ENTREPRENEURIALISM AND SOCIETY

Consequences and Meanings

Edited by Robert N. Eberhart, Michael Lounsbury and Howard E. Aldrich

Sponsored by the ASA section on Organizations, Occupations and Work

RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

VOLUME 82
ENTREPRENEURIALISM
AND SOCIETY
The two volumes of the “Reversing the Arrow” series are a tour de force that serve to crystallize a novel way of conceptualizing the interplay between society and entrepreneurship. They have led to a sea change in scholarship on entrepreneurship and will inspire new and exciting research for years to come.

Sarah Soule, Ph.D. Stanford University Graduate School of Business

Entrepreneurship has morphed from “what startups and small businesses do” into a pervasive ideology. From Shark Tank to university curricula, entrepreneurship is everywhere now. How did everyone become an LLC, ready to toss an elevator pitch at a moment’s notice? The articles in these volumes examine the societal impact of entrepreneurialism -- what happens when the process of starting a business becomes a set of values and a how-to guide for appropriate action far beyond the context of startups. They reflect an engaging mix of disciplines and methods taking on a vital problem.

Gerald Davis, Ph.D., University of Michigan

Entrepreneurship has been the rage for several decades, escaping serious scrutiny of its ramifications for those who experience its second and third-order consequences. The Reversing the Arrow authors remedy that omission, deftly revealing the many societal costs and limitations that stem from worshipping at the altar of entrepreneurship.

Walter Powell, Ph.D., Stanford University
RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

Series Editor: Michael Lounsbury

Recent Volumes:

Volume 56: Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
Volume 57: Toward Permeable Boundaries of Organizations?
Volume 59: The Production of Managerial Knowledge and Organizational Theory: New Approaches to Writing, Producing and Consuming Theory
Volume 60: Race, Organizations, and the Organizing Process
Volume 61: Routine Dynamics in Action
Volume 62: Thinking Infrastructures
Volume 63: The Contested Moralities of Markets
Volume 64: Managing Inter-organizational Collaborations: Process Views
Volume 65A: Microfoundations of Institutions
Volume 65B: Microfoundations of Institutions
Volume 66: Theorizing the Sharing Economy: Variety and Trajectories of New Forms of Organizing
Volume 67: Tensions and Paradoxes in Temporary Organizing
Volume 68: Macrofoundations: Exploring the Institutionally Situated Nature of Activity
Volume 69: Organizational Hybridity: Perspectives, Processes, Promises
Volume 70: On Practice and Institution: Theorizing the Interface
Volume 71: On Practice and Institution: New Empirical Directions
Volume 72: Organizational Imaginaries: Tempering Capitalism and Tending to Communities Through Cooperatives and Collectivist Democracy
Volume 73A: Interdisciplinary Dialogues on Organizational Paradox: Learning from Belief and Science
Volume 73B: Interdisciplinary Dialogues on Organizational Paradox: Investigating Social Structures and Human Expression
Volume 74: Worlds of Rankings
Volume 75: Organizing Creativity in the Innovation Journey
Volume 76: Carnegie Goes to California: Advancing and Celebrating the Work of James G. March
Volume 77: The Generation, Recognition and Legitimation of Novelty
Volume 78: The Corporation: Rethinking the Iconic Form of Business Organization
Volume 79: Organizing for Societal Grand Challenges
Volume 80: Advances in Cultural Entrepreneurship
Volume 81: Entrepreneurialism and Society: New Theoretical Perspectives
RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS ADVISORY BOARD

Series Editor
Michael Lounsbury
Professor of Strategic Management & Organization
University of Alberta School of Business

RSO Advisory Board
Howard E. Aldrich, University of North Carolina, USA
Shaz Ansari, Cambridge University, UK
Silvia Dorado Banacloche, University of Massachusetts Boston, USA
Christine Beckman, University of Southern California, USA
Marya Besharov, Oxford University, UK
Eva Boxenbaum, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Ed Carberry, University of Massachusetts Boston, USA
Lisa Cohen, McGill University, Canada
Jeannette Colyvas, Northwestern University, USA
Erica Coslor, University of Melbourne, Australia
Gerald F. Davis, University of Michigan, USA
Rich Dejordy, California State University, USA
Rodolphe Durand, HEC Paris, France
Fabrizio Ferraro, IESE Business School, Spain
Peer Fiss, University of Southern California, USA
Mary Ann Glynn, Boston College, USA
Nina Granqvist, Aalto University School of Business, Finland
Royston Greenwood, University of Alberta, Canada
Stine Grodal, Northeastern University, USA
Markus A. Hoellerer, University of New South Wales, Australia
Ruthanne Huiseng, Emlyon Business School, France
Candace Jones, University of Edinburgh, UK
Sarah Kaplan, University of Toronto, Canada
Brayden G. King, Northwestern University, USA
Matthew S. Kraatz, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA
Tom Lawrence, Oxford University, UK
Xiaowei Rose Luo, Insead, France
Johanna Mair, Hertie School, Germany
Christopher Marquis, Cambridge University, UK
Renate Meyer, Vienna University, Austria
William Ocasio, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA
Nelson Phillips, University of California at Santa Barbara, USA
Prateek Raj, Indian Institute of Management Bangalore, India
Marc Schneiberg, Reed College, USA
Marc-David Seidel, University of British Columbia, Canada
Paul Spee, University of Queensland, Australia
Paul Tracey, Cambridge University, UK
Kerstin Sahlin, Uppsala University, Sweden
Sarah Soule, Stanford University, USA
Eero Vaara, University of Oxford, UK
Marc Ventresca, University of Oxford, UK
Maxim Voronov, York University, Canada
Filippo Carlo Wezel, USI Lugano, Switzerland
Melissa Wooten, Rutgers University, USA
April Wright, University of Queensland, Australia
Meng Zhao, Nanyang Business School & Renmin University, China
Enying Zheng, Peking University, China
Tammar B. Zilber, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel
This page intentionally left blank
This volume is dedicated to the memory of Prof. William Miller who encouraged me to embark on a journey from being an entrepreneur to a scholar studying our new entrepreneurial world.
CONTENTS

List of Tables and Figures xiii
About the Editors xv
About the Contributors xvii
Foreword: Research in the Sociology of Organizations xxi
Acknowledgments xxiii
Author Acknowledgments xxiv

Introduction – “Reversing Entrepreneurship’s Arrow”: The Metaphor’s Model and Research Implications
P. Devereaux Jennings, Timothy R. Hannigan and Jennifer E. Jennings 1

Toward an Untrepreneurial Economy? The Entrepreneurship Industry and the Rise of the Veblenian Entrepreneur
Rasmus Koss Hartmann, Andre Spicer and Anders Dahl Krabbe 19

Revisiting the Relationship between Income Equality and Entrepreneurship: A Social Trust Perspective
Ryan Coles, Shon R. Hiatt and Wesley D. Sine 51

Rethinking Social Capital: Entrepreneurial Ecosystems as Contested Communities
Banu Ozkazanc-Pan 69

Social Entrepreneurship and the Common Good
Helen M. Haugh and Bob Doherty 89

How Do Founding Teams Form? Toward a Behavioral Theory of Founding Team Formation
David R. Clough and Balagopal Vissa 115
Enacting (New) Possibilities of Living: Entrepreneurship and Affirmation  
*Dillon Berjani, Karen Verduijn and Elco van Burg*  
149

Entrepreneurship Education in Post-Soviet Higher Education Systems: Moving Into or Resisting Global Entrepreneurial Culture  
*Pavel Sorokin, Isak Froumin and Svetlana Chernenko*  
161
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Introduction – “Reversing Entrepreneurship’s Arrow”: The Metaphor’s Model and Research Implications
Fig. 1. An Integrative Theoretical Model of the “Reversing the Arrow” Metaphor for Future Entrepreneurship Research 5
Fig. 2. Enhancing Method Using Latent Mapping 12

“Toward an Untrepreneurial Economy? The Entrepreneurship Industry and the Rise of the Veblenian Entrepreneur”
Table 1. Exemplary Differences Between Innovation-driven and Veblenian Entrepreneurship 30
Fig. 1. Veblenian Entrepreneurship 27

“Revisiting the Relationship between Income Equality and Entrepreneurship: A Social Trust Perspective”
Fig. 1. Social Trust and Gini Coefficient (United States), 1978–2011 55
Fig. 2. Firm Entry Rate and Gini Coefficient (United States), 1978–2011 56
Fig. 3. Firm Entry Rate and Social Trust (United States), 1978–2011 57

“Social Entrepreneurship and the Common Good”
Table 1. Participating Social Enterprises and Data Sources 95
Fig. 1. Data Structure 96
Fig. 2. Common Good Making, Staking, and Taking 104

“How Do Founding Teams Form? Toward a Behavioral Theory of Founding Team Formation”
Fig. 1. Process Model of Search for Potential Co-founders 121
Fig. 2. Aspiration Levels and the Feasible Set of Potential Co-founders 124
Fig. 3. How Aspiration Shifts Affect the Feasible Set of Potential Co-founders 125
Fig. 4. Process Model of Initial Founding Team’s Dynamic Evolution Through Contraction and Expansion 133
This page intentionally left blank
ABOUT THE EDITORS

**Robert N. Eberhart** is the Associate Director of Research of the Entrepreneurship and Society Project at Stanford University Graduate School of Business. He earned his Ph.D. in Management Science from Stanford University and his academic publications span topics such as new theoretical constructs on how institutional change has complex effects on new firms and how entrepreneurship is changing society. He is the Founder of the Project on Entrepreneurship and Society that this volume describes. His publications have appeared in *Organization Science*, the *Strategic Management Journal*, *Strategy Science*, and others. His papers have won numerous awards including his 2017 paper in Organization Science that won the Responsible Research in Business and Management award. He served as the Vice Chairperson of the U.S. Department of State and METI’s Japan–US Innovation and Entrepreneurship Council.

**Michael Lounsbury** is a Professor at the Alberta School of Business and Adjunct Professor in the Department of Sociology at the University of Alberta, Canada. His research has a general focus on the relationship between entrepreneurship and institutional change, especially the cultural entrepreneurship involved in the creation of new industries and practices. At the University of Alberta, he is the Academic Director of eHUB, overseeing curricular and co-curricular entrepreneurship initiatives.

**Howard E. Aldrich** is Kenan Professor of Sociology and Adjunct Professor of Business at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA. His main research interests are entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial team formation, gender and entrepreneurship, and evolutionary theory.

   His 1979 book, *Organizations and Environments*, was reprinted in 2007 by Stanford University Press in its Business Classics series. His book, *Organizations Evolving* (Sage, 1999), won the *George Terry Award* from the Academy of Management and was co-winner of the *Max Weber Award* from the OOW section of the American Sociological Association. In 2000, he won the *Swedish Foundation on Small Business Award* for his research on entrepreneurship. In 2002, he won the *Sitterson Award for Excellence in Freshman Teaching* at UNC-CH. His latest book, *An Evolutionary Approach to Entrepreneurship: Selected Essays*, was published by Edward Elgar in 2012. He is a fellow of Sidney Sussex College, Cambridge University, and an Affiliate in the Strategy Department at Duke University.
This page intentionally left blank
Dillon Berjani has recently defended his Ph.D. at the School of Business and Economics of Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam. His research adopts qualitative methods to study societal outcomes of entrepreneurship and motivate new investigations into the role of entrepreneurship in society. Next to his academic positions, he is also the Co-founder of a technology firm in Kosovo, which offers data science services to large corporations. He also serves as a Political Advisor for economic development to the Deputy Prime Minister of the Republic of Kosovo.

Svetlana Chernenko is a Research Assistant at the Institute of Education, National Research University Higher School of Economics, Russian Federation.

David R. Clough is an Assistant Professor in the OBHR Division and the Entrepreneurship and Innovation Group at the University of British Columbia’s Sauder School of Business. He received his Ph.D. from INSEAD. His research interests include new venture emergence, organizational learning, and technological change in innovation ecosystems.

Ryan Coles is an Assistant Professor of Management and Entrepreneurship at the University of Connecticut’s School of Business. He researches entrepreneurship, innovation, internationalization, and technology commercialization in the United States, Latin America, the Middle East, Africa, and Asia.

P. Devereaux Jennings is the T.A. Graham Professor of Business, the recent Canadian Center for CSR Coordinator at the Alberta School of Business, and one of the informal coordinators of the Interpretive Data Science (IDeaS) Group. He has published research on a wide variety of organizational topics, ranging from M-form use, hybrid startups in nanotech, and AI ecosystem cultural holes to corporate engagement with environmental regulation and Anthropocene issues. He has extensive editorial experience, including work as Associate Editor at AMR, ASQ, and JBV. He received his Ph.D. and M.A. from Stanford University and his A.B. from Dartmouth College.

Bob Doherty is Professor of Marketing and Chair of Food Systems at the University of York. He is also the Dean of the New School for Business and Society at the University of York. He leads a large funded 5-year program called “FixOurFood” – transformations to Regenerative Food Systems from the UK Transforming Food Systems Strategic Priorities Fund for a program. He was seconded in April 2019 for 3 years into the UK Government Department, DEFRA (Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs) as a Policy Fellow to work on Food Systems Policy Development. He specializes in research on pro-social
market mechanisms including hybrid organizations and certification bodies. He is Founding Editor Emeritus of the Social Enterprise Journal – after 10-years as Editor-in-Chief of the Social Enterprise Journal published by Emerald Publishing Limited.

Isak Froumin is a Professor at the Institute of Education, National Research University Higher School of Economics, Russian Federation. He is the author of multiple academic articles and editor of several monographs on education (for instance, 25 Years of Transformations of Higher Education Systems in Post-Soviet Countries. Reform and Continuity/Ed. by J. Huisman, A. Smolentseva, and I. Froumin, Palgrave Macmillan, 2018).

Timothy R. Hannigan is an Associate Professor of Organization Theory and Entrepreneurship at the University of Alberta and Co-Coordinator of the Interpretive Data Science (IDeaS) group. His research is oriented around the early moments of markets and fields, cultural holes and ecosystems, blockchain entrepreneurship, and organizational wrongdoing. His work has been published in numerous outlets, including Academy of Management Annals, Academy of Management Review, Research Policy, Big Data & Society, and Behavioral Science & Policy. He holds a D.Phil. (Ph.D.) from the University of Oxford, Saïd Business School.

Rasmus Koss Hartmann is an Associate Professor of Management at Copenhagen Business School. His research deals with questions of innovation, new technology, and entrepreneurship. Most recently, he has worked on the influence of the entrepreneurship industry and entrepreneurial consumption practices on the entrepreneurial process, the impact of social acceleration on reflexivity and ethics in organizations, and the dynamics of hidden innovation processes within bureaucratic organizations.

Helen M. Haugh is Associate Professor and Research Director for the Centre for Social Innovation, Judge Business School, University of Cambridge. She received her Ph.D. from the University of Aberdeen. Her research interests focus on social and community enterprise, development, and sustainability. Most recently, she was awarded a Leverhulme Research Fellowship (2018–2022) to research rural community entrepreneurship. Her research has been published in several leading journals, including the Academy of Management Journal, Organization Studies, Journal of Business Venturing, and Journal of Business Ethics.

Shon R. Hiatt is an Associate Professor of Business Administration at the University of Southern California’s Marshall School of Business. He researches entrepreneurship, ESG strategy, and sustainability innovation in domestic and international contexts, with a particular emphasis on food/agribusiness and energy industries. He received his Ph.D. from Cornell University.

Jennifer E. Jennings, Ph.D., is the Tier 1 Canada Research Chair in Entrepreneurship, Gender, and Family Business at the University of Alberta. Her
work on these topics has been published in numerous top journals, including the *Academy of Management Annals, Academy of Management Journal, Academy of Management Review, Administrative Science Quarterly, Entrepreneurship Theory & Practice, Journal of Business Venturing,* and *Organization Studies.* The 2021 recipient of the AOM ENT Division’s Foundational Paper Award, she has served on the ENT Executive Committee and as a Field Editor for *JBV.* She received her Ph.D. from the University of British Columbia and her B.Com. from Carleton University.

**Anders Dahl Krabbe** is a Lecturer in Innovation and Entrepreneurship in the Strategy, International Management and Entrepreneurship Research Group at King’s Business School. He started at King’s in Autumn 2021 after being a Postdoctoral fellow at Stanford University. He was awarded his Ph.D. in Innovation Management at the University of Southern Denmark.

His research focuses on themes related to the commercialization of technology, often examined at the market or industry level. In terms of methods, he opts for inductive, qualitative, and mixed-methods approaches, often drawing on archival material.

**Banu Ozkazanc-Pan** is a Professor of Practice at the School of Engineering and Academic Director of the IE Brown EMBA Program. She is also the Founder and Director of the Venture Capital Inclusion Lab at the Nelson Center for Entrepreneurship. The Lab focuses on understanding and solving funding inequities in the VC industry through data-driven research, education, and advocacy. She contributed her expertise to 2021 UNGPs10+ consultation on the gender dimensions of business and human rights, which is intended to inform the work of the UN Working Group on Business and Human Rights’ UNGPs10+ “next decade” project. She also contributed her expertise to the 2021 gender dimensions of business and human rights project via the Danish Institute for Human Rights. Her piece on inclusion in the tech industry in The Conversation has over 35k reads. It was chosen as essential reading in relation to sexual harassment and discrimination in tech, particularly in regard to the Activation Blizzard lawsuit. She is currently a member of CNBC’s Disruptor 50 Advisory Council Member. She recently published her co-authored book, *Entrepreneurial Ecosystems: A Critical Gender Perspective* (2021), with Cambridge University Press.

**Wesley D. Sine** is a Professor whose research focuses on the emergence of new economic sectors and entrepreneurship. His research context includes the United States, Latin America, and the Middle East. He explores issues related to institutional change, industry and technology evolution, technology entrepreneurship, and new venture structure and strategy. He has examined a diverse set of economic sectors ranging from the electric power industry to the emergence of the Internet. Teaching interests include entrepreneurship, commercializing university technology, new venture growth, the management of technology and innovation, and organizational change. He has consulted and taught executives in Latin America, Asia, and the Middle East. Sine has published, provisionally accepted,

Pavel Sorokin is a Senior Research Fellow at the Institute of Education, National Research University Higher School of Economics, Russian Federation. His research encompasses renovating theoretical and methodological tools of the current social science, making it more capable of dealing with the challenges of the global world, with a focus on the development of transformative agency.

Andre Spicer is Dean and Professor of Organisational Behaviour at Bayes Business School, City, University of London. He has authored a number of books including the Wellness Syndrome, Business Bullsh*t, The Stupidity Paradox and Desperately Seeking Self Improvement.

Elco van Burg is Full Professor of Organizational Theory and Head of Organizational Theory Section at the School of Business and Economics at Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam. Next to his academic positions, he has been working in a social enterprise in the rural highlands of Papua (Indonesia) for a period of six years, where he is still involved. His research is situated at the intersection of organization theory and entrepreneurship. Using process approaches he studies collaborations, imagination and decision-making, design perspectives on organizing, and organizing with purpose.

Karen Verduijn is an Associate Professor at the School of Business and Economics of Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam. Her research typically includes critical theorizing, and an interest in the intricacies of entrepreneurial everyday life. She is the (Co-)editor-in-Chief of the Scandinavian Journal of Management, a board member of the Entrepreneurship Studies Network (special interest group of the Institute for Small Business and Entrepreneurship), and editorial board member of the International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business.

Balagopal Vissa is a Professor of Entrepreneurship at INSEAD. He received his Ph.D. from London Business School. His research focuses on the people side of entrepreneurship, particularly in emerging economy settings.
FOREWORD: RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

Research in the Sociology of Organizations (RSO) publishes cutting edge empirical research and theoretical papers that seek to enhance our understanding of organizations and organizing as pervasive and fundamental aspects of society and economy. We seek provocative papers that push the frontiers of current conversations, that help to revive old ones, or that incubate and develop new perspectives. Given its successes in this regard, RSO has become an impactful and indispensable fount of knowledge for scholars interested in organizational phenomena and theories. RSO is indexed and ranks highly in Scopus/SCImago as well as in the Academic Journal Guide published by the Chartered Association of Business schools.

As one of the most vibrant areas in the social sciences, the sociology of organizations engages a plurality of empirical and theoretical approaches to enhance our understanding of the varied imperatives and challenges that these organizations and their organizers face. Of course, there is a diversity of formal and informal organizations – from for-profit entities to non-profits, state and public agencies, social enterprises, communal forms of organizing, non-governmental associations, trade associations, publicly traded, family owned and managed, private firms – the list goes on! Organizations, moreover, can vary dramatically in size from small entrepreneurial ventures to large multi-national conglomerates to international governing bodies such as the United Nations.

Empirical topics addressed by RSO include: the formation, survival, and growth or organizations; collaboration and competition between organizations; the accumulation and management of resources and legitimacy; and how organizations or organizing efforts cope with a multitude of internal and external challenges and pressures. Particular interest is growing in the complexities of contemporary organizations as they cope with changing social expectations and as they seek to address societal problems related to corporate social responsibility, inequality, corruption, and wrongdoing, and the challenge of new technologies. As a result, levels of analysis reach from the individual, to the organization, industry, community, and field, and even the nation-state or world society. Much research is multi-level and embraces both qualitative and quantitative forms of data.

Diverse theory is employed or constructed to enhance our understanding of these topics. While anchored in the discipline of sociology and the field of management, RSO also welcomes theoretical engagement that draws on other disciplinary conversations – such as those in political science or economics, as well as work from diverse philosophical traditions. RSO scholarship has helped
push forward a plethora theoretical conversations on institutions and institutional change, networks, practice, culture, power, inequality, social movements, categories, routines, organization design and change, configurational dynamics and many other topics.

Each volume of *RSO* tends to be thematically focused on a particular empirical phenomenon (e.g., creative industries, multinational corporations, and entrepreneurship) or theoretical conversation (e.g., institutional logics, actors and agency, and microfoundations). The series publishes papers by junior as well as leading international scholars, and embraces diversity on all dimensions. If you are scholar interested in organizations or organizing, I hope you find *RSO* to be an invaluable resource as you develop your work.

Professor Michael Lounsbury
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The editors want to express the deepest appreciation and respect for the authors in this volume, the participants at the Reversing the Arrow conferences in Lake Tahoe, and the organizers of this research effort who devoted so much time and energy to make this a reality. This volume grew out of conversations among the organizers and participants of the CalO2 conferences at the University of Southern California, the annual West Coast Research Seminars, and the annual conferences at Lake Tahoe. The editors would also like to express gratitude to the Graduate School of Business at Stanford for supporting and hosting this project, the Stanford Technology Ventures Program for their educational support, and the Rocket Wagon Venture Studio and Palo Alto Venture Studio for their generous financial support.
AUTHOR ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

David Clough and Bala Vissa thank the co-editors of this volume of *Research in the Sociology of Organizations* and Teppo Felin, Gerry George, Henrich Greve, Phanish Puranam, and Wesley Sine for constructive comments on earlier drafts of their essay. They are also grateful for feedback received from audiences at the Mack Institute Emerging Scholars Workshop, the Strategic Management Society Special Conference in Copenhagen, the Strategic Management Society Annual Conference in Paris, the Academy of Management Annual Meeting in Chicago, the “Reversing the Arrow” Conference on Entrepreneurship and Society, and research seminars at INSEAD and the University of British Columbia. They gratefully acknowledge research funding received from the INSEAD Alumni Fund.

Bob Doherty would like to thank the social enterprises and other intermediary organizations involved in the research, which made our work on social entrepreneurship and the common good possible.

Pavel Sorokin, Isak Froumin, and Svetlana Chernenko express gratitude to John W. Meyer, Robert N. Eberhart and all the colleagues who participated in the 3rd Conference on Reversing the Arrow, August 2021, Lake Tahoe.