structured history refers to “narrating theoretically conceptually structured and events” (Rowlinson et al., 2014, p. 250) and corpus linguistics, as shown above in the two examples of research on marketing history in India, is useful to understand the broad evolution of key words and the making or unmaking of a particular discourse. One of those studies used corpus linguistics and newspaper archives in conjunction with two corporate archive-based narrative accounts to chart out a robust periodisation of four eras of marketing in twentieth century India (Tumbe and Ralli, 2018). It is in the periodisation of analytically structured history, where the power of newspaper-based corpus linguistics can be well appreciated. Finally, in serial history where facts are repeatable and analysed as
such (as in Anteby and Molnar, 2012), the quantitative dimensions of corpus linguistics can be used across newspaper databases to discern robust trends versus frivolous ones.

Corpus linguistics is also important for “hermeneutics” or relating sources with their original contexts. Discourse analysis for instance has been used in management history to understand how the meaning of words have changed over time (Khaire and Wadhwani, 2010). Through a newspaper based cluster analysis, a set of words or phrases can be mapped out, for the key firm or concept of interest at distinct points of time, to understand how the nature and meaning of the word has changed over time. As the corpus of newspaper texts is much larger than most textual sources available to researchers using corporate of market level data, the method is potentially more robust or, in any case, serves as a means of triangulation of data hand-collected by researchers.

Digital archives of newspapers used for corpus linguistics research should also be subject to “source criticism”. Within the newspaper, researchers should observe if the keywords are appearing in particular sections of the newspaper such as editorials or advertisements across different time periods. If, for instance, a word appears more in advertisements in the early twentieth century and almost exclusively in editorials in the late twentieth century, then researchers would have to carefully understand the hermeneutics behind the observed pattern. The newspaper’s history should also be carefully studied – Who produced it? What were its stated objectives? Which events did they tend to cover more? The difference between a general newspaper and a financial newspaper, as observed earlier with the New York Times and Wall Street Journal is important to understand the differences observed in corpus linguistics analysis.

**Conclusion**

Corpus linguistics has been noted to be useful for two types of management and organisation studies (Pollach, 2012). First, lexical patterns can be located, quantified and compared across different and big samples to find similarities, and second, it has been recommended for narrative studies on organisations. However, in conjunction with newspaper archives that provide the added dimensionality of time measured in decades or centuries, it also raises the possibility of creative adaptation in the field of management and organisational history.

Writing good management history requires careful attention to a variety of data sources and multiple and competing narratives and interpretations. It has been likened to the act of a “craft” by a potter at the wheel (Grattan, 2008). This paper introduces a relatively new methodology in the toolkit of the potter or the management historian – corpus linguistics – which offers a promising “Big Data” way of locating trends in management concepts and interpreting management semantics over time. Like any “Big Data” method, it has its share of limitations, guided by the context in which the data was produced and the epistemic assumptions directing interpretations. Cognizant of these limitations, it does have several uses. It can generate a simple time-trend chart during exploratory research and also find important dates or periods where words and phrases gain or lose fashion. Cluster analysis enables a mapping of important words associated with the keyword of analysis. Comparative analysis across newspaper databases can generate new insights on evolution and adoption of management practices in cross-country settings. It can thus be a powerful aid in discourse analysis by not only identifying discourses but by also locating changes in discourses over time. It also provides a means of triangulation and periodisation in corporate, analytically structured and serial histories, though newspapers should be subject to source criticism, especially with respect to hermeneutics.
While much of the existing corpora are in the English language, similar efforts can be pursued by researchers to push for newspaper digitisation and access to research. For example, Buntinx et al. (2017) have conducted linguistic analysis of two French newspapers that contain four million articles and two billion words over two hundred years. As this method grows in popularity, it is likely that the number of research tools will expand as researchers ask for more customised solutions. It would also entail more inter-disciplinary connections with the field of linguistics. Management scholars, historians and linguists could unite – they have nothing to lose but their words.

References


About the author
Chinmay Tumbe is an Assistant Professor at the Indian Institute of Management Ahmedabad (IIM-A). His research interests lie in business and economic history and migration and urban studies. Chinmay Tumbe can be contacted at: chinmayt@iima.ac.in

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Abstract

Purpose – The purpose of this paper is to reveal something about a turn that occurred in Canadian management from the 1960s to 1980s through an empirical analysis of three different archival research sources. It considers three sub-themes that collectively help to reveal empirically major changes in management identity that happened in Canada from the late 1960s to the early 1980s.

Design/methodology/approach – This paper is divided into several sub-sections and uses social history methodology, although it is principally intended to be an empirical analysis. The rationale for selecting three specific sources and how they relate to each other is discussed. The sources are different in terms of form and periodization, yet they collectively provide coherent insights into the management experience in Canada from the 1960s to 1980s.

Findings – As a methodology paper, this analysis reveals the unique nature of archival sources that are not often found in management history and also shows how they relate to each other.

Research limitations/implications – This paper may seem specific to Canadian management history, but it is intended to present sources and methodology that are applicable regardless of locale.

Originality/value – This paper seeks to present the value of using new methodologies in the study of management history and, while building on existing literature, it helps to reveal the complexity of the management experience in important decades in post-Second World War Canada.

Keywords Canada, Historical research, Management history

Paper type Research paper

Introduction

Being a manager is immersive and can shape a person’s identity. The management function is complex, and people working in it experience it in different ways. This article focuses on how different types of research sources and methodologies can complement each other and how they inform the writing of history and reveal the experience of working in management. This analysis will suggest that the search for sources used in management history should be far-ranging and involve looking in places that seem unexpected, yet often reveal compelling insights into what motivated management, methods that were used, who could claim to be manager and why people aspired to go into managerial roles and the consequences of being in management. This narrative further seeks to add to the historic turn described by Clark and Rowlinson that began over 10 years ago in management history by showing how sources speak with diverse voices and collectively provide broad insights (Clark and Rowlinson, 2007). Management historians are often concerned with how their work can be used or operationalized by people actually engaged in managing corporations and this analysis will contribute to that effort. It is intended to be empirical but it will suggest that the value of using social history methodology, particularly historical materialism to interpret the
meaning and experience of management in different forms. Management historians do not frequently refer to social history, but there is work on social memory (Foster et al., 2011). This narrative will build on other work that has also advocated for using methodologies found in other historical fields (Smith and Russell, 2015). It also builds on recent scholarship on the education and training of managers in Canada in the five decades following the Second World War (Russell, 2018). While existing management history literature is referenced, the main emphasis in this analysis is on the identification and interpretation of primary sources.

This narrative revolves around changes that occurred to management identity over a comparatively short period in the post-Second World War decades. It will describe what the three different sources reveal about themes that shape management identity: defining who is a manager, managerial voice and popular depictions of management. These points of inquiry lead to the overall question of what managers did in the time periods covered by the research sources. These themes also collectively show that significant change occurred in the nature of management work in Canada from the early 1960s to 1980s. More people could aspire to the title of manager and management spoke with a collective voice on public issues, but being a manager also became more difficult. This analysis will also discuss what the three sources say about the role of the management profession within a Canadian context and it will comment on what the sources say about what it meant to be a manager.

Thinking about management history
This article contributes to a turn toward management history that began over 10 years ago. That historic turn has been described by a range of authors and the idea that history should be central to the study of management and organization theory has been a key part of related analyzes (Booth and Rowlinson, 2006). Research supporting the need to consider how history informs topics like management discourse predate the turn (Barley and Kunda, 1992). More recent work has shown how management methods such as the human relations school pioneered by Elton Mayo can be reconsidered in a way that better reveals their legacy (Bruce and Nyland, 2011). Conducting primary source research on management can pose some challenges but, as some work has shown, there is no shortage of archival sources available to historians (Raab, 2016, pp. 18-19). There are print sources, some that are electronic, oral interviews, databases of different kinds and moving images that found in a range of archives. The challenge involves identifying and dealing with the limitations of each source. Sensitive archival documents may be curated in such a way that they can frustrate researchers (Raab, 2016, p. 19). Many corporations retain significant archival holdings but are loathe to permit historians to access them for fear of how their public images may suffer. On the other hand, considerable insights can be gained when corporate archives are successfully accessed (Decker, 2014f). Management historians consequently must look for their sources in places that may not initially seem like repositories of helpful research materials.

The historic turn contributed to the collective understanding of how management developed over time, but the direction in which the writing of management history is now proceeding should include new methodologies. One of the more challenging aspects of the new research that has emerged since the mid-2000s is that it has been critical in the sense that it used a range of research methods to develop new avenues of inquiry into dominant forms of organizing while not always necessarily showing the negative aspects of management. Management is a global institution and it can inflict harm as well as act as an agent for positive change. Booth and Rowlinson (2006, p. 9) called for the turn to lead to “greater reflection on the historical methods appropriate for studying organizations” and that aspiration has in many ways been met. For instance, Decker (2014) used archival and oral sources to describe the use of architecture by three British firms operating in Ghana.
and Nigeria in the 1950s and 1960s. Suddaby et al. (2010) promoted the idea that rhetorical history could be used by firms for competitive advantage and referenced the work of non-management writers such as Eric Hobsbawm and George Orwell. Going further with research techniques such as oral history would add to analyses such as Decker’s. For example, could more be said about what Ghanians and Nigerians thought of the buildings constructed by the three firms, while also thinking about the wider imperial experience? Interest in proving the effectiveness of history as part of management strategy has completely understandable origins, as much of the management history published over the past 12 years originates in graduate business programs. On the other hand, management history is generally not a central topic of inquiry in University history departments.

In terms of writing style, the historic turn has introduced a social science approach to management history. Rhetorical history is a useful development but it differs considerably from narrative history. The style in which history is written represents a form of methodology. Moving toward a method of writing that stresses the need to situate work within existing literature illustrates that the work produced as a result of the turn is intended for academic audiences. However, the interest shown by people in historical organization studies in demonstrating the utility of history as part of management strategy should surely mean writing in a more narrative style that would interest non-academic management audiences. This challenge of how to write management history is not confined by specific borders and is found in Canada.

Methodology
Management is ubiquitous in Canadian society and appears in places like public archives, college records and documentary film. Historians will benefit from looking for archives that contain information about management, rather than looking for places that are specifically considered management archives. This article uses social history methodology to consider how archival sources may be identified and used. Finkel and Conrad (2006, p. 19) provided a widely used description of social history as interdisciplinary as it incorporates other fields such as geography and demography while also including methodologies such as working-class, gender and multi-culturalism. Social history as used in this paper means attempting to reveal aspects of the lived experience of people who were managers or aspired to such roles.

The challenge with Canadian management history is that it is often found in histories focusing on other topics. Within the Canadian context, historians have often learned about management from looking at it through the eyes of workers. For instance, Edith Burley described pre-colonial relations between workers and a key employer in her history of the Hudson’s Bay Company (1997). In that analysis, the company was continually facing difficulties with employing and retaining workers brought from Britain. Craig Heron’s work on working-class life is an example of total history that covers everything from economic to social history and includes analysis of management practice in Canada’s emerging steel industry in the early twentieth century (2015). Canada is closely linked to the USA economically and culturally, and there is considerable historical research on American business practices that provides similar insights. Jefferson Cowie’s research on employment practices in the Radio Corporation of America illustrated how concerned management could be about ensuring that only seemingly compliant and inexpensive workers would be employed (1999). The decades immediately before and after the Second World War witnessed growing employer interest in using forms of paternalism to maintain control over their workers. The Boeing Corporation was one example of a firm that methodically attempted to create what its managers felt was a family atmosphere within the organization (Myers, 2015).
The work by Burley, Cowie and Myers are examples of social history methodology because they reveal who was employed in organizations and at different levels in them. In contrast, institutional history frequently presents organizations as structured led by executives and owners without saying much about who they employed and with whom they interacted in wider socio-economic spheres. Alfred Chandler’s landmark book *The Visible Hand: The Managerial Revolution in American Business* is an example of institutional history that had a huge impact on business and management history, yet it regrettably says little about the actual lives of managers (Chandler, 1977). The relative absence of social history methodology from most business and management history can probably be attributed to the fact that it is rooted in Marxist historical analysis, specifically historical materialism. That methodological approach stressed the importance of considering how people relate to the means of production. Labor and working-class historian Edward Thompson argued that by writing *The Making of the English Working Class* that he was:

Seeking to rescue the poor stockinger, the Luddite cropper, the “obsolete” hand-loom weaver the “utopian artisan, and even the deluded follower of Joanna Northcott, from the enormous condescension of posterity (Thompson, 1991, p. 12).

A management historian can similarly save managers of different types from the same treatment by posterity, while also keeping his/her preferred methodological perspective.

**Sources considered**

Management history is found in places both expected and unexpected and this narrative describes both types of repository. Sources reveal how the concerns of social history analysis, such as gender and class, shaped management while also being shaped by them. When management history focuses on the experience of being a manager or corporate practice, it is often within the context of large organizations. For example, the businesses described by Alfred Chandler appear more often in management history than small and medium-sized organizations (1977). Rowlinson’s (2002) work on Cadbury World is another example of an analysis based on a major corporation. When Moss Kanter (1977) talked about the men and women of a corporation, she described a large organization. Secondary sources such as those ones reveal varying aspects of the management experience. The managers discussed by Chandler were anonymous functionaries, with the exception of senior leaders. Rowlinson also focused on that type of leader with his discussion of the Cadbury family and their religious beliefs. Moss Kanter talked about the experience of lower level managers, but their identities were unknown. This raises the issue of which managers matter and are worthy of being revealed. Analyses by Chandler, Moss Kanter and Rowlinson emphasize what managers did within the parameters of the firm. Such an approach yields important insights, but understanding how people got to managers is also central to the study of historical organizational studies. It is additionally crucial to consider how management attempted to speak on wider socio-economic issues beyond the firm and what happened to managers who were disconnected from their organizations.

The primary sources that are described here refer to management identity, including how managers were educated and viewed themselves, how the views of corporate leaders were expressed and the way in which managers were portrayed. The challenge for researchers is finding and using useful historical materials to support their analyses. The sources used in this analysis come from public archives and, with one exception, are explicitly presented as relating to management. Two of the archives, the Archives of Ontario in Toronto, Canada and the National Film Board of Canada (NFB) website, can be accessed with relative ease and are used frequently by researchers. The third archive at George
Brown College in Toronto, Canada is much less well known to researchers and is infrequently visited despite its staff being quite willing to accommodate research visits. The sources were chosen because they had common themes, but conveyed those themes in different forms. Two sources are principally print-based with photographic images and the third one is a moving image. They describe the management experience from a range of perspectives – from those aspiring to management to those who considered themselves the public voices of management – yet they provide coherent overall insights in the management experience. The sources were also chosen because they help reveal the management experience during formative decades in post-Second World War Canadian history. They also all come from public archival sources. A public archive has advantages for a researcher when compared with a private archive, as well as disadvantages. Table I illustrates some of the benefits and shortcomings either of both types or archival repository.

The first group of sources discussed here comes from George Brown College in Toronto. Community colleges like that one played a key role in educating managers in Canada from the late 1960s onward. They are analogous to further education colleges in the UK. George Brown was one of over a dozen such colleges founded in the province of Ontario in the late 1960s and it began offering management and supervisory training programs as soon as it opened. Its holdings are unique compared to other community colleges in English Canada as George Brown has an organized archive. The accessible George Brown holdings include program guides and correspondence related to matters such as government relations and new program development. The strength of such sources is that they are organized, retained in a systematic manner and hopefully devoid of major biases. The potential weakness of the George Brown holdings is that items that were not deemed important at the time they were considered for retention may have been lost. Those items may have been of interest to historians. Materials that are considered proprietary, including course syllabi, are not

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Considerations</th>
<th>Public</th>
<th>Private</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strengths</td>
<td>Usually well-organized</td>
<td>May contain sources that are not otherwise accessible in public archives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Generally staffed by trained archivists</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Generally accessible</td>
<td>Materials are often readily available once access is granted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>May or may not require copyright approval</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Will hold a wide array of archival collections that may not overtly relate to management but will still have value</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weaknesses</td>
<td>Some materials may require freedom of information approval</td>
<td>Often not easily accessible or well-publicized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There may be delays in the retrieval of records</td>
<td>May not be well-organized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>There can often be challenges with gaining access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Copyright approvals can be laborious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Holdings will not be broad and instead limited to one organization or one function in it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandate</td>
<td>Created as part of wider mission to preserve public memory</td>
<td>Created to preserve the memory of a particular person or organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>May have been created as part of organizational due diligence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I. Public and private archives
available in the George Brown archive. Being able to study an institution’s programs in close detail can be accomplished by examining documents like syllabi. One impediment to using public archives is that reproduction of images of people found in them can be prevented if the identity of a copyright holder cannot be guaranteed and the archive may not hold the copyright even if it holds the image in question.

Management also speaks beyond the business sphere on matters that pertain to corporate interests. Indeed, the matter of the public voice of management is one that is insufficiently examined in existing management history. The Canadian Manufacturers’ Association (CMA) fonds are the second source used in this narrative. This association was a leading voice of business from its formation in 1871 (it is currently known as Canadian Manufacturers and Exporters). It was sponsored by member corporations and articulated policy positions on a range of public issues. The CMA often felt compelled to comment on labor and employment topics. The value of the CMA fonds is that there is a lack of accessible corporate archival material in Canada and those that are accessible often do not reveal management attitudes toward socio-economic issues. The CMA, as one of the leading voices of Canadian industry, continuously articulated policy positions on a range of public policy issues. A possible weakness with the CMA fonds is that they may have been purged of documents that were considered damaging to the organization’s reputation before being deposited at the Archive of Ontario. Business is very concerned with reputation management and so are its advocacy groups.

The way in which management is portrayed in media shapes can shape how managers view themselves and how they in turn are viewed in society. Such depictions range from satirical works to serious documentary films. The experience of working in management is featured in NFB production After the Axe. This film is a docudrama and the third source examined in this discussion. Only the main characters in the film was an actor, while everyone else in the film portrays themselves. After the Axe describes how senior executives lose their jobs and are trained by outplacement agencies to re-enter the workforce. It is also a commentary on losing and regaining managerial identity and the values that people are told that they must internalize. Job loss is popularly associated with workers who are not close to the top of organizational hierarchies. After the Axe provides insights into what happened to senior executives when they lost their jobs in the early 1980s. It is important to emphasize that this film was an effort to accurately portray management job loss and not simply dramatize it as would have been done in other forms of popular media. The main weakness with a source such as this film is that it is an attempt to condense a complicated story into a length that will hold the attention of someone viewing it. A secondary problem is that, while people working in senior management roles and outplacement services portray themselves in the film they would have only done so if they felt assured that the experience would accentuate their careers.

**George Brown College: defining management**

George Brown offered a range of management programs from the late 1960s into 1980s. This discussion will focus on programs that it offered that pertained to service sector management. Those programs revealed the different forms that management could take and some were based on partnerships that the college created with corporate partners. For instance, a program called food service supervisor was offered in 1968 and presented as:

The course is designed to fill the growing need for men and women who are trained in the preparation of food on a large scale. Students are taught to prepare nutritious food in varied and attractive ways, and to purchase and handle supplies so that an establishment may operate at a reasonable profit, observing at all times the importance of cleanliness, sanitation and good public relations. Successful graduate of this course may look forward to well-paid positions in
Students were required to complete several courses over two years including management of food service operations, food service operation supervision and exemplary supervisory action (George Brown College, 1968, pp: 19-20). There was no doubt from the program description that students were trained assume front-line managerial roles and they were assured that decent career prospects awaited them.

Subsequent programs introduced in the 1970s further developed themes found in the late 1960s offerings. One of the programs that the college offered in the late 1970s was called hotel/motel administration. That program was described as:

Highly skilled management is vital to the efficient operation of modern hotels. The hotel industry is a round the clock business and it needs young men and women who are prepared to meet the challenges it offers. The Hotel/Motel Administration program gives the student the training to enter this field. Students learn practical skills in the most modern facilities available including fully-equipped bars and food preparation stations, a private licensed dining lounge and front desk classroom with individual reception desks. Management techniques are learnt with the aid of a computerized model of a hotel operation. In the well-established cooperative training program second-year students spend two months with the department heads of world-famous Toronto hotels learning under expert supervision what the hotel industry is all about (George Brown College, 1977, p: 33).

The description then went on to indicate that graduates would be prepared to work in hotel functions such as front office, catering, beverage control, accounting, personnel or purchasing (George Brown College, 1977, p: 33). Course descriptions were not included in 1977. The program description used the British “learnt” rather than North American “learned”, which suggests that someone who had emigrated from the UK wrote it. Graduates of the hotel/motel program were clearly not being prepared to quickly assume senior leadership roles in organizations and were instead educated to adapt to front-line tasks and responsibilities.

George Brown offered another program in the early 1980s called Apparel Management. The college’s brochures had become more visually appealing by that time and the entry for that program featured photos of stylishly dressed young people who were presumably the type of students that the college sought to draw into apparel management. Information on the Apparel Management program was more illuminating that what had been provided for programs in the 1970s. Students were told that:

The Needle Trade Industry in Canada is constantly seeking people trained in the areas of Production Management, Quality Control, Engineering, and the Marketing and Merchandising of its products [...] emphasis is placed on the following subjects, Supervision, Work Measurement Technology, Computer Applications, Marketing, Equipment Utilization, Fabric and Garment Analysis, Business Management, and Labour Relations…The College maintains a close relationship with trade associations, both in Canada and the United States [...] Successful completion of this program will qualify the student for years 3 and 4 of the degree programs at the Philadelphia College of Textiles and Science, the Fashion Institute of Technology in New York or several other colleges in the United States (George Brown College, 1983, p. 30).

Course descriptions were not provided for the 1983 Apparel Management program, but possible career paths were described. That program also may have appeared more interesting than working in an area of the hospitality industry as it promised the possibility of going to the USA for further study.
The George Brown College program descriptions reveal several interesting aspects about what the college thought that prospective managers needed to know to perform their jobs. From 1968 onward, management was viewed as a function that both men and women would perform even if it would involve working at a low level in business organizations. Management required learning about the practical aspects of running a business such as accounting and purchasing and it required familiarity with basic supervisory techniques. The college emphasized links to industry and, in the case of Apparel Management, the possibility of further learning through partnerships in the USA. The overall sense is that front-line management is important and that understanding the basic applied functions of business organizations was a crucial start to enjoying a successful career. It also evident that the term management could be used to describe roles in dissimilar industries such as apparel and food service, with the meaning of the term being largely the same in both instances. The possible vagaries of working in management were not described in the program course descriptions. The collective voice of management was also not found in the George Brown Archives, but can be found in other repositories.

The Canadian Manufacturers’ Association: management voice
 Managers are often anonymous in management history. They do not have advocacy organizations in Canada like unions representing their interests, indeed they have historically faced barriers to legally engaging in collective action. Management in Canada has instead historically spoken through industry and trade organizations. The CMA was one such organization. However, while it claimed to speak broadly for corporations, it in fact represented the views of senior executives and other people who ran corporations. The CMA still operates in Canada, and therefore retain archives materials and some records pertaining to its operations up until the 1970s are available in the Archives of Ontario in Toronto. Reviewing the CMA archival materials reveals an organization that was interested in, if not indignant over, government policy. For instance, in the early 1970s, the association was especially vexed over changes to labor and employment law in Ontario. In 1971 a member company called Automatic Electric Canada Ltd. sent an impassioned letter drafted by its president to Ontario Premier William Davis protesting changes that had been made to the provincial Employment Standards Act:

The adverse effects of the recent changes to the Employment Standards Act have caused me great concern. Briefly, the latest provisions of the Act, dealing with lay-off notice, has caused great confusion to our employees; uncertainly and embarrassment to the labour union representing them; great inefficiencies in our factory; and thousands of dollars of unexpected expense in the operation of our business [...] the legislation passed last year, and effective January 1st of this year, obliged employers to provide extended notice periods for mass layoffs [...] our cooperation has exacted heavy penalties in lessened morale, reduced efficiency, and increased cost to us (Canadian Manufacturers Association Fonds, 1971).

The letter was signed by company president C.R. Hughes and, while it went into great detail about the extent of his outrage, it was also not entirely accurate about stating who within the company was aggrieved. Hughes was clearly upset that a new requirement to provide longer notice of job loss had been imposed by the province and it is entirely possible that compliance with the new rule indeed led to some initial challenges for management. However, it is highly unlikely that the union representing workers was upset about its members receiving more warning of impending unemployment.

Another matter involving a new provincial requirement imposed on business led to a letter sent to William Davis in late 1971. This time, the CMA spoke directly for its members rather than letting one member company speak for itself. The association was aggravated
that employers had to pay higher premiums into the public Ontario Health Insurance Plan. The letter indicated that premiums had been rising since 1969, and that a further rise in 1971 was worsening the situation for companies (Canadian Manufacturers Association, December 1971). The CMA was not consistently critical of government policy decisions. In yet another 1971 letter to the Ontario Department of Labor, the association commended the government’s efforts to improve education and training as it related to industry but stated that “the Association rejects the concept of a planned economy which presupposes government direction as to what can or cannot be produced economically in this country” (Canadian Manufacturers Association, November 1971). The association did like the idea of government intervention in higher education, regardless of protests about state planning and had this comment about community colleges:

The Association finds that these colleges are filling a real need. Graduates become competent employees and, with experience and further education, are capable of advancing to make valuable contributions to company performance…we recommend that the Community Colleges be the principal arm of the Province of Ontario in providing post-secondary education for employment (Canadian Manufacturers Association, November 1971).

This was a contradictory commentary on what the CMA considered the state’s role in education, although the drafters of the letter obviously did not detect any inconsistency in their position. This was obviously because having government perform the leading role in shaping higher education policy, even to the extent of identifying what type of institution should prepare students for employment, constituted extensive planning related to the Ontario economy. The association was saying with little subtlety that government intervention and planning was necessary, as long as it was activity that business endorsed.

The CMA represented the private industry and thus had a stake in government policy decisions that would directly impact its members. However, as seen in its position on post-secondary education, the association felt that it had the right to comment on public policy issues that may pertain to its interest. There were other occasions when it spoke on issues that had relatively little direct influence on corporations and this was especially true when it came to public sector employment. The CMA argued in February 1971 paper on compensation in Ontario schools that having professional teachers was required for the province, but that teachers should not have the right to strike and that the public should not be “held to ransom, nor children denied an education as a result of labour disputes” (Canadian Manufacturers Association, February 1971). The association also stated that, through limited enquiries, it had determined that most teachers were “not very familiar with the federations and organizations to which they belong” (Canadian Manufacturers Association, February 1971). There CMA was determined that collective bargaining not be practiced in the public sector in the same manner as in the private sector (Canadian Manufacturers Association, February 1971).

The CMA’s positions on labor and employment matters show the same pattern as what it said about higher education. Corporations felt that they had a right to comment on public policy matters and only saw merit in government actions that helped business. The idea that government policy could realistically have both positive and negative effects was not even considered. The CMA also considered its members to be important and that it had a right to enunciate positions on all manner of public policy issues. It did clearly say why its members opposed the idea of public sector workers having the right to strike, but the subtext to the association’s arguments was that its members did not wish to see a strengthened Canadian labor movement. The passage of the Public Service Staff Relations Act (PSSRA) at the federal level in 1967 led to an enormous expansion of public section unionization across Canada (Heron, 1996, p. 96). The CMA was not willing to overtly say
that it did not want to see organized labor become stronger and would instead imply that sentiment. The voices of senior executives such as the indignant president of Automatic Electric Canada Ltd. are heard clearly in the CMA archival materials. Supervisors who had graduated from places like George Brown or any other community college are not heard. They were toiling in front-line supervisory jobs and may well have been unaware that their companies were members of the CMA and that the organization was expressing opinions on matters that may have well affected their daily lives. The names of CMA members and spokespersons appear in the fonds at the Archives of Ontario but their actual voices and images do not. Film and video archival sources do provide those sounds and images.

After the axe: management identity

The third source under consideration here follows the first two by showing what type of person ran corporations in the late 1970s and early 1980s and how executives were expected to make sense of their careers. They were the people whose organizations hired community college graduates and joined groups like the CMA. Managers were encouraged to feel that they had great careers ahead of them when they entered their positions or embarked on different forms of training. For instance, nobody entering a full-time management program at George Brown College from the 1960s to 1980s was advised to take a course on what to do after losing a job and spending time unemployed. The CMA appeared more concerned with labor relations matters in the 1970s than with management job loss. After the Axe was based on a fictional composite character. The film was produced in the same year that North America experienced a deep recession, which led to a wave of management job losses. Considering how people make sense of their life experience, especially adversity, is a theme in some management and organizational literature and After the Axe relates to it (Helms Mills et al., 2010).

The main character, D.R. (Biff) Wilson and the members of his family were portrayed by actors. Everyone else shown in the film actually played themselves and were employed in senior management roles and in the outsourcing industry and appeared as they would in their daily working lives. Wilson is shown to have been vying with another executive for the presidency of a company called Universal foods and the other executive was the successful candidate. Wilson had a bachelor’s degree while the other man held an MBA. He and Wilson did not get along, with the latter man resentful of the outcome of the competition for the president position. The new president hired a consultant to handle the process of terminating Wilson and moving him into new employment. Wilson was making $65,000 per year at the time of his termination, had a company car and benefit plan and was married with three children (National Film Board, 1981).

Wilson described himself as “shaken, numb” as he was shown methodically emptying the personal items from his office. He returns home and tells his wife that the entire process was handled in a clinical manner and that he “was so hot I could hardly speak.” He lamented that he had “sweated blood for that company for fifteen years; now what do I do?” Wilson had entered the workforce at a time when people joined in junior management roles, climbed the ladder and generally stayed with the same company. He was an organization man described by Whyte in 1956 as working in the type of firm subsequently examined by Chandler in 1977. The film then showed an employment lawyer who noted that Universal foods’ greatest fear was that Wilson would retaliate. The lawyer argued that, because of Wilson’s long tenure with the company, substantial cause would have to be shown for termination. Termination over something like general incompetence would be considered insufficient cause for dismissal by a court. Relocation counselor Eric Barton was paid $10,000 “to defuse the fired man.” The use of people such as Barton was not necessarily motivated by humane concerns, but is an effort by employers to avoid lawsuits. Giving Wilson relocation counselling and 12 months’ of salary
also made a lawsuit less likely to occur. His aptitudes and achievements would be codified as part of an overall assessment by the counselor and it was suggested that he would not like the outcome (National Film Board, 1981).

Wilson found himself sitting at the counselor’s office in a cubicle along with around 100 other displaced executives. He thought that it felt like a hospital ward. The relocation industry began in New York in 1968 when a marketing executive applied his knowledge to fired executives. Barton previously worked in insurance and was also a born-again Christian who felt a sense of mission about his work as a counselor. Wilson was put through a physical examination by a physician and several hours of psychometric testing. He found that he was inclined to be blunt and judgmental and that he possessed only fair managerial ability. On the other hand, he was in the eightieth percentile in intelligence among managers and had a competitive nature. Wilson was then shown running and undergoing an image makeover to improve his appearance, then participating in a practice interview. The relocation counselor concluded that Wilson had “peaked” in terms of his career and that he was “over his head” and that it would be better for him to move to a smaller company than his last employer. Elton Mayo was not referenced in the film, but his influence was evident throughout the outplacement process that was shown in it (Mayo, 1945). Putting people through psychometric tests and inducing them to rationalize their career circumstances are human relations school practices (National Film Board, 1981).

Wilson is disillusioned with the resource counselor’s recommendations and attempts a job search through his personal contacts. This job search approach does not succeed. In the meantime, a physician who treats senior executives who work in downtown Toronto commented on the combative nature of executive work and the physical ailments and stress from which his patients suffer. Wilson’s blood pressure increased when he lost his job. The problem of being an unemployed executive over the age of 40 was emphasized. Barton indicated that personality conflict with a superior is the main reason that people get fired, not because of competence. However, a recruiter who appeared in the film described company loyalty as being as relevant as “moats and drawbridges” and that the “corporation cannot be loyal.” Wilson still felt loyal to Universal foods even after losing his job, but gradually learned that he could no longer feel that sense of loyalty and had to instead look after his own interests. The film concluded with Wilson obtaining a new executive role at a smaller company (National Film Board, 1981).

There are some key reasons that this film is an important historical artifact. It shows the personality type of many senior executives, the negative aspects of their work and the emerging precariousness of their jobs by the early 1980s. The personal life of the main character seems decidedly lacking as he says at one point that executives would be better off not having families and he was shown on two occasions as essentially estranged from two of his children. There is also the problem of a person’s identity being defined by his or her executive role. It is entirely evident throughout the film that Wilson feels that his identity was lost along with his job. The unemployed executives shown in the film were male, with only one woman appearing in a non-speaking role. Being over the age of 40 was repeatedly cited as a barrier to new employment. The work environment for executives was shown to be highly competitive, if not combative and to take an enormous toll on people in such roles. Executives were primarily shown in isolation from the people whom they supervise, with female administrative support staff seeming to be the only lower-level workers portrayed. This suggests that executives were disconnected from the people who actually toiled in the organizations that they managed (National Film Board, 1981).

The fact that people in senior leadership roles participated in the film conveys some key insights. Firstly, they obviously felt it important to show what it is like when someone like
themselves lost employment. Secondly, they clearly thought that outplacement and the lessons
that it brought were valid and useful. Finally, it appears that at least some of the participants
viewed the film as somewhat of a vanity project. There are scenes of a lunchtime running
group in which senior executives participated and also a segment of them exercising in a gym.
In fact, there is even footage of them changing in a locker room with one man in a full-frontal
nude shot. The people playing themselves in After the Axe possessed large egos regardless of
the pressure that they felt on the job (National Film Board, 1981).

The messages from three archival sources
The three sources communicate the evolving nature of who could be called a manager, how the
voice of management publicly appeared in Canada and how the nature of managerial work
changed in Canada from the late 1960s to the early 1980s. They reveal a turn in the nature of
management. The course guides of George Brown College, the memoranda of the CMA and the
film After the Axe show an evolving management occupation that had broadened in terms of
who could acquire management training and associated job titles and they also show
management as increasingly confrontational and harsh. The fact that George Brown College
offered a diverse range of programs pertaining to management in different industries illustrates
that there was a demand for this type of education. The CMA endorsement of community
college programs further confirms that view. What is also clear from both the George Brown
College archival materials and those found at the Archive of Ontario on the CMA is that
management had a contradictory view of relations with government. The CMA felt that it
could advise the Ontario Government on how it should deal with public sector collective
bargaining, even though it had no member organizations in the public sector and that it could
critique such matters as financing of the province’s public health care system. The CMA
showed a form of collective management identity through its actions.

The most negative commentary in After the Axe relates to the idea that executives should not
feel any loyalty to an organization and should instead focus on what is best for them. Managers
were advised to put their own interests ahead of any other concern. It is clear from this film that
the organization man described by William Whyte in the 1950s was obsolete by the 1980s
(Whyte, 1956). The reality that loyalty may flow from the top down in an organization was not
discussed in the film, but a lack of loyalty among executives would inevitably lead to the same
sentiment being expressed by everyone in an organization. The fact that executives were told
that they had to unquestioningly accept the new realities of their jobs shows that, by the early
1980s, this was the accepted ethos in Canadian business. The film’s title summarized the new
reality: losing an executive job was akin to being decapitated. A small group of senior managers
and executives were shown in the film attending a prayer meeting held in Toronto’s financial
district during lunch hour to find solace from the intensely competitive nature of their work. They
were far outnumbered by people out on the street and in executive suites who had already
internalized the reality facing people. Wilson found a new job that met his personal requirements
and the film thus had something approximating a happy ending, but the overall narrative raised
more questions than it answered (National Film Board, 1981).

The sources expand on the nature of management by actually showing the types of
education programs in which individuals could enroll, who was actually representing corporate
advocacy organizations and the type of person who lost employment as a senior executive.
Corporations and management often appear monolithically in management and organizational
history. Individual managers are often anonymous, unless they are the chief executives of
corporations and develop considerable influence. For example, Farber’s book on Alfred P. Sloan
is an example of the type of history that has been written about corporate leaders (Farber,
2002). However, by writing narratives that focuses on a comparative small group of corporate
leaders, historians risk falling into the trap set in the nineteenth century by Thomas Carlyle through his great man theory of history (Carlyle, 1870). It is also important to avoid excessive positivism in management history, as it is with writing in any historical sub-field.

The three sources reveal much about who is a manager and what the role requires. Management can be reactionary, as shown in some of the CMA’s policy positions. Being in a management position need not lead to greatness, as seen through George Brown College’s programs and instead could simply mean employability. Management is seen as being principally male in those sources, although women appear in the George Brown materials. It involved organizing business functions and there is an overall message that being in management is important and that assuming leadership roles is a worthwhile vocation. Those insights link to the literature described earlier in this article. The need for control is a theme found throughout the three archival sources described here and that is discussed in detail by people like Burley, Cowie and Heron. The way that management is shown to act in the CMA fonds and After the Axe is remarkably devoid of historical context. The film in particular shows management mainly concerned with what is happen in an immediate contemporary context with little interest in what has happened in the past. A need to historicize the management experience, develop organizational memory and incorporate history into management thinking is substantiated in the three research sources discussed here.

Another important aspect about the film, the George Brown College materials and the CMA documents is that they are in government archival repositories. These are not sources from management or corporate archives; they are instead archival sources that pertain to management. This is a nuanced but important difference. Business may have ambivalent feelings about the socio-economic role of the state, but the state nonetheless does a lot of remembering for business. Referencing a documentary film acknowledges a basic reality for historians: many sources on recent history come in forms such as moving images or digital repositories. There is also the matter of whether management was depicted in positive manner. The George Brown program guides portrayed management as something aspirational and not at all negative. The CMA documents show that management wanted an influential voice and often spoke in publicly critical terms, while the film showed management as something predatory and perhaps to be avoided. Management could be something that led to a position of prominence in the business community, such as working as an executive, or it could also mean being a comparatively anonymous service industry manager.

Corporations may wonder why there is value in community college program guides, memoranda written decades ago by business organizations, or NFB films. They often have difficulty with acknowledging past practices that may have been regrettable or even unethical and management historians have similarly shown a reluctance to directly address such issues.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Archival collections</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **George Brown College Archives** | Box S87-1 to S87-4 (1968 Full-time program guide)  
| | Box S87-8 to S87-12 (1977 Full-time program guide and 1983 Full-time program guide)  
| **Archives of Ontario** | Canadian Manufacturers Association Fonds, RG7-12-10, Box 317096 and RG7-1-0-1881.1, Box 353713 (files unmarked)  
| **Film** | After the Axe, 1981 (film), Sturlar Gunnarsson director. Canada: National Film Board of Canada. https://www.nfb.ca/film/after_axe/, accessed 10 February 2018  
| **Website** | Canadian Manufacturers and Exporters, www.cme-mec.ca/english/who-we-are/our-history.html, accessed 10 February 2018  

Table II. Archival sources described
For instance, as Cook has shown, there has been unwillingness to talk about slavery and how it relates to management studies (Cook 2004). Rowlinson, Casey, Hansen and Mills have examined how organizational memory is formed through narratives and storytelling and delving into a broader range of archival sources helps construct organizational memory and also ideas about what constituted management as an occupation (Rowlinson et al., 2014). Discussing the meaning of management requires facing what is both positive and negative about it and how memories about both such aspects are formed and remembered.

The practices and beliefs that are found in the sources examined here help historicize management. They also speak specifically to the Canadian management experience and more generally to being in management. The George Brown College archive comprises materials devised and used at a Canadian institution and collectively show the routes that people could take to low-level managerial work. The CMA finds at the Archive of Ontario also provide insights into a Canadian organization that wanted to be a leading voice of the nation’s business community. After the Axe is somewhat different as it was set in Canada while conveying ideas about the broader nature of managerial work in North America in the 1980s. Community colleges continue to offer management programs of many types and help define who can be called a manager. Business lobbying organizations have an ongoing interest in public policy and identify themselves as the public voice of corporations and management. There is a pressing need to understand the lived experience of managers at all levels and how their roles altered over time. For example, in the case of After the Axe, it is important to identify the modern origins of management as a self-interested activity. It would be worthwhile to give greater consideration to management’s misuses of history as well as its uses. The sources described here show how management was shaped by relations with the work process, which is a key part of historical materialism. They illustrate how people working in managerial roles are able to exert some agency over their working lives, such as their choice of post-secondary education program, but also reveal that even senior executives can find their careers thrown into upheaval. Such sources can surely be used with greater vigor by historians to understand how people were taught to be managers, how management collectively expressed itself and how the nature of managerial work changed over time (Table II).

References


Myers, P.R. (2015), Capitalist Family Values: Gender, Work, and Corporate Culture at Boeing, University of NE Press, Lincoln.


Further reading


Heron, C. (2015), Lunch-Bucket Lives: Remaking the Workers’ City, Between the Lines Press, Toronto.


About the author

Jason Russell is an Associate Professor in the School for Graduate Studies at Empire State College – SUNY. He completed a PhD in History at York University in Toronto, Canada. Russell has published in Management and Organizational History and Labor/LesTravail and has also contributed chapters to edited volumes. He is the author of Making Managers in Canada, 1945 – 1995: Companies, Community Colleges and Universities (Routledge, 2018) and Our Union: UAW/CAW Local 27 from 1950 to 1990 (Athabasca University Press, 2011). Jason Russell can be contacted at: Jason.Russell@esc.edu

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website:
www.emeraldlitepublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
In search of continuity
Theoretical and methodological insights from a case study of a Polish centennial company
Tomasz Olejniczak and Anna Pikos
Department of Management, Kozminski University, Warsaw, Poland, and
Toshio Goto
Japan University of Economics, Tokyo, Japan

Abstract
Purpose – This study aims to represent an early attempt to define the notion of continuity and empirically illustrate its explanatory potential and methodological challenges.
Design/methodology/approach – This study combines historical and qualitative research techniques to conduct a qualitative analysis of continuity in the Jablkowski Brothers Department Store, a Polish centennial company. The paper highlights the potential synergies between historical and qualitative methods when applied to the analysis of long periods of time.
Findings – The authors find that using a theoretical framework of continuity provides novel ontological and epistemological insights into the nature of long-lived companies. Based on the findings, the authors present continuity in the context of existing theories and argue that it is a unique concept that deserves more scientific attention and rigorous empirical study.
Originality/value – This study contributes to the existing literature in three ways. First, it provides a brief, interdisciplinary overview of the concept of continuity. Second, it provides an empirical illustration of continuity analysis in a Polish centennial company with extremely discontinuous history. Finally, it positions continuity within the wider context of existing theories and shows how, through continuity, history can contribute to both the practice and theory of management.
Keywords Continuity, Research methods, Longevity, Business history
Paper type Research paper

Introduction
In the current age of great acceleration (McNeill and Engelke, 2016), tracking, measuring and addressing change at its ever-increasing rate seem to be attracting significant attention. Yet, simultaneously, we observe growing interest in the notion of continuity and its various manifestations such as family business succession (Pérez and Colli, 2013), longevity (Goto, 2013; Napolitano et al., 2015; Sharma and Dixit, 2017), brand heritage (Wiedmann et al., 2011), business archives (Turton, 2017), organisational identity (Gioia et al., 2000; Hatch and Schultz, 2002; Whetten, 2006) and sustainability (Jones, 2017). All of these streams of research jointly contribute to the growing impetus of the historic turn (Clark and Rowlinson, 2004) and a worldwide interest in business history (Amatori and Jones, 2003).

It seems that historical methods are uniquely positioned and equipped to provide in-depth insight into the underlying nature of continuity, but so far, they have failed to do so, at least explicitly. Despite a number of publications with continuity and change in the title

This work was supported by the Grant for Statutory Research number 785.
(McKinlay and Starkey, 1994; Ullrich et al., 2005; Pettigrew, 2013), one quickly realises that change, rather than continuity, constitutes the main focus of such analyses. In addition, the traditional association between these two words perpetuates the idea that continuity and change are somehow opposed to each other, an idea that over the years has been questioned by a number of authors (Streeck and Thelen, 2005; Farjoun, 2010; Nasim and Sushil, 2011). Given the dearth of reliable theoretical debate, many authors resort to common sense, which often leads to confusing continuity with other concepts such as stability, inertia, or simply “lack of change”.

In this study, we argue that historical analysis should focus on continuity rather than change. Continuity forces us to ask the ultimate ontological questions about the nature of the company and how it can reconcile the integrity of its organisational identity with disruptive environmental changes or the need for constant innovation. Continuity also holds the key to understanding the phenomenon of business longevity (Napolitano et al., 2015), which begins to attract more and more attention. Finally, while we approach the limits of managing accelerating speed of change, counter-intuitively it might be important to re-appraise the value of the continuity and start learning to use the past more strategically and effectively.

This study is an early, yet long-overdue attempt to explore the notion of continuity, including its definition, theoretical origins, possible research techniques and practical and theoretical implications. Study consists of two major parts, which contribute to the literature in two ways. The first part focusses on what continuity is. It puts forward a comprehensive framework of continuity theory, provides a brief, interdisciplinary overview of the concept of continuity and discusses methodological issues related to its measurement. The second part focusses on why continuity is important. We begin by providing an exploratory empirical analysis of continuity in the little-known Polish context. The analysis of the dramatic and abrupt changes that the Jabłkowski Brothers Department Store (DTBJ) has faced over the years illustrates how apparent discontinuity could be reappraised as continuity. Consequently, we argue that continuity can provide unique and novel theoretical insights and then discuss the practical implications including uses of history and potential strategic importance to a firm’s management.

Definition of continuity
Continuity is a unique example of a theoretical concept whose customary usage is much more pervasive than its scientific definition. In this paper, continuity is defined as *an uninterrupted line joining two points in time*, and although it might seem minimalistic or even simplistic, it highlights three crucial points grounded in the literature presented later on.

First, the definition focusses on the quality of a line being uninterrupted, rather than its length or shape, which would indicate the size, scope and speed of change over time. By separating the quality of being uninterrupted from the issue of change, this definition is consistent with the existing literature that will be discussed later, most notably, Leibniz’s law of continuity (Leibniz, 2001), recent arguments for the separation of continuity and change and the notion that the opposition of continuity is discontinuity (Streeck and Thelen, 2005; Farjoun, 2010; Nasim and Sushil, 2011).

The second point is that the proposed definition focusses on two points in time, without specifying their position. This too is a conscious choice, as continuity analysis should not be focussed exclusively on the time span between the arbitrarily defined foundation and the present day. In our view, which is to some extent inspired by the ambivalence towards periodisation in *longue durée* (Harris, 2004), the researcher should be able to freely choose the points in time between which they want to measure the company’s continuity. This is
because each dimension of the analysed company can, as will be shown later, have a different date of origin and time span.

Finally, the definition refrains from specifying who has the ultimate authority in assessing the quality of line being uninterrupted. This is due to the implicit, albeit slightly idealistic, assumption of objective approach to continuity analysis. This assumption represents an intended break from the Aristotelian tradition, which valued subjective identity and suggested that continuity is maintained as long as the object itself maintains coherent identity (Jiang, 2005). Instead, the definition gives anyone a right to assess the uninterrupted quality of the line based on the objective data and theoretical framework of dimensions discussed in the following paragraphs.

Figure 1 is a visual representation of the proposed definition and the notions of continuity and discontinuity.

In this intuitive representation, continuity is a horizontal line on a scale, which can be often observed in a real-life setting of corporate museums, chronologies, timelines or milestones, as well as the mathematical representations of a continuous function. The horizontal axis represents time, while the vertical axis can take any numerical value. As long as the line has no interruptions, continuity is maintained regardless of changes in value. The left side of Figure 1 presents continuity regardless of the ratio or nature of change, represented by the shapes of lines (a), (b), and (c), while the right side presents discontinuity of a linear process in its various forms distinguished by mathematicians studying functions. For example, line (a) represents infinite discontinuity, in which processes will continue to grow (or decrease) infinitely but their endpoints will never meet; (b) represents removable discontinuity, in which there is a single gap in the otherwise continuous process; finally (c) represents a jump discontinuity, in which there a mismatch between the endpoint of one process and the starting point of another. As discontinuity, in all its complexity, deserves a separate study, in the following paragraphs, we will focus solely on the issue of continuity.

A quick look at the graphical representation of continuity makes it obvious that a single line is incapable of representing the empirical complexity of a company. Ultimately, the question of continuity is linked with the ontological question of what constitutes a company or a business. Because the scope of this study does not permit a lengthy discussion, we will simply propose the notion under which the company can be defined as a bundle of ten mutually interacting but independent elements, namely, core business, name, core technology, product/service, location, legal status, ownership, infrastructure, people and

Source: Own elaboration
philosophy. This notion is neither new nor original and, as will be shown following paragraphs, has long been present in philosophy (Jiang, 2005) and organisational theories, most notably including a resource-based view (Barney, 2001) and family business literature (Drozdow, 1998). Consequently, we argue that continuity analysis should be subdivided into the analysis of multiple elements, which we choose to refer to – following Drozdow (1998) – as dimensions of continuity. The following paragraphs provide a brief overview of the notion of continuity across different disciplines, which provide grounds for the proposed definition.

Continuity in philosophy
In philosophy, the debate concerning the notion of continuity dates as far back as Aristotle, according to whom continuous referred to that which is divisible into parts which are always divisible (Jiang, 2005, p. 450). The Aristotelian definition of continuity was therefore not so much related to time and process as it was related to the object and its unity or identity. This focus made it impossible to account for continuity in the change process, as any degree of change in the object would automatically lead to the loss of its identity. Consequently, continuity in the Aristotelian sense is understood as a lack of change, stability or infinite divisibility at a certain moment.

Another philosopher who devoted a significant portion of his works to continuity was Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz. His chief contribution was in coining the famous principle of continuity, according to which nature makes no leaps (Jorgensen, 2009, p. 223). In Leibniz’s view, any change in location or time is a continuous change. [...] This applies not only to objects, but to their states as well (Jorgensen, 2009, p. 226). He argued that reality consisted of things in various states and degrees of continuous change, and that discontinuous change (like death or birth) is unnatural and out of the ordinary. Unfortunately, Leibniz’s work was based on the Aristotelian definition and failed to explain the dynamic aspects of continuity.

Ultimately, Japanese philosopher Nishida Kitarō disentangled the relationship between continuity, change and identity. Kitarō proposed the notion of logic of the predicates (Jiang, 2005), which assumed that the qualities of a given object should be given a value equal to that of the object itself. This notion was opposed to Aristotle’s approach called logic of the object, in which it was the object that integrated all of its qualities (or predicates) and gave them their ultimate identity. More importantly, Kitarō argued that while identity was a temporal phenomenon observable at a given point in time and not transferable from one moment to another, the qualities that constituted it could be seen as continuous processes (Jiang, 2005, p. 455). So, it was the objective continuous qualities that defined the temporal subjective identity and not the other way around.

As we will demonstrate in the following paragraphs, this early philosophical discourse concerning continuity had a crucial impact on the assumptions made by subsequent researchers, and to this day, it resonates in history, sociology and management.

Continuity in history and other social studies
In sociology and history, the debate about continuity and discontinuity represents a paradigmatic disagreement about the nature of society and reality. On the one hand, Fernand Braudel, the founder of a longue durée argues that “there can be no science without historical continuity; an anonymous history working in the depths and most often in silence” (Harris, 2004, p. 161). Such a view of history focusses on events that occur nearly imperceptibly over a long time (Braudel and Wallerstein, 2009) and the slowly changing relationships between people and the world (Tomich, 2011), as a result of which “history escapes the awareness of the actors” (Harris, 2004 p. 165).
On the other hand, Gurvitch’s sociology assumes a Promethean view of reality, according to which history does not exist separately from human consciousness or agency, and is perceived as a socially constructed phenomenon undergoing constant revolution (Harris, 2004). These early views are echoed in modern approaches such as institutional logics defined by Thornton and Ocasio (1999) as:

The socially constructed, historical patterns of material practices, assumptions, values, beliefs, and rules by which individuals produce and reproduce their material subsistence, organize time and space, and provide meaning to their social reality (p. 804).

These assumptions introduced the notion of historical contingency, according to which historical context affects the meaning of all organisational phenomena or actions. Despite this fundamental disagreement, some modern sociologists managed to find a middle ground. For example, Streeck and Thelen (2005) distinguish “between processes of change, which may be incremental or abrupt, and results of change, which may amount to either continuity or discontinuity” (pp. 8-9). Moreover, Sztompka (1993), contrary to Gurvitch’s view of sociology, sees society as a continuous, trans-temporal phenomenon. He argues that the past of the society never entirely disappears and continues in the form of historical traditions, whose survival is facilitated by two casual mechanisms: the material mechanism, related to the survival of objects, and the ideal-based mechanism, related to memory (Sztompka, 1993, pp. 56-57).

**Continuity in management**

In management, studies that explicitly refer to continuity come from the field of supply chain and risk management, where continuity management is treated as one of the main challenges facing global logistics (Herbane, 2010). Continuity has also been explicitly referred to by a number of authors from the perspective of organisational change (Huy, 2002; Nasim and Sushil, 2011), identity and historical narrative (Carr, 1986; Chreim, 2005). However, despite repeated calls for a wider debate (Sushil, 2013, 2014), thus far, no one has put forward a comprehensive framework for the analysis of continuity.

Much more has been written about the issue of continuity implicitly by authors studying the phenomena of dynamic capabilities, path dependence, or succession in family business. Dynamic capabilities were understood as key tools used to manipulate existing configurations of resources to create new ones and gain competitive advantage (Eisenhardt and Martin, 2000). From a historical perspective, dynamic capabilities were presented as recipes for success often rooted in the past, which could guarantee long-term survival (Jones et al., 2013). However, continuity as a source of competitive disadvantage, particularly in the context of technology, became a key area of focus for path-dependence theory aimed at the identification of critical events and lock-ins, which result in current suboptimal performance (Sydow et al., 2009). Finally, in the field of family business, continuity was often discussed in conjunction with succession (Drozdow, 1998; Jaskiewicz et al., 2015). In some cases, continuity was discussed from a historical perspective as trans-generational succession of values (Jaskiewicz et al., 2015) or as a recipe for survival (Drozdow, 1998). Drozdow’s study deserves special mention, as it is the only one that defies prevalent approaches rooted in a traditional philosophy and proposes the idea of dimensions of continuity, including strategy, ownership, family leadership, cohesion, business culture, mission and independence (pp. 339-340). Drozdow makes a compelling case that the survival of a family business can focus on one or several of the dimensions while sacrificing others. This perspective is unique, as it is probably the only case in the existing literature directly related to Kitarô’s...
logic of the predicate. Unfortunately, despite its innovative approach, Drozdow’s study fails to generate a wider debate regarding the nature of continuity.

Finally, and importantly, business historians have developed a keen interest in topics related to continuity in recent years. On the one hand, literature is growing on how managers use the past (Hatch and Schultz, 2017) or construct rhetorical history strategies (Smith and Simeone, 2017) to shape organisational identity (Rowlinson and Hassard, 1993; Maclean et al., 2014), obtain competitive advantage and communicate more persuasively with customers, workers and other stakeholders (Foster et al., 2011). All these studies omit the issue of continuity or discontinuity of history and its meaning in the context of prevailing historical culture (Smith and Simeone, 2017). On the other hand, such discussion seems to be increasingly relevant as we observe an increased interest in the issue of longevity (Goto, 2013; Riviezzo et al., 2015; Sharma and Dixit, 2017), where these authors seem to look for a common denominator, and some of them openly call for ‘an integrated framework of business longevity’ as follows:

Even if the domain of business longevity has been enriched by the multidisciplinary nature of approaches used to investigate the phenomenon, the lack of a unifying perspective has impeded systematic research and caused definitional ambiguity. [...] in most cases it is not even clear what has survived over decades or even centuries in long lasting firms: is it the name of the company, the brand, ownership, or something else? (Napolitano et al., 2015 pp. 1-2)

This brief literature review shows that although continuity has constituted an important topic across multiple fields, it still remains to be developed within the field of management and organisational studies. Due to the lack of an operationalised definition, theoretical framework or methodological discussion, we were unable to say what continuity is and how it affects the management of a company. The following paragraphs present a way towards an integrated framework of continuity and its empirical verification.

Methods
The key research question was defined as “how does continuity manifest itself empirically in a centennial company?” The study used a combination of historical (Bucheli and Wadhwni, 2014) and qualitative research methods including case study (Yin, 2009) and coding (Saldaña, 2015). Combining these methods is not uncommon as they share many similar features (Bucheli and Wadhwni, 2014, p. 279), and in fact, it is often encouraged by historians arguing for more plurality business history methods (Rowlinson et al., 2014; Decker et al., 2015; De Jong et al., 2015). In the following paragraphs, we will briefly discuss how these methods complemented each other in different phases of research.

Sampling
Both the historical and case study approaches advocate theoretical sampling for exploring a new phenomenon (Bucheli and Wadhwni, 2014, pp. 268-269; De Jong et al., 2015). Studying the concept of continuity is relevant particularly in the context of a Polish centennial company for three reasons. First, such companies transcend the normal span of human life and are the embodiment of longue durée phenomena (Braudel and Wallerstein, 2009), which raises the issue of continuity in the process of succession and the inter-generational transition of knowledge, values and resources. Second, they present a challenge from the perspective of historical methodology, which favours contextually rich research focussed on a certain period, thus creating the need for a novel theoretical and methodological approach that cuts across accepted periodisation (Harris, 2004) and extends to current day data collection (Napolitano et al., 2015). Finally, the sheer length of their existence exposes them
to many abrupt or discontinuous environmental change such as wars, industrial and technological revolutions and globalisation. In this latter aspect, Polish centennial companies constitute a particularly interesting case due to the extreme nature of the political and economic changes that took place in Poland over the past century and their under-representation in the international business history literature (Amatori and Jones, 2003; Pikos and Olejniczak, 2017).

Data collection

Regarding data collection, both historical and qualitative methods advocate multiple sources of data, which can be then used for triangulation (Bucheli and Wadhwani, 2014, pp. 287-294, 316-319). Historical methods aided in identifying and collecting primary archival sources dispersed in public and family archives, including archival records, archival shares issued by DTBJ, establishment act, corporate bulletins (1928-1931) and pictures. Secondary sources included corporate histories published by the company in 1980 and 2005, archival press articles and oral histories. Because our research included the current state of the company, it was necessary to use the case study method and supplement the archival data with secondary data, including internet records of company events and current press articles. We also obtained primary data through multiple visits to the company, interviews with current family members (Jan Jabłkowski and Marta Jabłkowska) and clients of DTBJ and participant observation of one of their events. Case study method prescriptions further helped in developing a database (or rather an archive) of the historical and current materials and maintaining a chain of evidence between data and report (Yin, 2009).

Data analysis

Regarding data analysis, both case study and historical methods share the same underlying commitment to source criticism, hermeneutic interpretation and triangulation of multiple sources of data (Bucheli and Wadhwani, 2014, pp. 316-324). Hermeneutic interpretation proved crucial in distinguishing between the corporate narrative, such as emotional recollections related to the confiscation of the building, and historical facts such as dates and legal decisions issued by local officials. In the process, we found that a longue durée phenomena indeed “escaped the awareness of the actors” (Harris, 2004, p. 165) as our respondents failed to notice continuity in some dimensions, while in others they mistook their sense of identity for the actual continuity. The case study method and coding were extremely useful in specifying the data related to the object of the analysis and distinguishing them from data concerning external, historical contexts (Yin, 2009, p. 32). In addition, the case study method provided flexibility in terms of choosing the unit of analysis, which in our case, due to theoretical assumptions, had to be based on particular dimensions rather than the company as a whole (Yin, 2009, p. 33). This assumption has been operationalised using the structural coding procedure (Saldaña, 2015, p. 98), which focussed on reading through the collected data in search of specific dimensions and continuous or discontinuous events in each of them. Coding has been conducted by one of the researchers and followed prescriptions for solo coding (Saldaña, 2015, pp. 36-37) including keeping analytical memos, holding joint research team discussions concerning the findings and emerging codes and validation by multiple audiences and by the respondents themselves during subsequent interviews.
Reporting of findings

Here, we aimed to overcome the dualism of explanation and temporality and tried to combine the analytically structured history with serial history (Rowlinson et al., 2014). Because our research question was focussed on “what happened” rather than “why it happened,” we utilised the case study to distil the description solely to chronological continuity and discontinuity of dimensions while abandoning the periodisation of Polish history and minimising the descriptive historical context to the bare minimum to understand the changes within the company. Finally, presenting the case as a comprehensive structural coding (Saldaña, 2015) allowed us to deconstruct it and signpost the individual dimensions within the narrative. Thus, we were able to tell the story of DTBJ while maintaining the focus on multiple dimensions of continuity. This is exemplified in the empirical section, which includes codes based on ten dimensions presented in parentheses (e.g. location). Therefore, a reader can follow a historical reconstruction of DTBJ’s history while keeping track of individual dimensions. The final analysis of their continuity/discontinuity is presented in the discussion section.

Empirical findings: case study of Jabłkowski Brothers Department Store

The origin of the DTBJ can be traced back to the end of the nineteenth century, when the Jabłkowski family moved to Warsaw (location). The male members of the family were educated abroad and acquired top managerial positions in Russian steel mills, Belgian and Polish textile factories and sugar refineries[2]. The dispersed family traditionally gathered for Christmas (people; philosophy), and during one such occasion in 1883, the idea of establishing a Jabłkowski Brothers Society took birth (name; status). The post of the first president went to the originator, Józef Junior, who wrote about it in one of his letters:

Our role is to follow the way indicated by our Father, to raise ourselves morally and economically and to become the foundation of this country. Working separately on one’s own account, we would achieve little, while together we are able to form a foundation[3]. (philosophy).

The society served mainly as a family relief and loan fund but Józef Senior suggested an additional commercial venture – a small stationery and haberdashery shop (core business) – entrusted to the 24-year-old sister, Aniela Jabłkowska (people). Initially, it was nothing more than a dresser (infrastructure) in the family apartment at Widok 6 Street (location), from which Aniela conducted limited sales (core business) with her neighbours[4] (Figure 2).

In 1888, after four years of very limited activity, the sole proprietorship gave way to a limited partnership (legal status) under the name Jabłkowski Brothers (name), and the store was moved to a larger premise on Hoża 8 Street (location). One of the brothers joined the company (people), while Józef Jr supported its expansion with his business connections in the textile industry (core business). The real breakthrough came in 1897, when Józef Jr decided to give up his career, invest the dowry of his wife and take the lead in the family business (people). The store then moved to Hoża 20 Street (location) and expanded the assortment to include textiles, bedding and linen (core business). The financial success that followed allowed for yet another relocation in 1900 to Bracka 23 Street (location), where the store expanded to three floors and eight exhibition windows (infrastructure) and carried a full assortment of women’s and men’s clothing, linens and other accessories (core business).

In the same year, in response to the growing scale of Polish emigration, the store organised a mail-order department (core technology; service), covering the geographical areas of Poland, Lithuania, Ukraine and Russia, which proved to be a key undertaking, responsible for 50 per cent of the company’s total sales in the following years. As the company once again approached its storage limits, a decision was made to build Warsaw’s first modern, large-
scale department store at Bracka 25 Street (infrastructure; location)[5]. To obtain the necessary investment capital in 1913, the Society of the Jabłkowski Brothers was transformed into a joint-stock company (status; ownership)[6]. The building was designed by Warsaw’s well-known architects, while the construction involved the use of a then-innovative material – reinforced concrete[7]. The grand opening took place in summer 1914 and attracted considerable attention, as the store had all the features of modern department stores of that era, including sections arranged on individual floors, a rooftop café called “Under the Sun”, elegant interiors decorated with stained glass windows and crafted furniture and highly qualified, multilingual staff (infrastructure; service)[8].

Unfortunately, the opening coincided with the commencement of the First World War (1914-1918), which disrupted the mail-order business (technology) and cut off the enterprise from most of its suppliers in Southwest Poland. During the wartime period of uncertainty and economic chaos following Poland’s independence in 1918, the company saw its sales collapse and was forced to start in-house production of clothes (technology; product), issue shares to maintain liquidity and eventually suspend its operations temporarily and sign a settlement with its creditors (business; ownership)[9]. At the peak of its activity, the department store had 44 stands with 300 product departments and had its own clothing production employing 200 tailors (business; service; technology). The building had an elevator and hosted two cafes, a bank, post office, long-distance telephone, telegraph and

Source: Jabłkowski family archives

Figure 2. Aniela Jabłkowska’s dresser

Theoretical and methodological insights
various information offices (infrastructure). The store’s brand and reputation were built on personal delivery, international fashion shows, high-quality customer service and regular discount sales, which targeted young customers and their parents (service; technology)[10]. At the end of the 1920s, the company reopened its mail-order department (service; technology)[11].

The outbreak of the Second World War interrupted plans for building expansion, while three board members, Tomasz, Feliks and Zbigniew, joined the general mobilisation. Only Feliks, who was captured, returned to Warsaw and continued managing the company (people)[12]. During the occupation, the store organised transportation and redistribution of food and necessities from villages to cities (business).

The department store re-opened in May 1945 with a crew (people) of several dozen people. Initially, it distributed first aid products from the United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration, owing to which it received its first truck (service; infrastructure). Soon after, a second truck was purchased, and thus, it was possible to start regular transport of textiles from the newly opened plants (business)[13]. On 13 April 1947, the communist Ministry of Industry proclaimed a new economic policy aimed at eliminating the private sector[14]. In March 1950, the tax office ordered Feliks, who continued running the store (people), to pay the so-called war enrichment tax to the amount of 40 million Polish zlotys. Despite formal appeals, Feliks received no response, and on 15 May 1950, he was informed that the company was liquidated (status). On 1 June 1950, governmental cars parked in front of the building, and the inspector ordered the family to leave (people) the building before he began requisitioning the property (ownership)[15]. In 1951, the Warsaw district court issued a statement of bankruptcy (status). A year later, the founder Józef Jabłowski Junior died at the age of 90. Just before his death, he passed to his grandchildren, Tomasz and Jan (people), a biography of their great-grandfather, Józef Senior, with the following note:

I wish this biography to serve as a signpost to my grandchildren and as an explanation of how the Jabłowski Brother’s Society was established […] Please continue to build your great-grandfather’s tradition (philosophy)[16].

The fate of the department store building at Bracka 25 after the nationalisation is an illustration of the haphazard nature of economic initiatives during Polish socialism and early capitalism. Over the years, the building became a children’s specialty store (1951-1970), a shoe store (1971-1974) and a warehouse (1975-1983). Finally, in 1984, it was transferred in perpetual usufruct to the Polish Craft Association (ownership)[17]. After the fall of socialism in 1989, the Association began looking for investors and eventually signed a lease agreement with a millionaire, Jerzy K. It quickly became apparent, however, that the contract was structured so that the Association’s ownership became gradually diluted and the building was de facto taken over by Jerzy K (ownership).

Simultaneously with these developments, in autumn 1989, Józef Jabłkowski’s grandchildren, Jan and Tomasz Jabłkowski, together with Ewa Jabłowska-Mackiewicz, (people) began efforts to regain rights to the property. Jan Jabłkowski justified this decision as follows: If we did not do it, it would be a neglect of the memory of previous generations, their work, devotion, and sacrifices (philosophy)[18].

Formally, the liquidation procedure was finalised in 1963 (status), but the case was reopened. In 1991, the decision confirming the Jabłkowski family’s right to land and buildings at Bracka Street was issued (ownership). In April 1996, a court pronounced a verdict questioning the legitimacy of the bankruptcy decision of 1963, and the company regained its legal status as Dom Towarowy Bracia Jabłkowscy S.A. (status; name). The
The company then had to challenge the complex nature of the case of notarial act of perpetual usufruct and the resistance of the current owners, which extended the length of court proceedings for several years. In 2001, the family regained rights to their townhouse at Chmielna 21 (infrastructure) and, in 2010, at Chmielna 19 (ownership) [19]. The reclaimed townhouse was renovated, while the land was developed by a foreign investor into an office building called New Jabłkowski House[20]. The main property of the historical department store at Bracka 25 (infrastructure) was finally returned to the Jabłkowski family at the end of 2013 (ownership)[21] (Figure 3).

Today, the company is still a family business, consisting of members of the third and fourth generations (people; ownership)[22]. The current generation makes an effort to sustain the memory of their ancestors, which is exemplified by the recent publication of memoirs of the last director Feliks Jabłkowski[23], hosting of the Bona Fide Retailer of the Year award[24] or various social activities such as former employee gatherings, the Jabłkowski Art Gallery, and events for children (philosophy)[25]. All these activities are linked to the past using excerpts of historical bulletins and pictures. In 2015, using its archival materials, the company published an album entitled “Lingerie, furs and Jabłkowski Brothers: World fashion trends in catalogues of the biggest department store in Central Europe 1910-1939”, displaying Warsaw fashion trends from la belle époque (Figure 4).

According to an interview with Marta Jabłkowska, all of these seemingly unrelated activities constitute an important element of DTBJ’s identity: all this contributes to the identity of the city and our company is a part of this identity too. That is how we see our role (philosophy; location).

Currently, DTBJ’s income is mainly derived from renting out office space and organising various types of events (core business; services). According to an interview with Marta Jabłkowska, DTBJ has 30 tenants and hosts 40 events per month on average (core business). One of the main tenants in the original building is a foundation called Dreamers and Artisans. House for Social Innovation[26], which supports the development of Warsaw through various projects. In the words of Zofia Komorowska, a co-founder of Dreamers and Artisans:

They are the medium of Warsaw’s traditions, trade and entrepreneurship. They said they managed to reclaim it and now they want to share it with the community of Warsaw. (location; philosophy)

According to Marta Jabłkowska, clients who rent the original building look not only for a venue at a convenient location but also for something to help them stand out and highlight

Source: Picture from DTBJ’s corporate website
their identity (location; philosophy). Organisers of a street-wear fashion event hosted at DTBJ on 9 June 2018 confirm this:

The condition of the building provides a certain atmosphere: the oak stairs, the stained-glass windows. [...] History is such a bonus. The renting family bearing the same name as the building – this is really something! This is the WOW factor. They’ve been taking care of this building for generations[27]. (infrastructure; name; philosophy; people)

While running current operations and social activities, DTBJ efforts are focussed on renovating the old building and a grand opening is scheduled for 2019, when the department store will be re-opened in its original (commercial) character (core business). A newly published leaflet targeted at potential tenants presents a concept of a modern-style shopping centre combining urban culture, fashion and food, while showcasing historical pictures of traditional elements such as stained-glass windows, the rooftop café and the façade of the building (infrastructure; services).

Discussion
The DTBJ case provides an extreme example of a company that somehow continues to exist despite revolutionary and discontinuous change. By using the Aristotelian logic of the object, which favours unity and identity, we arrive at a paradox. We can either assume that
once the company ceased to exist, it had lost its unity and therefore continuity, or we can agree with the current family members, who tell us that what matters is their continuous identity. We argue that to solve this paradox, we need to use Kitarō’s logic of the predicate, according to which DTBJ maintained at least partial continuity regarding some of its features. To understand and re-appraise this case, we must therefore engage in critical analysis of continuity or discontinuity in multiple dimensions which we previously discussed. Table I presents the outcomes of the analysis of DTBJ’s dimensions of continuity.

The dimension of core business is understood as the main area of the company’s activity, which constitutes its main source of income. DTBJ failed to maintain continuity in this respect, as the company was forced to suspend its activity multiple times due to war and nationalisation. In addition, it can be currently classified as a real estate developer; its re-opening of the department store in 2019 will not bring back the disrupted continuity.

The dimension of name is defined as a corporate name or brand recognised by consumers, which is closely related to uses or history, identity and brand value (Hatch and Schultz, 2002, 2017). DTBJ draws its name from the fraternity established in 1883 and despite multiple changes, the core characteristics of the name have been maintained throughout the company’s history until forced bankruptcy in 1951. Some studies show that even after that disruptive event, the building and its surroundings continued to function in public memory under the original name[28], until the company formally regained its legal status and original name in 1996. This curious phenomenon illustrates the ideal-based mechanism of continuing traditions discussed in sociology (Sztompka, 1993). It is worth noting that also currently DTBJ maintains its original name although the core business is not related to the retail trade.

Core technology refers to the underlying know-how, capabilities or specific patents obtained by the company. In that sense, it refers to continuity discussed in the literature concerned with path dependence (Sydow et al., 2009) and dynamic capability (Eisenhardt and Martin, 2000). In DTBJ’s case, such expertise could be considered in terms of their innovative trade (e.g. mail order) or marketing and customer relations techniques (e.g. catalogues, children-focussed marketing, fashion fairs), all of which were disrupted with the loss of the company’s core business.

The product and service dimension refers to the main offerings of the company. Currently, DTBJ draws its income from office space rental and arranging events. Regardless of this discontinuity, the current activities and future projects of the DTBJ constantly refer to historical initiatives, such as children’s plays, rooftop café, or fashion fairs. All these

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Continuity/Discontinuity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Core business</td>
<td>Discontinuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Continuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core technology</td>
<td>Discontinuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product/service</td>
<td>Discontinuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Continuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal status</td>
<td>Discontinuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ownership</td>
<td>Discontinuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure</td>
<td>Continuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People</td>
<td>Continuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy</td>
<td>Continuity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Own elaboration

Table I. Analysis of dimensions of continuity in DTBJ
efforts – although unable to bring back the continuity – could be construed as ways of tackling discontinuity of identity or strengthening the current brand through strategic use of nostalgia and historical assets (Foster et al., 2011; Hatch and Schultz, 2017).

The dimension of location refers to the geographical location of a company that could be considered on multiple levels, from a specific location to a district, city or even country. In DTBJ’s case, continuity in this dimension has been maintained. Even though the company relocated several times, all these relocations took place in a limited area of a single district of Warsaw.

Legal status often appears in the context of centennial companies and longevity (Goto, 2013). We define continuity here as a progression from a simple sole proprietorship to more complex legal forms that follow the evolutionary growth to a company. In DTBJ’s case, a clear gap exists between 1951 (when the company was formally liquidated) and 1996 (when it regained its legal status).

The ownership dimension refers to continuity in terms of stocks and capital invested that does not necessarily mean a majority ownership and is directly drawn from a family business (Drozdow, 1998). In DTBJ’s case, despite maintaining the family ownership over the course of wars and expansions, it was interrupted by nationalisation in 1951 when its assets were taken over by the state. Similar to dimensions of legal status or core business, reclaiming the ownership does not eliminate a discontinuous gap, during which the land and buildings remained public property and were passed around between different owners.

The infrastructure dimension refers to buildings or equipment, both in active usage and in the form of historical artefacts. In DTBJ’s case, this constitutes the most obvious and, arguably, the most important dimension of continuity. If it were not for the building that defied all odds, the family would perhaps not attempt to reclaim the business. Consequently, the historical building at Bracka 25 represents the physical continuity of infrastructure in which the costs of the renovation and modernisation are counterbalanced by the building’s symbolic value and the unique atmosphere that it offers. Another example is the family’s oldest artefact (i.e. Aniela Jabłkowska’s dresser) that has been stolen and survived only in the form of a picture and as a foundation myth. These two examples provide a perfect illustration of the difference between two mechanisms of preserving tradition in material or ideal forms (Sztompka, 1993, pp. 56-57).

The dimension of people refers to the continuous existence and/or involvement of the founder’s family or particular groups of people. The discussion about continuity in this dimension can draw from abundant literature, including institutionalism (Thornton and Ocasio, 1999), succession (Jaskiewicz, et al., 2015) or identity (Chreim, 2005). A clear separation of the family and business dimensions is necessary to assess DTBJ’s continuity. The forceful separation of family from its business does not imply discontinuity, which is exemplified by a return of the next generations of the Jabłkowski family. The current owners are the direct descendants of previous generations, as Jan Jabłkowski is the son of Feliks (DTBJ’s last director) and a grandson of Józef Junior (DTJB’s founder).

Finally, philosophy refers to the most abstract yet important element of the company’s existence, such as values and ideas. Paradoxically, their informal, ideal-based nature makes them most resilient to discontinuity, as ideas can reside and persist in artefacts, family members, employees or a wider community (Sztompka, 1993). In DTBJ’s case, continuity in terms of philosophy is most clearly exemplified by the values of unity and social responsibility that were sustained by the family both in the written form of letters and memoirs, and oral traditions and myths (Sztompka, 1993). These values, upheld by
subsequent generations, provided a stimulus for reclaiming the business after the fall of socialism and, to this day, are exemplified in social activities and guide their business actions.

The analysis presented above proposes a seemingly controversial idea that a business can lose continuity in crucial dimensions, such as core business or legal identity, while retaining its continuity in others. However, the notion that a company can continue in a building or in a family is controversial only from the perspective of the Aristotelian logic of the object, but not from the perspective of Kitaro’s logic of the predicate, which treats each characteristic as equally important. By applying this analysis, we are able to overcome the paradox posed by appraising a company as unified or whole based solely on its elusive identity.

Why continuity matters
Although this study is a first attempt at grasping the notion of continuity, the proposed definition, its underlying philosophical assumptions and the dimensions framework offer a wealth of potential theoretical and practical implications.

First, the notion of continuity contributes to a more nuanced understanding of the reasons behind using the past, than a simple strategy of value maximisation (Hatch and Schultz, 2017), which is especially important in case of long-lived family firms. It is safe to say that in DTBJ’s case, the original motivation behind reclaiming the building and re-establishing the company was not purely monetary but to a certain extent related to the preservation of family’s socioemotional wealth (Berrone et al., 2012). Even now, many social initiatives such as publishing books and organising events for children or cooperation with locally engaged non-profit organisations are not driven by economic logic but are aimed at preserving and developing the continuity of socioemotional endowment in the form of family legacy, identity and local community ties (Foster et al., 2011; Berrone et al., 2012).

Second, by introducing the dimensions of continuity framework, this article answers a call for an integrated framework of business longevity (Napolitano et al., 2015) and a more fine-grained approach to a rhetorical strategy. DTBJ is a good example of proactive management utilising synergies and continuity of multiple dimensions (philosophy, family, name and location) to maximise the value offered by the core dimension (infrastructure). In addition, future plans suggest that the family will gradually strengthen its legitimacy and identity by rebuilding discontinuous dimensions of core business (fashion and trade) and services (rooftop café). Moreover, DTBJ’s case illustrates that, as with any other strategic resource, the costs of continuity (e.g. historical building) need to be balanced by the benefits that it offers. Based on the proposed framework, long-lived companies that are heavily burdened by costs of continuity can choose to manage in a strategic fashion by cutting back on some of the dimensions, while strengthening others.

Finally, we believe that continuity and discontinuity may prove to be an important distinction when considering historical culture and its impact on the rhetorical history strategy (Smith and Simeone, 2017). DTBJ illustrates a case of historical discontinuity, which, owing to the company’s efforts, has been re-appraised and accepted as continuity. This is a valid yet complex business phenomenon in countries that experience nationalisation or other disruptions. Even though in such countries the overall historical culture might be viewed as shallow, from the point of view of business continuity constitutes an exceptionally rare commodity and therefore, a valuable asset that is difficult to imitate. Ideally, future studies could therefore focus on each dimension separately and
define which events or changes can be considered as continuous and which as discontinuous (Streeck and Thelen, 2005).

As far as the practical implications are concerned, the example of DTBJ offers a ready-to-use strategy for utilising the past that consists of four distinctive steps: first, identification of key continuous dimensions that need to be protected and preserved (for ex. the building); second, collection of archival materials, visuals and artefacts related to these dimensions to ascertain legitimacy; third, developing the narrative around existing continuous dimensions and memory assets (Foster et al., 2011; Hatch and Schultz, 2017); and fourth, re-establishing the remaining dimensions and weaving them into the narrative. It is noteworthy that while the third and fourth steps are where the narrative begins to shape the reality, the first two steps are about protecting and preserving the historical assets regardless of its future usability.

Research limitations and suggestions for future research

One of the conditions of reliability for an inductive theory building based on a single case is clarification of boundary conditions and limitations (Eisenhardt, 1989). The main boundary of this study is a uniquely discontinuous Polish context due to which the results are by no means generalisable to other countries or regions. Future studies may, however, focus on comparative analysis of various dimensions of continuity in centennial companies from different countries. The main limitation results from an analytical timeframe that extends over 140 years. Consequently, the results are simplified and presented in an extremely concise manner for the purpose of developing a comprehensive theoretical framework. Ideally, subsequent studies should narrow down a focus to a single dimension and conduct an in-depth inquiry into its continuity in a limited period of time.

Notes

1. For the sake of brevity, we present the philosophical debate about continuity in a simplified and concise manner omitting a number of debates and important contributions made by philosophers throughout centuries. Readers interested in the full scope of the discussion should refer to relevant philosophical literature that provides extensive discussion on predicates, substratum and bundle theories, identity of indiscernibles or an endurantism – perdurantism debate (Loux and Crisp, 2017).


4. The dresser, which remains to this day in the Jabłkowski family’s legends and picture collection, is considered a cornerstone of the department store. Ironically, it managed to survive two World Wars and nationalisation in 1950s, only to be stolen when the family moved in 1974.

5. ibid., pp. 63-76.


7. This decision proved to be crucial to the survival of the building during World War II. A detailed description of the store’s architecture can be found in ‘Architekt’ journal, Vol. 2, 1923, p. 19, available in the Digital Archives of Warsaw University of Technology.
13. ibid., pp. 138-140.
16. ibid., p. 154.
17. Description of changes in building ownership are available in Łazarewicz (2013). Pictures of the building between 1950-1990 are available in the digital collections of the Polish Press Agency.
19. ibid., p. 218.
20. See company website at: www.nowydomjablkowskich.pl/
22. See company website at: www.dtbj.pl/o-firmie/
23. The first version of Feliks Jabłkowski’s memoirs entitled ‘An economic affair’ was published in 1980, and the second version was published in 2005.
25. See company website at: www.dtbj.pl/projekty-spoleczne/
26. See society website at: www.marzycieleirzemiesnicy.pl/
27. Interview with organisers, 9 June 2018.

References


**Corresponding author**

Tomasz Olejniczak can be contacted at: tolejniczak@kozminski.edu.pl

---

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website: [www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm](http://www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm)

Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Managing projects in war-torn societies

A case study from Kosovo principles, practices and challenges of “project management” in conflict zones

James Earnest
School of Management, Curtin University, Perth, Australia

Abstract

Purpose – Planning and implementing reconstruction projects in areas that are affected by conflict has proven to be far more challenging than expected and has often been considered to be inappropriate response from practitioners, aid agencies and government. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to explore reconstruction and development projects in Kosovo given its history of non-sovereign state under United Nations administration and analyse how they were planned and executed that would more likely yield progressive outcomes for the society.

Design/methodology/approach – The study was designed to explore how projects are planned and implemented, as well as help in understanding the phenomena in the historical, social, cultural and governance context within the project implementation practices of multilateral agencies in Kosovo. Applying action research principles and using a detailed case study approach to the interviews, the study identified programme strengths, weaknesses and implications of project management practice and theory and differences of opinion within the project team in project planning and implementation in their wider sense.

Findings – There is evidence that both aid organisations’ constructed project management processes and international aid agencies practices do not work effectively in a community service delivery setting. The study showed that there continue to be challenges in project processes, implementation, stakeholder coordination, communication, cost, quality, procurement and risk management.

Practical implications – Forward looking and grounded in traditions, the study indicated a need to promote a better understanding of how reconstruction and development projects are undertaken at all levels of the organisation and to describe processes, procedures and tools used for the actual application of projects in war-torn societies.

Originality/value – The study is among the first academic research worldwide to examine traditional practices of project management which are wildly applied and to explore if the same processes can be applied in post-conflict settings. This study is timely and beneficial in fulfilling its responsibility to post-conflict communities.

Keywords Project management, Conflict

Paper type Research paper

Introduction

Success in post-conflict reconstruction (PCR) depends on the ability to understand the full complexities of the socio-political environment, as well as the ability to coordinate peace-building operations in an effective manner. Kosovo’s history has been marked by various aspects of humanitarian intervention. The socio-economic and political challenges faced by...
post-conflict transitioning of societies are multifaceted, interdependent and vary from one country to another. In post-conflict societies, the security situation is volatile and permissive and depends largely on the scale and context of any given disastrous situation. Implementing agencies and the government need to design and implement PCR policies and projects that promote local community participation, equity and ownership in rebuilding programmes. The reconstruction/development process is lengthy and requires a multifaceted, multiorganisational approach to overcome inequities caused by past and recent history, integrate culture and traditions and build viable sustainable structures to support democratic decisions that can lead to a high quality of coordinated administration and governance practices.

Every post-conflict country truly represents a unique situation. PCR, more so than any other development trajectory, must be underpinned by institutions capable of facilitating the transition from war to sustainable peace. It must also lay the groundwork for the physical, social and economic recovery of communities by adopting a comprehensive, well-sequenced and flexible approach. During the past few decades, Kosovo, a southern province of Serbia and central to Serbian identity, experienced upheaval and instability. Peace, democracy and stability are critical for Kosovo, an impoverished territory which is undergoing a transformation of its domestic political, social and economic systems after the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) bombing of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (FRY) comprising Montenegro and Serbia in March 1999. The Provincial Institutions of the Self-Government of Kosovo unilaterally declared independence from Serbia on 17 February 2008 (Tansey and Zuam, 2009). In supporting peace processes, the donors and international partners, through the United Nations (UN), played a valuable role in facilitating local communities to fulfil their agenda of reconstruction and development, thereby shaping the future of the Republic of Kosovo.

Background

History

In January 1993, Broun (1993) stated that the history of what had happened in Bosnia–Herzegovina, located in the Balkan peninsular, must never be allowed to happen again. Broun (1993) further affirmed that there would be disastrous consequences if the same were to extend to the province of Kosovo and to neighbouring Macedonia. The landlocked and impoverished province of Kosovo has a history of tension between two ethnic groups: the Albanians and the Serbs. The community has suffered from a host of economic, social and political/development problems arising from four generations of communism and a decade of serious financial crisis and continual ethnic discrimination. For the Serbs, Kosovo has been revered as a cradle of the Serbian medieval state and spirituality since the Middle Ages. The Albanians, who form a majority in Kosovo, claim that their Illyrians ancestors, the Dardanians, had inhabited the area long before the Serbian tribes arrived in the Balkans in the sixth century AD (Rogel, 2003). For centuries, the whole province of Kosovo was ruled by Turkey and was part of the Ottoman Empire from 1455 until the first Balkan war in 1912, following which Serbia took control of the Kosovo region (Blumi, 2001; Salla, 1998). In 1974, Kosovo became an autonomous province with access to the federal structure of the government of Serbia, and the people of Kosovo established their own government: a parliament with legislative powers, constitution and state institutions (Salla, 1998).

After the Second World War and until about 1980, the FRY had 90 per cent literacy levels and an exceptionally rapid economic growth. Between 1960 and 1980, it experienced one of the most successful socio-economic transformations in the region with an average life expectancy of 72 years, free medical facilities and a guaranteed right to income supplemented with annual leave pay (Parenti, 2000). After the death of Tito[1] in early 1980,
ethnic divisions and conflict grew in Yugoslavia. The political landscape began to change with Serb nationalists taking control of the Yugoslavian military and paramilitary structures. At the same time as the growing intra-ethnic tensions in Yugoslavia in the 1980s, the economy began to falter under unprecedented foreign debt and soaring unemployment (Rogel, 2003). Throughout the 1980s and early 1990s, the Kosovo Albanians continued with their desire to gain the status of a separate federal republic and broke away from Yugoslavia, aspirations that were perceived in some circles as exacerbating a long and continuing climate of ethnic tensions (Salla, 1998).

In March 1989, the Serbian Government stripped Kosovo of its autonomy, and the overwhelming majority of ethnic Albanians were forced to resign from their state jobs in the province. This imbroglio led to the movement of a “parallel state” of Kosovo Albanians in opposition to the Serbian authorities. The governance of the parallel state, headed by Dr Ibrahim Rugova[2], the eponymous leader of the Democratic League of Kosovo, had its own extensive network of financial and social councils, education and health-care institutions, political parties and a government-in-exile (Pula, 2004).

By the early 1990s, an estimated 200,000 Serbs still lived in Kosovo, and many had left the province long before the break-up of Yugoslavia in 1991 (Posen, 2000). The disintegration of the FRY started in the 1990s and, together with poor economic policies, social and economic development started to deteriorate in the region. Fuelling tension and contributing to political instability in 1998, the ethnic Kosovo Liberation Army (KLA) became progressively more prominent in the rural areas of Kosovo. The KLA engineered the struggle for independence from Serbia and the FRY (Charlesworth, 2002). The Serbian security forces’ paroxysmal retaliation against the rebel group prompted international intervention in 1999, first in the form of negotiations being convened in Rambouillet, France and then the US-NATO (USA/North Atlantic Treaty Organisation) intervention through its continuous bombing campaign of the FRY (Bellamy, 2002).

When the ethnic tensions, magnified by the significant weakening of economic management, deteriorating and inadequate infrastructure and services and political frustrations, reached their peak, NATO launched air operations against Yugoslavia in March 1999 without the authorisation of the UN Security Council (Williams, 2005). The military intervention was necessary only after repeated attempts to withdraw the Yugoslav military and paramilitary troops engaged in human rights abuses against the ethnic Albanian population in Kosovo and after negotiations by the US and its NATO allies failed (Naumann, 2002). Until then, Kosovo, poor and deeply divided between the Kosovo Albanians and the minority Serbs, was relatively unknown to many Americans and the rest of the world (Griffith and Allen, 2007).

After 79 days of intensive bombings, the Yugoslav forces started to withdraw from Kosovo (Wheatley, 2000) and an estimated 130,000 Kosovo Serbs left the province (Posen, 2000). Following the end of hostilities, the Kosovo Albanian refugees who had fled Kosovo returned to the shattered remnants of their war-ravaged homeland (Satterwhite, 2002). During this time, an international civil and security presence was deployed in the shape of the United Nations Interim Administrative Mission in Kosovo and a NATO-led multinational Kosovo Peacekeeping Force (Gerasimov and Temiashov, 2004; Williams, 2005). The challenge then was to lay the foundation for economic recovery and development. In contributing to the economic reconstruction of Kosovo, it was determined that pursuant to a widely applicable strategy under European Union (EU) direction and under the terms of UN Security Council Resolution 1244, economic development should be coordinated and directed to be compatible with the largely market-driven economies of the EU (Skogstad et al., 2003).
Challenges for reconstruction and development

As the war came to an end, it became apparent that there had been a significant level of destruction to life, property and business. To a large extent, key infrastructure such as roads, bridges, water supply systems, health centres, schools and telecommunications was severely damaged or destroyed. There was also an urgent need to address the problems of the humanitarian crisis involving a large number of internally displaced persons and returning refugees (Tarnoff, 2001). The slow economic growth and more than a decade of inchoate governance had deteriorated the public sector infrastructure. Business enterprises were not self-sufficient, and there was a substantial disruption of public utility services leading to intermittent supplies of water and electricity (Williams, 2005). In Kosovo, the following six priorities were identified for intervention from 2001 to 2003:

1. develop private sector reforms;
2. ameliorate the performance of the education sector;
3. rehabilitate and reform the crumbling health care system;
4. develop and manage sustainable social welfare reforms;
5. build the capacity of Kosovars to deliver higher standards of service in public administration; and
6. develop the ability of the private sector to provide adequate housing and support services to ethnic groups (Hasic and Bhandari, 2001).

Policies, projects and programmes

In a conflict setting, “defining a programme or project as peacebuilding implies that it promotes positive peace in three dimensions: the activities undertaken, the process of implementation, and the impact or outcomes” (Llamazares and Levy, 2003, p. 11). Over 40 years ago, Rondinelli (1976, p. 14) noted that “if policies are to be translated into development activities […] planning in developing countries must become more project-oriented”. This statement is still true for development professionals and practitioners who undertake a wide variety of tasks, identify their work as project-based activities and consider development work as a series of projects and programmes: “a vast interlocking series of them” (Wield, 1999, p. 36). In many developing countries around the world, projects are the key element of implementing development activity and are the basic means of translating national policies into action programmes. Although it has been noted that there has been a sharp decline in state activity, many of the activities are implemented in the form of projects as “a process of projectisation” (Wield, 1999, p. 36).

Establishing a strong nation and strengthening local governance requires both short-term and long-term projects and programmes. Reconstruction and development projects should reinforce the local capability of the governing regime to strengthen security, provide a stable political environment, eradicate violent conflict, generate sustained economic activities and combat poverty and inequality (Rondinelli and Montgomery, 2005). Emphasised by Locurcio (2005, p. 26) that “well managed projects produce lasting benefits to the society”. The planning and the application process of projects in the field is a complex exercise for the implementing partners in a post-conflict society, with limited knowledge and understanding, and insufficient resources and expertise, being major hurdles in this process. PCR should facilitate the transition from war to sustainable peace and permeate the groundwork for physical, economic and social development by adopting a comprehensive, well-sequenced and flexible approach.
Conventional “project-based management” tools and techniques are usually applied to technology-intensive areas in construction, engineering and information systems industries. It has been now recognised that project management knowledge and practices can be applied in many disciplines other than technological areas; these would include sociology, psychology, education and health management (Winter et al., 2006; Ika, and Hodgson, 2014). The use of project-based management tools, techniques and methodologies assists the successful completion of projects in a wide variety of areas and within the agreed timeline, cost and performance criteria (Smith, 2003). It has great potential to address the complex process accompanying the risk and challenges of reconstruction efforts.

Therefore, to ensure effective implementation of reconstruction and development programmes, local partners and the wider society have to undertake a series of interrelated and interdependent development projects (Nel, 2000; Wield, 1999). To respond to these challenges, the provision of services commences with the making of a policy. Policies are strengthened further through the establishment of a programme that is implemented by a number of projects. It is evident that, even though the terms “policy”, “program” and “projects” in the post-conflict context are increasingly complex and often confused, they remain closely interrelated (Kerzner, 2001; Nel, 2000). Given the complexities involved in post-war reconstruction and recovery, practitioners, academics and policy makers working in post-conflict environments have not established the essential “theoretical foundations” and “strict conceptual and operational framework” for successfully executing reconstruction project management processes (Hasic, 2004, p. 4).

Project “development” application through project life cycle
A project life cycle is not just about the start and finish dates; rather, it is a defined and logical approach to planning and managing the development life cycle process. According to the Project Management Institute, the processes are guided through five process groups: defining and organising, planning, managing execution, controlling and closing (Muriithi and Crawford, 2003; Nel, 2000). PMBOK (2017) emphasises that though the project management processes are generally acknowledged and applied, this does not however imply that the practices should be broadly applied on all projects. In a post-conflict environment, the project management team, in collaboration and partnership with the wider project steering committee and the participating community, should be responsible for determining what governance, planning, tools and techniques are appropriate in the given situation (Ika, 2015).

The project cycle consists of a number of progressive phases that, broadly speaking, lead from the identification of needs and objectives through to the planning and implementation of activities to address pre-determined needs and objectives, and onto the assessment of the outcomes. It serves to provide structure and direction to development activities while, at the same time, allowing for key objectives and issues to remain in focus. Though the exact number of stages varies somewhat according to each organisation and each project, as do the names given to each stage, it is possible to identify certain generic phases that are present in almost all project cycles (Biggs and Smith, 2003).

The project initiation phase represents a critical initial stage, where the options are identified and formulated as a preliminary project proposal by the stakeholders. From the outset, it is imperative that the project has clearly defined objectives and that the organisation has petitioned for all the expertise and resources it needs to ensure successful implementation (Locurcio, 2007). In the planning phase, the project proposal developed is tested through a series of feasibility analyses to enable a first appraisal of potential hurdles. These analyses also include scenarios for potential changes using project assumptions and
possible risks involved in implementation. This phase identifies the many operational tasks or activities that need to be accomplished. It identifies potential and likely constraints that will impact on the time estimates in the complex environment. The formalised project plan is then implemented and reviewed with careful monitoring of progress by the project team and handed over to the local community after completion of the project.

Methodology

Kosovo represented a form of support and collaboration among the international donor community in countries emerging from a destructive civil war. Following the end of hostilities, the local community welcomed the military intervention, and the international community appeared poised to support the local development. Kosovo received a large amount of financial aid after the conflict, unlike other post-conflict states such as East Timor, Afghanistan and Iraq. The presence of humanitarian organisations and the implementation of donor programmes in Kosovo were more effective. In spite of having a history of ethnic conflict, the province has had substantially high levels of human capital concentrated in a small geographic region of Europe. Espoused by all these apparently causal factors, Kosovo is an optimal case study to examine the effectiveness of international engagement in implementing projects and programmes in post-conflict societies (Percival and Sondorp, 2010).

In a post-conflict society, it is vital to identify the various complex, interactive processes and functions carried out in an organisation, and to determine how this affects the development and implementation of systems and influences the way an organisation functions and is structured. Action research using the principles of historical continuity, reflexivity, dialectics, workability and evocativeness (Heikkinen et al., 2007) was undertaken with the knowledge of the practitioners (Bradbury-Huang, 2010). The local stakeholders have the ability to understand and contribute to the issues confronting them and the local communities (Brydon-Miller et al., 2003). In this context, the case study approach gives an ideal opportunity to study a problem in depth within an acceptable time frame (Bell, 2005). The practice of selecting and applying a data collection technique is the same as in any other research process (Veal, 2005). Stake (1994) posited that not all case studies were qualitative. Yin (1994) noted that a case study may even be limited to quantitative evidence and should therefore not be viewed always as qualitative. Thus, case studies can be based on both qualitative and quantitative evidence. In the context of the study, the case study research method provided a greater opportunity than other available methods to obtain a holistic, actual view of an empirical inquiry (Gummesson, 1988).

Qualitative data as to the experiences of those implementing projects were obtained through semi-structured interviews and a focus group discussion conducted with key project personnel during the research data collection from August to October 2008. To understand particular processes in a case study, an interview is used to review participants’ experiences (Cooper and Schindler, 2008), and according to Lee (1999), a semi-structured interview has an overarching topic, highlights a number of themes at the heart of the research and investigates specific issues and questions for more focused information. In the study, the interview questions designed for practicing project managers (PMs) was intended to gather information on desirable skills and knowledge areas of project management and to find the degree of satisfaction with past and currently implemented projects. The qualitative data from both the focus group discussions and the project staff interviews (Table I) were collated and interrogated for patterns and insights with respect to the key research questions.
Discussions

Planning process for development projects

To strengthen civil society’s infrastructure projects, organisations should have a detailed work plan with specific and measurable goals and objectives. Good planning and project preparation are essential prerequisites to successful project implementation (Zwikael, 2008) and, arguably, are even more critical in fragile post-conflict situations (Flavin, 2003). Civil society organisations should have the ability to plan, facilitate and implement resources to the correct projects, and it should be done by the right people qualified for the job (Wescott, 1999). The project organisation should involve the community in the decisions that affect their lives (Johnson and Wilson, 2000), and the practice of community participation in the selection of projects helps to rebuild their shattered economy (Botes and van Rensburg, 2000; World Bank, 2006). Given the multifarious irregularities of each conflict situation, the organisation is encouraged to have flexible alternative approaches by which to achieve commonly agreed upon goals and objectives (Brown, 2005).

The majority of respondents felt that they had never come across any strategic or even basic project management plans for any of the reconstruction projects they had administered during the previous couple of years. The respondents argued that most organisations come with an assumption that because the projects were implemented in other post-conflict countries, they should work effectively in any post-conflict situation. Some respondents also felt that planning only starts after the funding or the donor approves the project budget.

Respondents reported that, though some organisations have a tentative plan on paper, when it comes to implementing the project management plans, they are not detailed enough or the PMs execute what is more convenient at the time of implementation. Similarly, even though some respondents reported having reviewed organisation manuals on how to implement projects in the field, they had not seen any PM following an organisation’s structured planning steps and processes. Taking into account the resources available, the well-reasoned views of the implementing agencies on how planning is taken in consideration were stated as follows:

Planning comes from where the development aid agencies come from […] each project manager comes up with their own plan. I work for International Organisation for Migration (IOM) and the planning for their projects is done in Geneva […] too many organisations like Catholic Relief Services (CRS) who I used to work for, all planning came from Baltimore. They say this is how we do reconstruction projects everywhere.

Not a lot of them pay a lot of attention to the planning phase, the concept of spending a lot of time in the planning phase is a concept that means for most organisation it’s a lost time, and you always have to just rush to working and doing stuff […] the planning phase is almost non-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary data</th>
<th>Secondary data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thirty-six interviews with Country directors Programme coordinators Project managers Project engineers Management consultants, and beneficiaries four focus groups (20)</td>
<td>Project documents Organisations reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table I. Sources of qualitative data collection
existent [...] hence we have so many problems during implementation [...] go over budget, longer time [...] this is one of the major weaknesses that they have in the planning phase.

They have a plan on paper but when it comes to implementation, they do not do what is written on the plan.

People were really working on assumptions much more that any kind of detailed plan using any particular criteria, so for a very long time it was just an ad hoc thing.

I think 70 per cent of projects failed, the mistake was during the planning of the projects, assigning all the people, local and international, and there was no supervision there [...] I think local people need to be more involved in the projects and designs, and to be monitored by the internationals.

When you plan projects, you should really identify needs in cooperation with the recipients. Therefore, the recipient’s side should be consulted, what are the most urgent needs, and then design projects according to that. Then should have ex-post evaluation when the projects are completed to learn and to see how successful they were.

It is worth stressing from the above quotes that though the international community has a critical role to play in supporting post-conflict stability, the project plan must be embedded into the community to foster agreement that will contribute to peace and stability in a society.

Managing cost
In post-conflict situations, the allocation of funds becomes restricted and the challenge for organisations is to engage more effectively with the stakeholders to have the right estimate (Mutebi et al., 2003). In an ever-changing environment where tasks are often difficult to implement, it is vital for the project organisation to categorise the total expenditure of the project. Along with the explanation of actual costs and variations, subsequent decisions of the corrective actions should be included in the progress report. Within the changing economic context, it would be logical for the organisation to have the capacity to provide an estimate of the project budget and connect it to project objectives (Diamond, 2006). Reconstruction activities are linked inextricably to the availability of resources, and the organisation should ensure that the limited resources are used efficiently and effectively to complete the project on time and within budget (MacDonald, 2005). Traditionally, PMs tend to compare the scheduled expenditure of the project with the budget cost. Given the uncertainty inherent in project forecasting and valuation, it is important to ensure that cost controls are considered in such intervention to maintain the delivery of a project (Diamond, 2006).

Respondents stated that they were aware that the cost of financing community-based projects could have a significant effect on the overall outcome for the civil society. Several respondents mentioned that managing budgets and comparing costs were critical process for reconstruction projects; however, they do not have the tools that help to reduce costs and increase efficiency. Respondents stated that in the post-conflict environment, it is standard practice for the finance department to control the flow of funds, and the project team has little control over the handling of funds.

Respondents also acknowledged that the primary tools in a post-conflict society are the project timelines and the budget and, by having appropriate tools to manage and control the project, finance estimates help minimise costs. In the case of large infrastructure projects and donor-dependent input, the respondents affirmed that organisations should have a clear
understanding of cost estimates before they seek funds for the projects. The respondent’s quotes below adequately convey the current practices and needs:

Projects have failed because the costing was not done properly.

You need to go to the field and to find the exact cost estimate. It is different when you are in the field.

When it comes to reconstruction projects in Kosovo [...]. I do not think they use any kind of sophisticated software to control time and cost [...] if they do not know how to manage time and cost they are going to suffer in quality.

I think it is very important to manage the cost especially since most of these projects are driven by strict budgets and it takes a lot of bureaucracy to change the budgets if the need arises.

Drawing from the responses to qualify for financing demonstrates the importance of indulging local communities and by having proper costing strategies to strengthen the transition for local communities with major project impacts.

Managing project time
In supporting reconstruction operations for organisations which have a scarcity of resources because of poor infrastructure, scheduling time frames and prioritising resources across function boundaries can benefit the implementing organisation (Bertucci et al., 2008). To engage a civil society and in the process to bolster progress against the schedule, PCR operations require continued long-term monitoring (Garcia, 2008). More often than not, in reconstruction development projects, there are inherent changes in the project structure and delivery processes. The project team working on the deliverables of the project should accommodate changes to the project milestone plan in pursuit of the final objectives (Cleland, 1999). As scheduling tools Gantt charts, bar charts and milestone charts provide a graphical overview and are excellent models for scheduling. With skills lacking in many agencies involved in developmental processes, simple scheduling and communication tools can be used to keep track of progress for each activity (Cobb, 2011).

The respondents revealed that almost a decade after the cessation of the war, a realistic summary of the situation suggests that Kosovo still has significant unmet basic needs in every sector. Owing to the apparent lack of familiarity with the local environment and the changing political situation, respondents also stressed that in such an operational context, many international organisations working in Kosovo found that the development processes were slowed down. Respondents categorically stated that management of the programme requires a special blend of experience and skills, and that many implementing partners were limited by resource constraints when trying to deliver quality projects within budget and time. Here are just some of the many factors quoted as likely to influence the project timeline:

I think first and foremost you need to consider the human factor. Who you plan to engage in the implementation of those activities and, in most cases that was one of the short falls of international consultants who implemented projects here [...] and then come the short falls of not being able to complete the task in time it’s a multi-effect of one, not being able to complete in time, then everything else sort of stagnates.

Working in such an environment is really stressful [...] when considering the complexity of a post-conflict society [...] there are multiple factors which may slow down the implementing, even
make it sometimes impossible to successfully implement it [...] one of the many factors is the lack of efficient government structures.

Specifically in some Serb areas we have obstacles because the community is split into two, there are people who are loyal to the Kosovo Government and people who are loyal to the Belgrade Government and they come to conflict between themselves [...] so sometimes it comes to a conflict of who actually takes the ownership of the project, and until such thing happen we can stop the project or it can also affect our project while it's being implemented. Therefore, it was not planned during the planning of the timeline of the project. Therefore, these would be the key factors.

Project communication challenges
In societies emerging from conflict, there is a sense of commitment and urgency to identify and communicate with the stakeholders early in the life of the project. In the light of changes in its operating environment, there is a need for a clear and transparent channel of communication to be outlined for reporting project problems (Gordon et al., 2006). There is a lack of effective community participation in the decision-making process by representatives from all major groups in the society. This deprives the community of the right to participate and to be consulted before initiating any development projects. Implementing understandable mechanisms and processes of communication between the organisation and the community can assist effective community participation (Orr, 2002). The implementing agency should be committed to openness and transparency in its decision-making and must keep all relevant stakeholders proactively informed of the project's activities and anticipated impacts (Mutebi et al., 2003).

All respondents zealously stated that communication is one of the biggest problems in a conflicting society where one is working with the team, and multiple stakeholders, to deliver the project on time and to a given budget. Moreover, in addition to bureaucratic and political influences, most respondents indicated that by not having proper communications standards and processes planned out much earlier in the life of the project, it does have a strong impact on project success or failure. Respondents emphasised that, faced with a high level of uncertainty and complexity, miscommunication amongst project stakeholders, contractors and relevant government departments leads to a slowing down in the delivery of development programmes.

To make a practical contribution to improve the project standards, respondents stated that in some instances, giving and receiving honest feedback both good and bad among all stakeholders would facilitate timely and effective project delivery. Finally, respondents felt that there was a necessity for building relationships and trust between factions of the conflict-affected groups to support the peace-building agenda:

There is a lack of communication sometimes [...] there is sometimes miscommunication between different departments, which unnecessarily slows down the project implementation process and it does affect efficient delivery.

Well communication challenges are left out because the stakeholders are not always involved in the implementation of a project. Therefore, that could create a lot of confusion, and there are no proper procedures for communication [...] and if there is a problem, people gather around, but there are no standard procedures of how to do it.

In the planning phase we need to initiate, we need to clarify, what communications processes are used, who is responsible for what, and what is the process of communication that needs to be used for decision-making, or for solving problem.
The Albanian community generally will tell us everything we do is great and they love us, even when we know that things were not so great, on the other hand, the Serbian community tends to be very critical of us, regardless of how great we do.

From the responses, it is evident that the two major intertwined factors are the failure to communicate and keep the stakeholders informed, validates the success or failure of post-conflict reconstructions efforts.

**Managing project risk**

After a conflict, the situation is fluid, volatile and uncertain, and organisations implementing project activities often face heightened risks. To maintain broad community support for the project, it should be considered good practice to involve the community to make the members identify where project risks can occur and respond to changes that arise over the life of the project (van Aalst, Cannon and Burton, 2008). In its decisions and activities that impact on society and the environment, the project team should develop a strategy to proactively identify potential risk and continually implement risk strategies (Audergon *et al.*, 2010). The risk of implementing projects in these areas should be clearly identified and mitigating strategies clearly allocated with their potential impact on project delivery (Kafle and Murshed, 2006).

A community development fund organisation sponsored by the World Bank was the only organisation that said the community was involved in identifying and analysing the risks in projects and planning mitigating strategies with the project team and other stakeholders. All other respondents stated categorically that though the organisations had limited community consultation, involvement in the risk management of the project was not the norm in the organisation.

Respondents mentioned that in many projects, the local municipal government was a partner in the project and controlled the power within a local community. Though many respondents considered the support of the local government to be vital, they also revealed that once the local government became involved in the project implementation process, nepotism and corruption became apparent in the system. Respondents reported that the local government tries to impose its power and force the organisation to implement projects in areas not previously planned. Despite having to avoid all these scenarios, the organisations were cautiously optimistic about getting the community involved in the risk management of the project:

> Not at all, they do not care [. . .] they see the immediate requirement on the ground, the risk to them is nothing. They have already gone through the conflict, now they want to get on with reconstruction.

These societies are most vulnerable to risk and effective resources, and investment should be given to aid agencies to identify risk throughout the development process.

**Managing project quality**

Project organisations and the planning team should ascertain compliance with all applicable local laws and design measurable quality standards essential for long-term sustainability (Musoni, 2005). Changes happen more frequently in post-conflict environment, and similar projects are implemented across many areas. For quality control and to ensure operations are executed as planned, a checklist is used to assess the activities performed in the implementation process (Natsios, 2005). Donors and development agencies struggling for quality need to strengthen monitoring mechanisms and report on any evidence of major non-conformities with other agencies (Watt and Regehr, 2008). Although every aid
organisation may have hidden agendas, projects in post-conflict society should contribute to sound economic expansion and social development of the community (Hass, 2006). Project implementation in the post-conflict environment should be monitored intensively to evaluate the progress, to ensure quality and timely progress and to report on the findings (Rummel-Shapiro, 2004).

Despite the challenges of reconstruction in a post-conflict and fragile environment, respondents revealed that only a small number of organisations’ projects oversee the quality performance of all operations and ensure that administrative functions are undertaken. Respondents indicated that organisations do not have the required skills and trained resources to monitor and evaluate projects as well as assess the quality of their operations. They considered that most project staff had limited understanding of quality assurance methods and mentioned the importance of training in quality management for engineers and field staff. Four factors were mentioned to ensure quality: having responsibilities for the selection and management of contractors, having defined roles and responsibilities for the selection of materials, having critical path charts and developing project management reporting structures. There was also mention of developing a quality plan for the project along with the project proposal submitted to the donor. Organisations often implement more than one project at a given time; by having reporting strategies with stakeholders about the project’s progress and by reporting of evaluation outcomes that needed special mention, control of the project was improved:

In the post-conflict, the quality is extremely important, because there is a huge need for infrastructure projects. Usually there is no set up unit to manage the process, to manage the quality of the infrastructure being serviced or built. Therefore, it is a big problem. Now they think of quality, they think of assembling right people to assess the quality, depends on the project of course […] now they are moving more towards it.

Quality is definitely part of every project; sometimes it is not clear what quality is. It is not defined, is it quality to finish the project on time? Is it quality to finish the project on budget? Is it quality to build great houses with good materials? That has to be defined.

Managing project procurement

Procurement is a most significant undertaking and, at the same time, a complex process. Early engagement of suppliers and contractors is critical in the developmental process. As far as is practical, organisations should facilitate stakeholder involvement and consultations for satisfactory procurement decisions and procure goods and services that benefit the community (Schultz and Soreide, 2008). The selection criteria for suppliers and contractors should be reviewed with the stakeholders of the conflicting society, which also includes organisational project representatives and beneficiaries of the project. Clear reporting channels and addressing contractual conflicts are particularly fundamental in the context of post-conflict economies, and failure to address these issues adequately does significantly affects cost and schedule overruns of projects (Schultz and Soreide, 2008). The challenge for contractors in post-conflict economic reconstruction is to provide goods, services and commitment to work in unstable and often fragile environments (MacDonald, 2005). With diverse transactions and often-arduous negotiating mechanisms in PCR projects, a procurement process can be considered too costly, bureaucratic and uncertain which, in turn, affects the economic performance (MacDonald, 2005).

Within the limited time available, procurement does not receive due attention because organisations have complicated and time-consuming processes. It was noted that plans need
to be developed through an understanding of the complex situation the country faces. It was also revealed that a project procurement team should understand that fraud and corruption are committed at a very high level in post-conflict societies and should ensure that the plan is flexible but also robust at the same time.

Almost all respondents mentioned that the procurement plan should be an early priority for the project organisation, and the understanding of these collaborative practices needs to be transparent and further reinforced. Most respondents commented that each donor organisation does have its own procurement policies and tendering procedures, but the project team has limited understanding of the organisation’s practices and standards. Respondents also reported that the project staff were not happy with the resultant delay of goods and equipment, as the procurement processes were thwarted by the complex, cumbersome and time-consuming approval processes of the organisation. In general, regarding the capacity to deal with conflict situations, the respondents stated that:

Procurement plans exist, but there is no one to force these people to implement the procurement plan.

I would say one of the weakest things that I found in the international agencies is procurement. There is a lack of setting priorities, because there are other things going on in post-conflict areas. I think they are worth their weight in gold, somebody who understands the procurement system [...] and, different agencies have different standards, an example, the UN takes the lowest bid. That is absolutely foolishness! I mean why we would take the lowest bid when we know that the second one, second lowest has proven that they are capable. So you get different standards with different agencies.

In the beginning of every project here, they put together a procurement plan [...] we have a project plan but we do an awful lot that is not planned for originally. Things just pop up automatically.

The above responses emphasises that training is critical in project procurement processes. Also early investment in procurement planning and by having contingency plans for alternative action can reduce significant implementation delays in reconstruction projects.

**Conclusion**

As outline in the discussion, this case study has gone some way to answering the following reconstruction questions raised by Zupan (2005, p. 49):

*How does development assistance contribute to peace building? Do projects consider the local conflict settings and are they designed accordingly, or do they - unintentionally – prolong or even reinforce conflict? [...] after all, programs and projects have to be adjusted to the difficult and ever changing context of violent conflicts and post-war societies.*

In the immediate aftermath of war, the ability to withstand the scale and complexity of transitional PCR operations and activities cannot be understated. Political and democratic governance in transition was identified as critical to the successful implementation of national programmes and policies, and they need to be a continued effort to build national and local capacities linked to development goals. Humanitarian agencies should no longer plan civilian reconstruction and development projects/programmes in isolation. To facilitate the planning and implementation on the ground, it is critical to have an effective state wide consultation and coordination mechanism between local and international agencies operating in a country. There should be an appropriate level of flexibility and a greater level of participation by stakeholders in policy and project cycle activities. The organisation
should consider varying levels of participation, as all stakeholders cannot participate at the same time.

It is important in this context that donors, in association with aid agencies, undertake a feasibility study before authorising construction for any given project. In addition to ascertaining its feasibility, the key stakeholders should define and understand its scope before a project is executed. Agencies and donors should ensure that project objectives and goals have measurable benchmarks by which to evaluate project milestones, and beneficiaries should participate in the selection and decision-making processes. Projects should be approved only after understanding the overall goals and objectives, which should be clearly defined as easily measured, verifiable and finite.

Coordination of project activities and consistency in the procedures require a proactive communication strategy and transparency in the decision-making process. The project team and the organisation should make information accessible to key stakeholders at key project stages in a transparent and timely manner. It is essential to establish formal channels of communication standards within the project plan. Schedule delays need to be avoided and costs must not exceed the sum of the amount allocated to projects. Organisations should initiate project risk assessments and potential mitigation strategies along with key stakeholders. Although international donors pledge to reconstruction and stabilisation efforts, it is important to recognise that financial risks faced by many organisations contribute to delays in project implementation.

Post-conflict projects require very close monitoring and control, which may also necessitate numerous changes; controlling overall project cost changes to the budget requires appropriate techniques and cost models for documenting and monitoring project plans. Control measures and policies within the project management framework should openly address the challenges of corruption at all levels of the project cycle. Significantly, projects do not attract continued and sustained funding by donor institutions, and it is therefore imperative that funds received are well coordinated and dispersed to implement critical projects.

The validity of procurement practices in post-conflict societies needs to be examined, particularly because requirements are complex, and there is a general scarcity of goods in the country. Speed and timely delivery of goods and services are critical; however, lengthy bureaucratic practices cause delays in delivering services and exacerbate the situation. There is a need for a procurement strategy to build on lessons learned and best practices that can contribute to support aid agencies. Further, the PMs should be more flexible and should make special effort to ensure that the needs of the community are met and that their continued participation is meaningful. Local beneficiaries should have ownership and an operational stake in the development of a project plan and programme. It is critical that the project planning team consults the beneficiaries in project procurement, design and implementation.

Managing post-conflict projects in Kosovo has proven far more challenging to the international organisations and the local communities. Project planning and design must be informed by the accurate analysis of the post-conflict environment driven by local conditions. Sound preparation, execution and monitoring are vital for efficient and effective use of donor funds to help ensure that resources are used for the intended purpose and, more importantly, to achieve long-term goals. There is still a wide gap between theoretical and practical knowledge, as well as a lack of research-based applications of systematic methods of project management in PCR development. This paper has addressed the complexities of PCR project planning and implementation and helped shape the future planning of development projects.
Notes

1. Josip Broz Tito (1892-1980) was a leading Yugoslav communist. From 1945 to 1953, he was the Prime Minister, and from 1953, he was the President of Yugoslavia. He was one of the founder members of the non-aligned movement (Klemencic, 2002).

2. Dr Ibrahim Rugova, a Veteran Politician and Charismatic Leader of the Democratic League of Kosovo was appointed as President of the self-proclaimed independence, by the Kosovo Albanians in 1992 (Duke, 1998).

References


World Bank (2006), *Community-Driven Development in the Context of Conflict Affected Countries: Challenges and Opportunities*, Social Development Department, Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development Network, World Bank, Washington, D.C.


Corresponding author
James Earnest can be contacted at: James.Earnest@curtin.edu.au

For instructions on how to order reprints of this article, please visit our website:
www.emeraldgrouppublishing.com/licensing/reprints.htm
Or contact us for further details: permissions@emeraldinsight.com
Bringing together over 1,600 eBooks, the Emerald eBook collections are a cost-effective way of instantly expanding library holdings and increasing usage through an award winning platform alongside journals.

Visit emeraldinsight.com
eCase Collection

Real world business scenarios for the classroom

An annual single subscription provides unlimited access for students and faculty to a growing digital library of over 1500 real-world case studies on a wide range of industries spanning the business and management disciplines from across the globe.

Visit emeraldinsight.com

Get eCase Collections for your library
Recommend eCases to your librarian today. Find out more: emeraldpublishing.com/ecasecollections