

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY  
OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT  
AND METHODOLOGY

# RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND METHODOLOGY

Founding Editor: Warren J. Samuels (1933–2011)

Series Editors: Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall and  
Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak

## Recent Volumes:

- Volume 37A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on 50 Years of the Union for Radical Political Economics; 2019
- Volume 37B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Ludwig Lachmann; 2019
- Volume 37C: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Robert Heilbroner at 100; 2019
- Volume 38A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Public Finance in the History of Economic Thought; 2020
- Volume 38B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Economists and Authoritarian Regimes in the 20th Century; 2020
- Volume 38C: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Sir James Steuart: The Political Economy of Money and Trade; 2020
- Volume 39A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Selection of Papers Presented at the 2019 ALAHPE Conference; 2021
- Volume 39B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Carl Menger at the Centenary of his Death; 2021
- Volume 39C: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Frank Knight's *Risk, Uncertainty, and Profit* at 100; 2021
- Volume 40A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on David Gordon: American Radical Economist; 2022
- Volume 40B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium On the Work of William J. Baumol: Heterodox Inspirations and Neoclassical Models; 2022
- Volume 40C: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on the Work of François Perroux; 2022

# EDITORIAL BOARD

Michele Alacevich  
*University of Bologna, Italy*

Rebeca Gomez Betancourt  
*University of Lumière Lyon 2, France*

John Davis  
*Marquette University, USA; University  
of Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

Till Düppe  
*Université du Québec à Montréal,  
Canada*

Ross B. Emmett  
*Arizona State University, USA*

Andrew Farrant  
*Dickinson College, USA*

Nicola Giocoli  
*University of Pisa, Italy*

Harald Hagemann  
*University of Hohenheim, Germany*

Tiago Mata  
*University College, London, UK*

Steven Medema  
*Duke University, USA*

Gary Mongiovi  
*St. John's University, USA*

Mary Morgan  
*London School of Economics,  
London, UK*

Maria Pia Paganelli  
*Trinity University, USA*

Gerardo Serra  
*University of Manchester, UK*

*This page intentionally left blank*

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT  
AND METHODOLOGY VOLUME 41A

**RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY  
OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND  
METHODOLOGY: INCLUDING A  
SYMPOSIUM ON RELIGION, THE  
SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT, AND  
THE RISE OF LIBERALISM**

EDITED BY

**LUCA FIORITO**

*University of Palermo, Italy*

AND

**SCOTT SCHEALL**

*Arizona State University, USA*

**CARLOS EDUARDO SUPRINYAK**

*American University of Paris, France*



United Kingdom – North America – Japan  
India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited  
Emerald Publishing, Floor 5, Northspring, 21-23 Wellington Street, Leeds LS1 4DL.

First edition 2023

Editorial matter and selection © 2023 Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, and Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak. Published under exclusive licence by Emerald Publishing Limited.  
Individual chapters © 2023 Emerald Publishing Limited.

**Reprints and permissions service**

Contact: [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com)

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

**British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-83549-517-9 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-83549-516-2 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-83549-518-6 (Epub)

ISSN: 0743-4154 (Series)



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

# CONTENTS

<i>About the Editors</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi
<i>Volume Introduction</i>	xiii

**PART I**  
**A SYMPOSIUM ON RELIGION, THE SCOTTISH  
ENLIGHTENMENT, AND THE RISE OF LIBERALISM**  
*Edited by Jordan J. Ballor and Erik W. Matson*

<b>Chapter 1 Introduction to the Symposium: Religion, the Scottish Enlightenment, and the Rise of Liberalism</b> <i>Jordan J. Ballor and Erik W. Matson</i>	3
<b>Chapter 2 Believing, Belonging and Understanding: Religion and Philosophy as Narratives and Practice in Adam Smith</b> <i>Jimena Hurtado</i>	11
<b>Chapter 3 Adam Smith and Religious Mercantilism</b> <i>Maria Pia Paganelli</i>	27
<b>Chapter 4 The Quest for Adam Smith's Theodicy</b> <i>Paul Oslington</i>	37
<b>Chapter 5 The Circumstantiality of Bivariate Relationships in The <i>Theory of Moral Sentiments</i></b> <i>Daniel B. Klein</i>	59
<b>Chapter 6 The Anthropology of Liberalism: Smith and Us</b> <i>Christina McRorie</i>	79
<b>Chapter 7 Opposing Sketches of the Clergy as Literati During the Scottish Enlightenment: Hugh Blair and John Witherspoon</b> <i>Paul D. Mueller</i>	99

**PART II  
ESSAY**

<b>Chapter 8</b> Description as Theory: Sen and Sraffa <i>Syed Mohib Ali</i>	121
---	-----

**PART III  
ROUNDTABLE ON GEOFFREY HODGSON'S  
"DISCOVERING INSTITUTIONALISM:  
ONE PERSON'S JOURNEY"**

<b>Chapter 9</b> Discovering Institutionalism: One Person's Journey <i>Geoffrey Hodgson</i>	141
<b>Chapter 10</b> Geoffrey Hodgson's Institutional Economics: Veblenian Origins and Beyond <i>Felipe Almeida</i>	159
<b>Chapter 11</b> Can Institutional Economics Still Fascinate Scholars? <i>Angela Ambrosino</i>	169
<b>Chapter 12</b> Why Is Geoffrey Hodgson So Important for Institutional and Evolutionary Economics? Some Personal Views <i>Olivier Brette</i>	181
<b>Chapter 13</b> Geoffrey Hodgson: An Institutionalism's Institutionalist <i>Daniel H. Cole</i>	189
<b>Chapter 14</b> Journeying toward Institutionalism <i>Richard N. Langlois</i>	195
<b>Chapter 15</b> Learning Economics. Discovering Geoff Hodgson <i>Alain Marciano</i>	205
<b>Chapter 16</b> The Three Scientific Faults in Some Neo-Institutionalism <i>Deirde Nansen McCloskey</i>	209
<b>Chapter 17</b> The Institutional Economics of Geoffrey Hodgson: Some Distinctive Foundations <i>David Dequech</i>	219



## ABOUT THE EDITORS

**Luca Fiorito** received his PhD in Economics from the New School for Social Research in New York and is currently Professor at the University of Palermo. His main area of interest is the history of American economic thought in the Progressive Era and the interwar years. He has published many works on the contributions of the institutionalists and on the relationship between economics and eugenics.

**Scott Scheall** is Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Social Science in Arizona State University's College of Integrative Sciences and Arts. He has published extensively on topics related to the history and philosophy of the Austrian School of economics. Scott is the author of *F. A. Hayek and the Epistemology of Politics: The Curious Task of Economics* (Routledge, 2020)

**Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak** is Associate Professor of Economics at the American University of Paris. He specializes in the history of political economy, exploring the intersections between economics and politics in different historical contexts, from early modern England to Cold War Latin America. Besides numerous papers in peer-reviewed journals, he is also co-editor of *The Political Economy of Latin American Independence* (Routledge, 2017) and *Political Economy and International Order in Interwar Europe* (Palgrave, 2020).

*This page intentionally left blank*

# LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

<i>Syed Mohib Ali</i>	University of Siena, Siena, Italy
<i>Felipe Almeida</i>	Federal University of Paraná, Curitiba, Brazil
<i>Angela Ambrosino</i>	University of Turin, Turin, Italy
<i>Jordan J. Ballor</i>	Center for Religion, Culture & Democracy, Plano, TX, USA
<i>Olivier Brette</i>	University of Lyon, Lyon, France
<i>Daniel H. Cole</i>	Indiana University, Bloomington, IN, USA
<i>David Dequech</i>	University of Campinas, São Paulo, Brazil
<i>Luca Fiorito</i>	University of Palermo, Palermo, Italy
<i>Geoffrey Hodgson</i>	Loughborough University London, London, England, UK
<i>Jimena Hurtado</i>	Universidad de los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia
<i>Daniel B. Klein</i>	George Mason University, Fairfax, VA, USA
<i>Richard N. Langlois</i>	University of Connecticut, Storrs, CT, USA
<i>Alain Marciano</i>	University of Montpellier and MRE, Montpellier, France
<i>Erik W. Matson</i>	Mercatus Center at George Mason University, Arlington, VA, USA
<i>Deirdre Nansen McCloskey</i>	University of Illinois Chicago, Chicago, IL, USA
<i>Christina McRorie</i>	Creighton University, Omaha, NE, USA
<i>Paul D. Mueller</i>	The King's College, New York, NY, USA
<i>Paul Oslington</i>	Alphacrucis College Sydney, Sydney, Australia, and PACT / ACC&C, Charles Sturt University, Canberra, Australia
<i>Maria Pia Paganelli</i>	Trinity University, San Antonio, TX, USA
<i>Scott Scheall</i>	Arizona State University Polytechnic Campus, Mesa, AZ, USA
<i>Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak</i>	American University of Paris, Paris, France

*This page intentionally left blank*

## VOLUME INTRODUCTION

Volume 41A of *Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology* features a symposium on “Religion, the Scottish Enlightenment, and the Rise of Liberalism,” guest edited by Jordan J. Ballor and Erik W. Matson. The symposium includes contributions from Jimena Hurtado, Maria Pia Paganelli, Paul Oslington, Daniel B. Klein, Christina McRorie, and Paul D. Mueller.

The volume also features a new research essay by Syed Mohib Ali that considers Amartya Sen’s interpretation of Piero Sraffa’s work.

Volume 41A also includes a roundtable addressing a new essay by esteemed economist Geoffrey Hodgson in which Hodgson reflects on the role that institutional economics has played in his work. The roundtable features contributions from Felipe Almeida, Angela Ambrosino, Daniel H. Cole, Richard N. Langlois, Alain Marciano, and Deirdre McCloskey.

The Editors of *Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology*

Luca Fiorito

Scott Scheall

Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak