

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF
ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND
METHODOLOGY: INCLUDING A
SYMPOSIUM ON BRUCE
CALDWELL'S *BEYOND POSITIVISM*
AFTER 35 YEARS

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND METHODOLOGY

Founding Editor: Warren J. Samuels (1933–2011)

Series Editors: Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, and
Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak

Recent Volumes:

- Volume 31B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Documents Related to John Maynard Keynes, Institutionalism at Chicago & Frank H. Knight; Ross B. Emmett; 2013
- Volume 32: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: A Research Annual; Luca Fiorito; 2014
- Volume 33: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: A Research Annual; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2015
- Volume 34A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Austrian Economics in the Postwar Era; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2016
- Volume 34B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Albert O. Hirschman; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2016
- Volume 35A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on the Historical Epistemology of Economics; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2017
- Volume 35B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on New Directions in Sraffa Scholarship; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2017

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT
AND METHODOLOGY VOLUME 36A

**RESEARCH IN THE
HISTORY OF ECONOMIC
THOUGHT AND
METHODOLOGY:
INCLUDING A SYMPOSIUM
ON BRUCE CALDWELL'S
BEYOND POSITIVISM
AFTER 35 YEARS**

EDITED BY

LUCA FIORITO

University of Palermo, Palermo, Italy

SCOTT SCHEALL

Arizona State University Polytechnic Campus, Mesa, AZ, USA

CARLOS EDUARDO SUPRINYAK

Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brazil



United Kingdom – North America – Japan
India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2018

Copyright © 2018 Emerald Publishing Limited

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: permissions@emeraldinsight.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-78756-126-7 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-78756-125-0 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-78756-127-4 (Epub)

ISSN: 0743-4154 (Series)



ISOQAR certified
Management System,
awarded to Emerald
for adherence to
Environmental
standard
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

CONTENTS

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS	vii
EDITORIAL BOARD	ix
ABOUT THE EDITORS	xi
VOLUME INTRODUCTION	xiii

PART I A SYMPOSIUM ON BRUCE CALDWELL'S *BEYOND POSITIVISM* AFTER 35 YEARS

INTRODUCTION TO A SYMPOSIUM ON BRUCE CALDWELL'S <i>BEYOND POSITIVISM</i> AFTER 35 YEARS <i>Scott Scheall</i>	3
A COUNTERCULTURAL METHODOLOGY: CALDWELL'S <i>BEYOND POSITIVISM</i> AT THIRTY-FIVE <i>Kevin D. Hoover</i>	9
BEYOND DEDUCTIVISM <i>Tony Lawson</i>	19
HYPOTHETICAL PATTERN EXPLANATIONS IN ECONOMIC SCIENCE: HAYEK'S EXPLANATION OF THE PRINCIPLE AND PATTERN PREDICTION MEETS CONTEMPORARY PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE <i>D. Wade Hands</i>	37
WHY METHODOLOGY MATTERS: REFLECTIONS ON BRUCE CALDWELL'S <i>BEYOND POSITIVISM</i> <i>Peter Boettke, Solomon Stein and Virgil Henry Storr</i>	57

REFLECTING ON *BEYOND POSITIVISM* AT
THIRTY-FIVE

Bruce Caldwell

81

**PART II
ESSAYS**

RECENT TRENDS IN ECONOMIC METHODOLOGY:
A LITERATURE REVIEW

Luis Mireles-Flores

93

WHY IS “STIGLER’S COASE THEOREM” STIGLERIAN?
A METHODOLOGICAL EXPLANATION

Alain Marciano

127

**PART III
FROM THE VAULT**

JOHN M. CLARK AND FRANK H. KNIGHT ON
THE ADDING-UP THEOREM, OVERHEAD COSTS,
AND MORE

Luca Fiorito

159

INDEX

181

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

<i>Peter Boettke</i>	George Mason University, Fairfax, VA, USA
<i>Bruce Caldwell</i>	Duke University, Durham, NC, USA
<i>Luca Fiorito</i>	University of Palermo, Palermo, Italy
<i>D. Wade Hands</i>	University of Puget Sound, Tacoma, WA, USA
<i>Kevin D. Hoover</i>	Duke University, Durham, NC, USA
<i>Tony Lawson</i>	Cambridge University, Cambridge, England, UK
<i>Alain Marciano</i>	MRE, Université de Montpellier, Montpellier, France
<i>Luis Mireles-Flores</i>	TINT, Social and Moral Philosophy, Department of Political and Economic Studies, University of Helsinki, Helsinki, Finland
<i>Scott Scheall</i>	Arizona State University Polytechnic Campus, Mesa, AZ, USA
<i>Solomon Stein</i>	George Mason University, Fairfax, VA, USA
<i>Virgil Henry Storr</i>	George Mason University, Fairfax, VA, USA
<i>Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak</i>	Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brazil

EDITORIAL BOARD

Michele Alacevich
University of Bologna, Italy

Rebeca Gomez Betancourt
*University of Lumière Lyon 2,
France*

John Davis
*Marquette University, USA;
University of Amsterdam,
The Netherlands*

Pedro Garcia Duarte
University of São Paulo, Brazil

Till Düppe
*Université du Québec à Montréal,
Canada*

Ross Emmett
Arizona State University, USA

Mary Furner
*University of California Santa
Barbara, USA*

Nicola Giocoli
University of Pisa, Italy

Harald Hagemann
University of Hohenheim, Germany

Kyu Sang Lee
Ajou University, South Korea

Tiago Mata
University College, London, UK

Steven Medema
University of Colorado Denver, USA

Maria Pia Paganelli
Trinity University, USA

ABOUT THE EDITORS

Luca Fiorito received his PhD in Economics from the New School for Social Research in New York and is currently an associate professor at the University of Palermo. His main area of interest is the history of American economic thought in the Progressive Era and the interwar years. He has published many works on the contributions of the institutionalists and on the relationship between economics and eugenics.

Scott Scheall is a Lecturer with Arizona State University's College of Integrative Sciences and Arts. He received his PhD in Philosophy from Arizona State in 2012. Scott is a former research fellow with Duke University's Center for the History of Political Economy and a former postdoctoral fellow with the F.A. Hayek Program for Advanced Study in Philosophy, Politics, and Economics at George Mason University. He has published extensively on the history and methodology of the Austrian School of economics.

Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak is Associate Professor of Economics at the Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG), Brazil. He specializes in the history of economic thought and economic methodology, studying in particular the interplay between social, political, and economic ideas in early modern England, and the institutionalization of academic economics in Brazil during the postwar era. He has published several papers on these and other related themes in peer-reviewed scholarly journals, and is also the coeditor of *The Political Economy of Latin American Independence* (Routledge, 2017).

VOLUME INTRODUCTION

We are delighted to present Volume 36A of *Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology*, the first of three volumes planned for 2018. The centerpiece of the volume is a symposium on the impact after 35 years of *Beyond Positivism*, Bruce Caldwell's influential 1982 book on economic methodology. The symposium features several significant contributors to the methodological literature of the past four decades, including Kevin Hoover, Wade Hands, Tony Lawson, and Peter Boettke. Professor Caldwell responds.

Our general-research section includes a review of recent methodological literature by Luis Mireles-Flores as well as Alain Marciano's methodological account of the Stiglerian nature of "Stigler's Coase Theorem."

Last, RHETM coeditor Luca Fiorito offers an archival piece culled from the papers of Frank Knight and John Maurice Clark that sheds light on several matters, including their published controversy concerning the significance of the so-called adding-up theorem.

Luca Fiorito
Scott Scheall
Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak
Editors